

Report of External Evaluation and Review

JTP Consultants
trading as Te Kotahitanga Training

Highly Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 31 July 2014

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	5
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	6
Summary of Results	7
Findings	9
Recommendations	16
Appendix	17

MoE Number: 8329
NZQA Reference: C14703
Dates of EER visit: 28 and 29 April 2014

Final Report

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	JTP Consultants Limited, trading as Te Kotahitanga Training
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	28 Frances Street, Manurewa, Auckland
Delivery sites:	One, as above
First registered:	1 May 1996
Courses currently delivered:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Training for Work – Commercial Road Transport (stream A); Forklift Training (stream B); Hospitality (stream C)• Youth Guarantee (Hairdressing) (Salon Support (Level 3)
Code of Practice signatory:	N/a
Number of students:	Domestic: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Around 80 Training for Work places• 12 Youth Guarantee places• 87 per cent Māori and/or Pasifika enrolments International: nil
Number of staff:	10 full-time equivalents
Scope of active accreditation:	Te Kotahitanga Training has consent to assess against a wide range of unit standards up to level 4 on the New Zealand Qualifications Framework

(NZQF). This includes core generic standards. The full range of unit standards is available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/nqf-accreditations.do?providerId=832943001>

In addition, Te Kotahitanga Training has accreditation to award three qualifications:

- National Certificate in Business Administration and Computing (Level 2)
- National Certificate in Computing (Level 2)
- National Certificate in Hairdressing (Salon Support) (Level 3)

Distinctive characteristics: Te Kotahitanga Training has elected not to charge fees for any education/employment services.

Recent significant changes: In 2013, all former education programmes funded via Foundation Focused Training Opportunities ceased (with the conclusion of government funding for all such programmes).

In 2014, Te Kotahitanga Training has largely re-orientated its focus towards Training for Work initiatives which are funded by the Ministry of Social Development. This programme focuses on employment readiness and facilitating employment opportunities for Ministry of Social Development clients who have experienced long-term unemployment. Training for Work programmes have a 13-week duration. This is a significant change in provision type (towards employment brokerage) for Te Kotahitanga Training.

Te Kotahitanga Training also delivers a Youth Guarantee programme. This is orientated towards retaining youth (16-19 years) within education and obtaining NCEA credits. Hairdressing is the thematic area of this provision.

Previous quality assurance history: NZQA undertook a first evaluation and review of Te Kotahitanga Training in 2010. At that time, Te Kotahitanga Training was found to be Highly Confident in educational performance, and Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment.

Te Kotahitanga Training has an annual audit by the New Zealand Transport Authority, in relation to

its Commercial Road Transport employment programme. The last audit was in 2013, and Te Kotahitanga Training retained its approval to deliver this service. The audit noted some operational areas for improvement which have subsequently been addressed by Te Kotahitanga Training.

Other:

Te Kotahitanga Training is a Māori education and employment provider. Its core values, which underpin all activities and services, are:

- Matauranga
- Oranga
- Tipuranga
- Whakawhanaungatanga

Te Kotahitanga Training is focused on providing entry-level tertiary education programmes that provide a pathway to employment and/or higher-level study. Its programmes are tailored towards learners seeking to re-enter the workforce or undertake formal study, typically after an extended period of unemployment. As noted above, there is also educational provision for youth (learners aged 16-19) whose educational needs have not been well met in the school sector.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The agreed scope of the external evaluation and review was:

- Governance, management and strategy
- Training for Work (Commercial Road Transport)
- Youth Guarantee (Hairdressing)

Governance, management and strategy is a mandatory focus area. Training for Work (Commercial Road Transport) was selected as it is the largest programme offered by Te Kotahitanga Training. Youth Guarantee (Hairdressing) was selected as it is an area of long-term provision by Te Kotahitanga Training.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document *Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review* available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eeer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

The evaluation team comprised two evaluators. The team visited Te Kotahitanga Training on 28 and 29 April 2014. Meetings and interviews were held with:

- Company executive director (sole directorship)
- Executive director and operations manager (overall responsibility for quality and academic assurance)
- Three tutors involved in the Commercial Road Transport programme
- Youth Guarantee tutor
- Learner support officer
- Current learners in Commercial Road Transport (10 learners)
- Current learners in Youth Guarantee Hairdressing (seven learners)
- External stakeholders including former learners (graduates), a former staff member, an employer representative, and representatives from other tertiary education organisations¹
- Ministry of Social Development contract manager (telephone discussion).

