



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

External Evaluation and Review Report

New Zealand College of Chinese
Medicine Limited

Date of report: 8 November 2018

About New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited

NZCCM has been delivering Tradition Chinese Medicine (TCM) programmes for many years. The focus is on educating competent traditional Chinese medicine practitioners to complement the western medicine approach currently available in New Zealand.

Type of organisation:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	321 Great South Road, Greenlane, Auckland
Code of Practice signatory:	Yes
Number of students:	Domestic: 105; Māori 2.4 per cent and Pasifika 1.6 per cent International: 21
Number of staff:	12 full-time equivalents and 16 part-time
TEO profile:	https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/details.do?providerId=728259001
Last EER outcome:	In 2014, Confident in educational performance and Confident in self-assessment
Scope of evaluation:	International Students - Support and Wellbeing Bachelor of Health Science in Chinese Medicine (Acupuncture and Herbal Medicine); Acupuncture (Level 7)
MoE number:	7282
NZQA reference:	C30384
Dates of EER visit:	16 and 17 August 2018

Summary of Results

NZCCM has very strong outcomes for students and graduates of the Bachelor's programme. Self-assessment activities are generally robust and comprehensive. In the forward-looking statements of confidence, NZCCM needs to demonstrate sustainability in current processes and practices for new programmes.

Confident in educational performance

- In the past four years, NZCCM has had the highest rates of retention and achievement in the sector. Comprehensive and robust internal and external moderation supports and validates the rate of achievement.
- Graduates gain immediate employment by registering as ACC acupuncturists.

Confident in capability in self-assessment

- The programme design and delivery matches student needs and reflects NZCCM's philosophy and commitment to Tradition Chinese Medicine (TCM).
- Teachers have extensive expertise in TCM. Most are practitioners, all engage in professional development and many undertake research – a significant output.
- NZCCM has appointed staff based on education expertise, with noted benefits.
- NZCCM has sound and comprehensive processes to determine and demonstrate the quality and value of the Bachelor's programme. The period of data collection is not long enough to determine trends over time and use data to full effectiveness.
- Due to the significant changes in delivery sites and programmes, NZCCM needs to demonstrate that the robust processes and practices will be sustained, guide and inform performance and self-assessment for the new programmes.

Key evaluation question findings¹

1.1 How well do students achieve?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Course completion rates² for 2014-2017 range from 86-89 per cent, which exceed Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) commitments for each year. Benchmarking against other providers delivering similar programmes at the same level consistently ranks NZCCM highest, indicating very strong outcomes for both course completions and retention in study.</p> <p>All international students successfully completed from 2014-2017. A very small number of Māori (six) and Pasifika (six) students enrolled in 2014-2017. Most complete but more emphasis needs to be placed on analysis of priority students' non-retention and non-completion.</p> <p>NZCCM has clear evidence of comprehensive processes around analysing and reporting data (i.e. per paper, per year), for the last 18 months. Lecturers discuss the information to inform teaching, and management highlights and discusses outliers. Internal and external moderation is comprehensive and systematic. These processes need to be fully embedded and sustained to meet the threshold for a higher level of confidence in self-assessment for the four-year Bachelor's programme.</p> <p>Students enhance their critical thinking skills, academic abilities and personal wellbeing while studying toward the Bachelor's, which is also an area of personal interest.</p>
Conclusion:	Very high rates of achievement lead the sector and are validated through comprehensive internal and external moderation.

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

² Information provided by NZCCM.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Graduates gain recognition as competent practitioners through registration with New Zealand authorities³ and as an accredited ACC acupuncturist. All except five of the 46 graduates from 2016-2017 are working as acupuncturists and traditional Chinese medicine practitioners in New Zealand. This rate of employment is consistent with outcomes before and since the last EER.</p> <p>Stakeholders include New Zealand acupuncturist and traditional Chinese Medicine registered authorities, employers and graduates. They place value on the graduates' ability to provide competent services as well as the benefits of having acupuncturists to complement western medical approaches as part of medical clinic and treatment option for patients.</p> <p>NZCCM is well connected and has demonstrated a long-term commitment to the local community. NZCCM has provided free and low-cost clinics on maraes and at Chinese community centres and NZCCM clinics for several years. This gives students access to patients and communities access to affordable professional services.</p> <p>Resources and personnel are dedicated to advance and improve relationships locally with local iwi Ngati Whatua and internationally with institutes associated with traditional Chinese medicine. NZCCM organised the World Congress of Chinese Medicine in Auckland 2016. The benefits to NZCCM staff were wide-reaching (e.g. networking, improving NZCCM's reputation).</p>
Conclusion:	The immediate outcomes for graduates are professional recognition, employment and income opportunities. Communities and medical practices gain significant value in having the option to choose a TCM approach for effective treatment of injuries and to maintain health.

³ Acupuncture New Zealand (AcNZ) and New Zealand Acupuncture Standards Authority. (NZASA)

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>The Bachelor's programme and learning environment is well planned and structured. The coherent progression from theory to practice leads students to advance their knowledge and develop their skills.</p> <p>The programme is regularly reviewed. The culture of feedback considers a range of perspectives: academic, TCM and students. Getting feedback from graduates would be useful and achievable, as some graduates return to complete the fourth year in herbal medicine. Academic standards and integrity are maintained through effective scheduled processes and a range of committees which report through to the academic board.</p> <p>Internal and external moderation of assessment is robust and systematic. Collated feedback highlights any actions and changes required. For example, detailed feedback to assessors leads to improvement in some marking schedules, making grading clearer.</p> <p>Lecturers have expertise in TCM. Many are current practitioners and most have or are working toward adult education qualifications. Feedback in the form of classroom observations, student surveys, peer observations and internal moderation informs teaching practice. The academic manager monitors and supports lecturers.</p> <p>NZCCM has commenced addressing feedback from the NZQA monitor to reduce lecturer workload by reducing the heavy internal moderation schedule, and to integrate some assessments to reduce the number of assessments and pressure on students.</p>
Conclusion:	Programme design and delivery matches the skill and knowledge development needs of students as they progress through the Bachelor's programme.

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>NZCCM provides students with accurate information before enrolment. The challenge of timetabling full-time and part-time students is effectively managed and the expectations of students matched their experience.</p> <p>At entry, NZCCM systematically assesses a student's knowledge on key aspects of the programme and any barriers to learning. The PTE provides additional compulsory training if required. This proactive intervention contributes significantly to supporting students' introduction to language and terminology associated with traditional Chinese medicine.</p> <p>Students and lecturers discuss learning outcomes and their alignment to the programme so they are clearly understood. The application of skills in clinics under supervision is highly valued, contributes to learning, and provides direct feedback to students from patients regarding their interpersonal skills.</p> <p>NZCCM has effective processes to monitor student progress and wellbeing through attendance, assessment results and grades, and engagement of all staff in this small PTE. International students are more closely monitored and supported by designated staff to ensure they are well prepared to study and live in New Zealand.</p> <p>Feedback mechanisms including student representatives and surveys. Activities such as orientation and communication via social media assist students in developing support networks.</p> <p>Students identified recent improvements that support their learning: the attempt to reduce the number and scheduling of assessments, improving the amount of feedback to students on assessments, and increased access to management and clear decision-making.</p>
Conclusion:	<p>NZCCM has a range of very good processes and teaching strategies to effectively support students in their learning. Recent improvements are being monitored to fully measure their sustainability and extent.</p>

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>NZCCM remains committed to the purpose and direction of the PTE. This continues to be communicated to and understood by staff and students. It is evident in the annual plan, reported progress and realised in the strong graduate outcomes.</p> <p>A number of significant changes have occurred since the previous EER in 2014, including: increase and decrease in both the number of delivery sites and programmes delivered, organisational restructuring (i.e. move from a board to a council to support directors in decision-making), an increased number of committees, and recruitment for three significant academic and quality positions to support the educational direction of NZCCM.</p> <p>Academic leadership is effective and improvements over the past 18 months in processes, practices and outcomes have been identified by all NZCCM staff and students. Programme approval applications to NZQA have been successful and monitor recommendations well considered.</p> <p>There is an embedded culture of research and NZCCM is funding a focus on the professional development for teaching staff. Research activity and outputs are significant considering the size of the PTE. Resources are being effectively managed to develop and sustain the PTE.</p> <p>The quality and value of the Bachelor's programme is clear. Considering the number of changes since the previous EER and the anticipated increased number of programmes about to be delivered, NZCCM acknowledges the need to demonstrate the effectiveness and sustained impact of these changes.</p>
Conclusion:	<p>NZCCM effectively supports educational achievement through clear and improved academic processes and standards. Effective self-assessment guides and informs performance. The very high rate of achievement and graduate employment reflect this.</p>

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>NZCCM has a range of internal scheduled processes to monitor and manage compliance accountabilities. NZCCM has dedicated and experienced staff to monitor and manage accountabilities to the TEC and NZQA, two significant stakeholders. The results from the most recent TEC audit in 2017 indicate that NZCCM understands and effectively manages TEC-related compliance.</p> <p>NZCCM has and effectively manages mechanisms to systematically review the Bachelor's programme and the accountabilities related to registration as a PTE. Student Fee Protection arrangement are in place, NZQA receives attestations in a timely manner, and NZCCM demonstrated active monitoring of compliance with the Education (Pastoral Care of International Students) Code of Practice 2016. NZQA did not identify any concerns at this evaluation.</p> <p>In August 2017, NZQA requested NZCCM undertake a hygiene audit of all clinics to meet its own hygiene guidelines. This was completed to NZQA's satisfaction. NZCCM conducts scheduled hygiene audits of clinics every two months to ensure and demonstrate that this standard continues to be met.</p> <p>Since the previous EER, NZQA monitoring reports identified weaknesses in NZCCM's diploma programmes. The delivery of these programmes ceased and is no longer specifically relevant at this EER. The most recent monitoring visit by NZQA for the degree programme, in 2017, recognised improvements since the previous monitoring visit, and the recommendations are being proactively addressed. NZCCM is aware of the need to ensure that compliance accountabilities related to newly approved diploma programmes are well managed.</p>
Conclusion:	NZCCM monitors its compliance accountabilities systematically using effective processes.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: International Students: Support and Wellbeing

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good

2.2 Focus area: Bachelor of Health Science

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

NZQA recommends that New Zealand College of Chinese Medicine Limited:

- Review the NZCCM council's role and function to effectively support the directors in their governance and management of the PTE.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. This include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

Appendix

Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document *Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review* available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- *Identify organisational fraud⁴*
- *Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources*
- *Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.*

⁴ NZQA and the TEC comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz