

**Assessment Schedule – 2022****History: Examine sources of an historical event that is of significance to New Zealanders (91231)****Evidence: Question One**

Achievement		Achievement with Merit		Achievement with Excellence	
A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
Examines some material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting some <i>understanding</i> of similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.	Examines material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting <i>understanding</i> of similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.	Examines in depth material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.	Examines in depth material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.	Examines comprehensively material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.	Examines comprehensively material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.
Attempts to use supporting evidence.	Uses some supporting evidence (may include irrelevant material).	Frames explanation in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence (may include some irrelevant material).	Frames explanation in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.	Frames detailed explanation in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence (may be implied or inferred).  Draws conclusions beyond the immediately obvious.	Frames detailed explanation in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.  Draws conclusions and raises relevant questions, beyond the immediately obvious. Explanation, examples, and evidence are drawn from the sources and wider knowledge.
<p><b>N0</b> = No response; no relevant evidence.</p> <p><b>N1</b> = Extracts some material from at least TWO of Sources A–F related to the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.</p> <p><b>N2</b> = Extracts material from at least TWO of Sources A–F related to the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder.</p>					

**Sample evidence Question One:** *Examine the similarities between the stories of Charlotte Badger and George Wilder, with reference to Sources A–F.*

<b>Badger and Wilder</b>	<p><b><u>Introduction</u></b></p> <p>“Both characters have had plays written about them and their respective adventures, sometimes taken as factual accounts instead of the entertainment they were created to be. George Wilder was also the subject of a song banned on public radio in the 1970s called ‘The Wilder Boy,’ by the Howard Morrison Quartet. What they have in common is that their stories started out with theft and grew to capture the imagination of a nation, becoming larger than the crimes themselves.</p>
<b>Badger</b>	<p><b><u>Source A</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• “English convict and ship’s mutineer Charlotte Badger is heralded as New Zealand’s first “White” woman settler, who lived with a Māori chief after her arrival in the Bay of Islands in 1806. Almost nothing written about Badger has been correct. The core of her story has been hiding in plain sight in a contemporary newspaper account that has been misinterpreted by generations of historians. Colourful fictions added by two Australian storytellers further clouded the facts. A ship’s passenger list and logbook ... confirm she did not settle in New Zealand after all.”</li> <li>• “Both accounts were in stark contrast to the only contemporaneous account of the mutiny that had been provided by Captain Chace in 1806, an account in which Charlotte Badger featured not at all.”</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Source B</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• “If you look through New South Wales census records ... you can find Charlotte Badger living in New South Wales in 1811 and right up until the mid 1820s,’ she [Jennifer Ashton] says. So, unfortunately, it may be that the fantastic tale of Charlotte Badger, the female pirate and first European women to live in Aotearoa is... just a story”.</li> </ul>
<b>Wilder</b>	<p><b><u>Source E(i)</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• “The play <i>The Ballad of Jimmy Costello</i> was inspired by a true story [George Wilder’s life]. In the 1960s, New Zealanders began cheering on a car thief-prison-escaper and inadvertently promoted a small-town Kiwi boy from petty criminal to multi-prison escapee to National folk icon... A hero who ran rings around the police in his many bids for freedom.”</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Source F</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ray: “George Wilder himself has said many of these stories aren’t true. Here’s how he put it in his only ever sit-down interview with a journalist from the <i>Sunday Times</i> in 1970: ‘I never left a note to anyone in my life and the only reason I tidied up these places was to avoid detection, naturally. When police are on your tail, you don’t leave the signs lying around for them’. And what this quote shows is that George Wilder never wanted to become famous. ... After all, the more famous he became the more the police tried to catch him”.</li> </ul>

**Evidence: Question Two**

Achievement		Achievement with Merit		Achievement with Excellence	
A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
Examines some material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting <i>understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.	Examines material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting <i>understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.	Examines in depth material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.  Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.	Examines in depth material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.  Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.	Examines comprehensively material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.  Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources (including implied or inferred) for supporting evidence.	Examines comprehensively material from at least TWO of Sources A–F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history.  Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.
Includes direct reference to the source(s) (may have limitations).	Includes direct reference to the source(s).	Includes direct detailed reference to the source(s) (may have limitations).	Includes direct detailed reference to the source(s).	Includes direct detailed reference to the source(s).  Reflects a high degree of engagement with the source(s), i.e. raising questions, awareness of limitations, etc.	Includes direct detailed reference to the source(s).  Reflects a higher degree of engagement with the source(s), i.e. raising questions, awareness of limitations, and the basis for making assumptions from it.

**N0** = No response; no relevant evidence.

**N1** = Extracts some material from at least TWO of Sources A–F and attempts to examine the problems caused by myths.

**N2** = Extracts material from at least TWO of Sources A–F and attempts to examine the problems caused by myths.

**Sample evidence for Question Two:** *Examine the problems caused by myths and how they influence people's understanding of history, with reference to Sources A–F.*

**Source A**

- “An emerging mythology of Charlotte Badger came in 1895 when an ‘Old Colonial Story’ appeared in the *Sydney Evening News*. Where would such information have been recorded in the first instance to be accessed by this author nearly ninety years later? The 1895 newspaper account reeks of sensationalism ...”.
- “In 1937, Roy Alexander, in a story in the *Sydney Morning Herald*, added that Badger had been the architect of the mutiny and even led the uprising with an assault on Captain Chace. Alexander made the groundless claim that the mutineers on the *Venus* had committed a further act of piracy by attacking another ship ... [He also repeated the author Louis] Becke's story that Badger .... Both accounts were in stark contrast to the only contemporaneous account of the mutiny that had been provided by Captain Chace in 1806, an account in which Charlotte Badger featured not at all.”

**Source B**

- “Charlotte Badger was one of the very first European women to live in New Zealand. She was also a pirate... or at least that's the traditional story.”
- “Last on the list were two women: ... *Charlotte Badger, convict. Very corpulent, full face, thick lips, infant child*”.
- “Later, the *Gazette* published official depositions from people who witnessed the mutiny, including the ship's captain who said the leaders of the mutiny were the first mate, the pilot of the ship and a soldier. The two women convicts are hardly discussed at all ...”.
- “Each time the story is retold, Charlotte Badger's role is amped up ... If you look through New South Wales census records ... you can find Charlotte Badger living in New South Wales in 1811 and right up until the mid 1820s,” observes Jennifer Ashton.

**Source D**

- “Wilder is a New Zealand national icon, but one who doesn’t want to be remembered. He rose to notoriety because no prison seemed able to contain him and the police could never seem to find him. He eluded tracker dogs, swam rivers, criss-crossed creeks and did a lot of cooking in other people’s kitchens – cleaning up after himself as he went. All the while, he left apologetic, endearing notes to those he robbed.”
- “When the *Taupo Times* published a story about my looming book, I was inundated by calls from people who recalled being burgled by the gentleman rogue.”
- “Every country has its folk heroes, those steeped in myth and legend. The English had Robin Hood, the Australians Ned Kelly, the United States had Daniel Boone and Davy Crockett. Here in New Zealand, we seem to enjoy our legends a trifle more real – Sir Ed Hillary, von Tempsky, Hone Heke, George Wilder. In the early 1960s, we were hungry for someone to relate to, someone who wasn’t an All Black. He was a loner, a petty thief, a gentleman rogue”.

**Source F**

- Balme: “All of the things that made him a great folklore character – escaping from prison, breaking into people’s houses, and leaving notes, the flipside of that was a real tragedy that was going on in the most horrible conditions in Mount Eden prison ...”.
- Ray: “The reason this escape [172 days on the run from police] became so famous wasn’t just how long it was, it was how dramatic it was. There were so many near misses ... a lot of the stories about Wilder during this escape are unconfirmed – some are probably true, some just folklore.  
One of the most famous stories is that he joined one of the search parties that was looking for him through the bush. But there are definitely stories that George Wilder himself said are completely made up”.
- Balme: “Everyone wanted a have a story that they could own about him. They’d go ‘Yeah well, I know George Wilder, because he stole my grandmother’s bicycle”.
- Ray: “Some people said that they found notes from him apologising for stealing from their houses and pointed out that he’d cleaned up after himself, although I would say George Wilder himself has said many of these stories aren’t true. Here’s how he put it in his only ever sit-down interview with a journalist from the *Sunday Times* in 1970: ‘I never left a note to anyone in my life and the only reason I tidied up these places was to avoid detection, naturally. When police are on your tail, you don’t leave signs lying around for them”.

