



Report of External Evaluation and Review

New Zealand College of Chinese
Medicine Limited

Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 28 January 2011

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	4
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	4
Summary of Results	6
Findings	7
Recommendations	12
Further Actions.....	12
Appendix	13

MoE Number: 7282
NZQA Reference: C02993
Date of EER visit: 12, 13 and 14 October 2010

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Location:	Level 1, 321 Great South Road, Greenlane, Auckland
Type:	Private Training Establishment
First registered:	1998
Number of students:	Domestic: 231 full-time equivalents International: 22 full-time equivalents
Number of staff:	35 full-time equivalents
Scope of active accreditation:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Certificate in Foundation Studies for Health Maintenance – Traditional Chinese Medicine (Level 3)• Diploma of Acupuncture (Level 7)• Diploma in Acupuncture – Traditional Chinese Medicine (Level 7)• Bachelor of Health Science – Chinese Medicine; Acupuncture and Chinese Herbal Medicine (Level 7)
Sites:	Christchurch: 183 Montreal Street Waitakere: 3091 Great North Road, New Lynn Auckland: Level 1, 321 Great South Road, Greenlane
Recent significant changes:	A restructure of New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine was completed in July 2010. New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine is transitioning students from diploma to degree qualifications.
Previous quality assurance	Accreditation to deliver the Bachelor of Health Science was approved in August 2009 for the Auckland site, and

history: is currently awaiting approval for the Christchurch site. National external moderation results from March 2010 indicate that New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine met moderation requirements. The college was previously quality assured by NZQA by audit in July 2008 and substantially met the requirements of QA Standard One, the standard then in force. The two requirements not met related to personnel, and learner information, entry and support.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

Following a review of available information and a meeting with senior management of New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited (NZCCM) the following focus areas were identified for inclusion in the scope of the external evaluation and review:

- Diploma of Acupuncture (Level 7)

The diploma is delivered on two sites and has students from year one through to year three and is transitioning to feed into the new Bachelor of Health Science recently approved.

In accordance with NZQA policy, the scope included the following mandatory focus areas:

- Governance, management, and strategy
- Student support (including internationals).

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eeer/introduction/>

NZCCM supplied the evaluation team with a self-assessment summary. The two lead evaluators met with the senior management team to consider the scope of the evaluation and agree on the focus areas, and further documentation was provided to the evaluation team at this meeting. The first day of the on-site visit was at the Christchurch branch and the following two days were spent at the Auckland branch in Greenlane. In Christchurch, the evaluation team met with the administrator and academic coordinator, and in Auckland interviewed the chief executive officer (CEO), the academic principal, the student services manager, and the senior liaison advisor. On both sites the evaluation team spoke with a number of students and staff, both administrative and teaching. The evaluation team also viewed a range of documents including course completion information, graduate employment outcomes data, the student handbook, correspondence (internal, external, and

with stakeholders), student evaluation forms, teacher evaluation summaries, and patient evaluation forms. Other documents included minuted meetings of student representatives, the senior management team, and the academic administration.

New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited has had an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and submissions received have been fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited**.

There is clear identification of stakeholders and effective engagement in the local community, within New Zealand and internationally. The organisation's advisory board is active and successfully supported NZCCM to achieve accreditation to deliver the Bachelor of Health Science – Chinese Medicine, Acupuncture and Chinese Herbal Medicine.

The successful completion of courses is very high and the qualification achievement rate is high. This high achievement rate is a result of the successful matching of the needs of stakeholders and good programme design with practical hands-on learning in clinics after year one.

There is evidence that a significant number of graduates move immediately into the workforce to practise acupuncture or continue on to further study. All graduates that achieve in the diploma or degree qualification offered by NZCCM are eligible to become ACC accredited to deliver acupuncture.

NZCCM is experiencing a period of transition and the support, guidance, and learning needs of some students are not being met effectively; however, the organisation has identified these gaps and is working to improve the situation.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited**.

The organisation conducted a comprehensive review of international university programmes in the subject area of Traditional Chinese Medicine in order to inform qualification development for NZCCM and the future possible needs of graduates to achieve registration as practitioners in New Zealand. As a result, the diploma and foundation qualifications will eventually be discontinued and be replaced by the bachelor degree. Continued monitoring of the change and finding ways to improve as the bachelor qualification is embedded would be a valuable initiative.

Balancing this innovation with the continuity and support students require in the transition to the bachelor degree is important, and the new role of student support manager is expected to assist with this. The CEO and academic principal are heavily involved in the day-to-day running of the organisation and, overall, NZCCM has effective processes for the review of student achievement, engaging stakeholders, teacher effectiveness, and matching the needs of students. Fuller analysis of data could better inform NZCCM of possible trends and ways to improve outcomes for learners.

Findings¹

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is Good.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Students that achieve in year one and continue with their qualification into year two have high rates of achievement and complete the formal qualification. Successful completion of courses at NZCCM in 2009 was 91 per cent, and the percentage of students who completed qualifications was 74 per cent.

Graduates who have achieved report being confident in their skills as practitioners, and NZCCM's graduate survey showed that 90 per cent of graduates in 2008 and 74 per cent of graduates in 2009 have gained employment in an acupuncture-related field.

Knowledge of graduate data is generally gathered through ongoing, informal relationships with students in keeping with the small size of the traditional Chinese medicine sector. Although NZCCM has effective processes for review of learner achievement, benchmarking across NZCCM sites, from year to year, or against other providers, nationally or internationally, would be useful.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

NZCCM has excellent mechanisms for engaging identified and relevant stakeholders, resulting in staff from several tertiary institutes in Auckland and community stakeholders becoming members of the academic board, the advisory group, and research committee, who meet annually or as required.

The CEO and academic director are involved in developing relationships external to the organisation with an interest in research and have been active in discussions in New Zealand about the standards and competencies of traditional Chinese medicine practitioners. They have also advocated externally and internally to gain recognition as Chinese medicine practitioners and to be regulated as a professional group.

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

Engagement with the local community has been occurring for a number of years, with NZCCM students participating in “Healing Hui” with local iwi on the marae, to which they are invited to return each year, other public event organised through the Auckland District Health Board, and “Wellness Days” which are run monthly on site. In Christchurch, Wellness Days are run bimonthly and are also open to the public. Establishing relationships with iwi and the wider community has a mutual benefit for students’ learning and experience and the community’s opportunity to experience complementary medicine in the form of traditional Chinese medicine. Feedback is sought from patients on their experience of the treatment at these clinics, and this feedback shows that patients are highly satisfied with all aspects of the treatment and care provided.

Graduates also emphasise that the skills gained are of personal benefit, enhancing their own health and that of their families.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

With the expiry of the diploma qualification, NZCCM has sought out and benchmarked various programmes internationally to identify future needs and ensure the quality and relevance of the recently approved bachelor programme. Analysis of the growth of acupuncture, and information to gauge the acceptance of complementary medicine in New Zealand, was used to establish future needs and possible changes to standards and competency for registration, ensuring qualifications gained by graduates will be recognised and useful in New Zealand.

The programme design is mostly theoretical in year one, with a small amount of clinic time. Clinic time increases in subsequent years, providing students with opportunities to observe and practise in a supportive environment which replicates an actual operational clinic and the associated expected professional conduct. This experience is identified by students and graduates as highly valued and directly affects confidence in the programme of study and their future practice.

The move to a purpose-built facility in Christchurch in July this year and the very recent recruitment of a librarian in Auckland, with plans to improve access and available resources for students, are welcome improvements.

There continues to be a transition for some students from a four-year to a three-year programme of study and from the diploma to the bachelor programme. Attempts to ensure consistency in this transition, in particular across sites, has highlighted some challenges with assessments and learning materials. NZCCM is aware of this and has introduced strategies to address the issues. Further mechanisms for gathering student and staff feedback could be improved and would assist in identifying issues before they become a problem.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

Teachers are well qualified in their fields, and are subject experts. There is, however, a wide variance in their teaching approaches. There is also a heavy reliance on lecture-style presentations and PowerPoint slides, which some students find less engaging..

English as the medium of instruction, combined with many tutors and students having English as a second language, creates communication difficulties which are not always addressed in the classroom, the teaching materials, and assessments. Tutor evaluation occurs and is available for tutors to reflect on, but further analysis and use of the information gathered is unclear.

There is a variance in students' experience in receiving feedback about their learning. students spoken to by the evaluation team did not consider the feedback they are given is sufficient to enhance learning, therefore students are not able to assess or self-manage their own progress. However policies and procedures around assessment are generally effective, internal moderation occurs, and feedback is sought from teaching staff.

There are a number of positive initiatives by individuals that support the teaching on both sites. For example, since a number of tutors are part-time or contracted, a Christchurch tutor has created a document that allows all tutors to comment on each student's progress, confidence, and other relevant factors that can inform and guide the tutor. There is an opportunity for NZCCM to capture initiatives and ensure they are embedded across the organisation as part of a teaching and learning strategy.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

There are some avenues of support for students which are effective, such as student representatives for each class, who meet each term, and a suggestion box. A new student services manager position has been created which sits within the senior management team which meets fortnightly. An initiative created by the student services manager identified possible difficulties that both staff and students experience with academic English; this was confirmed with a survey and resulted in a number of workshops being delivered internally and attended by staff and students. New policies and procedures are being developed, although it is not yet clear to the evaluators how effective these policies and procedures will be.

Progressing the transition to the bachelor qualification has been a complex task for NZCCM and has lead to misunderstandings with some students. NZCCM is aware of these misunderstandings. There is also evidence to suggest that when an issue of support or guidance is identified it is responded to and carried through to a timely conclusion. There does not appear to be effective methods for students to give feedback on the learning

environment and student support services. There is an attempt to gather information from those students who do not complete or withdraw from the programme, and further analysis of this data would be useful in understanding student support and guidance needs.

It is unclear to the evaluation team whether NZCCM is making regular reviews of its practice in relation to the Code of Practice for the Pastoral Care of International Students.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

There is a clear distinction between governance and management and a clear vision and strategy for the PTE which is looking to possible future needs and requirements for education in traditional Chinese medicine.

NZCCM has been consistently over-delivering on its allocated EFTS (equivalent full-time students) numbers, and has been requested by the Tertiary Education Commission to reduce them. There is good evidence that NZCCM has instituted a number of strategies to attempt to address and manage this request.

NZCCM has gone through a period of transition which has mostly been managed effectively. The CEO and the academic principal have a passion for the business and all decision-making sits predominantly with them. Managing a cross-cultural programme is difficult and there is a genuine willingness to acknowledge and address this issue.

Communication, consistency, and collaboration across the organisation at all levels have recently become more efficient. Miscommunication with some staff and students has occurred where there has been a reliance on digital technology across an environment where English is not everyone's first language. Recent visits by the senior management team to Christchurch have been highly valued by staff, although systematic mechanisms to gather staff satisfaction and feedback were not evident and these could enhance the process significantly.

Both Christchurch and Auckland campuses are attractive, spacious, and well resourced, with the presence of the herbal dispensary pharmacy and clinics on site enhancing the relevant and authentic experience for students.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management, and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.2 Focus area: Student support (including Internationals)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Adequate**.

2.3 Focus area: Diploma of Acupuncture

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Recommendations

There are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review, other than those implied or expressed within the report.

Further actions

The next external evaluation and review will take place in accordance with NZQA's policy and is likely to occur within four years of the date of this report.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

Self-assessment and external evaluation and review are requirements of course approval and accreditation (under sections 258 and 259 of the Education Act 1989) for all TEOs that are entitled to apply. The requirements are set through the course approval and accreditation criteria and policies established by NZQA under section 253(1)(d) and (e) of the Act.

In addition, for registered private training establishments, the criteria and policies for their registration require self-assessment and external evaluation and review at an organisational level in addition to the individual courses they own or provide. These criteria and policies are set by NZQA under section 253(1)(ca) of the Act.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring TEOs continue to comply with the policies and criteria after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of courses and/or registration. The Institutes of Technology and Polytechnics Quality (ITP Quality) is responsible, under delegated authority from NZQA, for compliance by the polytechnic sector, and the New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the policies and criteria approved by the NZQA Board.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process, including the publication Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review, is available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E eeradmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz