

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

## Community Support Services ITO Limited trading as Careerforce

Highly Confident in ITO performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 9 November 2017

# Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction .....	3
1. ITO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review .....	6
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	8
Summary of Results .....	9
Findings .....	11
Recommendations .....	27
Appendix .....	28

MoE Number: 8144  
NZQA Reference: C24324  
Date of EER visit: 13-16 June 2017

# Purpose of this Report

*The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the industry training organisation's (ITO) performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, trainees, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the ITO itself for quality improvement purposes.*

## Introduction

### 1. ITO in context

Name of ITO:	Community Support Services Industry Training Organisation (Careerforce)
Location:	Level 1, 189 Willis Street Wellington
Gazette recognition date:	18 March 2021
Gazette coverage:	<p>Pursuant to section 5(1) of the Industry Training and Apprenticeships Act 1992, the Community Support Services Industry Training Organisation is recognised as an Industry Training Organisation for the following industries:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• for the health and disability sectors, including: aged care, addiction, allied science and technical health, core health, dental support, health promotion, home and community support; intellectual, physical and sensory disability, mental health, rural health, palliative care, primary care, public health, and secondary health care, except where the workforce is covered by the Health Practitioners Competence Assurance Act 2003;</li><li>• for the social and community sectors, including: child development, community work, counselling, employment support, Iwi/Māori social services, Pacific Island social services, refugee and migrant services, social services, Tamariki Ora - Well Child Services, youth work, and whānau ora;</li></ul>

- for workforces focussed on the development, protection and safety of vulnerable New Zealanders, including: abuse, neglect and violence, child poverty, in-home educators, offender rehabilitation, restorative justice, social housing, social advocates, suicide intervention, teacher aides, the children's workforce, whānau/family and foster care, whānau and family services, and youth justice; and
- for cleaning, caretaking and the urban pest management industries.

Ambulance, first aid, injury prevention, pre-hospital emergency care, occupational health and safety, pharmacy, state services-related public administration and management are excluded from Careerforce coverage as they lie within the coverage of other standard-setting bodies.

Number of qualifications registered on NZQF:	38 (made up of 22 National Certificates, two National Diplomas, 11 New Zealand Certificates, three New Zealand Diplomas)
Number of standards registered on NZQF:	891
Number of trainees:	4,014 Standards Training Measures (STMs) 8,564 trainees as at 31 January 2017
Number of staff:	97
Number of registered workplace assessors:	1,277 registered assessors (including 126 available for mobile assessing)
Distinctive characteristics:	Careerforce supports sectors rather than industries, working closely with government, national peak bodies and employers to support the sectors it serves.

Central to this support is the identification of needs in workforce competence and the development of employer training solutions that meet those needs and align with government initiatives.

The majority of Careerforce training is carried out in the workplace, under an 'employer-led' model. Support to learners is mainly via the employer.

Careerforce has support systems in place for initial training and professional development of educators and assessors. When needed, Careerforce will organise contract assessors and support.

Careerforce works directly and closely with employers (in their own workplaces) to help them identify their specific workforce development needs and to tailor training supports to meet them.

Recent significant changes: In 2013 Careerforce had approximately 50 staff and total operating revenue of \$12.26m. In 2017 Careerforce has 97 staff and total operating revenue of \$19.44m, which represents substantial growth in a relatively short period of time.

In 2016 Careerforce launched its Apprenticeship Programme for the New Zealand Certificate in Health and Wellbeing (Level 4). Enrolments for 2016 across the sectors where Careerforce has both active apprentices and other trainees show a significant growth in apprentices.

In line with the ITO's commitment to pathways for young people, in 2016 Careerforce joined a consortium of ITOs under the umbrella Got A Trade? Got It Made! The campaign aimed to raise the profile of careers in trades and services for young people. Another area is ensuring high schools have access to the Gateway programmes to gain real-world experience working in the health and wellbeing and cleaning sectors.

Auckland is one of Careerforce's largest areas of growth by trainees, along with Wellington. In 2015 Careerforce opened an office in South Auckland which has supported the growth in engagement with stakeholders and has provided higher levels of administrative support for the field team and assessor support team.

Previous quality assurance history: Careerforce's previous external evaluation and review (EER) visit was in June 2013, and the report was published in September 2013. NZQA was Confident in both Careerforce's ITO performance and its capability in self-assessment.

The Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) conducted an audit of Careerforce in December 2015, to 'review compliance with the legislative requirements and conditions defined in the Tertiary Education Commission's funding confirmation ... including funding from the Industry Training Fund'. Two findings and related recommendations were made:

'TEC need to be notified of Ministry of Health funds administration and;

Careerforce need to hold NZQA course approval letters to provide evidence to TEC that all changes to original approvals were attained formally.'

Careerforce has taken action to ensure that both recommendations are now embedded in its practices.

Other:

Careerforce has been actively involved in the Targeted Review of Qualifications, leading reviews of qualifications for all its sectors except Pest Management which was led by the Primary ITO. The organisation is completing the development of New Zealand qualifications and resources for workplace delivery. Careerforce has developed 12 New Zealand Certificates and six New Zealand Diplomas, which have been listed on the New Zealand Qualifications Framework.

## 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The four focus areas below were suggested by the Careerforce senior leadership team in consultation with the NZQA evaluation team. These focus areas provide sufficient depth and breadth across the nine sectors of the organisation and cover significant changes since 2013. This allowed the evaluation team to explore how well Careerforce is performing its statutory functions.

