

Report of External Evaluation and Review

NZ Bakels Limited trading as Bakels
Training Organisation

Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 19 December 2012

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	4
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	5
Summary of Results	6
Findings	8
Recommendations	16
Appendix	17

MoE Number: 7945
NZQA Reference: C08347
Date of EER visit: 2 and 3 October 2012

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	NZ Bakels Limited trading as Bakels Training Organisation (Bakels)
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	421-429 Church Street East, Penrose, Auckland
Delivery sites:	Auckland, Palmerston North, Christchurch
First registered:	1 October 2010
Course currently delivered	National Certificate in Baking (Level 4) with specialisations in Craft Baking, Instore/Franchise, and Plant Baking.
Code of Practice signatory	N/A
Number of students:	30 at the time of the external evaluation review (EER) ¹
Number of staff:	One full-time Three part-time
Scope of active accreditation:	Baking trade skills to level 4
Distinctive characteristics:	The Bakels Group ² was first registered as a company in 1904 in Amsterdam, Holland. In 1943 the company began manufacturing ingredients. Since then, a mix of investment, innovation,

¹ Bakels operates a rolling enrolment process. Learners are able to enrol throughout the year.

² This is the current name of the parent company.

additional companies, and other products has seen the organisation grow to become an international organisation of nearly 40 companies operating around the world. NZ Bakels Ltd was first registered in 1953 with manufacturing commencing in 1956. Bakels Training School is a subsidiary entity of NZ Bakels.

Although a relatively new PTE, Bakels has been providing bakery-related training for many years. Prior to becoming registered as a PTE, Bakels provided block course training in conjunction with another provider, delivering national qualification accredited courses. Bakels is the only credited organisation in New Zealand able to deliver the advanced baking courses run in conjunction with the Richemont Bakery School in Lucerne, Switzerland. These courses concentrate on advanced bakery skills and are designed to recognise the competence, knowledge, and specialist skills required within the craft baking industry.

Recent significant changes:	One of the three bakery tutors employed with Bakels resigned prior to this EER.
Previous quality assurance history:	This is Bakels first EER. There have been no NZQA audits undertaken with this PTE. ³
Other:	The NZ Bakels head office is located next door to the PTE head office in Auckland.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The scope of the EER included the mandatory focus area of governance, management, and strategy. In addition, the following programme focus areas were evaluated:

- National Certificate in Baking (Instore/Franchise) (Level 4)⁴
- National Certificate in Baking (Plant Baking) (Level 4)⁵

³ Moderation assessments have been carried out and these will be commented on further in this report.

⁴ Offered as a two-year course

⁵ Offered as a two-year course

- National Certificate in Baking (Craft Baking) (Level 4)⁶

Although credited to teach all three qualifications, Bakels is currently only teaching the National Certificate in Baking (Craft Baking). At the time of the EER, Bakels had just started a one-week block course for secondary school students as part of the Gateway programme. This programme was not considered as a focus area for the EER.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

The EER was conducted over two days by two evaluators who visited Bakels in Auckland. The evaluation involved engagement with:

- NZ Bakels chair⁷
- Training school administrator
- Two bakery tutors⁸
- Four bakery employers
- Four students
- One recently graduated student

In addition to documents provided for the EER scoping exercise, the EER team sighted and was provided with documents of management and operational policies, moderation reports, self-assessment documents, a variety of data relating to student achievement and satisfaction, and related analysis.

⁶ Offered as a three-year course

⁷ The chair of NZ Bakels is also the chief executive officer of Bakels Training Organisation.

⁸ A third tutor had only recently resigned.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **NZ Bakels Limited trading as Bakels Training Organisation**.

As a newly established PTE, Bakels has shown that it has the ability and support systems in place to be an effective education provider. The vision and aim as expressed by the chairman of NZ Bakels is to operate a training organisation that will ensure quality outcomes for learners and to actively contribute to the baking industry. Although the first cohort of learners has graduated only recently, Bakels has had a 100 per cent completion rate, while the remaining learners are on target to graduate.

