



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

External Evaluation and Review Report

TAFE College (NZ) Limited trading as
TAFE College New Zealand

Date of report: 6 May 2019

About TAFE College (NZ) Limited trading as TAFE College New Zealand

TAFE delivers real estate training at certificate level to enable entry to the real estate profession as a salesperson. It also delivers two-day verifiable training that contributes to the training hours required to maintain a real estate licence.

Type of organisation:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	1-6 Mitchelson Street, Ellerslie, Auckland
Code of Practice signatory:	No
Number of students:	Domestic: 100 students (Māori 4 per cent, Pasifika 1 per cent)
Number of staff:	Two full-time equivalents and two part-time
TEO profile:	See: NZQA – TAFE College (NZ) Limited
Last EER outcome:	Not Yet Confident in both educational performance and capability in self-assessment (October 2017 EER report)
Scope of evaluation:	National Certificate in Real Estate (Salesperson) (Level 4)
MoE number:	8677
NZQA reference:	C35111
Date of EER visit:	20 February 2019

Summary of Results

TAFE is meeting the needs of learners and industry stakeholders through delivery of a relevant programme structured to different learning styles and needs, one-to-one learner engagement, and staff with strong industry backgrounds and connections. Appropriate self-assessment processes have been implemented since the last EER.

Confident in educational performance

- TAFE has done much work to address gaps and weaknesses identified in the previous EER. The PTE has invested in a new student management system. Effective processes to support self-review are in place and are continuing to be reviewed and refined.
- Learning and teaching processes support learner achievement and entry to the real estate profession. Assessment activities and feedback support learning. Moderation is robust. Learning delivery is tailored to meet the needs of distance learners. Individual support is readily available.

Confident in capability in self-assessment

- Staff have extensive sector knowledge and established sector relationships used to contribute to programme delivery and review. Employers value the practical relevance of the programme and knowledge and insights provided by industry-experienced staff.
- TAFE has worked hard to inform its understanding of educational governance and compliance and to establish processes to contribute to effective oversight. It is committed to ongoing improvement.
- TAFE has had recent unsuccessful attempts at gaining NZQA programme approval for the New Zealand Certificate in Real Estate due to the quality of applications and key criteria being unmet. This is a priority issue for TAFE to urgently address.

Key evaluation question findings¹

1.1 How well do students achieve?	
Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Since the 2017 EER, TAFE has implemented a student management system and is working with the supplier to ensure a fit-for-purpose product. TAFE now reports and analyses achievement data to identify completions at six and 12 months. Data is reported by ethnicity.²</p> <p>From July 2017 to June 2018, 67 per cent of learners successfully completed the programme. A further 17 per cent remain enrolled and are working to complete the qualification. The 67 per cent completion result is an improvement on the 61 per cent completion rate for July 2016 to June 2017, and consistent with the 66 per cent completion rate for 2015-2016.</p> <p>Of the 87 learners who completed between July 2017 and June 2018, 69 did so within six months and 18 within 12 months. In 2018, TAFE introduced student calendars and study plans to guide learner progress and timely completion of the programme, as well as planned follow-ups to encourage progress.</p> <p>TAFE now collects data at six months on reasons for non-completions. These are unrelated to programme quality. Realistically, TAFE identifies that more time is required before trends can be identified. TAFE is yet to identify an appropriate benchmark against which to assess the strength of its achievement. An established relationship with another provider delivering in this area could offer relevant benchmarking.</p>
Conclusion:	TAFE has established and is continuing to work on systems and processes to inform its understanding of learner achievement and to encourage timely qualification completion.

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

² Few Māori and Pasifika enrol at TAFE.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>The programme offers an industry qualification and is a prerequisite for obtaining a real estate licence to be able to work as a salesperson in the real estate industry.</p> <p>Learners gain relevant foundation knowledge including about different forms of property ownership and legislation. They leave with a realistic understanding of industry needs and what it is like to work in the industry. Real estate agencies that send employees to the training reported that the programme provides a good grounding in the industry.</p> <p>Some real estate agencies use TAFE as their preferred training provider. They also recruit from TAFE, recognising the strength of TAFE's preparation of learners for entry to the profession. TAFE has begun contacting real estate agencies to gather feedback on graduates in employment, with no negative feedback provided so far.</p> <p>TAFE also now captures data on learners' enrolment goals and employment intentions and reviews this information at learners' completion of the programme and to identify their subsequent destinations. It is still too soon to see the value of this information or its use.</p> <p>In 2018, TAFE's interviews with 54 graduates showed 50 per cent working in the industry. The downturn in real estate sales was a key factor affecting employment in real estate. National data on two-year, post-qualification employment rates show 54 per cent in employment two years after completing the qualification. TAFE's employment outcomes are close to this soon after programme completion.</p>
Conclusion:	TAFE is delivering a programme required by the real estate sector. TAFE's delivery is valued for the breadth of the programme and the realistic preparation for entry to the industry. Improved self-assessment contributes to an understanding of programme value, including employment outcomes, which seem on par with national results.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	Marginal
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>The unsatisfactory quality of TAFE’s recent applications for programme approval for the New Zealand Certificate in Real Estate (Salesperson) (Level 4)³ does not match NZQA’s expectation for a programme application that meets basic requirements and demonstrates the ability to provide a coherent, quality programme. This is unfortunate and a key area to address given other positive evidence of current delivery matching needs.</p> <p>Distance learning matches the needs of learners unable to commit to timetabled on-site learning. A weekly evening on-site tutorial can be attended remotely. Learners can study on site too. Learner feedback shows high satisfaction.</p> <p>TAFE has initiated employer interviews and feedback is positive on programme relevance and is beginning to provide good information. Stakeholders value TAFE’s delivery of relevant, practical industry content and the good grounding to a career in real estate. Feedback is being recorded for future review as TAFE builds this body of data. TAFE has well-established sector relationships used to discuss programme matters and trends.</p> <p>Assessment activities ensure and enhance learning. Learners can have three attempts to successfully complete assessments. Collecting reassessment data would confirm TAFE’s understanding that more than one attempt is usually for first assessments and minor reasons. Plagiarism seems well identified and responded to - the process could be better outlined. Three unit standards require observation. In limited cases, approved real estate managers undertake observations of employees. Limited information is documented on that process.</p> <p>TAFE has robust internal moderation with insights used and now documented. Positive 2017 external moderation saw TAFE exempt in 2018.</p>

³ Between February and April 2019, TAFE withdrew one programme application and two were declined by NZQA because the applications omitted key information.

Conclusion:	Recent programme applications are not meeting NZQA's requirements. Current delivery matches stakeholders' needs. New self-assessment processes are providing good information.
-------------	--

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>An enrolment interview identifies learners' study goals and is used by TAFE to explain study expectations and requirements. TAFE is yet to extract and collate study goal information overall, but such data could be used to compare exit interview information to understand how well the programme has met needs. A payment plan is in place to help learners access the programme.</p> <p>An individual orientation is provided by phone or Skype to orientate learners to the student portal, study calendar, learning and assessment materials and processes. TAFE is developing a video and other materials to support the orientation process.</p> <p>A weekly tutorial provides topic-based classes that expand on core information and knowledge. While fewer than 10 typically attend these voluntary tutorials, TAFE has continued to deliver them to ensure it is catering to those learners who benefit from this opportunity and to provide a greater depth of information.</p> <p>Learners are provided with a range of materials to support their learning in both hard copy and electronic form. They now receive individual study plans and a study calendar to help them manage their time and keep on track.</p> <p>One-to-one tutor support is available five days a week and is proactively and regularly accessed. Support is timely and responsive. Assessment results are ensured within five days and close engagement is undertaken with learners where assessment requirements have not been met.</p> <p>Learner progress is regularly reviewed and is a trigger to engage learners to check on their progress. An exit interview process has been implemented to understand learners' experience of the programme and to identify their subsequent intentions.</p>

Conclusion:	Established processes are in place to engage and support learners in their learning. Different learning styles and needs are well catered to. New processes have been introduced to encourage timely completion and learner feedback.
-------------	---

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	Marginal
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>TAFE has worked hard to respond to the findings of its last EER report and has resourced and made good progress in establishing fit-for-purpose processes that have or are beginning to contribute insights to support educational achievement. Emerging data is being used to inform this understanding. TAFE realistically understands that some processes will take time to produce meaningful self-assessment information. Data collection processes are being refined or improved as this process unfolds.</p> <p>A new student management system has been invested in and is continuing to be developed so that it can provide fit-for-purpose information to support the organisation's understanding of educational performance. Contingency support is in place and in development in recognition of the small size of the organisation.</p> <p>Since the last EER, the owner has engaged external governance support and has sought advice on areas to address and grow.</p> <p>TAFE staff have a depth of industry experience and are appropriately qualified. An annual performance appraisal process and professional development plans are in place.</p> <p>The National Certificate in Real Estate (Salesperson) is due to expire at the end of 2019 and TAFE can no longer enrol learners in that qualification. While TAFE has obtained NZQA consent to assess for new unit standards related to the new New Zealand Certificate in Real Estate, it is yet to successfully gain NZQA approval to deliver the new qualification – one application was withdrawn and two declined because key criteria were not met. Securing that approval is essential to TAFE's continued delivery in this area, and is a gap that was not being effectively managed at the time of this EER.</p>

Conclusion:	Sufficient resources are allocated to teaching and learning and have been applied to strengthen capability in self-assessment, governance and management. Pending qualification approval is essential to the PTE's ongoing delivery.
-------------	--

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Since the last EER, TAFE has established a compliance audit plan and calendar to ensure key compliance accountabilities are identified and responded to. Better documentation of processes and actions contribute to compliance management.</p> <p>A six-monthly internal audit process has been introduced. As a result of that audit process, TAFE self-identified a couple of processes that were not undertaken and has responded by allocating responsibility so that they occur.</p> <p>TAFE was required to submit an improvement plan after its last EER and did this in a timely manner, as well as establishing ongoing reviews of its progress subsequent to that plan. TAFE now ensures immediate updates to its quality management system as operational changes are made to policies and procedures.</p> <p>TAFE keeps up-to-date with sector requirements through membership of relevant industry groups. It regularly monitors Real Estate Authority decisions and sector communications to keep abreast of industry requirements and developments. NZQA updates are monitored and acted on.</p>
Conclusion:	Since the last EER, TAFE has established a process to ensure key compliance accountabilities are identified, managed and reviewed.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: National Certificate in Real Estate (Salesperson) (Level 4)

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Good

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

NZQA recommends that TAFE College (NZ) Limited trading as TAFE College New Zealand:

- Urgently and effectively review factors impeding TAFE gaining programme approval for the New Zealand Certificate in Real Estate (Salesperson) (Level 4).
- Continue to utilise and refine newly established self-assessment processes.
- Establish a relevant benchmark to assess the strength of learner achievement.
- Detail key processes relating to practical assessment.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. This include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

Appendix

Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published rules. The methodology used is described in the web document <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- *Identify organisational fraud⁴*
- *Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources*
- *Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.*

⁴ NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted under the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016, which are made by NZQA under section 253(1)(pa) of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister authorised as responsible for Part 20 of the Education Act.

Self-assessment and participation and cooperation in external evaluation and review are requirements for:

- *maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities, and*
- *maintaining consent to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards for all TEOs including ITOs but excluding universities, and*
- *maintaining training scheme approval for all TEOs other than universities.*

The requirements for participation and cooperation are set through the Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2018, the Consent to Assess Against Standards Rules 2011 and the Training Scheme Rules 2012 respectively. These rules were also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Rules 2018 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2018 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes, training schemes and consents to assess and registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). All rules cited above are available at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz

Final