

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

The Auckland East City Elim Church Trust trading as Elim Ministry Training College of New Zealand

Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 12 June 2015

# Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction .....	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review.....	5
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	6
Summary of Results .....	7
Findings .....	9
Recommendations .....	20
Appendix .....	21

MoE Number: 8475

NZQA Reference: C15746

Date of EER visit: 26 and 27 November 2014

# Purpose of this Report

*The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.*

## Introduction

### 1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	The Auckland East City Elim Church Trust trading as Elim Ministry Training College of New Zealand (EMTC)
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	198 Mahia Road, Wattle Downs, Auckland
Delivery sites:	As above
First registered:	23 April 1997
Courses currently delivered:	<p>NZQA-approved programmes are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certificate in Christian Studies (Level 4)</li><li>• Certificate in Christian Ministry (Level 4)</li><li>• Certificate in Christian Ministries (Internship) (Level 4)</li><li>• Diploma in Applied Christian Ministry (Level 5)</li></ul>
Code of Practice signatory?	Yes, for students aged 14-17 and students aged 18 upwards
Number of students:	<p>Domestic: 57 equivalent full-time students – Māori (10) 17.5 per cent and Pasifika (12) 21.4 per cent; under 25 years old (28) 49.7 per cent</p> <p>International: 6 equivalent full-time students (18 years and older)</p>
Number of staff:	6.8 full-time equivalents

Scope of active accreditation:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Christian Ministries (to level 4)</li> <li>• Christian Studies (to level 4)</li> <li>• English Language (to level 5)</li> <li>• English for Academic Purposes (to level 5)</li> <li>• English for Speakers of Other Languages (to level 5)</li> </ul>
	<p>For further details see:  <a href="http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/nqf-accreditations.do?providerId=847521001">http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/nqf-accreditations.do?providerId=847521001</a></p>
Distinctive characteristics:	<p>EMTC trains people for Christian leadership roles, offering ministry programmes with a strong practical and theological focus. The college operates from large purpose-built premises which includes an active Elim Church. The PTE delivers on site programmes, which includes applying their learning in regular visits and placements with local churches, as well as an annual trip to churches in the Pacific. Many graduates go on to work within the Elim ministry or other churches in a variety of paid and/or voluntary ministry roles.</p>
Recent significant changes:	<p>With the closure of the Christchurch campus in 2012, on-site delivery has been consolidated on one Auckland campus. A nationwide distance learning programme has also been rolled out, including four, five-day block courses on the Auckland campus.</p> <p>The Diploma in Applied Christian Ministry (Internship) received NZQA approval on 30 September 2014 to add online to the current on-site delivery. This qualification offers distant learners a second year of more advanced training and a pathway from the Certificate in Christian Ministries (Internship).</p> <p>There has been change in leadership and restructuring of roles partly in response to the above changes: an administration manager was appointed in 2013, responsible for academic quality; a distance principal, a more operational management board, and a chief executive position have also been established. The latter has just</p>

been appointed to the role. An academic board is currently being established.

The college also moved to a larger Manurewa site from the Botany-based campus in September 2013. This shift reflects a recent strategic focus on South Auckland and the large Māori and Pasifika population resident there, many of whom are active in the Elim church.

Previous quality assurance history:

The previous external evaluation and review (EER) conducted in September 2010 concluded that NZQA was Highly Confident in the educational performance and Highly Confident in the capability in self-assessment of the organisation. The PTE has engaged an independent moderator who is recognised in the sector to review their assessments. The 2012 and 2013 reports are detailed and of a high standard; overall they express confidence but recommend changes, which the PTE has addressed or is addressing.

## 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

There were two focus area selected for this evaluation. The first area is governance, management and strategy, which is mandatory. The second is Christian Ministry, which includes all qualifications the PTE delivers on site and by distance learning. This focus area was chosen because most students (68) were enrolled in this specific area of training. The same focus area was selected at the last EER, which allows for some comparison. International students were not chosen as a focus area because just six students are from overseas and this is not a strategic area for the organisation. The pastoral care of international students is addressed within key evaluation question five.

### 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

The team of two evaluators visited the Auckland site for one and a half days. The team interviewed on site or by phone:

- The founder of Elim Church along with other EMTC governance board members, all of whom are active in various roles in the Elim Church
- The college chief executive and administration manager
- On-site principal, on-site adjunct lecturers, approximately 15 on-site students on both the certificate and diploma programmes, and graduates of on-site programmes
- Dean for women, dean for men/Code of Practice (pastoral care) contact person and dean for interns
- Principal (distance learning), online lecturers and students (interns)
- Pastors from various churches.

The team reviewed a comprehensive range of documentation and data. These included: 2014 self-assessment report; annual qualification reports from 2013 for the Diploma in Applied Christian Ministry, the Certificate in Christian Ministries and Christian Studies, and the Certificate in Christian Ministries (Internship); external moderation reports for 2012 and 2013; course materials; individual student feedback; administrative and learner achievement data; two individual international student files. The team viewed video clips of weekly updates from the principal to online students, online lectures being delivered including the software platform being used, as well as the college website.

# Summary of Results

## Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **The Auckland East City Elim Church Trust.**

This organisation is meeting many of the most important needs of its students and key stakeholders. There are some highly effective processes contributing to important outcomes; however, there are a few significant gaps. The key points include:

- The college matches well stakeholder needs with accessible and relevant, practically focused Christian ministry programmes. Elim and other Pentecostal churches place a high value on the graduates, who are well prepared with knowledge, skills and attitudes, to carry out a range of roles. Nearly all graduates take up either paid and/or voluntary roles in their churches.
- The educational achievement of students is generally strong, with 81 per cent of 2013 students completing courses just below the sub-sector median. This is equal to or above comparable sector benchmarks. However, the 2013 achievement rates for Māori and Pasifika students, who comprise 35 per cent of the total, have been well below other EMTC student achievement rates. Results from the first semester of 2014 indicate that this gap is closing.
- A capable governance board, with a clear purpose, provides strong strategic direction. The management team has a wide range of expertise, offering sound leadership through mostly highly effective processes.
- Pastoral care of students is at the centre of this faith-based organisation. Staff who are qualified and experienced in pastoral care, support and train students upon graduation to perform a range of pastoral care roles. A range of processes support the students to achieve their learning goals.
- The teaching is overall sound, with capable professional leadership. The new online distance programme and teaching is innovative. Overall assessment is solid however robust external checking of assessment has identified some gaps which are being thoroughly addressed, for instance with the establishment of an academic board.

## Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **The Auckland East City Elim Church Trust.**

This PTE has developed a self-assessment culture across the key areas of the organisation. There is systematic information collection and strong analysis which assists decision-making that has led to a broad range of improvements. The key elements include:

- The board, guided by a clear purpose and analysis of data, has made a number of key long term decisions to: consolidated on-site provision to a single campus, purchased improved campus facilities in strategically important South Auckland, and developed online learning programmes to meet the needs of students and churches outside Auckland. Leadership and staffing have been restructured to support these changes, which have improved the value of the training and better meet the needs of Elim and Pentecostal churches and their students. Māori and Pasifika enrolments have increased for level 4 qualifications; this is a national educational priority.
- The development, design and delivery of a blended and innovative online programme illustrates creativity and sound evidence-informed planning. The programme is meeting well the needs of both the students and participating churches.
- Management, and the systems in place, comprehensively review performance using meaningful analysis and informing sound decision-making in numerous areas. This is evidenced by an overarching self-assessment report and ongoing annual qualification reviews leading to improved performance. Such improvements include, rising student satisfaction, more assessments being submitted on time, and considerably reduced technical issues on the distance learning programme.
- A range of thoughtful initiatives have been introduced to support the growing numbers of Māori and Pasifika students. The increased pastoral support to the students and their families include increased availability of the deans, establishment of honorary cultural advisor positions, scholarships, budgeting advice and home visits. The improved academic results for these students in the first semester of 2014 seem due to these responses.

# Findings<sup>1</sup>

## 1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The educational achievement of students is generally strong evidenced by a range of data. Most students complete the qualifications, at rates equal or above sector median and comparable to similar providers, as well as acquiring a broad range of relevant knowledge, skills and attitudes.

**Table 1. EMTC qualification and course completion rates, 2011-2013**  
**Percentage of total enrolled students**

Period	2011 % (PTE sector median in brackets)	2012 % (PTE sector median in brackets)	2013 % (PTE sector median for levels 3-4 and levels 5-6 in brackets)
Course completions	86 (85)	88 (85)	82 (82) (levels 3-4) 73 (82) (levels 5-6)
Qualification completions	88 (88)	94 (100%)	85 (79) (levels 3-4) 81 (75) levels 5-6)

Source: TEC and single data return data

Table 1 illustrates most students complete the qualifications. Course completion and qualification completion rates are generally above or equal to the sector medians. The level 4 programmes in 2013, which have over 80 per cent of the total students, performed more strongly. The 2013 rates compare with the rates for private training establishments offering similar theological programmes.

International students in 2013, though small in number, tracked above the median and domestic students. The first semester 2014 course completion rates indicate that completions are rising to 2011 and 2012 levels, with rates in the mid-to-high 80 per cent range for both levels 4 and 5.

---

<sup>1</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

**Table 2. Course completion rates for Māori and Pasifika students, 2013-2014**  
**Percentage of total students (student numbers in brackets)**

Period	2013	2014 (first semester)
Average course completions – Māori	65% (9)	86.9% (8)
Average course completions – Pasifika	66% (15)	83% (11)
Average course completions – all others	89% (63)	93.8% (34)
All enrolled students	n/a (87)	n/a (53) <sup>2</sup>

Source: Single data return submitted data

The shift to the South Auckland campus brought a significant and intended increase in students identifying as Māori and/or Pasifika; making up 40 per cent of total students in the first semester of 2014. Table 2 shows their achievement rates have been well below other students. However, the first semester of 2014 results indicate this gap has significantly narrowed due to a range of actions undertaken.

The students gain a broad range of relevant knowledge and develop important skills and attitudes. Their assessed course modules include: biblical knowledge, basic counselling, preaching, time management and communication skills. Their emotional and spiritual well-being is also enhanced, confidence increased and ministry and leadership capability strengthened. This valued development is evidenced, to some extent, by the students, pastors and workplace supervisors' feedback.

The PTE has a broad understanding of learner achievement based on both strong data collection and analysis. Deans track individual learner achievement and take action to ensure completions. Systematic annual qualification reviews include benchmarking against historical data, sector medians and comparable providers. These reviews are used to develop detailed plans to drive improvements. For instance, additional support has been provided to Māori and Pasifika students in response to their lower achievement, influencing improved achievement in the first half of 2014. Personal and spiritual development is a significant objective, particularly for the students. Some training outcomes data is collected and analysed, but the quality of this data varies.

---

<sup>2</sup> The total number of students enrolled in the first semester (53) is lower than the 2013 annual intake (72), as there is an intake of new students in the second semester of each year.

## 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

EMTC training provides a range of outcomes that are of high value to the students, Elim and other Pentecostal churches and broader communities. A large proportion of graduates take up a wide range of paid and voluntary church leadership and ministry roles and/or progress to further study.

<b>Table 3. Destinational outcomes for graduates, 2013</b>			
	Employment	Further study	Total
Certificate in Christian Ministry – on site	16% (paid church) 16% (paid other) <3% (voluntary church)	58% <sup>3</sup>	93%
Certificate in Christian Ministries (Internship) – distance learning	23% (paid church) 8% (paid other) 23% (voluntary church)	11%	65%
Diploma in Applied Christian Ministry – on site	57% (paid church) 14% (paid other) 0% (voluntary church)	29%	100%

Source: EMTC data

Nearly all of the 2013 graduates progressed to paid or voluntary work or further education (Table 3). The employment or voluntary roles<sup>4</sup> include formal positions such as a pastor for youth or for a church, preaching responsibilities at church services and running children's liturgies. The information on the destinational outcomes is generally sound and well analysed. Elim and other church communities rate highly the capability of the EMTC graduates with a range of competencies, particularly practical ones, to effectively carry out their roles. A few stakeholders have observed their graduates have more practical skills than some other Bible college graduates; this observation requires further investigation. Some church representatives stated the internship programme provided value by identifying and developing individuals who could lead and carry out ministry roles in their churches.

<sup>3</sup> Nearly all of these graduates progressed to the EMTC diploma.

<sup>4</sup> Voluntary or partly voluntary roles are a common labour market outcome in a church context. There is value contributed to the graduate and to the community.

A significant proportion of graduates go on to further education. Close to 60 per cent went from the on-site certificate to the diploma programme in 2013. The approval to offer the diploma via distance learning in 2015 will provide pathways for distance learning graduates of the certificate. An EMTC graduate of the diploma programme (employed as an online lecturer) has enrolled on a Master's in practical theology – the first graduate to do so – and two others have enrolled in similar degree-level qualifications.

The students and the college highly value the training outcome of personal and spiritual development in the students. A survey identified that over half were thrilled with their spiritual development and a further quarter saw definite improvement. There is potential to gather and analyse better quality information about this key and valued outcome.

The growth of the distance learning programme enables students to remain and participate in their local churches and communities with their improving knowledge and skills. Previously, some graduates of the Auckland campus have not returned to their home town. More generally, the college sees itself, through the range of initiatives, as contributing to the social capital of the graduates' communities. There are opportunities to better assess the value of these initiatives.

A range of recent strategic decisions, based on consultation and feedback from church communities and learners, have increased the value of the training outcomes. In the first instance, growth in the number of Christchurch campus students (with static government funding providing limited value to the home Auckland churches) threatened the financial viability of the Auckland campus. Also, many of the students were from non-Elim churches. A decision was made to close the Christchurch campus. The result is more Auckland region-based students, which offers greater value to the home churches in the region. At the same time, the college developed and delivered a distance learning (including block courses) programme to deliver more value to non-Auckland Elim and other church students and communities.

Another key long-term strategic decision, which increased the value of training outcomes to stakeholders, was moving the college campus from East to South Auckland. The intended outcome of higher Māori and Pasifika student participation is already being achieved, which is an indicator of success in the Tertiary Education Strategy 2014-2019.<sup>5</sup> These South Auckland enrolments and the graduates contribute to the long-term focus of the Elim Church to grow and develop the South Auckland churches. They also provide positive outcomes for the South Auckland and other communities with whom they engage. Examples include students supporting a graduate to run a weekly soup kitchen, contributing to the church free budget advice, and participating in Christians against Poverty initiatives. This focus on the well-being of the local community is in its early stages.

---

<sup>5</sup> Page12-13

[http://www.minedu.govt.nz/~/media/MinEdu/Files/EducationSectors/TertiaryEducation/TertiaryEducationStrategy2014/MOE\\_TES2014\\_V9.pdf](http://www.minedu.govt.nz/~/media/MinEdu/Files/EducationSectors/TertiaryEducation/TertiaryEducationStrategy2014/MOE_TES2014_V9.pdf)

### 1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The EMTC programmes and activities match well the needs of key stakeholders, the students and Elim and other churches.

The college is responsive to the needs of the Elim churches due to being strongly embedded within these relatively small communities. The college is governed by the representatives of four Auckland region Elim church communities. The college managers, staff and students are active, in multiple roles, within Elim and other Pentecostal churches. For example, a college lecturer might also be a church pastor, and a college graduate or intern might be a youth pastor. The student placements, the internships and student supervisors are within the same churches. The principal (online) visits the regional meetings, most distance learning students and their supervisors. These relationships mean the college is close to the needs of the churches and where graduates are active.

Through relevant programmes and activities the graduates develop the capability to effectively carry out various roles within their churches. The college provides practically based theology programmes so that students can meet the needs of the Elim and other churches in the Auckland region and beyond. The students learn the key doctrines of their Christian faith, as well as how to be effective in ministry and in leadership roles in the churches. Subjects include: overview of biblical books, how to preach and teach, working with children, counselling, time management and managing people. The students have numerous opportunities to apply their new knowledge and skills. Some instances are: ‘outstation’ visits to local churches where the students run the services; organisation of the weekly soup kitchen; an annual ‘mission’ trip to the Pacific to work with local churches on various projects. The recently developed distance learning internship programme has a stronger focus on hands-on relevant learning, as the students actively contribute in their local churches and communities, while learning new skills and knowledge. The students and churches consistently affirm this practical learning approach is highly effective.

The new campus offers facilities and resources that are of a high standard, providing a supportive learning environment. The facility has multiple classrooms, spacious, well-lit buildings, a full commercial kitchen and cafeteria, ample grounds, and shares the location with an active Elim Church. The move from Botany to Manurewa has supported an increase in enrolment of Māori (57 per cent) and Pasifika (60 per cent) students on their programmes from 2012 to 2014. Higher participation by these groups is a key goal of the Tertiary Education Strategy. As some East Auckland students now have to travel further, a church van was allocated to transport them.

There is an in-depth enrolment assessment process that is effective in selecting students best suited for the programmes. Extended opportunities are provided for students to trial the programme and staff to observe the applicants, concluding with a face-to-face, in-depth interview. The effectiveness of this selection process is evidenced by: low withdrawal/high retention rates, high satisfaction rates, positive response of students interviewed, and management's judgement that the process is working well and continues to be refined.

The PTE has strategically reviewed how its overall role, programmes and activities meet the needs of its key stakeholders. As previously noted, EMTC has a long-term strategic focus on South Auckland while still meeting the needs of students and churches nationwide. The closure of the Christchurch satellite campus and development of the online programme has produced positive feedback on how well the online programme meets the needs of churches and students distant from Auckland. There has been considerable interest in more advanced online learning opportunities. In response, EMTC has developed and gained NZQA approval to deliver higher-level diploma online. The approval stated 'the rationale for this programme change is sound and will enable the needs of learners to be more effectively met'. Another initiative has been to provide pathways for EMTC graduates to degree and postgraduate-level qualifications in practical theology via distance learning in partnership with an American university.

There are also a number of periodic processes used to assess how well needs are being met and decisions made. Each semester, students evaluate each of their programmes, the results are analysed and an argument presented for the programmes being amended. Annual reviews gather information from a range of sources. For instance, the 2013 review of the distance learning programme decided to use just one brand of tablet to simplify delivery and reduce technical problems and improve the submission of assessments by using a shared online calendar that can send reminders to the students. The same day was set each week for specific activities (assessments are due on 'Tremendous Tuesdays'). Technical issues were reduced to just two information queries in 2014, improved submission of assessments on time and consistently positive feedback from the students.

#### 1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The teaching at EMTC is effective and innovative at times on the distance learning certificate. Students gain the required skills, knowledge and attitudes, and most achieve recognised qualifications through an appropriate blend of face-to-face teaching and applied learning. There is a good understanding of teaching, and a reasonably coherent review approach, with instances of sound and improving practice. The gaps are mostly being managed effectively

The college uses a broad range of delivery modes which enhance the learning taking place. Face-to-face or traditional teaching is used for the knowledge-focused modules. However, an applied learning approach is embedded within all programmes to ensure graduates acquire a theology that has a sound and practical basis to carry out ministry roles. There is a broad range of feedback from students, church pastors, and formal assessments that the students are gaining the required competence. For instance, on the distance learning certificate, students are given supervised, hands-on work experience over an academic year including preaching and pastoral experience. Each week they attend online lectures on a platform delivering a live feed of the lecturer and/or a student who is speaking, a data presentation and notes, video clips, and an online class social network. The students can ask questions and there are assessment quizzes during the one-hour teaching sessions. The key principle involves using technology to create a face-to-face 'classroom' type experience to support and enhance learning. There are four, five-day block courses to reflect and consolidate the learning that has occurred. There are weekly assessments. This is the EMTC programme and teaching that the students most highly rated, despite the challenge of it being a distance programme. The programme is innovative and engaged the students. The feedback from lecturers and supervisors is also strong. A similar approach is being adopted for the distance diploma programme. The principal (online) is an information technology graduate with an inventive and effective approach to delivery.

The tutors, who share a common faith-based approach, are passionate about their educational role. All have qualifications, mostly in theology and/or education. They are well led by experienced educators with appropriate qualifications in theology and adult education, with one studying a graduate qualification in distance and flexible learning. The organisation aims for all teaching staff to have a certificate in adult education as a minimum qualification. Three of the seven full-time teaching staff have educational qualifications, of the remainder, one is enrolled for an adult education qualification, while another is undertaking postgraduate studies in practical theology.<sup>6</sup> The challenges posed by the growing number of students with limited previous academic achievement are addressed to some extent with this plan.

Senior teaching staff review the lecturers using a range of information. Each semester students rate their satisfaction with the overall lecturing, with 70 per cent of them very satisfied or at maximum satisfaction in semester one of 2014. They also rate the individual lecturers against 10 quality criteria, which the lecturers use for their self-review. Senior staff also use this information for decision making, along with observation and achievement data, for review discussions with staff. For example, a contract lecturer with significantly low ratings was not reappointed to a particular course. Full-time staff are involved in individual professional development, but the professional development for contract lecturers is more rudimentary. Assessment and moderation should be a professional development priority for staff.

---

<sup>6</sup> Some theological qualifications have educational papers.

Assessments are relevant and students view their assessments as being fair and valid. Robust, high-quality and detailed external checking of assessments affirms that generally sound assessment is taking place. However some recurring issues have been identified over two consecutive years including unclear marking schedules and insufficient feedback to the students. The academic leadership actively engaged with these external reports and identified assessment and moderation as a gap. A credible improvement plan is being implemented, including the formation of an academic board. The evaluators viewed samples of recently revised material which were of a high standard, indicating some improvements are occurring.

## 1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The care and guidance provided to students to stay engaged and complete their studies is of a high standard. At the end of semester one in 2014, 91 per cent of students rated being very satisfied or at maximum satisfaction with the support they received; no students gave a neutral or unsatisfied rating. The cases over the last three years of dissatisfaction or withdrawal are few and are individually known, and the college believes considerable support was offered to the dissatisfied students. The range of principles, structures and processes described below contributed to this strong outcome.

Pastoral care is a core principle of this faith-based college. The college comprises pastors and those in ministry training students who want to be or currently are pastoral workers in churches. Applied practical learning is a core educational approach. The students in interviews and feedback spoke of staff who ‘walk what they talk’, that is, they behave in a Christian, caring manner towards students and others. The documentation and interviews noted a range of supportive processes with a Christian orientation: prayer for students in need, worship together, active participation in a local church, and support for living as a Christian in daily educational life. The evaluators observed, and students spoke of, a Christian ethic of students actively supporting each other.

Pastoral principles are also reflected in the college’s structures, resources and practices. The dean of men, women and interns meet weekly to review and discuss the progress and welfare of the on-site students. Home visits to families are undertaken when additional support is required. All students have structured one-to-one interviews with appropriate staff each term. The dean of interns, as a trained counsellor, provides counselling sessions, as well as teaching counselling skills which builds their ability to support each other. The principal (online) has overall pastoral responsibility for the distance students. The interns are supported in their community by their community mentors, supervisors and church pastor and the

principal who visits most of them. The interns rate their progress in their learning journey on each of the four block courses.

Pastoral care of the small number of international students is strong and reviewed annually as required by the Code of Practice. The students are completing their studies and achieving well and their satisfaction ratings are high. Contact and support for graduates is also significant. The college tracks alumni as they are active on social network pages and participate in church networks.

The move to the South Auckland campus has resulted in Māori and Pasifika students making up nearly half of all students in 2014. The college has implemented or is implementing a number of support initiatives. The hours for when the on-site deans are available to the students have been significantly increased. The college identified that often family commitments or issues are a key factor affecting these students. It is now standard practice to visit the home and families of all Pasifika and Māori students. Family financial challenges is another common factor, and the college offers budget support services and four scholarships for Māori and Pasifika students. Voluntary Pasifika and Māori adviser positions have been established and an intern just appointed to the latter position. While it is noted that achievement rates for these students have improved in semester one of 2014, the impacts of these initiatives need to be evaluated. There is a reasonably coherent plan, but a more systematic approach is required to address the needs of Māori and Pasifika.

## 1.6 How effective is governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**

EMTC governance and management has provided strong and forward-thinking leadership and practices. This direction has produced educational achievement which delivers high value and matches well the needs of key stakeholders. Recent strategic decisions have produced considerable improvements in a range of outcomes.

The college has a clear mission and purpose: 'to train, equip and release people for effective Christian leadership and ministry'. The governance board, responding to a changing environment, has made some significant and considered decisions including:

- Closing the Christchurch campus and consolidating on one Auckland campus, which has added value for most key stakeholders and improved financial sustainability.
- Developing a blended online/block programme which better meets the needs of students and churches outside of Auckland. This includes appointing

capable leadership and investing in quality, innovative information technology resources.

- Investing resources to purchase a larger campus with improved facilities in South Auckland, a strategic focus area for the Elim Church.
- Making major changes to the management structure to operate this refocused organisation.

Some of the new roles and structures are: the governance-focused director has become a hands-on chief executive; an operational management board and academic board have been added to strengthen these respective processes; and honorary Māori and Pasifika advisory roles have been established to address this growing area. In the midst of these major changes, the PTE has continued with generally sound operational management. The organisation has attracted and retained experienced and capable staff with academic and information technology expertise. The quality management system has been revised with a checklist approach to support compliance checking.

There is a robust self-assessment culture operating across the organisation, from governance and management through to the various academic teams. This culture is clearly evidenced by:

- Significant strategic decisions noted above, bringing about valuable improvements in a range of areas
- Comprehensive 2013 annual programme reviews and a 2014 overarching self-assessment report documenting improved processes and outcomes
- Management being aware of all of the performance or self-assessment gaps identified in this report, and addressing them to a greater or lesser extent.

## Focus Areas

*This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.*

### 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

### 2.2 Focus area: Christian Ministry

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

# Recommendations

NZQA recommends that The Auckland East City Elim Church Trust:

- Assess and plan a more systematic response to the growing numbers of Māori and Pasifika students, guided by relevant research,
- Gather and analyse more systematically the key training outcomes of personal and spiritual development of the individual students, guided by recognised good practice
- Select assessment and moderation as a professional development priority.

# Appendix

## Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

*External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.*

*This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.*

*The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.*

*External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.*

*External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website ([www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)).*

*The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.*

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E [qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz](mailto:qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz)

[www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)