

Assessment Schedule – 2016

History: Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders (91436)

Assessment Criteria

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<i>Analyse</i> involves using historical skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate an understanding of historical concepts.	<i>Analyse in depth</i> involves using historical skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate a thorough understanding of historical concepts.	<i>Comprehensively analyse</i> involves using historical skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate an insightful understanding of historical concepts. <i>Insightful</i> includes 'reading between the lines' to draw conclusions that go beyond the immediately obvious, and demonstrating a high degree of engagement with the evidence.

Evidence

Question	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
ONE Cause and Effect	<p>Analyses the evidence by explaining ONE cause and ONE effect using the Introduction, Source A and Source B, referring to both Chinese and Dalmatian migrants in their response.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>TWO causes and TWO effects from one source, referring to either Chinese OR Dalmatian migrants.</p> <p>Interprets the evidence to show an understanding of cause and effect. A4 requires evidence from both Source A and B.</p> <p>Responses may be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> limited and/or be a generalisation created from a superficial examination of the sources. likely to analyse the sources and Chinese and Dalmatians separately. <p>A3 is likely to contain less use of specific and relevant evidence from the sources and contain only cursory explanation.</p> <p>A4 is likely to use some specific and relevant evidence in support of ideas.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <p><i>Source A – Causes</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New Zealanders saw themselves as 'British', and so viewed Chinese migrants as challenging that notion. As work on the goldfields became harder to find, so discrimination increased. 	<p>Evaluates the evidence by explaining in depth TWO or more causes and TWO or more effects, using both sources. (The introduction could provide further evidence.)</p> <p>Analyses and explains possible causes and effects of a historical event with specific and detailed evidence.</p> <p>Candidates can refer to causes and effects as listed for Achievement, but they must develop and expand on them.</p> <p>M5 and M6 responses will likely contain:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Generalisations supported by specific evidence Responses that describe how Chinese and Dalmatians had similar experiences due to being migrants – these candidates will have integrated both sources, although will likely not have identified differences between Chinese and Dalmatians. <p>M6 will have a more developed understanding of the causes and effects of racial discrimination, and use more specific and relevant evidence.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Both groups are resented because they are different – 'foreigners' and because they are able through hard work to extract gold or gum, which is consequently denied 'locals'. Both groups came not to settle, but to exploit particular resources before returning home. Numbers for both groups were never large, but were still able to instil fear and resentment. Responses to both groups involved the use of political power, with a number of Acts being passed. 	<p>Evaluates with discernment the evidence by explaining in depth TWO or more causes and TWO or more effects using both sources in creating an argument about the causes and effects of racial discrimination.</p> <p>Appropriate and relevant evidence from the specified sources is used to support generalisations. Candidate analyses and explains possible causes and effects of the event with specific and detailed evidence showing insight into causal relationships.</p> <p>Ways candidates could expand on the causes / effects is through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstration of an awareness of the causes and effects of racial discrimination against the Chinese and the Dalmatians that are both similar and different. prioritisation: "This cause is the most important because ..." categorisation "the economic effects of discrimination were..." acknowledgement of past and present "the legal discrimination of the early 20th century no longer exists, as acknowledged by the Government's poll tax apology in 2002..." specific acknowledgment of a trend or change over time; that discrimination worsened after the 1860s and didn't begin to improve until 1944 usage of Sources other than the Intro, A and B to support argument application of other relevant historical concepts.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ratio of Chinese women to Chinese men caused many to fear possible sexual activity between 'white' women and Chinese. • Chinese were seen as 'treacherous', and accordingly their presence would not be in the interests of New Zealand. <p><i>Source B – Causes</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As the number of Dalmatians grew, so did the volume of kauri gum, resulting in a decline in its value. • Dalmatians were seen as 'foreigners' whose loyalty lay elsewhere: earnings were sent abroad and not used to help in the building of the local economy. • Dalmatians worked together, enabling them to extract the maximum amount of gum from the ground, so denying 'locals' the opportunity to augment their income over winter. <p><i>Source A – Effects</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Chinese Immigrants Act of 1881 and the resulting poll tax, which was increased substantially by 1896. • The number of Chinese passengers on incoming vessels was restricted. • A number of Anti-Chinese organisations were established. • An English reading test was established. • Permanent residency was denied Chinese from 1926. • Chinese were not eligible for the old-age pension until 1936. <p><i>Source B – Effects</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The formation of the Gumdiggers Union as a way of protecting the interests of locals: lobbying the Government to reduce the number of arrivals from Dalmatia. • The creation of a Commission of Enquiry • The passing of the Kauri Gum Industry Act, which resulted in 200 000 acres of land set aside, land that could be dug/exploited only by 'locals'. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Both groups were the target of inflammatory language personalising the degree of discriminatory practices: 'ignorant', 'treacherous', 'like locusts'. 	<p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion about the desire to create a homogeneous society and the perceived threat posed by these groups; the way that political power is used to limit numbers and/or prosperity of these migrants: the different parliamentary acts that are passed, acts which impact directly on both groups. The use of political power suggesting the degree of fear/mistrust/unease that both groups engendered. Such political actions could well reflect the public support for limiting any possible integration. References to the actions of Lionel Terry and those who supported him in the killing of a Chinese man would support this assertion • Both groups find wealth / money / fortune in the ground: that from the earth come resources which belong to New Zealanders, not these strangers who have no ties to the land – people who are 'foreign'. • The sexual tension and fear of miscegenation that results from the very small number of Chinese women. This same fear is not one that the Dalmatians face. Indeed, Source D2 refers to the relationships formed between Māori and Dalmatians.
--	---	---	---

Question	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<p>TWO</p> <p>Past and Present</p>	<p>Interprets the evidence by explaining differences and/or similarities between the past and the present.</p> <p>Response is limited and/or lacks depth of evidence from the specific sources.</p> <p>Responses are likely to be implicit in contrasting past and present, discussing first the situation in the past, then the present.</p> <p>Responses are likely to treat Chinese and Dalmatian migrants as separate issues in the past and present.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <p>Past:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chinese were limited to living outside in the countryside (the photo suggests the isolation of the goldfield) There were few Dalmatians in NZ in the past represented by the small group of Dalmatians in the photo (and in Source B) Chinese were marginalised in the past Chinese were excluded or isolated. Dalmatians came to NZ to work in the gumfields. <p>Present</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Now there are many Chinese living in 'New Zealand's largest city. Dalmatians are now numbered in many thousands: 'over 100 000 New Zealanders have Croatian (Dalmatian) heritage'. The text in Source C2 suggests families enjoying the displays of Chinese culture. Now Chinese culture is celebrated. In the present Dalmatians are involved in many different areas of the New Zealand economy. 	<p>Evaluates the evidence by explaining in depth differences and/or similarities between the past and the present.</p> <p>Response must include specific reference to the sources indicated in the question.</p> <p>Responses are likely to be explicit in comparing and contrasting aspects of the past and present</p> <p>Responses are likely to discuss past and present views of migrants generally and provide specific examples of Chinese and Dalmatians in support of their argument.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the past Chinese were limited to the goldfields, isolated from European New Zealanders, in contrast today their culture is celebrated in NZ's largest city with the very popular Lantern Festival. The original Dalmatian migrants came to work the gumfields, today descendants of the Dalmatians are involved in many different industries such as wine (Nobilo) and fishing (Talley's). Similarities are noted between both photos – males isolated in a rural setting – and the texts of both sources which suggest a movement away from a particular place into being part of mainstream New Zealand. Numbers have grown significantly: exclusion has been replaced by inclusion – especially for Dalmatians who have a positive role in many aspects of New Zealand society. A process of evaluation: "The most important differences / similarities could be..." Generic comments about a 'lack of change' concerning racism and discrimination should not be accepted unless specifically referencing Source F. 	<p>Evaluates with discernment the evidence by explaining, in depth, differences and/or similarities between the past and the present.</p> <p>Responses must include specific and detailed reference to the sources indicated in the question.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comments that demonstrate a deeper understanding of the change in perception of the groups – Dalmatians were perceived as "locusts" and were resented for paying no taxes, whereas today Dalmatian companies like Nobilo, Talley's and Vela are important companies for NZ's economy. The way in which both Chinese and Dalmatians in the photos are workers confined to a particular spot and lacking economic/social/political power, but in both written sources both groups have grown, not just numerically, but in political power (the former Labour MP quoted in C2, and the reference to the number of MPs of Croatian (Dalmatian) descent), as well as economic (the wine and fishing industries) and social (over 100 000 New Zealanders with Croatian heritage). Dalmatians have been responsible for our wine industry – they have moved from extracting gum from the ground to the growing of grapes, both activities entailing a relationship with the earth/soil/ground. The lack of Chinese women in both C1 and C2: in C2 the Chinese who are commenting on the emergence of Chinese culture as something embraced by Aucklanders are both men. Including reference to Source F, commentary about a lack of change in, or a return to, racial discrimination and prejudice. Reference to 'presentism' - judging past ideas and values by the standards of today. <p>Not only do these visual and verbal texts illustrate the connection between past and present, they also recognise the relationship between the specific and general.</p>

Question	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<p>THREE</p> <p>Reliability and / or usefulness</p>	<p>Assesses the evidence and explains issues of reliability and / or usefulness of one or of both Sources E and F</p> <p>Response is limited and / or lacks depth of evidence from specific sources.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The evidence contained in this source is not very useful because it shows only one view about Chinese in New Zealand. In order to get a balanced view, we would need to know what other views of the Chinese were held by people living in Dunedin. • The evidence in the source is useful because it shows us that anti-Chinese feelings was such a controversial issue that people would attend a public meeting to discuss and vote for action. • A historian would need to be cautious about using this evidence on its own because it comes from a public address. The speakers are clearly using emotive, oratorical language and are playing along to an audience that is clearly supportive of this view. • A historian would question the reliability of Source E because of its clear bias against the Chinese; the speaker and audience are clear in their dislike. • A historian would find Source E useful because the report of the meeting sets out some of the reasons why people were fearful of a Chinese presence in their city or why they were motivated by racism in their desire to exclude Chinese from New Zealand. • The emotive language used limits the reliability of the source. • Cartoons and newspapers usually reflect the wider views of society at the time. 	<p>Evaluates the evidence and explains issues of reliability and / or usefulness of BOTH Sources E and F</p> <p>Responses must include specific reference to the sources indicated in the question.</p> <p>Responses must include reference to sources' usefulness, AND the limitations of the sources.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Source E is useful as it allows us to understand the support for anti-Chinese measures: the reference to the number of people, 'crowded in every part', the anti-Chinese resolution is 'carried unanimously', the speeches are interrupted by noises of approval: "Hear, Hear" applause, laughter. • Source F would be useful because it suggests that many New Zealanders continue to feel that Chinese are not part of mainstream society because of their insistence on retaining their language. • Discussion over the irony of Source F, or its satirical nature. 	<p>Evaluates the evidence with discernment and explains issues of reliability and / or usefulness of Sources E and F</p> <p>Responses must include detailed and specific reference to the sources indicated in the question.</p> <p>Responses that demonstrate a deeper understanding of the context, purpose and nature of the sources are likely to be at E.</p> <p>Response could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The presence of the Mayor and a Member of Parliament allows us to understand how widespread was the existence of prejudice in the community. • The account of events could be argued as being reliable as the people who attended the meeting would be readers of the newspaper, and so any inaccuracies in the reporting would be noticed. • The usefulness of Source F as it brings into question the position of Māori who have been absent from the other sources. Their opinion is voiced in this cartoon – an awareness of the irony of complaints from Pākehā about a perceived unwillingness to speak their language, an opinion which has been lacking in Source E in particular: how Māori felt about Chinese migrants has not been stated. We have been made aware in Source E of the views of those that see themselves as English or British, but such views have been monocultural. • However, Māori have, perhaps, been ready to welcome Dalmatians as Source D2 states that a number of Māori and Dalmatians married. References to how Māori felt about the arrival of these new migrants is lacking from all of the sources. Candidates could argue this lack of a Māori perspective limits the usefulness of the sources – other than Source F. • A comparison could be made with Source C2, which suggests that the views held by the Pākehā couple in Source E are decreasing: the Lantern Festival suggests a willingness on the part of many to enjoy Chinese culture; remarking on the year in which the cartoon was published and the account of the success of the Lantern Festival. • In Source F one point that the cartoonist is making is the willingness of Chinese to retain their culture, and how this is resented by some New Zealanders: this self-imposed exclusion is in contrast to the way in which Chinese were deliberately excluded by some New Zealanders from 19th-century New Zealand as seen in C1 and in E. • Sources E and F are both from the Otago Daily Times, perhaps limiting the usefulness of the sources as they do

			<p>not represent 'New Zealand', and could be confined to Otago.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comments that establish the usefulness and/or reliability of the sources in relation to other historical events such as the Chinese Immigration Act, the Poll Taxes and the Chinese Lantern Festival. • Establishing a relationship between the two sources, such as contrasting the "Hear, hear" comments in each.
--	--	--	--

N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.

N1 = Some relevance to the question or sources, but extremely limited.

N2 = Relevant to the question and sources, but may not have interpreted sources correctly, or cannot explain the historical concepts, may not have cause and effect, or references to past and present, or has not explained a relevant issue related to reliability or usefulness.

Cut Scores

Not Achieved	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
0 – 8	9 – 12	13 – 18	19 – 24