



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

External Evaluation and Review Report

Endeavour Technical Training

Date of report: 27 July 2021

About Endeavour Technical Training

Endeavour Technical Training (ETT) provides practical training programmes for young people interested in a career in the automotive industry.

Type of organisation:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	Level 1, 140 The Square, Palmerston North
Code of Practice signatory:	Yes
Number of students:	Domestic: In 2020, 33 (25 equivalent full-time students) including 13 Māori students and one Pasifika student International: nil
Number of staff:	Three full-time equivalents
TEO profile:	Endeavour Technical Training (NZQA website)
Last EER outcome:	In 2016, NZQA was Confident in educational performance and Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment. ¹
Scope of evaluation:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Governance, management and strategy• New Zealand Certificate in Automotive Engineering (Level 3)²
MoE number:	8465
NZQA reference:	C45343
Dates of EER fieldwork:	28 and 29 April 2021

¹ In 2016, Endeavour Technical Training (called Mara Marketing Limited) had been recently sold and became part of Endeavour Education New Zealand Limited.

² From 2021, this is the sole programme delivered by ETT.

Summary of Results

ETT is meeting many of the important needs of its learners. However, learner outcomes and organisational performance have been negatively impacted by staffing changes and related issues. Since 2019, academic management and self-assessment processes have been reviewed, and there is some evidence of their improved effectiveness contributing to valued outcomes.

Not Yet Confident in educational performance

- ETT students are gaining useful practical skills and theoretical knowledge. Overall course completion rates have declined since the previous EER.
- Some students go on to further study and/or employment. ETT is strengthening its focus on developing work-ready graduates with the required knowledge, practical skills, attitudes and personal attributes to meet industry expectations.

Not Yet Confident in capability in self-assessment

- ETT delivers hands-on learning in an inclusive and supportive environment to students who have varied educational backgrounds and personal circumstances. ETT gathers and responds to student feedback.
- Teaching staff have relevant industry experience and are supported to build teaching capability in a collegial team environment.
- Since 2019, ETT has reviewed priority areas and made changes to programme delivery, learner support and administrative processes, and is becoming more systematic in self-assessment.
- Outcomes since the previous EER are not strong enough for a Confident rating. There are some – very recent – indicators of improving outcomes and contributing processes. There is insufficient evidence, as yet, of the impact of changes and that improvements will be sustained.

Key evaluation question findings³

1.1 How well do students achieve?

Performance:	Marginal
Self-assessment:	Marginal
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Student achievement rates have declined since the previous EER (see Appendix 1, Tables 1-2). The poor achievement rates and trends are attributed to staff changes, historic inconsistencies in marking standards (now being addressed), and programme changes. Māori student achievement is variable over the period (see Table 3).⁴ Achievement rates also reflect a high drop-out rate, although no specific analysis of withdrawal data or trends was available.</p> <p>ETT students have achieved literacy and numeracy gains, including some significant gains. This was a particular focus in the level 2 programmes (not offered in 2021). Students acquire theoretical knowledge and practical skills for the automotive industry. There is also anecdotal evidence of students' improved 'soft' skills and attributes, which are meaningful outcomes for this learner group.</p> <p>ETT closely monitors individual progress, including attendance rates and unit standard achievement; 2021 data for these indicators is promising.⁵</p> <p>ETT does not routinely aggregate achievement data for review. However, steps are being taken to better understand withdrawal rates as a basis for improvement.</p>
Conclusion:	Overall student achievement rates are low. ETT is focussing on increasing student engagement and wellbeing and reducing early withdrawals, to improve achievement rates. Regular review of achievement data could strengthen the evidence base for improvement purposes.

³ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

⁴ Pasifika student numbers are very low, reducing the validity of statistical analysis.

