

Assessment Schedule – 2020**History: Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders (91436)****Assessment Criteria**

| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|--|---|---|
| <i>Analyse</i> involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate understanding of historical concepts. | <i>Analyse, in depth</i> , involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate thorough understanding of historical concepts. | <i>Comprehensively analyse</i> involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate understanding of historical concepts, showing insight. |

Cut Scores

| Not Achieved | Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|---------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 0 – 8 | 9 – 12 | 13 – 18 | 19 – 24 |

Evidence**Question One: Perspectives**

The candidate analyses the various perspectives held on Truby King's character, using Sources A–D.

| A3 | A4 | M5 | M6 | E7 | E8 |
|---|--|--|---|---|---|
| Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and explains the various perspectives held on Truby King's character (explanation may be limited). | Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and explains the various perspectives held on Truby King's character. | Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and analyses the various perspectives held on Truby King's character. | Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and analyses, in depth, the various perspectives held on Truby King's character. | Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and analyses, with some insight, the various perspectives held on Truby King's character. | Assesses Sources A–D and identifies and analyses, with insight, the various perspectives held on Truby King's character. |
| Includes some reference to Sources A–D and attempts to explain the perspectives by placing them in the correct context (depth of evidence from sources may be limited). | Includes reference to Sources A–D and attempts to explain the perspectives by placing them in the correct context. | Includes some specific reference to Sources A–D and explains the perspectives by accurately placing them in context. | Includes specific reference to Sources A–D and fully explains the perspectives by accurately placing them in context (may attempt to categorise, group, or otherwise define the perspectives in ways other than "negative" and "positive"). | Includes some comprehensive reference to Sources A–D by selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations. | Includes comprehensive reference to Sources A–D by discerningly selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations. |
| | | | | Comments on the limitations / bias / validity of the perspective. | Comments on the limitations / bias / validity of the perspective. |
| <p>N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.</p> <p>N1 = Some relevant evidence, but extremely limited.</p> <p>N2 = Relevant evidence but may not have interpreted the sources correctly; or may not have the perspectives correct; or shows insufficient depth of analysis for Level 3.</p> | | | | | |

Sample Evidence

| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|---|--|--|
| <p><i>Assessment of the evidence, identification and explanation could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source A (Truby King notes)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • King was an individualist. • King was a leader. • King operated Seacliff like a fiefdom, therefore he acted like an old-fashioned “boss”. • King did improve the patients’ lives. <p><u>Source B (Seacliff Asylum)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shows that King was in control of a large building. <p><u>Source C (Prescriptive ideology)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Notes that Olssen believes that King was important in creating authority. • Very influential man. <p><u>Source D (Plunket’s founder)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negative view of King. • Had views on eugenics and was a racist. <p><i>(A candidate may note that Sources A and C are generally positive, while Source D is negative.)</i></p> | <p><i>Assessment of the evidence, identification and in-depth analysis could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source A (Truby King notes)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Possible bias in some views. • Brookes thinks he was “bossy” (or words to that effect). • “Personal fiefdom”, i.e. set up his own empire. <p><u>Source B (Seacliff Asylum)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shows that Seacliff was an old design, yet King introduced new ideas. <p><u>Source C (Prescriptive ideology)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Picks up the idea of King being the “boss”. • Believed women needed training. • Believed that New Zealand families needed his help. <p><u>Source D (Plunket’s founder)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Largely negative view, but the author acknowledges King for some work with Plunket. <p><i>(A candidate may note that Sources A and C are generally positive, while Source D is negative. Source D is written from the view of someone who is not a historian.)</i></p> | <p><i>Assessment of the evidence, identification and insightful analysis could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source A (Truby King notes)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Professor Brookes’ views have the benefit of historical research, i.e. being a Professor of History, she would have access to many documents on King. <p><u>Source B (Seacliff Asylum)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Builds upon the idea of King operating Seacliff like a lord. <p><u>Source C (Prescriptive ideology)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Links to idea of fiefdom in Source A through “... his subordination of medical science to traditional morality ...”. • Believes King was a perceptive man / innovator, e.g. against ideas such as superstition. <p><u>Source D (Plunket’s founder)</u></p> <p><i>Perspectives</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Largely negative view, i.e. “grim”. • Links to idea of eugenics being “heavily, heavily reflected in the early Plunket society policies”. <p><i>(A candidate may note that Sources A and C are generally positive, while Source D is negative. They may also note Sources A and C are from academic historians who have researched extensively, and / or Source D is from a modern, female perspective.</i></p> <p><i>A perceptive candidate may note views of people change over time because of the results of further research.)</i></p> |