### **Governance, management and strategy**

The response to the substantial growth in staffing and operating revenue noted above – and increased complexity – has required significantly more sophisticated strategy, planning and operational activities. The governance and management structures, processes and practices have evolved significantly since the last EER and are an important area of focus in evaluating the effectiveness of the ITO.

### **New Zealand Certificate in Health and Wellbeing (Level 4) (Social and Community Services) and New Zealand Certificate in Health and Wellbeing (Level 4) (Brain Injury Rehabilitation)**

These 120-credit apprenticeship programmes were launched in 2016 and is a key growth area for Careerforce. The programmes were developed in consultation with the sector to meet current and future needs and to provide training support to grow the number of qualified support workers for a sector with an ageing population and increased demand on mental health services. Apprenticeship is a departure from the traditional training arrangements at Careerforce and resulted in the creation of a new team and new systems and processes to support apprentices. The apprenticeship is delivered online using My Path<sup>1</sup>, and an evaluation framework was developed for the apprenticeship which evaluates three areas: access, achievement and outcomes.

### **New Zealand Certificate in Cleaning (Level 2)**

The National Certificate in Cleaning was a new addition to Careerforce's suite of qualifications in 2013 and was selected as a focus area for this reason. Since that time, Careerforce has made significant changes to the programme through consultation with a range of employers as a result of the Targeted Review of Qualifications. As a result, trainees in the National Certificate in Cleaning increased from 129 in 2013 to 914 at the end of 2016. With the release of the New Zealand Certificate in Cleaning (Level 2) in 2015 there were 749 active trainees at the end of 2016.

### **Certificate in Health and Wellbeing – Health Assistance (Level 3)**

The completion rate for this qualification has been comparatively low at around 25 per cent, a consequence of an unregulated workforce. Most workers doing this qualification are part-time and very transient in nature and so do not complete the qualification. Careerforce has worked with various government agencies to recognise the role of these workers in the health sector.

---

<sup>1</sup> Careerforce's online digital learning platform which supports workplace learning.

### 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/for-providers/keydocs/index.html>) [Refer to ITO supplement]. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

The evaluation team of four met with staff from the TEC and NZQA's Tertiary Assessment and Moderation team to gain information to inform the on-site evaluation.

The evaluation team spent four days interviewing and viewing documentation at the Careerforce Wellington office.

During the on-site visit, the evaluators interviewed the board chair, the chief executive, the senior management team, section area leaders, Careerforce workplace advisors, apprenticeship and vocational pathway advisors, moderation managers, product and resource development staff, on-job assessors, and many support staff. The evaluation team held telephone interviews with a number of stakeholders, including employers, apprentices and trainees and graduates. The lead evaluator interviewed two board members by phone.

Prior to and during the EER visit, the evaluators considered a wide range of information provided by Careerforce. The evaluators requested and considered additional Careerforce documents during the visit.



# Summary of Results

## Statements of confidence on ITO performance and capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance and **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Community Support Services ITO Limited trading as Careerforce**.

Careerforce is meeting the needs of the health and wellbeing and cleaning and caretaking industries very well. Employers, apprentices, trainees and government agencies attest to Careerforce's responsiveness to their needs. Examples of met needs are outlined throughout this report.

Systematic needs analysis across the organisation by way of research, surveys and evaluation is ensuring that most industry, trainee and government needs are well understood. The organisation is proactive in its critical reflection and analysis of data as well as the development of improved processes.

Extensive engagement with industry by board members, the chief executive, the senior leadership team, workplace assessors and apprenticeship and vocational pathway advisors provides current and effective information about skill and training needs across the sectors. This information is regularly analysed and used effectively to inform changes or updates to standards and qualifications. For example, extensive sector consultation led to the level 4 New Zealand Certificate in Health and Wellbeing apprenticeship offered in 2016.

Careerforce uses a variety of needs analyses and ongoing research to gather, inform, discuss and identify actions to improve the managing of training and the training requirements of most of its stakeholders. Careerforce understands the value that its training provides from the positive feedback received from employers and trainees.

Careerforce has taken a leadership role in the NZQA-initiated Targeted Review of Qualifications and the rationalisation of qualifications across a range of providers has developed strong, ongoing working relationships between individuals, most peak bodies and Careerforce staff.

The one notable exception has been in the field of aged care training. Representatives of the aged care industry's national body are strongly of the view that Careerforce's communication has not been timely, clear or consistent, and that these problems are of long duration. As a result, the board of the national association has lost confidence in the relevance of some training and qualifications facilitated by Careerforce. Further discussion of this dissenting view of Careerforce's performance is covered under Findings 1.6.

Careerforce won the 2016 AUT Business School Excellence in Business Support Award (Not for Profit Category) for their commitment to supporting organisations to achieve success through workplace training.

Careerforce understands government priorities and is using government funding appropriately to upskill workers in industry and is supported well by its industries. This finding is supported by a 30 per cent increase in TEC funding in 2017 and is shown by the increased cash contribution employers have made over time – from 27 per cent in 2015 to 37 per cent in 2016.

Outcomes data and information from key research projects provide valid and effective advice to industry, employers and trainees regarding the skill development needs and future trends of its industries, and has contributed to goal-setting and strategic direction. This provides a high level of assurance that the organisation understands the needs of most of its stakeholders.

Given the nature of the sectors in which Careerforce operates, qualification completions are good and have remained between 60 and 76 per cent over the last four years. This is below the ITO average (78 per cent for 2016), but is a high achievement in an unregulated workforce which is part-time and very transient in nature.

Employers have tended to focus on their employees gaining the necessary skills without completing a qualification, and Careerforce has done well in encouraging employers to support employees to gain qualifications. Careerforce is working to change community attitudes about their workforce and undertakes research projects to understand how well their efforts create value for the stakeholders, with a constant focus on improvement. Research outcomes (completions data and uptakes for programmes) are showing there is a growing sense of value for the workers and the functions they provide.

Work with various government agencies has been ongoing to ensure recognition of the role of the unregulated sector in the cleaning and health sector. This recognition has recently come about and qualification rates will rise as workers completing the qualification will be rewarded with higher pay and more regular hours.

The organisation has a clear purpose and direction and is well led by a highly effective sector and industry skills-based board and senior management team. They set high-level strategic goals and drive robust processes to identify the current and future priorities of Careerforce. The board researches innovative ways of working as a standard-setting body to meet the current and future skills needs of its industry sectors and to ensure the ITO meets its statutory functions.

Careerforce has effective processes that contribute to training outcomes. It is meeting the most important needs of employers, industry, trainees and government agencies.

# Findings<sup>2</sup>

## 1.1 How well does the ITO understand and meet the needs of industry, trainees and government?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Careerforce provides valid and effective advice to industry, employers and trainees regarding the skill development needs of its industries. It does this in many ways, including through robust research. Since 2014, key research projects have included: profiling the unregulated health and disability workforce using 2013 census data (leading to the development of the Kaiawhina<sup>3</sup> Workforce Action Plan with Health Workforce New Zealand<sup>4</sup>, a five-year plan with a 20-year forecast); evaluating how well Careerforce supports family carers to gain a qualification; evaluating dementia unit standards for trainees and employers (Open Minds, Open Doors); and evaluating a new approach to assessment.

The ITO is meeting the need for skilled workers, as demonstrated by the number of trainees with the qualifications. To support this, outcomes data and information from the research projects has contributed to goal-setting and strategic direction. For example, research on assessment led to the development of the REAL (respectful, efficient, applied, living) model. REAL facilitates workplace training through a 10-step process that recognises employer and trainee needs. It matches these needs to a customised trainee qualification package and uses the online My Path tool.

Trainees across the programmes in focus for this EER consistently reported that the key learning for them was that they had increased their critical thinking skills and ability to self-reflect. Both attributes had led to improved on-job performance and greater job satisfaction. These outcomes were confirmed by a range of employers. For many trainees, these are their first qualifications, representing a significant milestone for them. Careerforce has taken a leadership role in the

---

<sup>2</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

<sup>3</sup> Kaiawhina is the overarching term to describe non-regulated roles in the health and disability sector. The term does not replace specific role titles, for example: healthcare assistant, orderly, mental health support worker.

<sup>4</sup> Health Workforce New Zealand is a business unit within the Ministry of Health set up in 2009 to provide national leadership on the development of the country's health and disability workforce. Its work is overseen by an independent board with members from business and across the health sector.

NZQA-initiated Targeted Review of Qualifications and has developed 12 New Zealand Certificates and six New Zealand Diplomas. The collaboration required by the review (to rationalise the numbers of qualifications across a range of providers) has developed strong, ongoing working relationships between individuals, most peak bodies and Careerforce staff. These relationships encourage ongoing dialogue and the potential for increased understanding of how well qualifications are meeting stakeholder needs.

On the other hand, the board of the New Zealand Aged Care Association reported a long-standing concern about the quality of communication and the relevance of some training and qualifications facilitated by Careerforce. Owners and chief executives of aged care homes represented on the board believed that strategic consultation in this area was a gap. This breakdown in the relationship with a key stakeholder, and actions arising, is discussed in greater length later in this report (Findings 1.6).

Careerforce uses a variety of needs analyses and ongoing feedback (workplace visits, peak body engagement, trainee and employer surveys, moderator meetings, on-job registered workplace assessors, website responses) to gather, inform, discuss and identify actions to match the training to the needs of its stakeholders. A good example of this was the extensive sector consultation that led to the apprenticeship being offered in 2016. The apprenticeship programme is growing in numbers, indicating that it is meeting trainee and employer needs well.

The proactive partnership model and professionalism observed across the ITO has enabled the organisation to maximise opportunities with stakeholders and, in some instances, exceed stakeholder expectations. For example, industry attributed the increased uptake in cleaning qualifications during 2013-2016 to the increased interest, respect and enthusiasm shown by Careerforce personnel.

Population demographics will add to the need and demand for a qualified workforce particularly in the aged care sector. Pay equity, guaranteed hours of work and an aging population requiring care will highlight the contribution made by groups of workers that have traditionally been unseen and undervalued in New Zealand society. The need and ability to balance current and future training needs is well understood and supported by a highly competent and experienced chief executive and a board with strong governance, business acumen and sector connections and influence.

## 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for employers and their trainees?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Careerforce training provides very good value for the stakeholders. This value is shown in many ways. One significant point is the professionalisation of the industry through training. Traditionally, the industry sectors covered by Careerforce have not had much status and have suffered from being unregulated minimum-wage sectors with high staff turnover. Workers in these sectors were largely undervalued and their skills were not appropriately recognised. With the recent developments in pay equity and guaranteed hours of work and minimum levels of training, this situation is beginning to change. Careerforce is working to change community attitudes. As a result of research, there is a growing sense of value for the workers and the functions they provide. NZQA consistency checks of the programmes that Careerforce administers have confirmed the reliability of the graduate outcomes.

New qualifications have been drafted for the sectors covered by Careerforce as a result of the Targeted Review of Qualifications. These new qualifications have been designed by an industry-led consortium in which Careerforce was a guiding influence. It is intended to tie these qualifications to the pay rates for the workers in each sector. In one sector, there was an immediate pay rise in July 2017 for trainees with the relevant qualification. This will give more incentive for workers to gain their qualifications. For employers, Careerforce research has shown that for higher levels of training the economic return is significant.<sup>5</sup>

The acquisition of qualifications by the workers will provide credentials and create a consistent standard of skill in each sector. The qualifications will give recognition of transportable skills throughout the sector, and the qualified employee will be regarded as an asset. The REAL and recognition of prior learning processes used by Careerforce help to recognise prior knowledge and skills. Trainees and apprentices work and earn wages during the training period. This means they are not burdened with student loans and can provide the employer with tangible work output during the training.

Employers have noted that the trainees develop confidence and a sense of self-worth through completing the training. These attributes can lead to the trainees making positive changes in their lives. The trainees also gain an extra level to their understanding of the job: they understand not only what they are supposed to do but also why they are doing it. This deeper understanding also heightens the trainees' problem-solving skills and makes them more valuable to their employers.

---

<sup>5</sup> Return on a level 2 programme is \$1 for \$1 invested. A good number of trainees go on to level 3 training. The level 3 cleaning certificate shows \$4.50 return for every \$1 invested by the employer in the training.

The training makes the stakeholders more aware of the importance of the work they are doing, and how collectively it has far-reaching importance for the country. This concept of holistic training, accentuated by the Kaiawhina initiative, is now being studied by overseas interests to see if they can also use it.

Careerforce understands government priorities and is using government funding appropriately to upskill workers in industry. This finding is supported by a 30 per cent increase in TEC funding in 2017. Employer confidence and support is shown by the increased cash contribution employers have made over time: 27 per cent in 2015, rising to 37 per cent in 2016.

Careerforce has a very good understanding of the value that its training provides. For the most part, this assurance is gained from the positive feedback received from employers and trainees. Values are an intrinsic part of the way Careerforce works, as much of its work is in caring for others. There is a prevailing culture at Careerforce to understand how well their efforts create value for the stakeholders, with a constant focus on improvement. Training in the industry sectors covered by Careerforce are areas of interest for the New Zealand government, particularly the aged care and mental healthcare sectors.

### 1.3 How well do trainees achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

For 2013-2016, qualification completions have remained between 60 and 76 per cent (Table 1). In spite of this being slightly below the sector average, across the years the gap is closing rapidly and the result is high performance by the ITO given the nature of the health and wellbeing and cleaning sectors. Robust assessment and moderation processes give credibility to this achievement.

Careerforce is meeting its TEC performance targets for credit and programme completions and the percentage of learners achieving a minimum of 10 credits per year. This is in line with ITO sector performance. Careerforce's industry training fund allocations have increased since 2013, and forecasting and delivery is considered reliable and supported by health sector projections.

Careerforce compares its targets and identifies patterns and deviations. It monitors the impact of changes with comprehensive analysis of the achievement of Māori, Pasifika and learners under 25 years overall and within each sector. The progress year to date is compared with the same period the previous year.

**Table 1. Careerforce – participation, credit and programme completion rates for trainees and apprentices (2013-2016)**

	Participation		Credit achievement				Programme completion			
	2014	2015	2013	2014	2015	2016**	2013	2014	2015	2016**
All	-	-	66% (72%)*	68% (76%)*	74% (80%)*	73% (80% trainees) (57% apprentices)	60% (74%)*	64% (72%)*	70% (75%)*	76% (78%)*
Māori	20%	20%	19%	63%	67%	69%	-	57%	60%	74%
Pasifika	12%	13%	10%	60%	74%	67%	-	56%	71%	70%
Under 25s	9%	9%	9%	67%	69%	70%	-	56%	61%	65%

\*Performance of all ITOs; \*\*2016 data is provisional; Source: data provided by Careerforce and TEC reports

Workers in the various sectors have generally been very low paid. Most workers tend to be part-time and may have two or more jobs. This has been a deterrent to completing qualifications. Employers have also been reluctant to encourage employees to complete qualifications as this leads to greater employee mobility. Hence, employers have tended to focus on their employees gaining the necessary skills without completing a qualification.

Careerforce has done well in encouraging employees to gain qualifications. The new legislative direction that recognises the qualifications of this unregulated workforce and ensures that this is accompanied with pay equity and regularising of work hours has contributed significantly to qualification uptake. There is already evidence for this in the level 4 health and wellbeing qualification where the apprentice programme is showing high growth (numbers of apprentices have increased from 55 to 362 within a year of commencement).

In the level 3 health and wellbeing qualification, the completion rate has been comparatively low at around 25 per cent. This sector has been most severely affected by the working conditions of this unregulated workforce. As noted, legislation now ensures that carers who were on the minimum wage receive a pay rise of between 15 and 49 per cent, depending on their qualifications. The legislation will lead to greater uptake of qualifications, and completion rates should rise, as workers completing the qualification will be rewarded with higher pay and more regular hours.

Since the cleaning area was taken over by Careerforce, the number of trainees has increased from around 45 to a fairly stable 600. There was a spike in 2015 when the number of trainees doing the National Certificate in Cleaning rose to 1,042. This was mainly due to the Multi-Employer Collective Agreement (MECA) between district health boards and E-tū which provided differential pay rates for cleaners based on qualifications.

Training has always taken place in the cleaning sector, but there was a reluctance to credentialise this training in a formal qualification. This reluctance came about mainly due to high staff turnover – ranging from 20-70 per cent – reducing the incentive to invest in staff skills. The collective agreement also specified only an extra 35 cents per hour for qualified staff.

However, qualification completions in the cleaning sector are beginning to show a steady increase from a 2013-2015 average of 70 per cent to the current 86 per cent. This has come about as cleaning agencies have become more aware of the need for highly trained cleaners, especially in places like hospitals where the penalties for poor cleaning are extremely high. Careerforce is able to give an indication of the value cleaning can add to employers and the benefits of having a qualified workforce.

Qualification completion rates have been raised through strong on-job support and guidance provided by Careerforce workplace advisors and apprentice and vocational advisors. These staff members support both the employer and the employee so that qualifications can be completed. As noted in Findings 1.2, graduates not only achieve the qualifications but are often then more secure in their jobs. From interviews it was evident that such support is valued and provides useful information to maximise completions.

#### 1.4 How effective is the training arranged by the ITO?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Careerforce has an excellent understanding of the needs of the various sectors it represents and provides highly effective training to meet those needs.

Careerforce has had to convince employers that the ITO will provide formalised, structured training and have evidence that they have met that promise. The board and leadership team looked at every other ITO model before deciding on a particular model. Care was taken with the knowledge that this vocational grouping is not all about technical skills, as in other, regulated sectors – it is more about care and respect for the person. Careerforce-supported training is delivered using the REAL approach. It is designed to develop real skills that make a positive difference to everyday work practices and uses a 10-step process that recognises employer and trainee needs.

Careerforce works on a value system that supports their approach and mission while doing the above. The quality of provision is through direct engagement with employees and trainees. The ITO has developed an appropriate mix of training, apprenticeship and traineeships, to ensure that trainees acquire relevant skills for the workplace. The ITO monitors the progress of apprentices and trainees while supporting them to succeed.



The recently (2016) introduced REAL approach to training (see Findings 1.1 for overview) has been well received by employers, assessors and trainees. It makes on-the-job training efficient as it focuses on learning to fill the gaps in skills and knowledge needed for the specific role. New learning can then be applied immediately on the job. REAL empowers employers, trainees and assessors. It empowers trainees by recognising current competencies, observing and assessing on-job practical activities (naturally occurring evidence), and providing the ability to choose (by logging in online) when to learn theory aspects of a qualification. It empowers employers by recognising their existing workplace systems and processes, and working with these to increase overall workplace capacity and capability. REAL empowers workplace assessors by acknowledging their skills and experience and upskilling them to be competent to assess their workmates.

Careerforce is taking seriously their role of arranging training by encouraging the training via workplace advisors and apprenticeship and vocational pathway advisors and working within the sector. Three of these advisors work with apprentices to track and support the trainees to maximise their performance. In preparation for more apprentices enrolling, three more will be trained up shortly. Support and guidance is also provided by Careerforce workplace advisors, who make regular visits on site to engage with the trainees and to track progress and provide any related advice.

Careerforce advisors are in constant contact with both trainees and employers. They act as observers and monitor training effectiveness using training plans and My Path. Feedback is by email and day-to-day interactions. Students requiring support are identified at the commencement of the course. For example, literacy and numeracy deficiencies are identified with the Literacy and Numeracy for Adults Assessment Tool for further support where necessary. A high proportion of those who are given further support show progress in literacy and numeracy.

A qualification pathway for workplace training is in place, acknowledging the differences among iwi around Tikanga<sup>6</sup>, protocol and cultural identity. Careerforce showcases the success of Tangata<sup>7</sup> who have completed Careerforce qualifications.

Barriers to achievement beyond the managed training include the level 2 trainees leaving before moving to the level 3 qualification, or the level 3 not being offered by employers as a result of having to pay higher wages. This will no longer be possible after July 2017 in the health and wellbeing and, more recently, the disability sectors.

Careerforce is proactive and works to reduce barriers to achievement. An example is the three-month stand-down before trainees enrol to allow them to decide

---

<sup>6</sup> Māori customs, rules, values and ideologies.

<sup>7</sup> A Māori term of the indigenous peoples of New Zealand and literally means 'people of the land', from tangata, 'people' and whenua 'land'.

whether they want to commit to the training. There has been a fast uptake of the level 4 apprenticeships which shows the success of this training arrangement.

Early evaluation of the apprenticeship programme shows meaningful change in the way apprentices are approaching their work and their clients. Non-apprentices have seen the benefits of the apprenticeships and are keen to enrol. Careerforce has commissioned research from the New Zealand Council for Educational Research to support this finding, which will be published in 2017.

The apprenticeship programme was evaluated using a new evaluation framework tool to understand how well the programme was working six months after commencement. Assessors, employers and apprentices noted the effectiveness of the training arrangements and could identify many areas of difference in their work and the workers. However, My Path and resourcing were seen as needing more development. The evaluation framework tool was seen to be of considerable value and is now being used for consistency and programme reviews.

Development of apprenticeship and trainee skills and knowledge is achieved through on-job training, enabling skilled and experienced supervisors to track and support the trainees to maximise their performance. An example of maximising performance is employers adapting and mapping their induction and orientation package to the level 2 health and wellbeing training resulting in increased qualification outcomes for their staff.

Cleaning training arranged by employers takes place in the workplace, and the ITO was able to show from employer survey feedback that all the learning experiences were part of the trainees' daily activities and responsibilities, with naturally occurring evidence being used to assess competency. The learning is about the 'why' of cleaning as well as cleaning skills. The increase in those wanting to gain a level 2 cleaning qualification indicates the effectiveness of the training arrangement. From feedback from employers and trainees it was identified that those working in the workplace have been more on-job focused and reflect on what they are doing in their work. This was confirmed from evaluator discussions with employers and trainees.

Positive feedback from employers and graduates interviewed confirmed strong correlation between the training and better efficiencies. Evidence of the worthwhile outcomes of qualified staff was shown in the cleaning and infection control training in one hospital ward. The ward had a 95 per cent efficacy rate from infections which was higher than usual. As a result, the qualification was rolled out to other wards.

Careerforce has developed the capability to manage and make the best use of training. Trainees are supported to achieve by ensuring programme design and assessment are customised to the particular industry. The ITO plans to ensure they will have the required number of registered assessors to conduct assessment to meet the growth in achievement as a result of the pay equity and apprenticeship programme.

## 1.5 What is the quality of the assessment being undertaken towards industry standards and qualifications?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Careerforce is meeting its obligations for assessment and moderation well. Assessment is an important part of the learning process as it provides verification that the trainee can meet the requirements of the learning outcomes/graduate profile of the programme. These outcomes must be valid, reliable, consistent, and fair. Careerforce has put renewed emphasis on this area in recent times. Originally, moderators at Careerforce did their moderation duties in conjunction with other tasks. This is now a consolidated role with the moderators only engaged in moderation. Internal and external<sup>8</sup> moderation is now combined and performed by the same unit at Careerforce. Careerforce has identified a need for more staff and resources to be employed in the area of moderation, business plan to this effect has been approved by the board and changes to the resources for moderation are in the process of being actioned.

The assessment practice used by Careerforce is standard for this type of work-based training. Trainees learn on the job and are assessed by the registered assessor after their work-based supervisor verifies that the trainee is ready. Any part of the assessment that is not initially achieved by the trainee is able to be done again until the trainee demonstrates competence. The assessor reports the results, and forwards the paperwork to Careerforce. Careerforce shows it has a commitment to assuring the quality of its training outcomes and is meeting its statutory obligations and assuring that quality assessment is being undertaken.

Assessment is carried out by people who meet the Careerforce Consent and Moderation Requirements<sup>9</sup> of Careerforce. Assessors must hold standard 4098 and have industry qualifications at least to the level they are assessing, or an equivalent amount of industry experience. Moderation is primarily carried out to check the work of the assessor. New assessors are usually from the workplace where the training is taking place. They undergo assessment training and work with a moderator to support them to develop into the assessor role. Each assessor is generally moderated annually on a sample of three standards and is rated according to the outcome. If there is a problem with the performance of an

---

<sup>8</sup> Internal moderation deals with the work-based training, in the form of traineeships and apprenticeships, administered by Careerforce. External moderation is of the assessment of private training establishments and institutes of technology/polytechnics who use the standards leading to qualifications administered by Careerforce.

<sup>9</sup> Ref: 0024 Consent and Moderation Requirements (CMR) for Community Support; Health, Disability, and Aged Support; Human Services; Social Services; Urban Pest Management; and Cleaning and Caretaking (version 8) <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/nqfdocs/maps/pdf/0024.pdf>

assessor, the results are not reported until the assessments are independently re-marked. When the assessor starts in their role, they are moderated more intensively to help the assessor to learn the process.

Effective systems of feedback are employed to discuss areas of improving practice with the assessors, including a risk matrix for moderation of assessments using a traffic light system to highlight action required. Training providers are surveyed to find out what works well and what could improve.

There are around 1,160 Careerforce assessors, and the few non-performers do not have their registration renewed. Each standard is reviewed once every five years, but the standards are not being well managed to ensure the quality of outcomes. If a problem is detected with a standard, it is moderated sooner.

Currently there are two national moderators (soon to become four), so the ratio of moderators to assessors is quite low. The assessors interviewed by the evaluation team said they seldom saw the moderators. The assessors attend moderation workshops and cluster meetings to allow peer moderation and moderation training. This has been effective in ensuring consistency of assessment. Assessment of specialist areas, such as mental health issues, are allocated to contracted specialist moderators who have subject knowledge that contributes to valid outcomes.

Some standards used in Careerforce training are administered by other standard-setting bodies, such as NZQA, The Skills Organisation and Service IQ. These standards are moderated externally by these bodies. Careerforce is performing consistently to standard in the NZQA moderation results and is compliant with NZQA-managed systems, but is not assessing against other ITO standards. Careerforce engages in the pre-moderation of assessment material produced by providers to ensure it is fit for purpose before the material is used.

## 1.6 How well does the ITO's governance and management support the ITO to meet its statutory functions?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Careerforce is accountable to industry training in seven sectors. In its various engagements, Careerforce has demonstrated good awareness of the distinctive characteristics within each of these sectors. Management and communication have been customised sector by sector and management reports to a representative board. In most instances, this approach has been highly effective.

The one exception has been with respect to the aged care industry. The New Zealand Aged Care Association, a key stakeholder whose members employ 40,000 staff, has strongly expressed its concern about the quality of Careerforce's

communication and the relevance of some training and qualifications facilitated by the ITO. The Pay Equity qualifications equivalence process brought the issues to a head for the association. According to the association's representatives, Careerforce has failed to engage adequately on strategic training matters and the implementation of the new qualification equivalence arrangements. These representatives reported frustration with the way Careerforce has managed the process, even while acknowledging that the timeframes placed upon Careerforce by the settlement arrangements were tight.

Notwithstanding retaining good relationships with some individual New Zealand Aged Care Association members, and the doubling of enrolments from the sector over the past six years, Careerforce acknowledges that its larger relationship with the association, especially its board, needs substantial improvement. Remedial actions, including mediation, have already begun. NZQA will continue to monitor progress here, to ensure that Careerforce re-engages effectively across the aged care sector, and achieve the same high levels of success that it has managed in its other areas of gazetted coverage.

Overall, the Careerforce board is effective and skills based, with sector representation and an appropriate structure to provide oversight of the sectors' education and training activities. The board and management team take a proactive approach to exploring new ways of working as a standard-setting body and industry training organisation to meet its industry sector needs. Several board members have attended Institute of Directors training to develop governance capability. The ITO has critically reflected on its effectiveness as a governance body, and has adopted a process for the periodic review of board members and policies.

The board monitors overall ITO performance against strategies and key performance indicators and relies on the information provided to build their knowledge and understanding of the ITO, its issues and its performance. As outlined in Findings 1.1, outcomes data and information from research projects have contributed to goal-setting and strategic direction. The need and ability to balance current and future training needs is well understood, but the board's systems may need to be reviewed regularly to respond to rapid growth.

The leadership team has considerable expertise both in education and industry, and the overall organisational structure includes appropriate personnel to support Careerforce to meet its statutory functions.

The ITO is in hiatus in terms of numbers/growth, but as a result of government legislation around pay equity is poised to take advantage of an influx of workers requiring qualifications. Effective strategies and investment are in place to support future growth without compromising effectiveness.

The senior management team and aligned staff have been actively involved in and have taken a leadership role in the NZQA-initiated Targeted Review of Qualifications. Management worked to support staff to arrange training in the

healthcare sector by investing in the apprenticeship model and ensuring the review process was carefully managed. As a result, Careerforce has been recognised for excellence in its support of the health and wellbeing sectors and was named winner of the Not for Profit category of the AUT Business School Excellence in Business Support Awards 2016.

Careerforce reached beyond the shareholders/stakeholders to commissioners and agencies, i.e. district health boards and the Ministry of Justice to get traction for qualifications for their sector. Employers did not want qualifications and did not want employees with competencies they could not use. The Targeted Review of Qualifications process enabled Careerforce to develop a suite of qualifications that provided a career pathway for those either working or wishing to be employed in the sectors they supported. Careerforce needed to develop a plan for the unregulated workforce of the sector and gave the type of worker the name Kaiawhina.

Careerforce uses efficient and effective management of funding to produce the best possible training for the funding provided. There was a net financial loss in 2016 as a result of the required investment in assessment structures. Careerforce recognises that public funding comes with obligations to ensure that funding is well managed including reasonable assurance that financial reporting is correct. The ITO has successfully met this obligation, as shown by a 30 per cent increase in TEC funding in 2017 and an increased cash contribution by employers – from 27 per cent in 2015 to 37 per cent in 2016. The willingness of industries to provide these cash contributions is an important test of the relevance and value of the services offered by ITOs.

ITOs operate in a changing and challenging environment which generates risks and uncertainty. The Careerforce board has adopted a systematic approach to managing risk. It provides oversight to ensure risks are continually identified and managed, and to ensure compliance with legislation and external reporting requirements to the TEC and NZQA.

The board has taken direct responsibility for managing major risks. This ensures risk is now central to discussions and is on the agenda at board level each meeting. The board receives periodic reports on the ITO's compliance and is informed of any significant breaches.

Careerforce has a highly effective board and leadership structure for setting skills standards and for determining and monitoring training delivery. This includes accountability and reporting to government.

## Focus Areas

*This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.*

### 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for ITO performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Refer Findings 1.1-1.6.

### 2.2 Focus area: Health and Wellbeing (Level 4) (Social and Community Services) and Health and Wellbeing (Level 4) (Brain Injury Rehabilitation)

The rating in this focus area for ITO performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

An apprenticeship in health and wellbeing is a training programme to support roles in health, disability, mental health and addiction, social services and rehabilitation. Each Careerforce apprenticeship is built on the philosophy of creating a person-created, thinking workforce.<sup>10</sup>

The programme was launched in 2016 after extensive community consultation. This programme is innovative because, traditionally, apprenticeships related directly to trades. This is the first such programme in health and social services and is being watched with interest internationally.

The rapid growth in numbers, from an initial enrolment of 55 to over 500, is testimony to the success of the programme. Careerforce expects the number of apprentices to rise to 2,000 by 2018.

The programme is designed to enable people working in the sector to get a qualification while still earning. It is built around the employer's capability and capacity to provide support to the apprentices. This has enabled a number of more mature people working in the sector to get regular work and be recognised for what they do and have done for many years. Over 50 per cent of apprentices are aged between 38 and 57. These people have been a critical part of the sector, delivering care to the sick and the needy, but were paid very little and very often had irregular hours of work. If the person they were caring for, for instance, had to be hospitalised, they would be left without work and pay.

---

<sup>10</sup> The New Zealand Certificate in Health and Wellbeing (Level 4) Apprenticeship programme is a 120-credit programme with a common core of 80 credits and specialist strands of 40 credits. It takes 18 months to complete. The specialist strands are in social and community services; primary care practice assistance; and rehabilitation.

The apprenticeship programme is delivered online and apprentices are supported by apprenticeship and vocational pathway advisors. The advisor works with the employer and the employee to ensure that the apprentice has the opportunity and time to do all the necessary course work. The advisor is also responsible for ensuring consistency of assessment through peer reviews and working closely with the national moderators.

The advisor is responsible for all pastoral support for the apprentice, including giving them feedback from their assessment, monitoring progress and helping with the online system.

Changes to the apprentice that have been observed include:

- Change in attitudes – they have become more aware of the role they play in the care of their client and how it fits the bigger picture
- A more holistic view of health matters
- Being better informed
- Having a greater impact on their client and their communities.

The client also benefits from the programme as they have a carer who has a greater understanding of health and wellbeing and is able to not only support them in their basic functions but also help them in wider aspects of their life, such as giving up smoking.

The workplace benefits from having workers who are not only capable of doing the necessary work but also understand the importance and relevance of what they do and can adapt to an individual client's needs. The apprentices will be more committed to working because they have regular hours.

Finally, the community benefits from the programme because many of the skills and attitudes learnt through the programme are taken back to the apprentice's private life and shared with their families and communities, which contributes to healthier communities.

### 2.3 Focus area: Certificate in Cleaning (Level 2)

The rating in this focus area for ITO performance is Excellent.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is Excellent.

This qualification is suitable for people entering the cleaning industry and is also designed to recognise the skills and knowledge of those already employed. Careerforce was part of a consistency review for this qualification in July 2016 and met requirements. (This qualification was a focus area in the 2013 EER and received ratings of Good/Good.)



There are over 35,000 people<sup>11</sup> (70 per cent female) in the New Zealand cleaning industry. Most of them are employed by companies that operate on a contract basis for customers. A high proportion of employees are aged over 35 (73 per cent) and many were born overseas (31 per cent). The cleaning industry provides cleaning services for commercial and domestic premises including residential and health care facilities.

The strategy adopted for the development of qualifications in the cleaning sector was to identify key employers and to work with them to review qualifications and develop competencies within qualifications that meet the needs of the sector. As with the health and wellbeing sector, the workplace benefits from having workers who are not only capable of doing the necessary work but also understand the importance and relevance of what they do. For example, in the hospital sector the quality of cleaning is vital to infection control, and there is evidence that training leads to a drop in rates of infection. Trainees and employers noted an increased sense of professionalism as an outcome of the training.

The relevance of the certificate (the first to be successfully developed for online learning) is confirmed by the growth in cleaning trainee numbers – from 129 in 2013 to 914 trainees in 2016. The industry has a high proportion of trainees with no qualifications or little English and/or numeracy problems. Careerforce supports workplaces to identify literacy and numeracy needs in their staff with the development of user guides for workplace trainees/assessors. A total of 1,663 trainees enrolled in the Certificate in Cleaning between 2013 and 2016, indicating that the qualification is meeting both employer and trainee needs very well. There were 254 graduates with 45 different employers in 2015, with 171 being awarded the qualification with the optional Health Care Facilities Cleaning endorsement.

## 2.4 Focus area: Health and Wellbeing – HealthCare Assistance (Level 3)

The rating in this focus area for ITO performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

This qualification was developed to recognise the skills and knowledge required to provide person-centred support in a health and wellbeing context. Careerforce was part of a consistency review for this qualification in July 2016 and met requirements.

As noted under Findings 1.3, the level 3 health and wellbeing qualification completion rate has been comparatively low over the past four years, at around 25 per cent. Most workers doing this qualification are part-time and very transient in nature and so often do not complete the qualification. This workforce is

---

<sup>11</sup> Figures supplied to Careerforce by Statistics New Zealand and are based on the 2013 census.

unregulated and as a result has had mostly unsatisfactory working conditions and low remuneration. Careerforce has worked with various government agencies to gain recognition for the role these workers play and the work they do in the health sector by ensuring pay parity. Higher pay and more regular hours depend on the worker completing the qualification.

# Recommendations

NZQA recommends that Careerforce work closely with the New Zealand Aged Care Board to improve communication and strategic and operational engagement between the two entities to ensure all concerns within the industry are suitably addressed.

# Appendix

## Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

*In 2009 NZQA introduced the evaluative approach to quality assurance in the tertiary education sector, consisting of self-assessment and external evaluation and review. This is applied in the quality assurance of programme approvals and accreditations under sections 249 and 250 of the Education Act 1989, as well as for training schemes (section 251), consents to assess against standards (section 252) AND PTE registration under Part 18 of that Act.*

*The NZQA Board also published policies and guidelines for the conduct of external evaluation and review of ITOs on 27 May 2010. NZQA relies on ITOs to build the self-assessment and external evaluation and review model into their infrastructure. ITOs will be evaluated on their infrastructure and use of the model in the following ways:*

- *Advising Ministerial recognition of an ITO under the Industry Training Act, 1992*
- *Accepting arrangements for monitoring and assessing of industry training under section 10 of the Industry Training Act 1992*
- *Registering standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards*
- *Awarding consents for ITOs (or their assessors) to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards under section 252 of the Education Act 1989*
- *Applying programme approval criteria where ITOs are course owners.*

*External evaluation and review is also used by NZQA as a monitoring and evaluation tool, with the outcomes of these processes informing Tertiary Education Commission decisions relating to re-recognition of an ITO. In addition, external evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions in relation to an investment plan agreed between an ITO and the Tertiary Education Commission. The understandings and expectations for the implementation of ITO quality assurance are set out in a protocol to the Memorandum of Understanding between NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission.*

*This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the policies and criteria approved by the NZQA Board. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the ITO's performance and capability in self-assessment.*

*External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website ([www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)).*

*Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process is summarised in the publication *Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and**

*Review. Two other documents explain how the process is applied to ITOs: EER Policy and Guidelines – ITO Supplement and Evaluation Indicators for Industry Training Organisations. These documents are available at:  
<http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-for-eer-ito/introduction/>*

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E [eeradmin@nzqa.govt.nz](mailto:eeradmin@nzqa.govt.nz)

[www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)