⁵ However, no information on unit standard achievement rates prior to 2021 was provided.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

Performance:	Marginal
Self-assessment:	Marginal
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT programmes provide generic and industry-specific skills for employment in a range of roles within the wider automotive industry, and/or further study, including progression to an automotive engineering apprenticeship. These opportunities are valuable for the students, many of whom have limited prior educational achievements. This is confirmed by STAR/Gateway co-ordinators, youth social services and justice agencies who refer clients to ETT.</p> <p>Stakeholder engagement has been largely informal. ETT has undertaken several surveys of industry stakeholders to meet external requirements⁶ and, more recently, to gather information on the level 3 programme offered in 2021.⁷ In general, stakeholders confirm the relevance of ETT programmes and note the importance of personal skills and attributes and workshop experience for successful employment.</p> <p>Information on student destinations is incomplete prior to 2020, although efforts have been made to contact all ex-students. The data that is available shows variable performance across the level 2 and 3 programmes (refer Tables 4 and 5). ETT reports poor retention in apprenticeship programmes.</p> <p>Recent initiatives to improve performance include a more structured approach to engaging with ex-students and graduates, to offer ongoing support and to strengthen destination information. Recently ETT established an employment support initiative with Work and Income.</p>
Conclusion:	Educational performance, self-assessment information and processes have been inconsistent. ETT is now developing a more structured approach to gathering and using feedback, to improve programme relevance and the employability of the graduates.

⁶ NZQA consistency reviews for the New Zealand Certificate in Foundation Skills (Level 2) (2019) and the New Zealand Certificate in Automotive Engineering (Level 3) (2020).

⁷ NZQA approved a programme change application from ETT for the New Zealand Certificate in Automotive Engineering (Level 3) in December 2020.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT has made changes to delivery of the level 3 programme.⁸ Instead of individual self-paced learning using workbooks, students now all work on the same unit standard. Two tutors are now available for classroom teaching and practical sessions. Literacy and numeracy teaching is embedded in the curriculum rather than taught by a specialist tutor. There is an increased focus on 'real-world' application and experience (such as Monday workshop clean-ups and job cards). Staff and students report satisfaction with the changes, including new teaching and learning resources that are more relevant and engaging.</p> <p>ETT is ensuring that students receive a basic introduction to automotive engineering and are also prepared for employment through an emphasis on punctuality and reliability, teamwork, communication skills and health and safety protocols. Work experience is currently not available, although it is considered important by some employers.⁹ ETT is establishing a process to support students to acquire their drivers' licences.</p> <p>Assessment and internal moderation processes are in place to ensure consistency and maintain standards. ETT also participates in external moderation cluster meetings and has met the requirements of standard-setting bodies.</p> <p>Tutors have industry experience and qualifications and are being supported to develop their teaching capability. Programme improvements are identified through regular meetings and student and stakeholder feedback.</p>
Conclusion:	ETT has a good understanding of automotive industry requirements and learner needs. Ongoing monitoring will be important for evaluating the impact of changes made in 2021.

⁸ From 2016-20 ETT also delivered level 2 programmes (foundation and vocational pathways) and STAR/Gateway programmes.

⁹ Work placements were suspended during COVID-19. These are optional and not currently a core part of the programme.

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT has effective processes for understanding learning needs, setting goals and providing ongoing support. These include interviews with prospective students and whānau, literacy and numeracy testing, orientation and regular conversations to discuss progress. ETT also provides access to external support services such as alcohol and drug awareness programmes.</p> <p>ETT has an organisational commitment to Te Whare Tapa Whā.¹⁰ Although this framework is not well understood by all staff, ETT has a holistic approach to student support and wellbeing, and the learning environment is participatory.</p> <p>Tutors are accessible and approachable. Students have opportunities to apply their knowledge and practical skills as they prepare for assessment. Individual review sessions with tutors do not occur as frequently as planned. However, in addition to informal engagement, students can offer feedback in end-of-term surveys and Monday class meetings, and via a suggestion box.</p> <p>Students are establishing social and academic support networks through groupwork, field trips and social opportunities. Staff publicly acknowledge students' positive attitudes and behaviours.</p> <p>ETT has strengthened systems for recording and sharing information on student progress and wellbeing, which are discussed at regular staff meetings.</p> <p>ETT completed a reflective self-assessment against the outcomes of the interim domestic Code and has identified areas for improvement.</p>
Conclusion:	Consistent and effective support and guidance is appropriate for the learner group and their various educational, social, personal and health issues. Student feedback is gathered and acted on.

