

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

IGQ Golf College Limited

Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 13 August 2015

# Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction .....	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review .....	5
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	5
Summary of Results .....	6
Findings .....	7
Recommendations .....	14
Appendix .....	15

MoE Number: 7713  
NZQA Reference: C14761  
Dates of EER visit: 18 and 19 June 2014

*Final Report*

# Purpose of this Report

*The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.*

## Introduction

### 1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	IGQ Golf College Limited
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	Coringa Golf Club, 680 McLeans Island Road, Christchurch
Delivery sites:	One site – as above, but at times may conduct practices and participate in tournaments at other golf courses within the Canterbury region
First registered:	February 2006
Courses currently delivered:	<b>NZQA-accredited programmes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certificate in Golf Development (Level 2)</li><li>• Diploma in Golf Coaching (Level 5)</li><li>• Diploma in Tournament Golf (Level 5)</li></ul> <b>Other advertised courses</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certificate in Tournament Golf – Intermediate (equivalent to NZQF Level 3)</li><li>• Certificate in Tournament Golf – Advanced (equivalent to NZQF Level 4)</li><li>• Golf Beginner Programme</li><li>• Golf Intensive Programme</li><li>• High School Golf Training Programme</li></ul>
Code of Practice signatory?	Yes, for trainees 18 years of age and above; also for trainees between 14 and 17 years of age

Number of students:	25 international trainees at the time of the on-site visit
Number of staff:	Management and administration: four Coaching: six
Scope of active accreditation:	As per NZQA-accredited programmes currently delivered
Distinctive characteristics:	IGQ Golf College is a small provider specialising in offering professional golf qualifications to international trainees from the People's Republic of China (P.R. China). Both Ministry of Education and NZQA approved IGQ Golf College for bilingual delivery of training in both English and Chinese Mandarin.
Recent significant changes:	The board of directors has expanded from three to five and a new chairman of the board was appointed in 2012.  The organisation restructured in 2013, with new positions appointed (such as the roles of administration manager and director of coaching).  Sino-Kiwi cooperation agreements for joint delivery of golf qualifications signed with two tertiary institutions based in Wuhan City, in the Hubei Province of P.R. China.
Previous quality assurance history:	The previous external evaluation and review (EER) for IGQ Golf College was conducted in 2010. NZQA was Confident in both the educational performance and capability in self-assessment of the IGQ Golf College.  A validation visit was conducted in 2013, which identified a number of non-compliance issues. <sup>1</sup> These issues were raised with the IGQ Golf College and all have since been rectified.
Other:	IGQ Golf College is receiving external funding from Education New Zealand for the period between 2014 and 2015 for promoting international

---

<sup>1</sup> Matters identified include the incomplete quality management system, non-compliance with the Privacy Act 1993, non-compliance with relevant age restrictions for enrolment, and potential confusion on some publicly advertised materials.

education in P.R. China.

## 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The scope of this EER included the following mandatory focus areas:

- Governance, management and strategy
- International students

The other focus areas selected were:

- Diploma in Golf Coaching (Level 5)
- Diploma in Tournament Golf (Level 5)

Most trainees are enrolled in one of the above programmes. The remaining trainees are enrolled in other advertised courses that have not previously been through the NZQA accreditation process, such as the High School Golf Training Programme.

## 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

IGQ Golf College initially submitted limited materials to NZQA. At the request of the lead evaluator, the college submitted further information which assisted in the determination of scope for this EER.

The evaluation team comprised two evaluators. The on-site visit lasted two days. During the on-site visit, the evaluation team interviewed the managing director, the marketing principal, the operations principal, the director of coaching, the administration manager, two other members of the coaching team and six trainees. A range of documents was reviewed during the on-site visit.

# Summary of Results

## Statements of confidence on educational performance and on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **IGQ Golf College**.

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **IGQ Golf College**.

The evaluation team finds IGQ Golf College performs well in the following aspects:

- The college has been very effective in tracking graduate destinations and produces positive outcomes in relevant employment.
- The graduates of the programme are equipped with relevant, advanced golf skills.
- The coaching staff show that they have the skills, passion and experience in the sport of golf, and are able to give individual attention to the needs of the trainees.
- Feedback from trainees shows that they are satisfied with their training and the pastoral care offered by the college.
- The board of directors is able to use the specific strengths of the members to execute its business development strategy in P.R. China.

There are some areas that could be improved:

- A systematic review of programmes is required to ensure that they continue to meet the needs of the trainees and other stakeholders and to update delivery practice periodically.
- IGQ Golf College should improve its focus on trainee achievement in the nominated programmes. The evaluation team saw trainees achieve well at attaining professional standards in golf, but completion of the qualifications is not always a priority.

IGQ Golf College is a specialised golf training college. The college has performed well in training trainees to reach their potential in the sport of golf. Its activities lie in 'training' rather than in 'learning'. The college enrolls its trainees primarily from P.R. China as 'international students' and is therefore required to be registered with NZQA. In some ways these programmes do not always sit comfortably in a training scenario. This is apparent in the activities observed by the evaluation team at IGQ Golf College. Therefore, taking into account the outcomes for most learners, the small scale and the specialised context of the college, the evaluation team is convinced by the overall educational performance of IGQ Golf College and is therefore expressing confidence in the college.

# Findings<sup>2</sup>

## 1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

IGQ Golf College and its trainees value the outcomes of attaining professional golf skills of sufficient standard to become coaches and professional golf players. In this regard, the college performs well. It is not clear that the college holds the achievement of its qualifications as being as important for its trainees, as illustrated in Table 1.

The college bases trainee performance on the professional 'handicap figure' to determine a trainee's progress and achievement. For professional golfing in New Zealand the handicap figure is calculated by the New Zealand Golf Association. The evaluation team accepts this as a valid, externally moderated measure of achievement.

**Table 1. IGQ Golf College qualification completion data, from 2009 to June 2014**

Qualification	Enrolled	Graduated	Exited
Diploma in Golf Coaching (Level 5)	17	4	11
Diploma in Golf Tournament (Level 5)	4	2	1

Source: IGQ Golf College submissions to the draft evaluation report, 31 July 2014

*Explanatory notes for Table 1:*

- *'Graduated' denotes trainees enrolled, successfully completed and awarded with the level 5 qualification initially enrolled in.*
- *'Exited' denotes trainees enrolled in the corresponding programme who have subsequently exited with a non-NZQA accredited certificate, equivalent to a lower level on the New Zealand Qualifications Framework.*
- *Two trainees enrolled in the Diploma in Golf Coaching programme and one trainee enrolled in the Diploma in Golf Tournament programme were expelled by the college for ongoing attendance concerns and thus are not represented in either the 'Graduated' or 'Exited' columns.*

IGQ Golf College measures success in terms of graduation and trainees gaining meaningful employment in the industry. By these standards, it achieves well, with an 88 per cent success rate for the Diploma in Golf Coaching and 75 per cent success rate for the Diploma in Golf Tournament. The figures in Table 1 indicate

---

<sup>2</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

that gaining jobs in the industry is the key motivator, an outcome of which may have little influence from the completion of qualifications.

IGQ Golf College advised that the reason for not awarding the relevant diplomas usually relates to the trainee's inability to get a handicap of 5 or below (despite training and practice), which is a requirement for the award of the qualification under the current competency-based structure. The college advises that graduates who achieve the required handicap after completing the programme may be considered to have the qualification conferred retrospectively, but such a policy is not documented, and how it is applied was unclear to the evaluation team.

Individual coaches have a good idea of their trainees' rates of performance and current handicap at an individual level. During the on-site visit, IGQ Golf College could not present the evaluation team with a summary view of trainees' handicaps across the organisation. The evaluation team also found that the college could do more work on implementing systematic procedures to monitor comparative rates of progress over time of its trainees, to better understand the organisational performance. Furthermore, IGQ Golf College could improve its procedures for collating and analysing qualification completions data to gain a better understanding of trends.

Despite the above issues, the evaluation team believes that trainees receive high-quality, professional training and personalised, individual coaching in golf (see Findings 1.4), which generally lead to satisfactory employment outcomes within the golfing industry (see Findings 1.2). The college shows an interest in graduate outcomes and has successfully tracked destination data over the years. This is considered by the evaluation team to be sufficient when taking into account the context the college is operating in (the currently relatively small number of enrolments and the emphasis on sports training).

## 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

There is evidence that IGQ Golf College's board of directors is interested in the employment outcomes of the graduates. The college has tracked its graduates extensively and successfully, and is able to present a contact list and destination outcomes for its 23 graduates since 2009 showing that 78 per cent of those graduates are currently employed within the golf industry. This is considered a satisfactory outcome by the board, who advised the evaluation team that, anecdotally, any figure above 50 per cent is deemed to be good given the golfing industry has high entry barriers and/or standards for success. The evaluation team agrees.

As golf is an expensive activity in Northeast Asia, the trainees are receiving value for money for their training in and practice of golf in New Zealand. It is understood that the professional golf industry is a growing market in P.R. China, and graduates who remain within the industry have a good chance of receiving significant financial returns for their investment in golf training. There is also some evidence that trainees, mostly in their late teens or early twenties, develop and refine their personal and professional behaviour and attributes beyond the technical training in golf, such as independence and perseverance.

In addition, the college provides training in the English language by two professional teachers qualified in the teaching of English to speakers of other languages (two hours per week), which some trainees find valuable.

The college has very good links overseas and has entered into cooperative agreements in the joint delivery of golf training and the conferring of qualifications with two institutes in Wuhan City. The expansive and diverse choice of golf courses, the beautiful scenery and the safe environment are valued by trainees and training partners.

### 1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

The evaluation team observed that there is a collaborative approach between IGQ Golf College and the professional golfing associations in New Zealand, as well as some tertiary education institutes and authorities in P.R. China. These relationships help in developing the college's programmes and activities and help to keep the training up to date and relevant. An office of the college has been opened in Wuhan since the last evaluation and one of the directors frequently travels to P.R. China to market the activities of the college, as well as to maintain key relationships and an understanding of needs in Hubei. The signing of a couple of cooperative agreements are examples of successful outcomes of those efforts.

IGQ Golf College advises that the college's office in China helps attract high-quality trainees by screening prospective applicants. One of the directors conducts an initial interview with applicants to ascertain their motivation, determination and suitability before they are accepted into the desired programme. The college has a policy of allowing a trial period to determine the suitability of the programme to the needs of the student, to be used if necessary.

The college does not emphasise getting trainees to complete a qualification. This is mainly due to the golf industry perception of the value of demonstrable skills over qualifications, but is also partly due to a technical inability to meet the handicap requirement by some trainees. Given this perception, the evaluation team believes

*Final Report*

that the design and/or structure of the programmes may need to be reviewed to confirm whether the handicap requirement is set at a realistic level or whether it should be a requirement at all, especially for the Diploma in Golf Coaching programme. A regular, systematic review of programmes with input from the industry and other educators would be a great benefit in establishing and maintaining the relevance and currency of the programmes.

#### 1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

The evaluation team observed that the professionalism and technical expertise of the coaches at IGQ Golf College are of a high standard. All coaches are highly qualified, successful golf professionals, who demonstrate strong passion for training golfers, are current members of the Professional Golfers' Association of New Zealand and receive professional training in coaching skills, as well as support and ongoing development through the association.

The director of coaching conducts observations and provides feedback to each individual coach at least once per quarter. A feedback model has been designed and implemented to ensure consistency in the provision of feedback by different coaches. The evaluation team found IGQ Golf College to have a good grasp of dealing with some of the elements of golf assessment. A one-to-one, coach-to-trainee training model is implemented, with a ratio of one coach to no more than five trainees while training out on the golf course. There is strong evidence of individual attention given to each trainee, and a system of individual progress reporting is in place using computer-aided visual technology to record and analyse individual trainee's performance, and further investment is planned for other computer software programmes to enhance the training experience. The evaluation team saw evidence of the effectiveness of individual training in terms of developing golfing skills. This evidence is further supported by the high level of satisfaction from trainees interviewed by the evaluation team.

IGQ Golf College would gain valuable information from monitoring the overall training progress of its cohort at an organisational level. The managers were unable to provide a high-level summary of the educational performance of the organisation. The evaluation team found the college's practice of 'reporting by exception' limiting, especially taking into consideration that the college is planning to expand and is expecting to increase enrolment numbers by four times over the next two years. The lack of a system to report and monitor trainees' collective progress to provide information for decision-making at board and/or management level is a potential risk that should cause concern for the college if it expands according to its plans.

## 1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

IGQ Golf College supports its trainees well. The new role of administration manager has been filled in a recent restructure of the organisation, with the incumbent praised by trainees for being caring and effective in looking after their wellbeing, both on and off-site. The office in China, which primarily acts as a marketing outpost, has been effective in being the liaison point between the college and trainees' parents. Information provided to prospective trainees is accurate and up to date as the college's marketing staff in the China office are direct employees. There is an effective communication channel between the Christchurch headquarters and the China office, using the internet and cloud technology.

With no public transport options available, travel to and from the Coringa Golf Club may be an issue. The college is currently exploring various options to address this.

Nevertheless, there is abundant evidence that the trainees thoroughly enjoy their time in New Zealand and their wellbeing is being looked after. For example, events are organised to recognise ceremonial dates of cultural significance to trainees. NZQA concerns in 2013 arising from the validation visit have been addressed and the college is now compliant with the Code of Practice for the Pastoral Care of International Students.

## 1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Adequate**.

IGQ Golf College has a clear vision and purpose. The college has been effective in using its competitive strengths, in terms of its ability to deliver practical golf training at very reasonable prices (from the perspective of Northeast Asians), and has developed a comprehensive strategy and marketing plan for expansion primarily for the Chinese market. The expertise and connections of the current board members provide significant benefits to complement the college's business development strategy. In terms of business performance, IGQ Golf College presents a sound business plan and positions itself as a sustainable commercial operation in a market with potential.

The shareholders appear willing to invest in the venture, with plans in place for significant capital investment in the infrastructure of the college (technology and premises). In line with the forecast expansion, the organisation has taken on more

contracted coaching staff and restructured to support its business development activities.

The college uses an appropriate assessment measure (the handicap figure) and therefore has access to a centralised record of trainees' progress through the professional association with which all trainees must be registered. This rich data is currently under-used at an organisational level. The planned expansion of the college and the forecast increase in trainee numbers (as a result of the college's successful partnership arrangements with various Chinese tertiary institutes) will result in IGQ Golf College operating in a significantly different context in the near future. Risks arising from self-assessment capability, although not yet realised, is a matter to which governance and management must give due consideration and respond to accordingly.

IGQ Golf College runs a very good commercial golf training enterprise, with a view to capitalise on the potential for expansion. However, the evaluation team noticed the lack of understanding at governance and management level about operating a private training establishment in alignment with the requirements for NZQA registration. IGQ Golf College is required to maintain its NZQA registration in order to enrol international trainees for any programmes over three months. The college does demonstrate a strong understanding of golf training, applying an individual apprenticeship model and delivering highly positive employment outcomes to the majority of its trainees. Given its current size, and taking into account all relevant factors, the evaluation team concludes that the college's performance, processes and systems are sufficient for its current primary objective. However, if the college expands as projected, then an increased awareness of NZQA requirements and expectations is required.

## Focus Areas

*This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.*

### 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Adequate**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Adequate**.

### 2.2 Focus area: International students

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

### 2.3 Focus area: Diploma in Golf Coaching (Level 5)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Adequate**.

### 2.4 Focus area: Diploma in Tournament Golf (Level 5)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Adequate**.

# Recommendations

NZQA recommends that IGQ Golf College:

- Enhance the capability of the college's governance and/or management to strengthen understanding of the operating environment for a private training establishment in New Zealand.
- Consider ways to improve the qualification completion rates for the Diploma in Golf Coaching (Level 5). The college could achieve this by, for example, reviewing the programme's graduation requirements (whether the current requirements are reasonable and relevant, given most trainees of the programme – whether meeting the handicap requirement or not – appear to gain employment in the golf industry nevertheless).
- Implement a systematic scheduled review of the programmes with a view to maintaining currency and relevancy.
- Explore ways to further enhance collation, analysis and use of the data about graduate destinations.

Further evolve self-assessment practices, including methods of data analysis, to support the future growth of the college.

# Appendix

## Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

*External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.*

*This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.*

*The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.*

*External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.*

*External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website ([www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)).*

*The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.*

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E [qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz](mailto:qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz)

[www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)

*Final Report*