

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

3

91436



914360



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

Tick this box if
there is no writing
in this booklet

Level 3 History 2020

91436 Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders

2.00 p.m. Thursday 19 November 2020
Credits: Four

| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders. | Analyse, in depth, evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders. | Comprehensively analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders. |

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

You should attempt ALL the questions in this booklet.

Pull out Resource Booklet 91436R from the centre of this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–11 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

High Merit

TOTAL

17

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

INSTRUCTIONS

Read ALL the sources in Resource Booklet 91436R before you begin answers in this booklet.

QUESTION ONE: PERSPECTIVES

An important skill for historians is to analyse and explain perspectives.

Using Sources A-D, analyse the various perspectives held on Truby King's character.

There are three types of perspectives on Truby King's character. Sources A-B, acknowledges Truby King's success of how a good person who cares for women's health & babies. Source C, was neutral who first acknowledges ^{King's} ~~Truby~~ good attributes before adding a statement which was a tipping point ~~for~~ of King's good character. Source D, was specifically exposing King's true character, negatively & realistically.

^{an} is a secondary source, who in Source A, this perspective was ~~first~~ ^{an} by ~~Barbara Brookes, in 1990~~. has viewed Truby King as an 'individualist' who didn't need any help to assist with his theories for medical treatments. This source viewed ^{King's} ~~King as~~ ~~an~~ ~~to his career as~~ as a person who understands people's welfare as he focused on the 'hygiene for the body, hygiene for the mind'. From this source it's acknowledging King ^{as a principled person} ~~as a~~ ~~skills and moral plans~~ for who focus not on what the condition of the body and it's problems, but the people's state of mind. Source B, is a primary Source, showing the Seacliff Asylum that's looks very functional ^{environment} ~~and~~ ^{built on} a safe for patients to be in.

Source C, was neutral. An analysis from Erik Olssen is that Truby King is a pioneer, because he helped to "elaborate a 'new religion of health'. This is by King understanding the ^{patients} ~~moments~~ state and improving their way of living ~~and~~ by "reasserting the ~~medical~~ ^{traditional} moral standards and the cults of true motherhood." ~~It is believed King is aware~~

However, it ~~believes~~ ^{argues} that ~~king~~ a king who believes families who aren't living the way or function in a way they should, cannot be treated medically by him without the experts supervising them.

4 It shows ~~Turkey king is a~~ ^{Turkey king is a} conservative person ~~and~~ ^{believes in traditional morals of life.} ~~believes in the way of people living the way they~~

5 Source D, which is a primary source heavily states that king is a terrible person. This is because king was a "huge proponent of eugenics" ~~as~~ ^{had some} ~~had some~~ terrible ideas about women... , and was a massive racist." King was viewed as someone who strongly believes in ways to improve a person's quality of existence and shall follow in order to be a better person genetically. He views women poorly and comes up with crazy ideas he thinks suits best for a woman's welfare.

6 He's viewed as a racist because ~~from the phrases of the Plunkett~~ ^{from the phrases of the Plunkett} ~~the early writings of the Plunkett~~ ^{set} society like "The race marches forward on the feet of little children" and it's viewed by Leimomi Oakes, ~~as~~ ^{that} ~~that~~ that, phrase ~~that~~ ^{means} the ~~white~~ ^[human] race is, continued by the white babies.

Also ~~in~~ in Source D, Oakes ~~believes~~ ^{argued} king believed anyone who was different or defective shouldn't reproduce. This is similar to the perspective ~~that~~ in Source C, that king is a conservative person who prefers the traditional ways ~~for~~ ^{of a} ~~reproducing~~ ^{how a} people/families ~~society~~ should be.

7 Turkey king is only known to be the founder of the Plunkett Society and his success & principled character [Source] shows a person who's defiant to make a change. But ~~his~~ ^{perspectives} from Source C-D, proved that he's ~~changing~~ ^{racist} ~~and a conservative~~ ^{and a} ~~the~~ ^{person}, who's inspired to treat people's health on a plan to create an idealistic

QUESTION TWO: RELIABILITY AND USEFULNESS

An important skill for historians is to analyse the reliability and usefulness of sources.

Using Sources D-F, analyse the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society.

~~Source D is~~ After analysing ~~Source D~~ Turby King is ~~an awful~~ Source D is viewed as an awful. It's a primary source, about Emily Writes, editor of The spinoff website interviewing a textile & fashion historian Leimomi Oakes. This source is useful to identify a perspective from an historian's point of view. ~~This Source D~~ This is useful to understand the historian's argument by exposing Turby King with her own research.

Like referencing the Early Plunket Society writings to point out King is racist. Or like "Papers Past" a ~~pre-1940s NZ newspapers~~ "pre-1940s NZ newspapers" to support her points. Her ~~finding~~

However, Source D has its limitations. This is because the information in this source has strong emotive language like "huge proponent", "massive racist" or "terrible ideas". This doesn't make the source reliable to be factual. ~~Also~~ It's

opinionated and the historian in ~~the~~ Source D is biased with her statements. ~~However~~ ^{Though} She may be an historian, but how we know her ~~for~~ ^{do} points are true. We don't know the other side of ~~the~~ who Turby King really is. Also

Source D is not known as a government website & the article has been published in the present time in 2019.

Therefore, ~~Source D~~ ^{Source} D may be useful to evaluate views of what the present thinks of Turby King. ~~But Source D does not acknowledge from Source D is that~~ ^{But Source D}

But Source D, could be reliable in a way as it's points of racism could be linked ~~by~~ with Source E. This source is a secondary source that holds primary evidence

4 from a government website, ~~where~~ This could be useful ~~to~~ evidence, to ~~get~~ get a view of the past. Source E has a paragraph underneath a photograph, who ^{also} ~~is~~ believes that Turby King is a strong believer ^{in eugenics} like what Source D pointed out. And the effect of King's success was to breed a 'Imperial ^{white} race', which in Source D referred to as the ~~white~~, 'European race'. Therefore, Source ~~D~~ is quite reliable ~~to~~ to understand that King is racist and only wants to ^{white} ~~create~~ women to breed for the benefit of building a dominant and superior society. Source E, is useful ~~to~~ because of the photograph which only shows white women ~~and~~ holding white babies. This useful primary evidence to rule out the fact Turby King wants ^{the} a white race to grow superiorly and also, ^{Source E is} ~~relevantly~~ reliable be the photograph was at the time of ~~the~~ King's time.

3 ~~Source D & E are~~ Source D & E are useful to see the purpose of King's ~~the~~ medical centres. ~~They~~ It's because of his strong belief to ~~be~~ exclude "people and groups judged to be inferior, and promote those judged to be superior" [Introduction]. to create a white society. The effect on NZ Society is that he's practically erasing other races in NZ, ~~more like the Maori, islanders, Asians & those who are~~ ^{so} ~~more~~ for only white babies to grow. He's an advocate ~~to~~ which today the effect of that plan, the European population is high in NZ. //

QUESTION THREE: PAST AND PRESENT

An important skill for historians is to analyse the relationship between past and present.

Using Sources G-K, analyse the various ways in which Truby King has been remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere.

In the past ~~was~~ Truby King was honoured ^{physically} by the people of New Zealand and other countries, ~~national organisation, Plunket Society, that is found in~~ ~~Source G-I~~. The physical honours of King are found in Source G-I.

Source G, King was honoured with a NZ stamp, 1957. ~~This is~~ ~~honour of him~~ for his face to ^{be} scattered around in NZ to remember his help to ~~the~~ the people of NZ.

Source H, a ~~red~~ 'pink-red Floribunda rose' that'll multiply ~~in the~~ around the Plunket Society is named after Truby King. This rose ~~is~~ ~~intro~~ given in 1966 is a comparison to Truby King. ~~Since~~ This is because the rose is named after King who helped women & children. The rose will multiply in the Plunket Society in his honour.

Source I; has honoured King with a 1.9 hectare Garden in Wellington ¹⁹⁴³ ~~These have~~ ~~been many~~ Similar Plunket Societies have been created in England, Australia, South Africa and Canada. ~~The~~ King's influenced many countries ^{to} ~~improve~~ improve the 'health of children and mentally ill'. Therefore, more Plunket Societies are created world wide.

2

In the present, Turby King is honoured with ^{the local} media coverage like in Source J, by Alex Campbell from BBC News in 2013, as he quotes "Turby King is undoubtedly best known as an early champion of enforcement parenting with its emphasis on discipline and detachment". Campbell is reminding the present socially in NZ ~~& possibly to the world~~, who Turby King was and his purpose in NZ.

past

Another ~~present~~ ^{international} honour of Turby King is also through media coverage as ~~one~~ George Bernard Shaw, who was an Irish playwright and a prominent British socialist. Acknowledged Turby ~~King~~ and his success to viewers out of NZ. ~~He~~ As mentioned in Source I, the planket Society was also found in ~~England~~ ^{other countries} ~~like so that's~~ and ~~the England~~ ^{Shaw} may've encountered King's facilities which encouraged him to say in public that, "Turby King was the greatest man in New Zealand, and should have the most imposing monument New Zealand can build to commemorate him", he commented on his show in 1934.

3

And Turby King did get most imposing monuments in NZ ~~like the ones in Source G, I, & J.~~ ~~in NZ like the ones in Source G, I, & J.~~ ~~in NZ like the ones in Source G, I, & J.~~

4

And Turby King did get most imposing monuments in NZ, after 1934, through the honour found in Source I, G. J. //

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Merit Exemplar 2020

| Subject | L3 History | | Standard | 91436 | Total score | 17 |
|---------|-------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-------|-------------|----|
| Q | Grade score | Annotation | | | | |
| 1 | M6 | <p>The candidate provides multiple examples of perspectives on King's character in points (1), (3), and (5). The analysis of the perspectives moves past a 'good / bad' comparison by offering accurate comments such as "individualist" in point (1), "principled" in point (2), "conservative" in point (4), and the issues surrounding King's "racist" attitudes in point (6).</p> <p>The comments in point (7) contrasting perspectives nearly reach an Excellence level, but an examination of the holders of the perspectives or the target audiences of the sources is required to achieve an Excellence grade.</p> | | | | |
| 2 | M6 | <p>The candidate examines the usefulness and reliability of the sources in depth. In points (1) through (5), the candidate provides good examples of Merit level responses by clearly identifying the issues of 'reliability' and 'usefulness' and using evidence from the sources to support their explanation. Point (3) is strong in that it identifies limitations of the Source D. However, explaining some valid steps that a historian might take to address the limitations of Source D is required to achieve an Excellence grade.</p> | | | | |
| 3 | M5 | <p>The candidate differentiates the past memorialisation of King as "physical" in points (1) and (2) and the present memorialisation of King as "media coverage" in point (3). However, clearly explaining the concept of 'past' and 'present' and how the sources demonstrate this concept is required to achieve a higher grade, e.g. in point (2), the candidate could have noted that the report comes from the BBC demonstrating King's appeal and influence outside New Zealand and across the former British Empire.</p> <p>There is over quotation from the sources, but the final sentence of the response demonstrates some insight in identifying Shaw's desire for "imposing monuments" to King was actually fulfilled. However, this does not analyse Shaw's bias and, while insightful, more comment like this is required to achieve an Excellence grade.</p> | | | | |