**Evidence: Question Three**

Achievement		Achievement with Merit		Achievement with Excellence	
A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
Examines some material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting <i>understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.	Examines material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting <i>understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.	Examines in depth material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.	Examines in depth material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting a <i>thorough understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.	Examines comprehensively material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.	Examines comprehensively material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F, reflecting a <i>perceptive understanding</i> of their reliability for historians.
Attempts to use supporting evidence.	Uses supporting evidence (may include some irrelevant information or application of sources).	Uses appropriate and relevant supporting evidence accurately.	Uses appropriate and relevant supporting evidence accurately.	Uses appropriate and relevant supporting evidence accurately.	Uses appropriate and relevant supporting evidence accurately.
		Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence (may have limitations).	Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.	Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources (may be implied or inferred) for supporting evidence.	Frames detailed response in own words, while drawing on the sources for supporting evidence.
				Shows some awareness of the limitations of the evidence.  Reflects some insight, via conclusions / questions.	Shows some awareness of the limitations of the evidence.  Draws insightful conclusions beyond the immediately obvious and / or raises relevant questions.

**N0** = No response; no relevant evidence.

**N1** = Extracts some material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F and attempts to examine their reliability for historians.

**N2** = Extracts material from ONE of Sources C, E, or F and attempts to examine their reliability for historians.

**Sample evidence for Question Three: Examine the reliability for historians of ONE of Sources C, or E, or F.**

**Source C(i)**

- Title of the text is “The Mutiny on the *Venus*, 1895” – the time since the event took place is significant.
- Little evidence provided to base judgements on: “In May, 1826 ... a native of Oahu (Hawaii)... informed the Captain... that ... about ten years before (this would be about 1816) ... [he saw] a very big, stout woman with a little girl about eight years of age with her. .... who had escaped from captivity with the Maoris. No doubt this was the woman Badger, described in the official account of the mutiny of the *Venus* as ‘a very corpulent’ person”.

**Source C(ii)**

- The incident took place in 1806, so how accurate a newspaper report of the incident in 1937 would it be that long after the event is questionable.
- “Charlotte Badger was of a different calibre; she thrived on dangerous ground ...” – there is no evidence to support this.

**Source E(i)**

- The play is a dramatisation, therefore most likely not an accurate account: “The play *The Ballad of Jimmy Costello* was inspired by a true story”.
- “Kiwi multi-award-winning star Tim Balme wrote Jimmy Costello to set the record straight about a man who started his career by stealing the milk money and ended up doing seventeen years, and to reveal the true personality at the centre of the phenomenon, while introducing a host of Kiwi characters along the way” – the play can only go so far to “reveal” the truth when dramatic license is taken and the intended purpose is entertainment.

**Source E(ii)**

- RNZ’s William Ray reports the banning of the song is not clearly stated: “I still haven’t got to the bottom of it, but I have two theories: the first is that the song was initially released in between his first and second escapes, and, because that third escape was a lot more

serious, it might be that the powers that be at RNZ thought that the crime was pretty tough stuff compared to what he'd been involved with previously and we shouldn't be celebrating this guy".

**Source E(iii)**

- It's a song intended for entertainment based on reports from the time and popularised by a well-known band of the time:

"There is a wild New Zealand Boy,  
George Wilder is his name  
He robs the rich to help himself,  
conversion is his game  
He breaks and enters any house  
to him this brings great joy  
And that is how he got his name,  
the wild New Zealand Boy".

**Source F**

- This source is a podcast intended for entertainment and possibly educational purposes.
- Tim Balme's play was called *The Ballad of Jimmy Costello* and heavily based on George Wilder's life.
- In the process of writing his play, Tim Balme became the closest thing we have to a George Wilder expert.
- George Wilder himself said many of the myths / legends were untrue: "I never left a note to anyone in my life and the only reason I tidied up these places was to avoid detection, naturally. When police are on your tail, you don't leave signs lying around for them".

**Cut Scores**

Not Achieved	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
0 – 7	8 – 13	14 – 18	19 – 24