

Report of External Evaluation and Review

Renard Group Limited
trading as Spear Hospitality/Career
Café/Artisan Consulting

Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 18 February 2016

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	5
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	6
Summary of Results	7
Findings	9
Recommendations	16
Appendix	17

MoE Number: 7133
NZQA Reference: C18845
Date of EER visit: 25 and 26 June 2015

Final Report

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	Renard Group Limited trading as Spear Hospitality/Career Café/Artisan Consulting
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
First registered:	30 August 2012
Location:	Level 1, Spartik House, 6-8 Edward Wayte Place, Grafton, Auckland.
Delivery sites:	As above. Training also occurs at employers' venues and hired premises on an as-needs basis.
Courses currently delivered:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management (Level 5)• National Certificate in Business (First Line Management) (Level 3)• Skills for Industry (Ministry of Social Development)• A number of short, non-unit standard courses delivered on an as-needs basis
Code of Practice signatory:	No
Number of students:	Domestic: 262
Number of staff:	Eight full-time staff
Scope of active accreditation:	Training Scheme – Leadership and Communication Programme (Level 4)
Distinctive characteristics:	Renard Group PTE is made up of three divisions: Spear Hospitality, Career Café and Artisan

Final Report

Consulting. Each division has different programmes, funding streams and student profiles.

Spear Hospitality is not currently active and is not undertaking delivery of training or programmes.

Through a contract with Ministry of Social Development (MSD), Career Café provides a 12-week programme, Skills for Industry, which includes four weeks pre-employment training and eight weeks job-seeking. Clients referred to Career Café by Work and Income New Zealand (WINZ) are looking to move from dependence on a Government benefit into employment.

Artisan Consulting delivers programmes under a subcontracting arrangement with industry training organisations (ITOs), delivering and assessing industry-specific programmes on the ITOs' behalf. Programmes are delivered through workshops and on-job training. Students are employed within industry.

Currently, Artisan Consulting delivers two unit-standard based programmes. On behalf of the Motor Industry Training Organisation (MITO), it delivers the National Certificate in Business (First Line Management) (Level 3) and, for ServiceIQ, the National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management (Level 5). Both ITOs also hold the accreditation and consent to assess the programmes. Both ITOs have approved Artisan Consulting to deliver and assess – using ITO-registered assessors – the programmes the ITOs monitor.

Recent significant changes: Renard Group Limited was registered as a PTE in 2012, and a change of ownership occurred in 2013 with the current director becoming the sole owner. This is Renard Group Limited's first external evaluation and review (EER).

Previous quality assurance history: Artisan Consulting participates in external moderation undertaken by MITO and ServiceIQ as required. Since registration as a PTE, no external moderation of assessor judgements has been undertaken by the ITOs.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

Following the receipt of Renard Group's self-assessment information, a scoping meeting was held by phone on 29 April 2015. Meeting participants included the lead evaluator and managing director.

The focus areas agreed include:

- Governance, management and strategy

This is a mandatory focus area.

- National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management (Level 5)

Delivered by Artisan Consulting on behalf of ServicelQ, this two-year programme with rolling enrolments contains within it Renard Group's training scheme, Leadership and Communication Programme (Level 4). Programme delivery is by workshops and on-job learning. All students are employed in the hospitality industry. This is the highest-level programme delivered by Renard Group. Artisan Consulting is responsible to ServicelQ for all aspects of this programme.

- Skills for Industry

This pre-employment programme, contracted and funded by MSD, is delivered by Career Café and has the largest number of clients across the Renard Group. The programme is 12 weeks long, comprising four weeks of workshops and eight weeks of job-seeking.

The only other programme offered and not selected as a focus area is the National Certificate in Business (First Line Management) (Level 3). Artisan Consulting delivers this programme using MITO teaching and assessing materials. Selection of the National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management provided a better option to evaluate the capability and capacity of Artisan Consulting and governance of Renard Group Limited.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

The EER of Renard Group took place with a team of two evaluators over two days. The EER included interviews with the managing director, national training manager, programme managers and tutor. Clients of the Skills for Industry programme were also interviewed. Stakeholders, including ServiceIQ, employers of learners of both focus areas, National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management students and the chief executive of Hospitality New Zealand were interviewed by phone.

A range of documentation was reviewed, including achievement data, reports to MSD, MITO and ServiceIQ, external moderation results, internal moderation review, and a strategic plan. A range of feedback, both raw data and collated, was also reviewed.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **Renard Group Limited trading as Spear Hospitality/Career Café/Artisan Consulting**.

Key reasons for this are:

- Career Café exceeded the MSD-contracted requirement to place and sustain 70 per cent of clients into employment for 2010-2014. This result has been consistently achieved over the nine years of delivery of pre-employment programmes. The annual increase in the number of clients allocated by MSD, and the hospitality skills and knowledge clients gain which are directly leading them into employment, indicate and support the success of these outcomes.
- Artisan Consulting is the only provider approved by ServiceIQ to deliver the ITO's programme, National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management (NDH). ServiceIQ and industry stakeholders are highly satisfied with the progress of the students and their outcomes, namely developing skills and knowledge to prepare employees to move into leadership roles in the hospitality industry.
- Programmes offered by Career Café and Artisan Consulting are highly relevant and contextualised to the hospitality industry. All staff have current engagement with key stakeholders locally, while the managing director has extensive networks nationally. This knowledge and understanding provides an exemplary basis on which industry needs are understood and programmes are designed and delivered.
- Stakeholders recognise the training as authentic; the acquired skills and knowledge of clients and students support specific employer and industry needs.
- Teaching and support of clients and students is provided by qualified and industry-experienced staff. Engagement of tutors and programme leaders with clients and students is clearly effective across the PTE's mixed modes of delivery.
- Renard Group is clearly and decisively led by the managing director, who anticipates and responds to changes within the hospitality industry, funding organisations and the political arena. Resulting changes are well considered and planned for. The PTE is agile and flexible as it responds to external influences while remaining focused on and operating within the parameters of its expertise.

The most important needs of stakeholders are being met. These include clients looking for employment, students wanting to progress within the industry, and the hospitality industry requiring a skilled and knowledgeable workforce. These groups are having their needs well met through the delivery of relevant programmes with authentic activities and practical on-job components resulting in positive outcomes in the form of employment and a skilled workforce. Improving some existing self-assessment activities that review outcomes, and improving some processes and practices would provide Renard Group with stronger evidence to support a higher rating in the overall educational performance of the organisation.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Renard Group Limited trading as Spear Hospitality/Career Café/Artisan Consulting**.

Renard Group and its two operating divisions, Career Café and Artisan Consulting, have clear and effective processes and practices to guide the delivery of training and to monitor outcomes. All processes are occurring reliably and systematically. Renard Group is clearly making changes to programme content, delivery and teaching as a result of review. The effectiveness of the changes is evident in the continuing positive outcomes for all stakeholders, including the annual increase in allocation from MSD and continued selection as the sole provider delivering NDH on behalf of ServiceIQ.

Strengthening some existing self-assessment activities would further support and inform the PTE of the areas it is most concerned with, such as achievement of the NDH, and would provide specific employer and graduate feedback to validate the longer-term outcomes of this programme. Evaluating the classroom component of the Skills for Industry programme would provide specific feedback to the tutor about the teaching and delivery of this pre-employment programme and support the tutor in their ongoing development.

Considering the size and context of the organisation, Renard Group has a solid self-assessment foundation with useful information gathered and worthwhile changes occurring as a result.

Findings¹

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Students and clients are consistently achieving well at Renard Group. Both Career Café and Artisan Consulting have established internal targets for achievement. These targets, and MSD and ServiceIQ targets, are closely monitored by the organisation. Formal reports discussing achievement and required outcomes are provided to the external bodies who are highly satisfied with learner achievement and the outcomes of the programmes. Career Café and Artisan Consulting are not reliably meeting their own high internal targets. These results are being discussed and reviewed systematically, informing changes to the programme and delivery.

The Skills for Industry programme delivered by Career Café has exceeded the MSD target to support clients into sustained employment for at least the last four years, despite variations to the contract and client profile. The progressive yearly increases in the number of clients allocated to Career Café by MSD further indicates the level of confidence and high level of satisfaction with these outcomes.

Clients gain hospitality industry-specific skills and knowledge of the hotel, café and full range of restaurant services; covering fast food outlets to fine dining and product knowledge (for example, coffee, wine and beer); and customer service skills and expectations. The improvement in knowledge supports clients' ability to approach potential employers and present themselves confidently at interviews. This is evidenced in the increasing number of cold call visits and job applications clients complete each week on the programme. The skills and knowledge gained are directly leading clients into employment.

Artisan Consulting's primary focus is on individual student achievement. Students' progress and achievement in the NDH is closely monitored over the two years and in some cases longer, from enrolment to completion. The rolling enrolments and on-job component of this self-paced programme have made it challenging for Artisan Consulting to determine how well its own high internal benchmark is being achieved. Good data collection and review occurs; however, refining or targeting this data collection would improve Artisan Consulting's ability to use the data more effectively and gain a broader understanding of achievement. The same is true for understanding Māori and Pasifika achievement in comparison with other learners. Few Māori and Pasifika students enrol in the NDH, and although individual

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

achievement is collected and monitored, it is not considered within the larger context of the NDH programme.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Both programmes are clearly meeting the needs of employers in an industry with highly mobile staff and a high attrition rate. Students and clients are gaining recognition alongside skills and knowledge to enter and progress within the industry.

Clients in the Skills for Industry programme gain skills and knowledge which enable and equip them to undertake entry-level employment in hospitality, usually in roles such as wait staff, barista and reception/customer service. Career Café continuously engages employers to understand their specific and changing needs. Career Café then undertakes to match those needs from within the client group – both current and past clients. The strong outcomes – high rates of sustained employment for clients – indicate the precision with which Career Café is meeting the needs of both employer and client. Furthermore, the success in matching and meeting employer and client needs has resulted in employers looking to Career Café in the first instance to fill any vacancies and promote clients that will complement their business and culture. This is of significant value to employers in an industry with a highly mobile workforce, overall reducing the impact on employers' time and resources and lessening time spent on training new staff.

Employers of the NDH students recognise the value of having qualified and competent staff to support their hospitality business. The benefits, such as improved customer service, increased ability to take responsibility, and the acquisition of knowledge which enhances decision-making, encourage employers to continually select and support their employees to undertake the two years of training for the mostly on-job NDH. Successful completion of the NDH supports the longer-term goal of all stakeholders, including students, gaining entry-level leadership positions within hospitality and/or undertaking higher-level training that will further benefit the industry. Strengthening the current processes around graduate destinations and employer and graduate feedback would better validate the longer-term outcomes of this programme.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Stakeholders recognise the training as authentic. The skills and knowledge clients and students gain on completing courses support specific employer needs. Renard Group as a whole and all staff within each programme have numerous key relationships and connections within the hospitality industry which are long-standing and high level. The relationships include a broad range of businesses within hospitality such as cafes, breweries, and hotel and restaurant chains with multiple sites. Combined with the personal experience of staff having worked in the sector, Career Café and Artisan Consulting have a clear and current understanding of the hospitality industry in New Zealand.

Feedback and continuous engagement with the industry, employers, clients and students informs activities, programme design and content for both programmes, which are reviewed in an ongoing basis after delivery. As a result, the skills and knowledge clients and students develop are highly relevant and linked to current trends and practices. This is strongly evident in the Skills for Industry programme. Through established and ongoing sector relationships, Career Café staff also understand the specific needs of employers and support clients in their job-seeking and skill development to meet those needs. Needs analysis of clients is also undertaken and Career Café's assessment of clients' skills, attitudes and interests are the primary guide to ensure the best match with an employer, their business and culture. Employers consider Career Café's client assessment and subsequent matching of client to employer as 'bang on' and accurately reflecting the competence and practice of the client once engaged in the workplace. The attendance of employers at Career Café 'exposés', the increasing number of employers using Career Café as an employment agency to source the 'right person' for the culture of their business, alongside the high and sustained employment rates, attest to the effectiveness of matching and meeting the needs of all stakeholders.

ServiceIQ's NDH is the only predominantly workplace, on-job national hospitality diploma. The benefits are significant to students and employers. Students are located around the country and hours of work are not conducive to attending the usual study days and hours. Programme design allows for rolling enrolments, and block courses scheduled every three months support employers and students to plan attendance and assessment. Students have opportunities to directly apply the knowledge and skills they are developing in the workplace. The NDH programme is supported by Hospitality New Zealand which provides scholarships annually for students and actively promotes and endorses this programme. Both ServiceIQ and Hospitality New Zealand recognise the qualification as highly relevant and

specifically designed to develop the existing workforce to pathway within the industry and move from entry-level into leadership and management roles.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Teaching of clients and students is provided by industry-experienced staff who also hold hospitality-related qualifications. Staff assessing students against unit standards hold the required assessment and moderation unit standards and are registered assessors with the relevant ITO. Teaching staff deliver only one programme and dedicate all their time to that programme and the students or clients within it.

The Skills for Industry learning environment is structured to reflect as much as possible a working café. Clients have the opportunity to apply and practise skills which staff review and provide feedback on immediately, enhancing the learning experience and enabling staff and clients to gauge progress in these hospitality practices. The engagement of staff with clients is effective and evidenced through course evaluations, exit interviews, testimonials, and the retention of clients, which is high. This is important for Skills for Industry clients, and Career Café staff are aware of the potential barriers to learning that a classroom environment may present for some clients in this pre-employment programme. Gathering specific client feedback on the teaching and delivery of the four-week workshop component of the programme would provide specific feedback about the teaching and delivery and support the tutor in their ongoing development.

Assessment of the NDH is undertaken by Artisan Consulting staff who are ServiceIQ-registered assessors. Verification of the authenticity of workplace assessments and projects is the responsibility of workplace verifiers. Close communication and training agreements between ServiceIQ, Artisan Consulting and the employer ensure assessment is authentic. Self-assessment activities include student and employer surveys, exit interviews and course evaluations. Programme review and identification and analysis of assessment results have all provided opportunities to make changes to the teaching, assessment and delivery of the NDH. Seeking verifiers' feedback on students' performance would strengthen evidence of the effectiveness of this programme, which has workshop and on-job components. The director is further assured of the quality and effectiveness of the teaching through the consistently successful outcomes, regular internal moderation of assessor judgements, teacher observations and review. Artisan Consulting would benefit from supporting the professional development of staff to gain adult education and training qualifications, which is planned but not yet implemented.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Within the context of this small PTE, support and guidance is a key focus in the Skills for Industry programme and is provided by the programme leader and tutor and overseen by the director. The NDH is delivered mostly on-job, and the support and guidance of students is a shared responsibility between employer, verifier and Artisan Consulting. The support provided is appropriate for the programmes and enhances the learning experience and engagement of clients and students. The staff and director are assured of appropriate support for clients and students in the monthly reporting and weekly monitoring at staff meetings. Student and client feedback on support and guidance is captured and is a key performance indicator for staff in their formal performance appraisal.

Both programmes have clear and robust processes to select students and clients, and these processes detail support requirements before engagement in the programme. Career Café has a structured induction and interview where expectations are outlined – not all clients who approach Career Café are accepted into the programme. Selection of students for the two-year NDH programme requires employer and ServiceIQ endorsement prior to enrolment, and Artisan Consulting also has a comprehensive selection and interview process to ensure careful selection of students most likely to complete the qualification. Improving the process to determine the English language needs of potential students would be beneficial, but is somewhat mitigated in that employers in the first instance are nominating and supporting students through the bulk of their study.

Career Café recognises the impact of targeted pastoral care on the clients' ability and motivation to engage and participate in the pre-employment programme. Providing access on site to food for breakfast and lunch, a freephone number to speak to Career Café staff, and travel payment in the form of providing a travel card or reimbursement for petrol, support the practical needs of clients. There is ongoing access to the training facilities and staff at any point of the 12-week programme to practise skills such as barista and mock interviews or to get advice and one-to-one support. Support and encouragement continue after the client is placed into employment, and an exit interview provides the opportunity to plan and consider specific support strategies. The effectiveness of these activities is reviewed at weekly staff meetings.

Student support in the on-job NDH programme is less well evidenced and is provided mostly by employers and verifiers. The Artisan Consulting programme leader provides additional support remotely by email and phone and in person at workshops. Artisan Consulting works collaboratively with employers when an issue arises. For example, a request by a student for an extension to submit an assessment includes consultation with the employer to ensure agreement and no adverse impact on the workplace. ServiceIQ also must approve extensions, providing an opportunity to

explore the reason behind the request and possible avenues to improve. However, Artisan Consulting does not gather information routinely from verifiers or employers about the support of students. Gathering such information is important for this mostly on-job programme because verifiers and employers are in close proximity to the student and able to provide specific and potentially useful feedback to the programme leader. Understanding how well Artisan Consulting is supporting verifiers in their role would also provide a fuller perspective on the impact of all avenues of support that students experience.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Renard Group has clear and decisive leadership, the direction of which is well informed by a wide variety of key stakeholder relationships within the hospitality sector, and ongoing and proactive engagement with funders and ITOs.

Understanding industry expectations and requirements and anticipating and responding has been a key focus of this small PTE. Planning for the future, including scoping possible accreditations and future staff skills and knowledge, are identified and prioritised to progress the PTE and continue to support development of staff within the hospitality industry.

Resourcing is targeted to the location and needs of students and clients, and the facilities and equipment reflect those used in the industry. Staff feel valued and collegial relationships are evident within the small team. Performance reviews and professional development are undertaken and support the development of all staff.

The PTE is small and agile, responding to changes that have occurred over the nine years of delivery. Since registering as a PTE in 2012, and the change of ownership in 2013, Renard Group has introduced and is using effective self-assessment processes to better guide and respond to these changes. Self-review of the effectiveness of the processes themselves is occurring on an as-needs basis. This is currently sufficient; however, systematic review would strengthen Renard Group's sound foundation of self-assessment.

Renard Group may be able to better demonstrate governance and management's ability to support the educational achievement of students and clients by improving their understanding around NDH achievement, gathering information from verifiers, employers and graduates of the NDH programme, and closer scrutiny of the effectiveness of the teaching within the classroom component of the Skills for Industry programme.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.2 Focus area: National Diploma in Hospitality Operation Management (Level 5)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.3 Focus area: Skills for Industry

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Recommendations

NZQA recommends that Renard Group:

- Strengthen some existing self-assessment activities such as understanding achievement of the NDH and gathering specific employer/verifier feedback.
- Extend the breadth of self-assessment to include: NDH graduate feedback to demonstrate the longer-term outcomes the programme is designed to achieve, and evaluate the classroom component of the Skills for Industry programme to more clearly evidence the effectiveness of the teaching.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz

Final Report