In addition, the evaluation team reviewed a range of operational documentation, including strategic planning materials, staff meeting minutes, a quality management manual, enrolment information and policies, course design information, and samples of delivery and assessment materials. The evaluators undertook a sample review of all materials tabled.

This documentation complemented the self-assessment information that had been submitted by Te Kotahitanga Training prior to the external evaluation and review.

¹ The former staff member was also present as a representative of another tertiary education organisation.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance of **JTP Consultants Limited trading as Te Kotahitanga Training**.

There is clear and comprehensive evidence that Te Kotahitanga Training is meeting the most important needs of learners and other stakeholders and that this results in positive learner outcomes. Primarily, for learners within Training for Work programmes (people who have experienced long-term unemployment), their expressed need is for a new skill that is directly linked to new employment opportunities. This is met through the provision of the Class 2 licence with the programme of study. Evidence from employers, graduates and learners supports the quantitative data presented by Te Kotahitanga Training that this programme makes a significant difference in the learners' employment and social outcomes. Te Kotahitanga analysis indicates that the labour market outcomes for Commercial Road Transport were 54 per cent in 2011, 52 per cent in 2012, and 61 per cent in 2013. In the words of graduates, 'the programme is life-changing', and the evaluation team also found supporting evidence of this in employer and broader stakeholder feedback.

For Youth Guarantee learners, the keystone need is the provision of education that facilitates transition to higher education and apprenticeship training within their desired professional area (Hairdressing). Evidence presented indicates that this need is also being met, and successful completion of this programme leads to further training and employment in this sector. Supporting data provided indicates average credit achievement – over a 36-week programme – of 46 in 2011, 26 in 2012, and 24 in 2013.

This evaluation has also found strong evidence of effective processes that contribute towards the outcomes noted above. These include effective teaching practices, clear strategic and management processes, suitable resources, structured course design, and ongoing student social support. The evaluation has not found any significant gaps or weaknesses within the processes and practices applied by Te Kotahitanga Training.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **JTP Consulting Limited trading as Te Kotahitanga Training**.

Te Kotahitanga Training has a highly effective self-assessment approach which is applied to all programmes and all areas of operation. The approach applies the six key evaluation question areas used within this report, and therefore has strong alignment with the quality expectations of NZQA.

Evidence shows that the self-assessment methodology is applied continuously and formally reviewed annually. Continuous application means Te Kotahitanga Training staff and management always have current information on the progress of learners against desired outcomes, including social and academic outcomes. This information is used to both understand learner needs and to support learners. Numerous excellent, clearly linked examples of the use of this information – leading to improved educational performance and other valuable outcomes – were noted during this evaluation.

The annual review involves a week dedicated to discussing and implementing granular process changes to improve quality. In total, the approach of Te Kotahitanga Training allows the organisation to gain useful insights into its practices, using valid and relevant data – which ultimately contributes to quality educational performance outcomes.

Findings²

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Within Training for Work provision, Te Kotahitanga has a dual focus on readying trainees for employment and securing employment opportunities. Accordingly, self-assessment identifies labour market outcomes as a key success measure. Te Kotahitanga analysis indicates that its labour market outcomes for Commercial Road Transport were 54 per cent in 2011, 52 per cent in 2012, and 61 per cent in 2013 (refer table below).

	2011	2012	2013
Positive labour market outcomes	54%	52%	61%
Number of credits received	3	4	8
Overall occupancy	75%	93%	75%

These outcomes met contract targets set by the Ministry of Social Development, and the PTE is satisfied that these are appropriate outcomes for this cohort of learners. Te Kotahitanga Training also considers that it is on track to deliver on 2014 contracted targets.³ As the majority of learners are Māori/Pasifika, there are no discernable statistical differences across student cohorts.

The evaluation team is satisfied that these employment outcomes for long-term unemployed are challenging but realistic targets for individual learners, and that Te Kotahitanga is successful in meeting its objectives in this area. Interview comments from graduates and learners also support this finding. Secondary objectives, including the number of credits achieved and overall occupancy, are also being met and reported on throughout self-assessment processes at Te Kotahitanga Training. These outcomes are appropriate for the duration of training offered (13 weeks, which includes a four-week work placement opportunity).

² The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

³ Due to contracting changes, Commercial Road Transport is the only programme that can be assessed over a three-year period, as other Training for Work programmes have only just commenced. Additionally, Te Kotahitangi Training advises that it has not presently obtained outcome levels established within its 2014 contract, but expects to do so as outcomes increase throughout the year.

In the Youth Guarantee programme there is a strong focus on credit achievement to allow progression towards higher-level study.⁴ Data provided indicates average credit achievement – over a 36-week programme – of 46 in 2011, 26 in 2012, and 24 in 2013. This evaluation notes that the funding arrangements and eligibility for this programme have altered in 2014, which means multi-year data comparisons are not presently possible. Based on the self-assessment information provided, and learner comments, the evaluation team considers the results in this area are satisfactory, particularly within the context of the challenging social issues presented by the learners (discussed within Findings 1.5). Learners on the Youth Guarantee (Hairdressing) programme are also predominantly Māori/Pasifika, and there are no discernable statistical differences for these cohorts.

Self-assessment practices include tutors maintaining a running record of academic progress and social outcomes, which are reviewed by managers on a weekly basis. Outcome reports and assessment completion reports are also undertaken weekly, and on a programme basis. In addition, Te Kotahitanga Training sets aside one week each year to reflect on achievement and self-assessment results, and to plan for the year ahead. Given these approaches, the evaluation has found that self-assessment of learner outcomes is multi-layered and meaningful and results in ongoing self-improvement.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

This evaluation has found strong and convincing evidence that learners and stakeholders consider that Te Kotahitanga programmes deliver useful skills and knowledge. In particular, graduates commented positively on the practical skills achieved, which led directly to new employment opportunities for them. Numerous examples were provided to the evaluation team of sustainable employment arising from Te Kotahitanga programmes, and through positive and meaningful sector relationships. Such comments were made in reference to both Hairdressing and Commercial Road Transport. (Note that for Commercial Road Transport, obtaining a Class 2 licence within the programme of study was considered to be the key success factor, by learners, graduates and employers.)

In order to find employment placements, tutors at Te Kotahitanga maintain relationships with an increasing range of local employers. Evidence provided suggested that there is a careful matching of learners to employers in order to best facilitate opportunities for ongoing employment. To aid this process, Te

⁴ This includes achieving relevant NCEA credits.

Kotahitanga also has a learner support officer, who provides supplementary career advice.

In addition, Te Kotahitanga Training maintains a positive relationship with education organisations that offer higher-level education within relevant areas. Locally, the Manukau Institute of Technology, for example, provides the next level of hairdressing training and indicated a strong and positive working relationship with Te Kotahitanga to ensure learners can progress their studies and move into apprenticeships.

Overall, the evaluation team found that Te Kotahitangi is highly engaged with its community, including its local marae, relevant employers and other education organisations. This has occurred through conscious effort, and is driven through active engagement strategies that are well reflected in annual self-assessment plans. Because of this approach, a number of graduates of Te Kotahitanga described their learning outcomes as 'life-changing'.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Learners in Commercial Road Transport desire a Class 2 drivers licence (allowing them to legally drive buses or trucks). The programme is entirely orientated around this outcome. To achieve this, the programme is matched against the requirements of the New Zealand Transport Authority, and standard materials from the Motor Industry Training Organisation are used to deliver the theory components of the programme. This delivery design and approach ensures the programme is well matched against the needs of learners and sector stakeholders. The other key programme resource is the truck used for training. This is a new vehicle. A maintenance schedule is in place, and reserve vehicle arrangements are also available if required.⁵

The Youth Guarantee Hairdressing programme is orientated around the National Certificate in Hairdressing (Salon Support). This is a level 3 NZQF qualification designed as an introductory qualification for this sector (i.e. it is the first level of qualification available). All students participating seek to become hairdressers, and are aware that success through this course will allow them to access further training at Manukau Institute of Technology or with other providers. Accordingly, the programme is well matched to the aspirations of all learners. Further to this, Te Kotahitanga Training has actively sought to align its programme to dovetail with the

⁵ Through an arrangement with a rental company.

higher-level training at Manukau Institute of Technology, to ensure there is no repetition of material. Evidence from a Manukau Institute of Technology staff member indicates that this approach has worked successfully in better preparing students for future studies. In delivering this programme, Te Kotahitanga uses materials and assessments that are pre- and post-moderated by the Hairdressing Industry Training Organisation. This ensures a match against industry needs. Staff, students and sector stakeholders all commented that the resources required for this programme were also well matched to needs. (Te Kotahitanga has a full 'training salon'.)

Te Kotahitanga has clear self-assessment processes to ensure a continuing match of its programmes with student and sector needs. This includes, for example, regular surveying of relevant parties on the appropriateness of provisions, and collating and responding to achievement data. Feedback provisions include student and stakeholder surveying, meetings with key stakeholders, and documented self-assessment sessions.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

In the Youth Guarantee Hairdressing programme, the primary tutor has relevant experience, sector knowledge and qualifications. The tutor-student class ratio is 1:12 or less. Youth learners felt that the primary tutor had strong industry skills.

In Commercial Road Transport, three tutors are involved in various components of the programme, each with a particular speciality (core generic skills, driving instruction, workplace support). All tutors have relevant and significant experience, and all are highly regarded by learners, graduates and employers for their subject knowledge and rapport. Learner satisfaction surveys consistently rate these tutors highly. All tutors have, or are in the process of obtaining, qualifications in adult education. Class ratios are also 1:12 or less.

However, Commercial Road Transport learners found that some theory materials from the Motor Industry Training Organisation were challenging. The evaluation also found that the programme design— with the core tutor out 'on the road' with one or two learners at a time – meant it was not easy for other learners to progress their studies more independently.⁶ Through its self-assessment processes, management is aware of this issue (the amount of self-directed learning) and indicated that it is difficult to address this matter without greater staffing numbers.

⁶ As other tutors would be scheduled to work with other cohorts of learners at this time.

Tutors in all programme work to clear programme guides, which are developed and maintained in accordance with the PTE's quality management system and the annual self-assessment review. This process includes ongoing monitoring of learner achievements (social and academic) to ensure the effectiveness of teaching. Oversight of teaching by means of clear job descriptions, useful teacher observation and annual performance review are effective in monitoring and maintaining effective teaching practices.

Te Kotahitanga is using the online literacy and numeracy assessment tool. However, evidence of effective use of results was not clearly demonstrated. Programme assessments are based on relevant industry training organisation or NZQA standards, and evidence of effective internal and external moderation processes was sighted. Based on the information reviewed, the evaluation team is satisfied that assessment processes are fair, valid and transparent.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Te Kotahitanga has employed a student support officer whose role is to assist students with social issues that arise. There are a range of social issues present among the learners, including drugs and alcohol, homelessness, pregnancy and whānau support, and benefits. Accordingly, this role is orientated towards ensuring students can access appropriate external support. Students throughout Te Kotahitanga Training were aware of this support, had used it, and highly valued it (including the individual undertaking this role). Te Kotahitanga Training also has a range of relationships with support bodies, such as the local marae, to assist learners with these social needs.

Career counselling is also a foundation element of programmes, and allows students to make clearer choices of study options. Programmes typically have a two-week withdrawal window if the programme is not well matched to the learner.

In response to industry needs, the Commercial Road Transport programme has a compulsory drug test integrated within the programme. Not all learners were aware of this on enrolment, which was resulting in some programme withdrawals. There is an opportunity for Te Kotahitanga to review its programme prospectus materials and student course guide to ensure this component is well understood from the outset.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Te Kotahitanga Training has strategic and management documentation in place, and evidence was presented to demonstrate how this is used to guide services. The planning is comprehensive and detailed, and orientated around ensuring learners and staff have positive experiences at Te Kotahitanga Training.

In alignment with the core value of whakawhanaungatanga, numerous students and graduates commented on the friendly and family atmosphere they experienced at Te Kotahitanga, and gave examples of social initiatives, such as barbeques, used to strengthen relationships and enhance personal well-being.

Staff also indicated that they felt valued and that their needs were met through appropriate teaching and delivery resources. Examples of these were provided (such as easy access to teaching resources and investment in a new vehicle for training purposes). Management staff said there are no current legal or ethical matters arising, and the organisation remains financially stable. The chief executive is also involved in sector-wide initiatives, and has an active role in engaging with government officials on policy design on behalf of a grouping of Māori education providers. This allows Te Kotahitanga Training to be aware of and to respond promptly to changes in policy and funding settings, which have been significant in the last few years.

This evaluation has found strong self-assessment practices relating to governance and management, in particular very clear quality management processes, explicit self-review sessions, and regular sessions with staff to discuss best practice and optimal services for the learners. The cumulative result is highly effective governance and management support, which permeates throughout Te Kotahitanga Training and underpins consistent and continuing positive educational outcomes for learners and other stakeholders.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

2.2 Focus area: Programmes – Youth Guarantee

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

Stronger evidence of student success and long-term outcomes is required in this focus area.

2.3 Focus area: Programmes – Training for Work provisions

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

Recommendations

NZQA recommends that Te Kotahitanga Training:

1. Ensure all programme requirements (such as drug testing) are made explicitly clear to prospective learners before enrolment
2. Gather further data on educational and career pathways of the youth cohort to better demonstrate the effectiveness and relevance of current provision
3. Ensure responses to New Zealand Transport Authority audits are documented within internal quality management processes alongside other quality assurance evidence to ensure full alignment of quality assurance processes.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz