

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

3

91436



914360



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

Tick this box if
there is no writing
in this booklet

Level 3 History 2020

91436 Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders

2.00 p.m. Thursday 19 November 2020
Credits: Four

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Analyse, in depth, evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Comprehensively analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

You should attempt ALL the questions in this booklet.

Pull out Resource Booklet 91436R from the centre of this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–11 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

High Achievement

TOTAL

12

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

INSTRUCTIONS

Read ALL the sources in Resource Booklet 91436R before you in this booklet.

QUESTION ONE: PERSPECTIVES/

An important skill for historians is to analyse and explain perspectives.

Using Sources A-D, analyse the various perspectives held on Truby King's character.

As described in the resources introduction, Truby King is a significant figure in New Zealand's history. As his actions & choices were watched by many members of the public, this brought multiple perspectives on his character. Some have been positive (source B & A) and others more negative (source D). //

One positive perspective can be seen in source B. This photograph is a primary piece of evidence which shows Truby King's 'Seacliff Mental asylum'. Although this source does not give a lot of written detail, it still shows ~~to~~ one of his many accomplishments. This shows him in a positive view because the main buildings & large grounds show people the safe & large environment for the patients. The public may believe that what King is doing is positive therefore a positive perspective is made. There are limitations to the photograph as it may not be the Seacliff Asylum since it was retrieved //

from google & not a book or printed photograph

2 ~~from~~ ~~Or~~ another / different perspective, ~~we understand~~ negative. On the other hand, source D shows us a more negative perspective compared to source B. Source D is a primary interview with a historian named Leimomi Oakes. Her perspective about ~~Toby~~^{Truby} King is based around the fact he was "a huge proponent of eugenics, had terrible ideas about women... and was a massive racist". Her perspective is believes that the idea of improving babies and mother's hygiene & health is a really loving idea but people miss what goes on behind the ~~scenes~~^{scences}. For example, after ~~reaser~~ researching about ~~Toby~~^{Truby} King, she learnt that he would turn away anyone who was different or defective. This gave Oakes a negative perspective on King's character. Her perspective may be influenced by being a women therefore she understands how these events are unfair to other women.

Between source B & D, there ^{is an} ~~are~~ obvious difference in perspective. Source B shows a positive / outcome by ~~Toby~~^{Truby} King whereas source D shows the negative side to King's actions & opinions. There is also a difference in the sources themselves.

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION
NUMBER

ASSESS:
USE ON

1 Both source B & D are primary sources but source D gives more background about ^{Truby} ~~Truby~~ King meaning it gives people a better understanding and a stronger perspective. Source B only gives a small amount of information therefore a weaker perspective is given. //

3 1 Overall, Truby King's character caused a various amount of different perspectives. Some being positive over his achievements and more negative & perspectives on his opinions and actions. //

QUESTION TWO: RELIABILITY AND USEFULNESS

ASSESSOR
USE ONLY

An important skill for historians is to analyse the reliability and usefulness of sources.

Using Sources D-F, analyse the reliability and usefulness of at least TWO of these sources to a historian studying Truby King and his effect on New Zealand society.

If a historian were to study about Truby King, there are many sources available to use.

However some resources are reliable & useful whereas others are not and may be false.

For example ~~historians~~ resources written by historians are both reliable & useful. Some found on random websites are more likely to be untrustworthy or have fake information.

If a historian came across source D in the resource booklet, they would be able to use the information given more effectively. In source D, an editor from the spinoff website

(Emily Writes) interviews a historian named Leimomi Oakes. ~~Oakes has researched into~~

~~Truby King is very informative. As this source provides a lot of information, a historian~~

~~would know that most of it would be thoroughly researched & checked in order~~

~~to know if it were factual or fake.~~ Source D goes into detail about Truby King's effect on

New Zealand's society by including information

suggesting "his terrible ideas about women" and how he was racist and had eugenic

views" influenced the Plunket Society policies therefore influencing the wider society.

3 Information like this is reliable since it was found and talked about by a historian. Therefore, she would have researched ~~these~~ this information from other sources. It is also useful because it allows those interested in learning, a better understanding of Truby King's effect on society and how he influenced New Zealand's history. It is also useful since a lot of information is given within this source. (source D)//

4 On another - hand, a historian may come across questionable resources such as source E: Karitane nurses and babies, 1928. This source does include a primary piece of evidence, a photograph of the nurses & babies from Karitane Hospital in Whanganui. This shows us ^{another} Truby King's movement and contribution to New Zealand's society. This ~~is~~ can be useful for a historian looking into King's effect on society as it is visual evidence. However there is limited amount of information given therefore, some information may be false surrounding this image. Since this information is taken from a website and is not written by a historian this means it may not be reliable. There is a chance that the information is made up or only partially correct. This source is unreliable and not very useful for a historian//

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION
NUMBER

2 Between source D & source E, a historian should use source D. Between these two sources, source D gives more information and can be more useful than the small amount given in source E. It is more likely to be easier to understand the information given in source D than source E. Although source E is a primary piece of evidence, it is less reliable than source D because it is on a random website and not talked about by a historian. Source D is an interview //

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLYQUESTION
NUMBER

with a historian therefore the information included should be factual and more reliable than source E. Source D helps historians and those interested in Truby King, to have a better understanding of his achievements and actions have effected New Zealand's society //

2 Overall historians may come across multiple sources when looking into Truby King's effect on New Zealand's society. Some may be reliable & useful like source D or be more questionable and unreliable like source E. Either way there is a lot of information out there that can be used. //

QUESTION THREE: PAST AND PRESENT

ASSESSOR
USE ONLY

An important skill for historians is to analyse the relationship between past and present.