Bakery owners commented that they were impressed with the quality and standard of baking that learners were exhibiting after completing the block course component of the course and returning to work. Some bakery owners added that they had seen dramatic increases in the technical abilities of their trainee bakers and that the trainees are now an integral part of their business.

The tutoring staff of Bakels are highly qualified bakers, with one having in excess of 40 years experience in the baking industry. In addition, learners are able to train in fully equipped commercial grade kitchens. These aspects combined provide learners with a solid training environment in which to learn the technical aspects of baking. In support of the teaching staff, Bakels utilises its regional sales representatives (sales reps) as mentors for learners while training on the job. This support has proved to be very useful to learners who are able to seek assistance in a less formal learning environment. One of the negative aspects of the sales reps identified by the evaluation team was that none had any formal training in adult teaching or mentoring. Bakels has acknowledged this as one of the areas to be addressed as the training school continues to develop.

At a governance level, Bakels is well served by its senior management team who bring to the training school good leadership and guidance. The chair of NZ Bakels is also the inaugural CEO of the training school. He provides a wealth of governance leadership to the school, having served in a number of leadership positions within the company, including managing director and serving on the Bakels Group international executive board.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **NZ Bakels Limited trading as Bakels Training Organisation**.

Self-assessment at Bakels is genuine and focused, and findings are used to make useful improvements. These include responding to feedback from learners and implementing intervention strategies. An example of a successful strategy arising from self-assessment was the development of a guide for learners to understand the requirements of their student plans. Learner feedback had indicated that there was some uncertainty on how to read student plans and to understand the requirements for the course. The 'how to read your student plan' guide was developed by the training school administrator.

Other areas where self-assessment activities have been introduced include post-course student evaluations which are recorded and analysed by the Bakels management team to identify areas for improvement. As a new training provider, Bakels is beginning to gather learner and stakeholder feedback, which over time will provide useful information for analysis and comparison to inform ongoing teaching and learner achievement. In relation to teacher effectiveness, Bakels uses its head tutor to undertake observations of the other tutors in the regions to ensure there is a consistency of teaching and that standards of practice are high.

The establishment of the training school administrator position has provided Bakels with a dedicated person who is able to collect and analyse much of the learner data that is required of training providers. Although the systems and processes being developed by the administrator are at an initial development stage, there is evidence to suggest that Bakels is progressing in a positive direction. In addition, with the training school head office located adjacent to NZ Bakels head office, the training school is able to draw on this support.

Findings⁹

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The National Certificate in Baking (Instore/Franchise) is completed over a two-year period, with learners completing credits to levels 2 and 3 in their first year. The main focus of the first year is on the baking of breads as this provides for the broadest coverage of baking skills. The second year focuses on pastry, cake, and biscuit baking skills, with assessments completed at level 4 to show that learners have the capability to bake and assess their own product as well as being able to demonstrate learnt knowledge. To be accepted on the Bakels course, applicants must be currently employed as a baker. All learners interviewed during the EER were employed in a bakery. The course structure and schedule consists of on-the-job training and assessment, distance learning, and block course study. Bakels staff commented that this structure accommodated various learner styles. This has benefited learners who have struggled with the more formal sessions encountered on the block courses.

As a newly registered PTE, Bakels has only just had its first group of learners complete their two-year course of study. Course completions as at 20 July 2012¹⁰ were three (learners) at 100 per cent. For those learners still progressing through the course, three were between 90 and 99 per cent, one between 75 and 89 per cent, none between 50 and 74 per cent, and 11 between zero and 49 per cent. Most learners for this period are making steady progress and are meeting all requirements. Bakels is confident that all students are progressing to complete their programme within the 24-month timeframe. This confidence is based on current course work being submitted and tutor and employer assessments showing positive progress. The significance of these figures for learners is that on completion of the national certificate, they are eligible to apply for a baker's apprenticeship.

Learners described their training with Bakels as an achievable pathway to further enhance their skills in the baking industry and to secure an apprenticeship. They commented that their primary focus for being at Bakels is skills enhancement and the training received is improving their skills considerably. All the learners interviewed were confident that they would complete their studies and gain the

⁹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

¹⁰ With the open enrolment policy operated by Bakels, there are no common start and finish dates. The 12-month period to 20 July 2012 has been chosen to provide an analysis of course completions within that set period.

national qualification. They were also confident that they would be able to secure an apprenticeship as many had been given time by their employers to undertake the training – although some learners were responsible for covering their own course costs, including expenses incurred during the block course phase.

Employers interviewed for the EER commented that learners had demonstrated improved skills while undertaking the training with Bakels. The employers also commented that from on-the-job observations they were confident that learners in their employment would cope well when they commenced their apprenticeship.

As part of the initial drive to set up its PTE, Bakels saw the need to establish an administration position to ensure programmes were being administered effectively and that accurate learner data was being collected and monitored appropriately.¹¹ Learner achievement data from all three Bakels training sites as well as the distance learning assessments are collated by the training school administrator and are analysed together with the CEO and the head tutor. Any issues identified are assessed and are followed up almost immediately by the administrator. This has included direct contact with the learner, informing the Bakels sales reps who act as mentors for learners at their employment, and direct contact with the Bakels tutors who visit some of the learners.

The systems set up by the administrator are effective and straightforward, and are sufficient and manageable for the number of learners currently enrolled in the courses. However, if Bakels is to enrol greater numbers of applicants to its courses, it needs to consider making the administration position full-time as the demands required of this position will undoubtedly increase. In addition, as the sales reps do not have any formal training in adult teaching or pastoral care of learners, Bakels would need to invest resources to have these people up-skilled.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

The primary goal of Bakels as expressed to the evaluation team by the NZ Bakels chair is to train learners to a high standard so that these standards contribute to the baking industry here in New Zealand and internationally. Learners commented that the value to them of the training provided by Bakels is the marked increase in their technical skills related to baking. They were able to practically apply the learning almost immediately on their return to work and are able to actively contribute in their work place. Learners also commented that the training gave them a sense of

¹¹Currently, Bakels offers this position as part-time only. The intention, should learner numbers increase, is to offer the position as full-time.

the discipline and work ethic required to work in a bakery and what would be required to complete an apprenticeship. As an incentive to reaching higher standards of baking – and only by invitation – learners are able to train towards undertaking an advanced baker's course through the Richemont Bakery School in Switzerland.

Employers commented that their businesses were also benefiting from the improved technical skills of their employee while being trained by Bakels, particularly after completing the block course component. One employer commented that they were more than confident in delegating responsibility for managing the bakery as the learner had gained a good level of maturity and work ethic.

Self-assessment is currently being managed sufficiently, and over time it is expected to improve as Bakels continues to develop and grow and gain more experience dealing with learner and stakeholder issues in relation to education and training. An example of Bakels' capability in self-assessment is that the organisation was able to analyse the results of learners who had transferred to Bakels from other PTEs and quickly realised that these learners had not completed the core credits required for the qualification. Bakels was then able to inform the learners of the situation and begin planning a way forward to assist the learners to fulfil the qualification requirements. Another area that will require greater attention by Bakels is literacy and numeracy. Evidence provided for the evaluation demonstrated that literacy and numeracy aspects are embedded in the course structure by being aligned to the baking context. What was evident was that literacy and numeracy were not yet a priority for Bakels. As Bakels expands and attracts an increasingly diverse range of learners, it will need to consider placing a greater emphasis on ensuring literacy and numeracy matters are given a higher priority in the context of overall learner educational achievement.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The expected pathway for learners completing the Bakels course is to graduate with the national certificate at level 4, therefore completing their apprenticeship. The first year, which includes level 2 and some level 3 credits, concentrates on basic baking skills and progressing on to more complex baking techniques. The second and final year includes level 3 and level 4 credits which improve on the skills taught the previous year, and include advanced techniques and some management practices. The progression for learners is clear and structured and allows for steady growth. The Bakels course has been deliberately designed with the focus on the application of practical baking skills. The inclusion of distance learning, on-the-job training, and a block course located at one of the three Bakels

training centres enables the PTE to cater for various learning styles that support the practical application focus. Although learners' responses varied with regards to the course structure, most were positive as it gave them an opportunity to observe and participate in a formal class session under close supervision from experienced tutors and then return back to their home locations and apply what they had learnt. Some employers commented that the Bakels course provided effective technical training for their employees and that the employee was able to demonstrate what they had learnt and become an integral part of business operations.

Bakels management is developing a practice of analysing learner evaluations after each block course to ensure that the course meets learner needs and objectives. Using the evidence from the evaluations as well as monthly tutor briefings, Bakels is able to make reasoned decisions relating to course improvements. In addition, Bakels utilises its sales reps as mentors for learners and in some cases as assessors. This is proving successful as the sales team are all qualified bakers and are familiar with the course structure. Bakels will need to consider making an investment in training related to mentoring and tutoring for the sales reps if this role is to be increased, or will need to show a clear delineation between the roles of sales and mentoring. The sales reps' primary responsibility is securing product sales. The mentoring aspect of their roles has evolved since the establishment of the training school.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Bakels has very experienced baking tutors who teach the two-week block courses at the three Bakels training centres. The tutoring staff each have over 30 years experience in the baking industry and have at some time operated their own bakery as well as employed baking assistants and apprentices. This hands-on experience and baking industry knowledge provide learners with high quality and high standards of baking knowledge and techniques. Learners commented that the tutors were able to explain the finer details of baking in ways that were easily understood and easily applied. They noted that being able to apply the learning almost instantly on the block course helped reinforce the techniques. All learners commented that they had gained immense knowledge from the tutors. In addition, and as support of the tutoring staff, Bakels utilises its sales reps in the role of mentors. The sales reps are able to assist learners through their work-course assignments as well as carry out assessments. The advantage of utilising the sales reps for learners is that all the reps are qualified bakers, are fully familiar with the course content, and are able to support the learner in a less formal environment. This has proved useful as it allows some learners to be tested outside of the classroom setting as well as keep abreast of some of the course assignment deadlines. Bakels' tutors stated that this allows for those learners who do not cope

well in a group/class environment to be able to be assessed in the workplace by one of the sales reps.

Bakels management has a clear understanding of the characteristics of a successful baking graduate. The longevity of the Bakels Group in the baking industry provides Bakels with the credibility and knowledge that helps inform its model of training.¹² In line with the aim of helping grow the baking industry, every effort is made to ensure that learners have the required abilities and attitude to succeed. This is clearly demonstrated through the development of the advanced baking course which is offered to all learners as an incentive once they complete their apprenticeship; however, only those learners that are able to cope with the demands of the course are invited to apply.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

Bakels aim for its training organisation of supporting the growth, development, and quality of the baking industry in New Zealand ensures that learners are provided with effective guidance and support, from the initial application process, selection on the course, on-the-job training, and completion of course requirements to assistance in finding and securing an apprenticeship. Most of the direct support and guidance to learners is facilitated by the sales reps who operate in the regions. They have established relationships with bakeries and as qualified bakers are able to offer on-the job tutoring. The 100 per cent course completion rates of the initial learner cohort, as well as the expected completion rates of the current learner cohort – together with positive comments from learners and employers – confirm the effectiveness of the guidance and support.

An example was provided to the evaluation team of one sales rep who offers a monthly voluntary tutoring session for the learners who have queries or issues. Learners are able to attend free of charge in a commercial grade kitchen and under the tutelage of the sales rep. Learners commented that they found these sessions extremely helpful as they are learning in a relaxed environment where they are free to ask questions away from the formal class setting. During the block course sessions, one of the tutors said they provide one-to-one sessions where needed as part of their commitment to ensuring learners are given every opportunity to complete the qualification.

¹² Bakels made it clear to the evaluation team that it does not promote the use of Bakels products on the course, preferring to use a 'scratch principle' where learners use basic ingredients that are commonplace in most kitchens for baking.

All course materials, including a student handbook produced by Bakels, are provided to learners at the commencement of the course. The resources are intended to complement and reinforce the techniques learnt on the job and on the block course. Learners commented that the materials were straightforward and easy to comprehend and were also useful as reference material while at work. An example of this was a simple step-by-step guide developed by the training school administrator for learners on how to read their student learner plans. The guide was developed after a number of enquiries by learners regarding their student plans. With positive feedback received from the learners, the guide is now included with the reference materials provided to learners.

As part of ensuring that teaching standards and consistency are being maintained, the head tutor regularly visits the two tutors in the regions to observe training methods. The visits also enable the head tutor to communicate any strategic and operational changes that have been decided from the main training office. There is genuine mutual respect among these tutors for each other's abilities, experience, and knowledge, which helps support the aim of quality and improvement for the industry. Learners described the support received on the course as helpful and reassuring as they are able to have issues immediately addressed by people who know the industry.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Bakels has a clear vision and purpose of providing quality outcomes through quality training for aspiring bakers and to positively contribute to the baking industry nationally and internationally. New Zealand is the first country covered by the Bakels international group to establish its own training school. According to the NZ Bakels chair, the school is being observed closely by other Bakels subsidiaries throughout the world as to its contribution and success. There is a strong commitment from NZ Bakels to support the training arm and this is exemplified by the parent body absorbing the costs of the training school and the NZ Bakels chair spearheading the training school as its inaugural CEO. The CEO is a trained scientist and brings a wealth of governance and experience to Bakels, having been with the company since 1975. He has served as a technical adviser, sales manager, general manager, and managing director. In addition, he is also a trustee of the Bakels Group Foundation, which is the main international governance body.

Shortly after the establishment of the training school, Bakels identified the need for a dedicated role to oversee the administration of the school. The appointment of the training school administrator has been useful in ensuring Bakels is meeting its obligations as a PTE. In addition, the administrator has the responsibility of checking that learner course assignments are being submitted on time, learner

achievement data is being accurately recorded and monitored, and reports are being submitted in a timely fashion. The training school administrator has become an integral part of the management team of the training school. This position has proved to be worthwhile in providing learners and all stakeholders with a key contact person for Bakels. Learners commented that the administrator was very prompt in replying to their inquiries and was proving to be very helpful in having those enquiries addressed.

Bakels reported that it had participated in a number of NZQA-organised self-assessment seminars with the NZQA sector relationship manager. According to Bakels, these seminars have proved to be very useful to the extent that, although it is a new training organisation, its systems and processes are proving to be helpful for monitoring and reviewing learner progress and programme development. An advisory committee which includes representatives from polytechnic and other tertiary providers has been set up to provide additional advice to Bakels. The Group meets twice a year formally, while some members of the group are consulted throughout the year as required. Meetings are attended by the NZ Bakels Chair, Head Tutor and Training School Administrator.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management, and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.2 Focus area: National Certificates in Baking in Craft, Instore/Franchise, and Plant to level 4

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Recommendations

The following recommendations are being suggested to Bakels to support its development as an emerging educational training provider.

- Bakels will need to invest sufficient time and resources into ensuring all teaching staff and in particular, tutors and sales reps, undertake specific educational training to ensure they are able to meet appropriate teaching standards. This may include the National Certificate in Adult Education and Training, and an assessor course.
- If Bakels is to expand and accept greater numbers of applicants, it will need to consider making the training school administrator position full-time to enable Bakels to cope with and meet the demands of learners and other stakeholders.
- Regarding the sales reps role as mentors and the impact of expansion, Bakels will need to consider the effectiveness of the sales reps having the dual role of sales and mentoring, and whether this can be sustained. At present the roles are being managed, but it would be of benefit to Bakels to assess this situation while the structure of the training school is still in a development stage.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

Self-assessment and external evaluation and review are requirements of programme approval and accreditation (under sections 249 and 250 of the Education Act 1989) for all TEOs that are entitled to apply. The requirements are set through the Criteria for Approval and Accreditation of Programmes established by NZQA under section 253(1)(d) and (e) of the Act and published in the Gazette of 28 July 2011 at page 3207. These policies and criteria are deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under the new section 253.

In addition, for registered private training establishments, the criteria and policies for their registration require self-assessment and external evaluation and review at an organisational level in addition to the individual programmes they own or provide. These criteria and policies are also deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under section 253. Section 233B(1) of the Act requires registered PTEs to comply with these rules.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the EER process approved by the NZQA Board.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process, including the publication Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review, is available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz