

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

## Avon City Ford Training Services

Highly Confident in educational performance Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 16 April 2011

### Contents

Purpose of this Report	.3
Introduction	.3
1. TEO in context	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	4
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review	4
Summary of Results	.6
Findings	. 8
Recommendations	
Further actions	15
Appendix	16

MoE Number:7270NZQA Reference:C04055Date of EER visit:25 and 26 January 2011

### Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

### Introduction

### 1. TEO in context

Location:	Sockburn, Christchurch
Type:	Private training establishment
First registered:	1998
Number of students:	Domestic: 21
Number of staff:	Four full-time plus one part-time tutor, as required, depending on trainee numbers.
Scope of active accreditation:	Unit standards towards the National Certificate in Motor Industry (Foundation Skills) (Level 1), and various motor industry and foundation skills, and driver licensing and skills unit standards.
Sites:	One site in Christchurch.
Distinctive characteristics:	Avon City Ford Training Services (ACFTS) is a private training provider within the Avon City Ford motor dealership. Trainees use the company's facilities, which include full servicing, panel and paint, and dismantling workshops, as well as their own training facilities. ACFTS trains and supports predominantly 16-18-years-olds from the greater Christchurch area who want to gain entry into the automotive and related trades industry.
Recent significant changes:	One staff member has completed the National

Previous quality assurance history:	ACFTS was quality assured by NZQA by audit in 2007 and substantially met the quality assurance requirements in force at that time.
	ACFTS met the NZQA moderation standards for core generic units in 2009 and was exempt from national moderation for 2010.
	ACFTS did not meet the national standards for Motor Industry Training Organisation (MITO) moderation in 2010 for three unit standards. These units are now being modified.
Other:	ACFTS works with Canterbury high schools in delivering STAR and Gateway automotive programmes. ACFTS also offers a full range of driver training courses, from learner to defensive driving. The Automotive Work Placement Training course is focussed on preparing students for further education and/or employment, including apprenticeships within the automotive industry. Trainees may be referred to this programme by Work and Income (WINZ) or Workbridge. Trainees are encouraged to complete the National Certificate in Automotive (Foundation Skills) (Level 1) (42 credits).

#### 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The focus areas chosen were the Automotive Work Placement Training course and the mandatory focus area of governance, management and strategy. The Automotive Work Placement Training course is a 48-week course with 18 funded places (Youth Training) and 11 active learners.

#### 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/

The evaluation team consisted of one lead evaluator and an external evaluator. During the visit, the team met the Avon City Ford management and training coordinators, one tutor (Youth Training), and seven current trainees. In addition, the team spoke by telephone to

two ex-trainees, a high school Gateway/transition teacher, a Workbridge case manager, MITO, and one employer. The team was on site for one and a half days.

ACFTS has had an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and submissions received have been fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

## Summary of Results

#### Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance of **Avon City Ford Training Services.** 

Trainees at ACFTS achieve excellent outcomes. Students of varied academic ability and educational success are assisted to identify goals and suitable learning pathways. More than 80 per cent of trainees enrolled on the Automotive Work Placement Training course during 2010 are progressing to further education and/or have gained employment (Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) benchmark 60 per cent). ACFTS reports that the average number of unit standard credits achieved in 2010 was 32.6 (TEC benchmark average of 20 credits), while an average of 29.1 credits was achieved in 2009. Thirty per cent of trainees successfully completed the National Certificate in Automotive (Foundation Skills) during 2010.

The value of the training is recognised within the automotive industry and by high schools and referring agencies, for the increased well-being and motivation of trainees as well as the relevance of the skills learnt for trainees considering further study or employment in the automotive industry.

Trainees benefit significantly from a strong, integrated model of teaching and pastoral care, with a particular focus on the development of life skills and the skills employers are seeking in new employees. Teaching and assessment practices are varied and effective and appropriate to the content. The mix of classroom and practical training is particularly relevant for the learning styles and needs of the trainees.

The location of the training within a large and well-resourced automotive dealership enhances the trainees' overall learning experience, and staff are energetic in leveraging industry networks to broker work experience placements and ongoing employment.

ACFTS is providing a very high level of individual and ongoing guidance and support for learners. The supportive yet structured environment enhances both the well-being of trainees and their educational achievement.

#### Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Avon City Ford Training Services.** 

ACFTS has demonstrated a commitment to continuous improvement. Self-assessment practices are generally purposeful and have led to genuine improvements.

The ACFTS team closely monitors trainee progress and meets frequently to plan the teaching programme and work placements to accommodate trainee needs. Reflection on trainee needs and a refocusing of teaching activity has led to improved credit achievement over the last two years. More detailed teaching planning materials would complement the current reliance on the course workbooks. Appropriate programme review and internal

moderation processes are in place. ACFTS is using external moderation results to make changes to teaching materials through the supplier.

Individual trainee achievement is recorded and regularly monitored. A more systematic approach to the collection and analysis of achievement data and the documentation of trainee "success stories" would improve the quality and validity of self-assessment information available to ACFTS. Periodic review and analysis of performance information across the organisation would improve the capacity of the organisation to know how well it is doing compared with previous years or external benchmarks.

ACFTS communicates frequently with key stakeholders and is responsive to issues or problems. While some written surveys are administered, there is a high reliance on informal communications, such as telephone or face-to-face contact, which is appropriate for an organisation of this nature and size. However, some recording of this feedback would facilitate objective review and analysis at a later time.

#### **TEO** response

ACFTS has accepted the accuracy of the report.

## Findings<sup>1</sup>

#### 1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is Excellent.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Good.

Trainees at ACFTS achieve excellent outcomes. Students of varied academic ability and educational background are assisted to identify goals and suitable training pathways and then supported to develop their personal, study, and work skills to achieve success.

ACFTS has consistently met or exceeded the performance benchmarks set for Youth Training by the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC). More than 80 per cent of trainees enrolled on the Automotive Work Placement Training course during 2010 are progressing to further education and/or have gained employment (TEC benchmark 60 per cent). ACFTS reported that the average number of unit standard credits achieved per trainee in 2010 was 32.6 (TEC benchmark 20 credits), while an average of 29.1 credits was achieved in 2009. Thirty per cent of trainees successfully completed the National Certificate in Automotive (Foundation Skills) during 2010 (compared with 16 per cent in 2009).

ACFTS is highly effective in working with each trainee on their personal growth and wellbeing as well as ensuring trainees acquire relevant theory and practical knowledge and skills. Individual tuition and group learning is focussed on building trainee motivation and confidence in their ability to learn and achieve their goals. The effectiveness of this approach in reducing barriers to learning was confirmed for the evaluation team by trainees, ex-trainees, and key stakeholders. Examples of previously at-risk youth succeeding in training pathways and automotive careers were provided.

Regular minuted meetings of the ACFTS team are held at which trainee progress is discussed and outcomes closely monitored. Changes were implemented to the teaching programme in 2009, to increase the focus on literacy and numeracy and core generic skills during the first part of the course. These changes have been effective in lifting unit standard credit achievement over the last two years.

While records are maintained on individual trainee progress and unit standard achievements, the quality and validity of self-assessment information could be improved by a more systematic approach to the aggregation and analysis of achievement data. Furthermore, tracking and recording of trainee growth and personal development, and progression through their training and career pathways, could provide a rich source of achievement information to illustrate the value added to trainees by this provider.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

### 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Good.

The training delivered by ACFTS is highly valued within the automotive industry and by high schools and referring agencies, for the increased well-being and motivation of trainees as well as the relevance of the skills learnt for trainees considering further study or employment in the automotive industry.

Trainees acquire useful skills and knowledge and achieve unit standard credits or the National Certificate in Automotive (Foundation Skills). The majority go on to either further training or employment. Four 2010 trainees gained access to polytechnic pre-trade courses. The additional value of the training to the trainees and ex-trainees spoken to was also in the opportunity to receive individual attention within a supportive learning environment and to grow as individuals. They reported increased enjoyment in and motivation for learning and welcomed the additional "life lessons", such as how to behave in a workplace, self–management, and learning strategies and assistance with personal problems. As a result, trainees were making progress towards their study and work goals, which they had not achieved previously.

Schools and referral agencies reported high levels of satisfaction with ACFTS courses and trainee outcomes. The quality of the learning interaction was noted as well as the valuable contribution to the community in working "fairly but firmly" with trainees presenting with various personal and social challenges.

While the recent economic downturn has reduced employment opportunities, employers continue to confirm the value of ACFTS training by offering trainees work experience or permanent employment and apprenticeships. While trainees may present with relatively low levels of knowledge or skills, employers have indicated their overall satisfaction with trainee attitudes, work ethic, and motivation. The ongoing support provided by the ACFTS training manager routinely extends beyond the training period and this is valuable for both the trainee and the employer.

The organisation communicates regularly with stakeholders and is responsive to issues or problems. While some written surveys are administered, there is a high reliance on informal communications, such as telephone or face-to-face contact, which is appropriate for an organisation of this nature and size. However, some recording of this feedback would facilitate objective review and analysis at a later time.

### 1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Good.

ACFTS effectively ensures that programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders, through the priority it places on individual development and social as well as industry outcomes.

The courses and qualification are at the right level for the target group (primarily level 1 and 2 unit standards on the New Zealand Qualifications Framework (NZQF)). The Gateway and STAR programmes complement the National Certificate Automotive (Foundation Skills), providing a meaningful pathway for 16-18-year-old trainees. Selection, trialling, and testing processes are in place to assess trainee academic readiness and commitment to the training programme. Testing includes specific literacy and numeracy testing and referral, if necessary, to other specialist providers. Small class sizes are maintained in order to facilitate appropriate group interaction, a wide range of practical activities, and individual attention. These practices reflect the organisation's commitment to successful outcomes for each individual, taking into account their personal situations.

Through frequent interaction with a wide network of employers, ACFTS has gained an excellent understanding of the employee attributes sought by industry employers and has focussed its delivery to ensure that the courses and learning experience address these. The location of the training within a large and well-resourced automotive dealership enhances the trainees' overall learning experience and preparation for work. In particular, the development of attitudes and behaviour appropriate to the workplace and evidence of interest in the industry are crucial, as well as demonstrable capability to learn, in order for trainees to achieve ongoing employment and apprenticeships. Staff are energetic in leveraging industry networks to broker work experience placements and ongoing employment, which is reflected in the high proportion of ex-trainees in work.

ACFTS provides STAR and Gateway programmes to a number of Canterbury high schools. Feedback from key high school staff confirm that ACFTS is recognised as a quality provider which is effectively meeting the needs of its trainees. ACFTS staff contribute to other school activities also, such as attendance at assemblies and public recognition of highperforming trainees.

Social agencies such as Workbridge regularly refer clients to ACFTS for automotive training. They report satisfaction with the quality of the training and support, and the positive outcomes for their clients.

ACFTS places a high priority on relationships and communication with trainees and other stakeholders and is effective in meeting their needs. Trainee logbooks provide a focus for fortnightly discussions on goals and needs, and staff regularly discuss the allocation of time and resources to meet these needs and maintain progress. Ongoing networking, including regular meetings with other Canterbury providers, also enables ACFTS staff to actively support individual trainees through study and employment pathways. The effectiveness of

these day-to-day processes could be further enhanced by more periodic reflection on ACFTS' overall effectiveness in meeting stakeholder needs.

#### 1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is Good

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Good

Trainees at ACFTS receive effective teaching, as demonstrated by the NZQF results and the development and acquisition of life and employment-related skills. The Workplace Learning course is a 42-credit, full-time programme delivered at the Avon City Ford dealership. Programme delivery is flexible and individually targeted to accommodate different trainee start dates, different levels of knowledge, and work placements. The weekly teaching timetable provides for a suitable mix of classroom and workshop.

Trainees benefit from a strong, integrated model of teaching and pastoral care, with a particular focus on the development of life skills and work readiness. Teaching and assessment practices and materials are varied and effective and appropriate to the content and the various learning styles and needs of the trainees. Appropriate practical and workshop experience complements the theoretical and classroom programme. Trainees and ex-trainees confirmed their satisfaction with the learning environment which had increased their confidence, motivation, and ability to learn. They reported positive relationships with tutors who they perceived as being knowledgeable and encouraging and with relevant industry experience.

Good teaching, a team approach, and an explicit focus on the development and growth of the individual learner contribute significantly to the positive trainee outcomes at ACFTS. The ACFTS team closely monitors trainee progress and meets frequently to plan the teaching programme and work placements to accommodate trainee needs. All trainers are experienced and suitably qualified in the automotive industry and in adult teaching and assessment. Ongoing professional development available through the dealership ensures that trainers maintain their industry currency and knowledge. Trainers are regularly observed by peers and managers and also receive and discuss feedback from learners. Performance appraisals, which include tutor self-review, are undertaken annually. Appropriate, ongoing, regular professional development is provided through the Avon City Ford dealership.

Teaching and assessment materials include externally sourced and in-house written materials and course workbooks, an interactive video based training programme and access to physical automotive components in the classroom. Materials are appropriate to the programme and training level. Appropriate programme review and internal moderation processes are in place. ACFTS is using recent external moderation results to make changes to teaching materials through the supplier. More detailed teaching planning could enhance the current delivery.

#### 1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent.** 

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Excellent.

ACFTS is providing a very high level of individual and ongoing guidance and support for learners. The supportive yet structured environment enhances the educational achievement of trainees and their well-being. The skills and approach of the staff are crucial to the motivation and mentoring of learners through the programme, both in the classroom and on work placements. Trainers create a positive, encouraging culture, where behavioural expectations are clear and standards are maintained. Their "firm but fair" approach is entirely appropriate to and effective with this learner cohort. As a result, there are very few participants in the Workplace Learner course who do not complete the programme and progress to either further study or work. ACFTS as well as NZQA has not received any student or other complaints, indicating satisfaction with the care and support offered.

A careful selection process, which includes assessment of personal skills and interests, literacy and numeracy testing, and a trial period establishes whether the programme is suitable for trainees and they have a chance of success. Other applicants may be referred to alternative local providers for remedial study in the first instance and then return to ACFTS. Trainees with particular literacy needs receive targeted assistance, and literacy progression booklets are maintained. Reader/writer assistance is made available as necessary. All trainees have fortnightly meetings with tutors and this discussion is used to update their logbooks, set and reaffirm goals, and address any issues. This contact assists trainees significantly in their personal development and educational achievements. Each trainee's progress is recorded on a chart in the classroom which, together with the individual monitoring, provides motivation and recognition of achievement.

Trainees and ex-trainees interviewed confirmed that they valued the level of individual attention and support they received from trainers and understood the benefits of learning within a dealership. They particularly appreciated the encouragement and recognition of effort. Tutors are open to questions and patient in helping trainees understand. A class representative process provides formal opportunities for trainees to give feedback. Learners understood that trainers were helping them to get ready for a real workplace and were positive about the impact of this on their motivation and behaviour. Examples were provided of ACFTS staff assisting trainees with personal issues or problems involving outside agencies such as the police or WINZ. Practical support was routinely available for the job search process, including curriculum vitae preparation, interview practice, and the provision of industry contacts. This high level of engagement, care, and support is a crucial factor in achieving positive trainee outcomes.

### 1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent.** 

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is Good.

ACFTS is the training division of Avon City Ford, and governance and management oversight is provided by a senior management team comprising the principal dealer, the service manager, and the administration manager. The location of the training within a large and well resourced automotive dealership provides significant advantages and opportunities for trainees which far exceed those routinely available within small training providers. These advantages include access to modern facilities and vehicles and current technology, and extensive industry and community networks. There may be some opportunity to further leverage this advantage through extending the level of cooperation and communication with three other Ford dealerships also delivering training, including benchmarking of outcomes.

The organisation is guided by a clear vision and shared passion for improving trainee wellbeing and employability, while meeting the needs of the industry for relevant training and suitable candidates for apprenticeships and automotive careers. Senior management confirmed its ongoing commitment and long-term focus despite the challenging economic environment. Good communication practices and a shared commitment to working positively with schools and industry provide a strong platform for ACFTS training. Staff reported that they felt valued and supported by senior management. They appreciated the opportunities for professional development and the ongoing resourcing available for the programme.

There is evidence of good documentation, organisation, and systems. Minuted weekly, monthly, and quarterly meetings, and further informal meetings, ensure staff and senior management are well informed and actively engaged in planning and decision-making. The day-to-day focus is on individual trainees and detailed financial monitoring. While processes were in place for prioritising investment in resources, these and other planning and monitoring processes could be supplemented by periodic review and analysis of educational performance information across the organisation rather than relying on annual TEC reporting. Current educational tracking and monitoring does not provide for easy understanding of how well ACFTS is performing at any given time of the year compared with previous years or external benchmarks. The planned implementation of a new student management system is expected to improve staff capacity to extract meaningful reports and statistics. The evaluation team considers that this is likely to improve the quality and validity of self-assessment capability.

#### Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

#### 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management, and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent** The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good** 

#### 2.2 Focus area: Automotive Work Placement Training course

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**. The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

## Recommendations

There are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review, other than those implied or expressed within the report.

### **Further actions**

The next external evaluation and review will take place in accordance with NZQA's policy and is likely to occur within four years of the date of this report.

## Appendix

#### Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

Self-assessment and external evaluation and review are requirements of course approval and accreditation (under sections 258 and 259 of the Education Act 1989) for all TEOs that are entitled to apply. The requirements are set through the course approval and accreditation criteria and policies established by NZQA under section 253(1)(d) and (e) of the Act.

In addition, for registered private training establishments, the criteria and policies for their registration require self-assessment and external evaluation and review at an organisational level in addition to the individual courses they own or provide. These criteria and policies are set by NZQA under section 253(1)(ca) of the Act.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring TEOs continue to comply with the policies and criteria after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of courses and/or registration. The Institutes of Technology and Polytechnics Quality (ITP Quality) is responsible, under delegated authority from NZQA, for compliance by the polytechnic sector, and the New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the policies and criteria approved by the NZQA Board.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (<u>www.nzqa.govt.nz</u>).

Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process, including the publication Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review, is available at: http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/for-providers/keydocs/index.html

NZQA Ph 0800 697 296 E <u>eeradmin@nzqa.govt.nz</u> WWW.NZQA.GOVt.NZ