Evidence**Question Two: Reliability and usefulness**

The candidate analyses the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of Sources D–F to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society.

| A3 | A4 | M5 | M6 | E7 | E8 |
|--|---|---|---|---|---|
| Examines Sources D–F and explains the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. | Examines Sources D–F and explains the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. | Evaluates Sources D–F and analyses the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. | Evaluates Sources D–F and analyses, in depth, the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. | Evaluates Sources D–F, and analyses, the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. | Evaluates Sources D–F, and insightfully analyses, the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society. |
| Includes some reference to Sources D–F and attempts to explain the historical concept of reliability and usefulness (may be limited). | Includes reference to Sources D–F and attempts to explain the historical concept of reliability and usefulness. | Includes some specific reference to Sources D–F and explains the historical concept of reliability and usefulness, with at least two examples of the “reliability-usefulness” relationship. | Includes specific reference to Sources D–F and explains the historical concept of reliability and usefulness. | Includes some comprehensive reference to Sources D–F, by selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations about the historical concept of reliability and usefulness. | Includes comprehensive reference to Sources D–F, by discerningly selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations about the historical concept of reliability and usefulness. |
| <p>N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.</p> <p>N1 = Some relevant evidence, but extremely limited.</p> <p>N2 = Relevant evidence but may not have interpreted the sources correctly or may not have made valid comments on their reliability or usefulness; may have ignored the specifics of the question such as “his effect upon New Zealand society”; or shows insufficient depth of analysis for Level 3.</p> | | | | | |

Sample Evidence

| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|--|--|--|
| <p><i>Examination and explanation</i> could include, but is not limited to:</p> <p>Source D (Plunket's founder)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A website, therefore questionable reliability as a source, and should be treated with caution. • May note that Leimomi Oakes is a textile and fashion historian, therefore health reform is not her area of expertise. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Offers some insight into King and his views, e.g. eugenics. <p>Source E (Karitane nurses)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reliable as from a New Zealand history site. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A narrative, i.e. a basic introduction to the views of King. <p>Source F (Infant mortality)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Highly reliable as the graph comes from a government website. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Highly useful as the graph provides data on how Plunket led to a decline in infant mortality. | <p><i>Evaluation and in-depth explanation</i> could include, but is not limited to:</p> <p>Source D (Plunket's founder)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A magazine website with the intent of providing sensationalist reading for the general public, e.g. "awful", "obsessed", "dark past", "despicable views". • Somewhat reliable as Leimomi Oakes has done some research, but there is little indication of what that research involved (apart from past newspapers). • Would need to cross-check the information to check if it is accurate. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Offers a modern viewpoint of King and his views that may have been widely held by others during King's lifetime. <p>Source E (Karitane nurses)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very reliable as many teachers and students use the site. • A government-based site, therefore it would have been checked for inaccuracies. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shows the dress and maternal attitude of the time. • Shows King's positive and negative contributions / view, e.g. Plunket as a positive, eugenic as a negative. <p>Source F (Infant mortality)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reliable as it comes from Stats NZ, i.e. from the <i>New Zealand Official Yearbook</i>. • Data could be inaccurate due to the time period it was collected. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Useful as the data indicates that most of the decline in mortality was for infants under 12 months old. • Shows a downward trend for New Zealand infant mortality, especially from 1907 onward (when Plunket was founded). | <p><i>Evaluation and insightful analysis</i> could include, but is not limited to:</p> <p>Source D (Plunket's founder)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Emily Writes (the author) could be perceived as showing bias, i.e. a negative view of King that ignores his other achievements, e.g. "I've never much admired him for inflicting on generations of parents the idea that showing affection to your babies was coddling". • Leimomi Oakes does not present "peer-reviewed" academic research but has published her findings on her blog, i.e. it is for general interest only. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Several sensationalist claims are made without supporting evidence, e.g. "massive racist", "terrible ideas about women". • More academic, detailed research would need to be undertaken to verify the claims made. <p>Source E (Karitane nurses)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Highly reliable. • A historian would check other sources, especially first-hand accounts. • Primary accounts preferable. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited usefulness as little insight offered into King or his motives. <p>Source F (Infant mortality)</p> <p><i>Reliability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reliable, but other factors may be involved rather than just Plunket, e.g. higher living standards, improved hygiene. • Questionable reliability because some infant deaths around this time may not have been counted due to the isolation of some towns and / or a lack of access to medical care. <p><i>Usefulness</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Could be more useful if it offered some information on race / gender. • Plunket and King have had an effect, but it is difficult to assess the importance of other factors such as the Great War, or the Great Depression. |

Evidence**Question Three: Past and present**

The candidate analyses the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere, using **Sources G–K**.

| A3 | A4 | M5 | M6 | E7 | E8 |
|---|--|---|---|--|--|
| Interprets Sources G–K by analysing the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. | Interprets Sources G–K by analysing the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. | Assesses Sources G–K and analyses the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. | Assesses Sources G–K and analyses, in depth, the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. | Assesses Sources G–K by analysing, with some insight, the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. | Assesses Sources G–K by analysing, with insight, the various ways in which Truby King is remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere. |
| Includes some reference to Sources G–K and attempts to explain the historical concept of past and present (may be limited). | Includes reference to Sources G–K and attempts to explain the historical concept of past and present. | Includes some specific reference to Sources G–K and explains the historical concept of past and present, with at least two examples of the “past-present” relationship. | Includes specific reference to Sources G–K and explains the historical concept of past and present. | Includes some comprehensive reference to Sources G–K by selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations about the historical concept of past and present. | Includes comprehensive reference to Sources G–K by discerningly selecting the most relevant information and examples to support perceptive generalisations about the historical concept of past and present. |

N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.

N1 = Some relevant evidence, but extremely limited.

N2 = Relevant evidence but may not have interpreted sources correctly; or may not have the past and present historical concept correct; or shows insufficient depth of analysis for Level 3.

Sample Evidence

| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
|---|--|--|
| <p><i>Assessment of the evidence and explanation could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source G (Stamp)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> King is remembered on a New Zealand stamp – this is an honour few have. Positive view of King. <p><u>Source H (Rose)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The rose named in King's honour shows he was idolised by some. <p><u>Source I (Truby King Park)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> King has gardens / a park named after him in Wellington, therefore is remembered fondly by the public. <p><u>Source J (Childcare gurus)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> BBC article that references King as a key figure in parenting worldwide. <p><u>Source K (Bernard Shaw quote)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> King does have a monument built to commemorate him. | <p><i>Evaluation of the evidence and in-depth explanation could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source G (Stamp)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shows that King was honoured for his contribution to Plunket. It is the 50th anniversary stamp therefore King's effect has been long-lasting. <p><u>Source H (Rose)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Few have gardens / parks / flowers named after them (these all add to King's prestige). Honour people in various ways, e.g. statues, but clearly Truby King was held in high regard by some. <p><u>Source I (Truby King Park)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gardens are in Wellington, yet they honour King's work worldwide with Plunket. <p><u>Source J (Childcare gurus)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> References King as a key person in parenting worldwide. Highlights King in a very positive fashion. Mentions King was knighted – few New Zealanders receive this honour. King is described as being "among the people who have had the biggest impact on parenting over the past 100 years". <p><u>Source K (Bernard Shaw quote)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A very favourable view of King written at the time by a highly regarded celebrity. | <p><i>Discerning evaluation of the evidence and explanation could include, but is not limited to:</i></p> <p><u>Source G (Stamp)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Very few honoured with a stamp, let alone for a 50th anniversary. <p><u>Source H (Rose)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A rose being named in honour of King and the royalties from the sale of each bush going to the Plunket Society, indicate there was an expectation at that time that people would buy the rose bushes to remember King in a positive way. <p><u>Source I (Truby King Park)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uses language that is very positive about King, e.g. refuge, mausoleum. King co-founded Plunket in other Commonwealth countries, i.e. his work was significant in many countries. <p><u>Source J (Childcare gurus)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Named as a "guru", suggesting King was held in very high esteem by his colleagues. BBC News is a highly regarded source, therefore King is held in a positive light, especially in the United Kingdom. <p><u>Source K (Bernard Shaw quote)</u> <i>Past and Present</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Being honoured in an exhibition is a great achievement (may be linked to sources that also remember King in a positive fashion). <p><i>(A candidate may note the cumulative effect of these sources. The fact King is honoured in stamps, in parks, and in sources from overseas shows his impact has been long-lasting and he has had a positive effect on many Commonwealth countries, However, while Truby King is fondly remembered in various ways, this is now questioned and there is a need to consult other sources to gain a more balanced view.)</i></p> |