Using **Sources G-K**, analyse the various ways in which Truby King has been remembered in New Zealand and elsewhere.

HOW & WHY

Over some time since ~~Truby~~ ^{Truby} King became a significant figure in New Zealand's history, there have been many ways to remember him & his achievements. For example, a rose was named after him, he became the face of a stamp & how his house & garden became a popular sight to see. //

~~Truby~~ ^{Truby} King was and still is remembered for his contribution to "reducing infant mortality and had the biggest impact on parenting over the past 100 years" (source J). One of the ways that he is remembered is by "A pinky-red floribunda rose propagated by an amateur grower" which was named the "Truby King rose". (source H). This was an action which took place in 1966 but has continued on to present time, in New Zealand. //

Another way he has been remembered in New Zealand was when his portrait was used on the Plunket society stamp in 1957 celebrating their 50th anniversary (source A). As seen in source A, this stamp would have been used during that year. //

2

It is however unclear ~~the~~ ^{wheather} ~~weather~~ the stamp is still used in present time or has been kept to celebrate ^{Truby} ~~Turby~~ King in present time in New Zealand.

Truby's

On a more wider scale, ~~Turbys~~ ^{Truby's} achievements had stretched to "England, Australia, South Africa, India and ~~Ganda~~ Canada" where he founded similar projects & societies. For this, his house and garden became a popular land mark in Wellington's ~~at~~ Melrose hills ~~along the~~ People from New Zealand & other countries ~~ex~~ were and are still able to visit this historic piece of land where Truby King & his beloved wife now rest in an on-site mausoleum.

As a result he is remembered by those who visit his hidden house and garden. (source 1)

This allows those in today's society to learn

~~Lastly, in~~ his history and see a beautiful piece of land from New Zealand's history.

Lastly, in 1925 Fredric Truby King was knighted "for his contribution to society.

This was more of a personal achievement

for him but it was a way for those in

1925 to celebrate & remember his achievements

as being a huge impact on parenting.

3

Although this was celebrated in the past,

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESS
USE OFQUESTION
NUMBER

3 ... it may still be remembered in today's society as another piece of New Zealand's history. As ^{he was a} New Zealand citizen, this is still significant today as we remember his impact and influence as being knighted.

3 In conclusion, ~~he~~ there have been many big and small ways to remember Truby King. ~~From having his name being~~ From having a flower named after him to his house being a popular site for the public to visit. He ~~has~~ is still remembered in present time and was remembered in his past. //

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Achievement Exemplar 2020

Subject	L3 History	Standard	91436	Total score	12
Q	Grade score	Annotation			
1	A4	<p>The candidate clearly identifies two different perspectives on Truby King's character in (1) and (2). However, the explanation of these perspectives is limited and does not go much further than 'positive' and 'negative'.</p> <p>The candidate ignores Source A and there are several simplistic comments about the nature and content of the sources.</p> <p>Commenting accurately on Source A or providing further explanation of the sources that placed them in context is required to achieve a Merit grade. The conclusion provided at (3) is a good start but requires expanding with more evidence and context to achieve a Merit grade.</p>			
2	A4	<p>The candidate provides multiple examples of the usefulness and reliability of the sources, although these comments could not be considered 'in-depth'.</p> <p>(1) through (5) are all valid comments providing evidence that the candidate meets Achievement level. However, there is insufficient depth in each of these comments, e.g. (3) identifies that Oakes is a historian (adding to her reliability), but the candidate does not go on to identify the limitations of her experience or field of research, which is required to achieve a Merit grade.</p> <p>In (4), the candidate provides some simple reasons why this source could be useful, but the comments in (5) are simplistic and not supported by evidence. (6) is an attempt at making a judgement on the relative usefulness of the evidence, which when done well could provide evidence for Excellence, but in this case the candidate has provided a simplistic summary, with no supporting evidence or examples. (7) is an example of a typical summary comment. In this case, it is largely repetitive and adds little to the response.</p>			
3	A4	<p>The candidate demonstrates an understanding of the 'past' and 'present' concept. This is a strong response that nearly meets the Merit level requirements. Expanding on the explanations offered at (1) and (3), and the assumption provided at (2), is required to achieve a Merit grade.</p> <p>The candidate addresses multiple sources and attempts to explain the 'past' and 'present' concept that each source might demonstrate. Recognising the differences between the way King is remembered in New Zealand compared to around the world is required to achieve a Merit grade.</p>			