¹⁰ <https://www.health.govt.nz/our-work/populations/maori-health/maori-health-models/maori-health-models-te-whare-tapa-wha>

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Marginal
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT's organisational and educational performance since the previous EER has been disrupted by staff changes and related issues.¹¹ Enrolment numbers and learner outcomes have declined over the period. Review and improvement activities – focussed on effective teaching and learning and strengthening industry relationships – have been recently underway to provide greater assurance of academic quality and a sustainable future. It is too early to determine their sustained effectiveness.</p> <p>ETT responded to the COVID-19 lockdown with regular staff and student communications and increasing learner access to technology. However, distance learning was challenging for many students (especially at level 2). ETT continues to develop online learning resources to augment classroom activities.</p> <p>Management is investing appropriately in teaching and learning, including workshop equipment and tools, new teaching resources and upskilling staff. In addition, systems for managing student information and data have been improved.</p> <p>The quality of self-assessment information is variable. A more systematic approach to understanding needs and evaluating outcomes is being developed. Routine analysis and review of learner achievement and outcomes data would strengthen self-assessment.</p>
Conclusion:	<p>Management systems and processes are generally effective in supporting the organisation's provision of automotive training. In responding to challenges since the previous EER, ETT is investing in improved academic quality and responsiveness to student needs. Comprehensive and systematic self-assessment will strengthen the evidence of the impact of review and improvement activities for future planning.</p>

¹¹ This includes turnover of nearly all tutorial staff including the training manager (three appointments) and three out of four tutors.

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT has generally effective processes in place to manage important compliance accountabilities including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NZQA rules and regulations, such as monitoring that delivery matches programme approval, and effective assessment and moderation processes. • International and domestic pastoral care codes, including completing annual attestations and self-assessments.¹² • Tertiary Education Commission funding – minor issues identified in the 2019 routine audit against funding conditions have been addressed. ETT has recently strengthened systems assurance for data management. • Legislative requirements such as the Health and Safety Act 2015 (online system for monitoring and reporting, and a monthly independent review of compliance) and the Vulnerable Children Act (police vetting of all staff). <p>Areas for further attention include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ETT complies with external moderation requirements relating to MITO¹³ unit standards. Currently, not all of the tutorial team meets the qualification requirements for consent and moderation for automotive unit standards.¹⁴ • ETT's quality management system is comprehensive – however, it is not fully reflective of, or integrated into, ETT operations. A review is planned for 2021.
Conclusion:	ETT's approach to management of compliance is generally sound. Weaknesses have been identified and are being addressed.

¹² ETT is a signatory to the Education (Pastoral Care of International Students) Code of Practice 2016 (including amendments 2019) but does not currently enrol international students.

¹³ Motor Industry Training Organisation

¹⁴ On 29 April 2021, ETT advised that an application for a temporary exemption from the qualification requirements had been made to MITO.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Marginal
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>ETT's director owns another PTE, English Teaching College, also based in Palmerston North. As a result, ETT has access to business and financial services and, from time to time, teaching-related support and advice. ETT's director has recently assumed the role of quality manager, which was previously shared across the PTEs. ETT accesses external advice and expertise as required, for example in programme development and health and safety management.</p> <p>Management capability has been strengthened since mid-2019 with the appointment of a training manager with educational management skills rather than automotive industry experience. This is proving useful for developing and implementing improved academic and student support systems and processes.</p> <p>For 2021, ETT management has decided to focus on the level 3 programme, and is not currently offering school programmes (STAR and Gateway) or either of the NZQA-approved level 2 programmes. The rationale is to reduce complexity and to focus resources on consolidating improvements and performance. It is not clear if any stakeholder input was sought as to the impact of this for learners who have not succeeded in education, and who previously benefited from an achievable learning pathway through levels 1-3 in 18-24 months. Stakeholder feedback gathered during the EER confirmed a strong desire for the Gateway and level 2 programmes to be continued.</p> <p>ETT reports that the needs of Māori and Pasifika learners are met within an inclusive learning environment, although there is an intention to strengthen engagement and capability in relation to these cohorts.</p> <p>Students benefit from purpose-built facilities, including well-equipped workshops, classrooms and student spaces. In addition, students have access to a variety of vehicles for</p>

	practical experience and are permitted to bring their own cars to work on.
Conclusion:	ETT management is now well positioned to support educational achievement within a collegial culture and working closely with a committed and enthusiastic tutorial team. However, further time is required to demonstrate the impact and sustainability of recent improvement initiatives.

2.2 Focus area: New Zealand Certificate in Automotive Engineering (Level 3)

Performance:	Marginal
Self-assessment:	Good

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

NZQA recommends that Endeavour Technical Training Limited:

- Continue to support tutors to build their capability and complete required qualifications in adult teaching and to meet all requirements of the industry standard-setting body.
- Continue to strengthen the self-assessment framework and adopt a more structured and systematic approach to regularly gathering and using information and data for improvement purposes and reviewing the impact of changes made.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. This include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

Appendix 1

Table 1. All programmes 2016-20 course completions (SAC* and YG) (%)**

Year	Level 2	Level 3	Combined
2016	93	74.5	86.2
2017	78.7	61.7	71.5
2018	80.2	64.5	70.2
2019	67.6	56.3	64.3
2020	56	77	67

*Student Achievement Component; **Youth Guarantee

Table 2. All programmes 2016-20 qualification completions (SAC and YG) (%)

Year	Level 2	Level 3	Combined
2016	62.5	61.5	60.9
2017	52.2	25.1	47.7
2018	51.2	43.8	49.1
2019	68.4	33.3	52.9
2020	36	35	36

Table 3. All programmes 2016-20 course completions by ethnic group (%)

Year	Māori	Pasifika	Non-Māori and Non-Pasifika	All learners
2016	86	78.5	85.9	86.2
2017	62.4	73.4	73.8	71.4
2018	56.3	63.6	75.7	70.2
2019	67.9	60.9	63.8	64.4
2020	56	0	74	67

Note: For Tables 1-3, data for 2016-19 is derived from Nga Kete; 2020 data was provided by ETT, as at 27 April 2021.

Table 4. Progression to further study – YG programmes 2016-19 (%)

Year	Progression rate
2016	43.9
2017	36.1
2018	20.8
2019	47.8

Table 5: Destination data – New Zealand Certificate in Automotive Engineering (Level 3) 2017-20 (numbers)

	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Enrolments	5	18	22	15	14
Roll-over previous year		5	6	9	8
Successful graduates		9	3	6	2
Rollover – following year		6	9	8	
Other training provider	1	2	4	1	1
Employment		1	4	9	2

Note: Employment data refers to both graduates and students who withdraw before completing.

Appendix 2

Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published rules. The methodology used is described in the web document <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- Identify organisational fraud¹⁵
- Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources
- Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.

¹⁵ NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted under the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016, which are made by NZQA under section 253(1)(pa) of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister authorised as responsible for Part 20 of the Education Act.

Self-assessment and participation and cooperation in external evaluation and review are requirements for:

- *maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities, and*
- *maintaining consent to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards for all TEOs including ITOs but excluding universities, and*
- *maintaining training scheme approval for all TEOs other than universities.*

The requirements for participation and cooperation are set through the Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2018, the Consent to Assess Against Standards Rules 2011 and the Training Scheme Rules 2012 respectively. These rules were also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Rules 2018 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2018 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes, training schemes and consents to assess and registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). All rules cited above are available at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz