



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY  
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

---

**QUALIFY** FOR THE FUTURE WORLD  
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

## Bethlehem Tertiary Institute

Highly Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 8 November 2016

# Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction .....	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review .....	6
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	7
Summary of Results .....	8
Findings .....	10
Recommendations .....	22
Appendix .....	23

MoE Number: 8694  
NZQA Reference: C23284  
Date of EER visit: 23-25 August 2016

*Final Report*

# Purpose of this Report

*The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.*

## Introduction

### 1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	Bethlehem Tertiary Institute (BTI)
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
First registered:	1992
Location:	24 Elder Lane, Bethlehem, Tauranga
Delivery sites:	As above
Programmes currently delivered:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Diploma of Counselling (Level 6)</li><li>• Diploma of Family Support (Level 5)</li><li>• Bachelor of Counselling (Level 7)</li><li>• Bachelor of Social Work (Level 7)</li><li>• Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Early Childhood Education (Level 7)</li><li>• Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Primary (Level 7)</li><li>• Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary) (Level 7)</li><li>• Postgraduate Diploma of Professional Practice (Level 8)</li><li>• Master of Professional Practice (Level 9)</li></ul>
Code of Practice signatory:	Yes. No international students were enrolled at the time of the external evaluation and review

	(EER).
Number of students:	Domestic: 373 equivalent full-time students – Māori 10 per cent and Pasifika 3 per cent, under-25s, 28 per cent. Female students make up 81 per cent of enrolments.
Number of staff:	Thirty-eight permanent staff (either full-time or part-time) and 14 fixed-term contractors.
Scope of active accreditation:	BTI has approval and accreditation from NZQA and the relevant professional bodies to deliver the programmes listed above.
Distinctive characteristics:	<p>BTI programmes are offered full-time or part-time through on-campus or blended delivery (a mix of on-campus and distance learning). All BTI programmes attract Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) funding.</p> <p>BTI states that it offers ‘Christian Tertiary Education, with all programmes shaped by a biblical worldview’. As a not-for-profit entity, BTI is owned by the Christian Education Trust. It is the tertiary arm of the Bethlehem Campus located alongside Bethlehem College and Bethlehem College Kindergarten.</p>
Recent significant changes:	<p>BTI’s postgraduate programmes were approved by NZQA in 2014 and first offered at BTI from 2015.</p> <p>The Diploma in Teaching (Tonga), a focus area in the previous EER, was discontinued in 2015. The Free Wesleyan Church of Tonga, the local partner, is now able to offer a teaching qualification under their own status.</p> <p>There has been a 26 per cent increase in ‘permanent staffing’ since the previous EER, reflecting consolidation of roles and the transition of contractors into permanent positions.</p>
Previous quality assurance history:	<p>At the EER in 2012, NZQA was: Confident in the educational performance and Confident in the capability in self-assessment of the PTE.</p> <p>The TEC conducted a scheduled audit of BTI in 2015, and concluded with five recommendations</p>

relating to enhancements to existing administrative systems and processes.

BTI degree programmes have all undergone the required ongoing monitoring since the previous EER.

External moderation has been ongoing and documented since the previous EER, and involves:

- Counselling and social work programmes – two institutes of technology
- Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Primary – first by Te Whare Wānanga o Awanuiārangi; more recently by Laidlaw College
- Early childhood education – first by Manukau Institute of Technology, then more recently by Massey University
- Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary) – University of Otago

An application from BTI for programme approval and accreditation for the New Zealand Certificate in Study and Career Preparation (Level 4) was being processed by NZQA at the time of the on-site EER visit.

Other:

The college has professional affiliations with: Christian Theological and Ministries Education Society; Independent Tertiary Institutions – Ngā Wānanga Motuhake; Association of Tertiary Education Managers; and a range of professional bodies involved in counselling, teaching, tertiary education and social work education.

## 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

Focus areas and rationale for selection		
1.	Governance, management and strategy	This focus area has importance for the quality of the educational experience for students, matching the needs of key stakeholders, the employment experience of staff, and the legal, ethical and compliance context for operating as a registered PTE.
2.	Bachelor of Counselling (Level 7)	This is currently the largest programme at BTI in terms of students. Common to all other BTI programmes, it is offered both through on-campus and blended delivery (on-campus/distance). Completion of the degree may lead to professional recognition by the New Zealand Association of Counsellors. This degree was not included in the previous EER. At the time of the on-site visit there were 113 students enrolled, many of whom study part-time.
3.	Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary) (Level 7)	This is a growing niche programme which reflects the core educational mission and worldview of both BTI and the Christian Education Trust. This degree was not included in the previous EER. At the time of the on-site visit there were 36 students enrolled.
4.	Postgraduate programmes	The Postgraduate Diploma of Professional Practice and the Master of Professional Practice were first offered in 2015. They provided an opportunity to evaluate an area of development since the previous EER. At the time of the on-site visit there were 15 students enrolled across the two qualifications. Postgraduate programmes are yet to produce their first graduates.

### 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

A pre-scoping meeting was conducted at BTI before the on-site visit. A self-assessment summary document was later supplemented with additional educational performance data provided at the visit. Two evaluators conducted the on-site enquiry over three days. Personnel interviewed or otherwise contacted during this EER included: the dean and other senior leadership team members, board of directors, employers of graduates, support services and administration staff, teachers, students and graduates, and the 'kaumatua/cultural gatekeepers' for BTI.

A significant proportion of the documentation viewed on site was selected at random based on references by staff to BTI's key tools and processes during the interviews. Significant examples included: annual reports and five-yearly programme reviews; external monitoring reports and external moderation reports; examples of pass rates and grades analysis for focus area programmes; graduate and student surveys; academic board and senior leadership team minutes; boards of examiners, course critique and internal moderation samples; summaries and examples of staff research; the Special Character Audit of BTI by the Christian Education Trust. The evaluators were also shown the library facilities and examples of online learning resources and teaching activities.

The report for the EER conducted in 2012 contained six recommendations, and BTI's response to these was discussed at the on-site visit, and is referenced in this report where applicable.

A panel representing the Social Workers Registration Board visited BTI in the week following the on-site visit by NZQA. This related to maintaining registration for the Bachelor of Social Work programme. Information from that visit was shared with the evaluators by the board registrar. The external monitor for the Bachelor of Counselling visited BTI two weeks after this, and the draft report from that visit was also considered by the evaluators.

# Summary of Results

## Statements of confidence on educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance and **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Bethlehem Tertiary Institute**.

This confidence is reflected by:

- Most students succeed in their studies at BTI, passing their courses and gaining relevant skills, knowledge and qualifications. High course pass rates since the previous EER are plausible and surpass BTI's own targets and compare favourably with a similar high-performing tertiary education organisations.
- Rates of progression into employment in areas that relate to the qualifications completed by graduates have consistently exceeded 80 per cent since the previous EER.
- Successful postgraduate programme development since 2012 indicates strong self-assessment and the capability to add programmes that fit well with BTI's vision and values, and build upon their existing strengths.
- Teaching practices indicate development of capability in blended/online learning, to give one important example. Teaching staff have suitable qualifications and experience and are engaged in relevant research which is teaching-related and shared across the tertiary education sector.
- Continued evolution of blended learning capacity is apparent, with all BTI programmes available online. This dual model matches many needs, is flexible and, with the use of mandatory on-campus 'intensives', adds value to the BTI campus resource by making it available more widely.
- Support services provided to students has been increased. Programme and course-related information, library services and study facilities clearly match student needs. The campus facilities and environment are of a high standard and students report high satisfaction with these services.
- Overall, the governance, management and operational aspects of BTI perform effectively. The PTE has appropriate expertise and sector understanding which guides strategy and leads to worthwhile and sustainable improvements. Management ensures that a learner-centred approach informs decision-making, and that a culture of critical review is encouraged.
- Self-assessment practices are well embedded and involve most or all staff at relevant points of the academic cycle. Course critiques, boards of examiners and an active and critical academic board indicate robust academic quality processes

and close attention to trends and patterns. This is a particular strength of the PTE's self-assessment, supporting a continuous improvement approach.

- Consistent practices across programme areas were evident to the evaluators. This adds rigour to both academic quality and self-assessment more generally. A key example is the five-yearly programme review documents. These are extremely thorough, are evaluative, and provide plausible evidence of achievements, challenges and areas for improvement.
- BTI is an effectively functioning, mature academic institution, able to offer credible undergraduate and postgraduate qualifications, and is currently performing very well.

# Findings<sup>1</sup>

## 1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Most learners succeed in their studies at BTI, passing their courses and gaining relevant skills, knowledge and qualifications which lead to relevant employment for most. Students under 25 perform exceptionally well. Course completion rates for Māori and Pasifika students are lower overall, but the small numbers of these students have a disproportionate impact on the percentage pass rates. Based on consideration of TEC indicators, relevance of employment outcomes, external monitoring reports of BTI's programme quality, and moderation findings, there are few gaps that significantly detract from BTI's performance under this key evaluation question.

**Table 1. Course (and qualification) completions (%) 2012-2015**

	2012 %	2013 %	2014 %	2015 %
All BTI programmes*	89 (88)	88 (80)	85 (81)	87 (49) <sup>2</sup>
Benchmark tertiary education organisation <sup>3</sup>	86 (97)	87 (86)	87 (96)	tbp
<b>Focus area programmes</b>				
Bachelor of Counselling	90 (39)	77 (75)	90 (48)	88 (21)
Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary)	90 (86)	85 (71)	81 (67)	84 (82)

Source: BTI and \*TEC single data return confirmed reporting. Postgraduate programmes are not listed; new programmes are yet to produce graduates.

BTI sets what it sees as a reasonable institution-wide target for course completions of 85 per cent, and it achieved 88 per cent in the 2009-2014 period. The PTE believes the course completion indicator is the most reliable of the TEC indicators, particularly given BTI's high proportion of part-time and/or 'interrupted studies'<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

<sup>2</sup> The qualification completion rate for 2015 fell dramatically due to an administrative change in programme end-dates, which subsequently affected the data available for the TEC single data return.

<sup>3</sup> BTI benchmarks its performance with a 'comparable provider': a degree-awarding, faith-based (Category 1) private training establishment.

<sup>4</sup> Students who reduce their study load or take semester breaks due to other commitments.

students. The impacts of this are particularly evident in the qualification completion rates for the Bachelor of Counselling. The postgraduate programmes are reasonably new and have yet to produce their first graduates. Benchmarking of performance is ongoing and uses – for example – time series analysis and the performance of a similar PTE (see Table 1).

Course completion rates for Tertiary Education Strategy priority groups are high for under-25s, but lower for Pasifika and Māori students than those of non-priority student groups (Table 2). The details of individual circumstances and these course completion trends are well analysed by BTI, as shown for instance in the annual report. Strengthening enrolment interview processes, increasing the targeted student support staffing, and the introduction of a level 4 tertiary study skills programme from 2017 provide examples of BTI's efforts to close these gaps (see also Findings 1.4). Evidence indicated that staff are knowledgeable about student circumstances and offer timely support.

**Table 2. Trends in course completion rates – priority groups 2012-2015 (Student Achievement Component-funded)**

Group*	2012	2013	2014	2015
BTI students (headcount)	435	440	437	406
Students under 25	90% (95)**	91% (94)	91% (89)	90% (86)
Māori students	81% (41)	80% (38)	72% (39)	78% (37)
Pasifika students	88% (10)	85% (10)	73% (10)	70% (8)

\*Some students may be included in more than one priority group category, limiting comparability of performance between the three groups. Source: BTI supplied data.

\*\*Equivalent full-time students enrolled shown in brackets.

BTI students are learning both theoretical knowledge and how to apply it effectively in human services contexts such as teaching, counselling and social work. The importance of structured practicums and effective supervision arrangements are well understood by BTI teaching staff, who have published research on these factors. Course content is not being taught in an instrumentalist way but is explicitly informed by values, beliefs and character development – as indicated in BTI's mission statement and marketing materials. This is valued by, or otherwise important to, students and other stakeholders, in particular but not exclusively faith-based organisations recruiting staff (see Findings 1.2). The Christian Education Trust audit report and the annual graduate surveys provided useful self-assessment evidence about the quality of achievement.

Educational performance analysis includes year-by-year and comparative benchmarking using the course completions measure. Clear graphical representation of programme performance is used to understand patterns. The senior leadership team and the academic board monitor educational performance regularly and closely. Analysis of achievement patterns is very effective at the course and individual student level, and at least good at the programme and

institutional level. There is an opportunity to make more use of the qualifications completion indicator; recent refinements to that metric by the TEC should assist here. As indicated earlier, assessment control and moderation practices and findings support a view that the course and qualification results discussed here are credible.

## 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

BTI has continued to gather reliable evidence of solid outcomes into the professions aligned with their programmes: for example, teaching at all levels of the schooling sector, social work, and counselling. These outcomes also align well with the mission of the PTE, the students' employment aspirations and the staffing needs of schools and social service providers. Some counselling graduates establish private practices. Across all programmes, graduates have been in part or full-time employment at rates well exceeding 80 per cent year-on-year since 2012. This is measured three to four months after completing the programme. These are excellent outcomes, and the self-assessment practices to gather, analyse and share findings are also strong.

BTI conducts a thorough 24-point graduate survey at the students' graduation event; this enhances response rates and the quality of data. It includes graduates' rating their overall experience of BTI, which is positive.<sup>5</sup> The resulting BTI graduate survey report is very thorough and shows analysis by programme, which feeds into both programme reports and BTI's annual report to stakeholders. Reporting also provides staff with a full list of where students find employment, clearly indicating outcomes into intended occupational groups. For example, 85 per cent of the graduate diploma secondary students moved into teaching roles within three months of exiting their programme. All five of the first cohort of social work graduates found relevant employment. Analysis of graduate data could perhaps be enhanced by measuring outcomes for TEC priority groups more specifically.

Since the previous EER, BTI has refined and developed the programme pathways available to the students. This has included the provision of teaching scholarships for secondary school students, the winding down of the Diploma of Counselling which will no longer meet the registration requirements of the New Zealand

---

<sup>5</sup> Capture of some strongly critical feedback from a small number of graduates noted: in 2016 only four (of 95) indicated they 'would not study at BTI' in retrospect.

Association of Counsellors, and the launch of the postgraduate programmes. Material considered as part of this evaluation showed a careful and deliberative approach. Management has ensured the ongoing alignment with the faith-based value proposition of BTI<sup>6</sup>, and the vocational and career outcomes of graduates. Building and maintaining long-term, constructive relationships with employers and other key stakeholders is also evident.

BTI does not conduct an industry survey, but knowledge of workplace requirements is being gained very directly through staff monitoring visits to students in their practicum placements across programmes. This is reinforced by ongoing and critical scrutiny by the relevant professional and registration bodies. Together, these seem to ensure strong ongoing programme alignment with industry needs and changes. BTI serves employers beyond the Christian community, and would do well to understand the outcomes and experiences of their graduates in those settings. There may be an opportunity here for more direct follow-up with a targeted sample of graduates and employers, but this was not seen as a particular gap by the evaluators.

### 1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The needs that BTI is seeking to meet are specified in their mission and purpose. The programmes on offer are well aligned with those goals, and the promotional material provided to prospective students and stakeholders appears accurate. Key stakeholders include students from Tauranga and – increasingly – across New Zealand who wish to pursue a qualification from a faith-based provider. Students are well catered for, and student and graduate survey findings support this view. On occasion, there are gripes or dissatisfied students, but these are few and BTI staff and management respond constructively. To illustrate: surveys indicate high agreement with statements that ‘BTI is culturally inclusive’ and ‘has a commitment to the Treaty and bi-cultural relationships’.<sup>7</sup> The learning environment is inclusive and policies and practices minimise barriers. These are areas that BTI has actively worked on, and have shown development and improvement since the previous EER.

---

<sup>6</sup> BTI states that it offers ‘Christian Tertiary Education, with all programmes shaped by a biblical worldview’.

<sup>7</sup> In 2015 over 90 per cent of respondents selected a positive 4 or 5 score from a Likert (1-5) scale.

For the focus area programmes, themes arising relating to matched needs included:

- For all focus areas, students have the opportunity to study at distance while still having regular on-campus, short intensive components, where their skills can be checked and enhanced and social learning needs met. Mature age students with other responsibilities (in particular child or elder care) can and do participate from home. Some stated that they would not be able to otherwise access their programme.
- Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary) students can select/suggest schools for their practicum, allowing them to experience different types of schools and locations. Although the qualification is typically undertaken over a 12-month period, the programme can be undertaken on a part-time basis. However, a candidate must satisfy the requirements for the degree within two years from admission to the programme. Flexibility and reasonable timeframes to ensure currency of knowledge are being well balanced. Effectively matching students to schools, with placements occurring continuously throughout their programme, is leading to good integration with school culture and routines and strong employment outcomes.
- Bachelor of Counselling students are taught three major types of counselling; this has been endorsed in monitoring reports. The qualification is recognised by the New Zealand Association of Counsellors. External moderation arrangements with two institutes of technology also help to ensure that a credible and current programme is offered. Monitoring of pass rates indicated issues with practicums which were modified for 2016. Evidence shows that improvements are occurring in response to the changes. Self-assessment is thorough and ongoing.
- Postgraduate programmes are intentionally designed to provide a vehicle for higher-level study and research informed by BTI value propositions, but suitable for professionals from various backgrounds. The current student cohort confirms this. The NZQA panel approving the postgraduate programmes commended BTI on the 'comprehensive external consultation, which was iterative and influential in the development of the programmes'.

The introduction of a level 4, 60-credit introductory certificate from 2017 seems timely, and may mitigate some withdrawals from this and other programmes. The analysis and developmental approach taken indicates robust self-assessment.

Evidence from numerous degree monitors' reports since the previous EER and the recent TEC audit report indicate that NZQA's quality assurance requirements and TEC's funding requirements are being met. Related to that, professional body monitoring and registration board requirements are being consistently adhered to.

## 1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Students achieve well at BTI, and effective teaching is an important contributor to that, which is closely related to effective programme and course-related guidance. A robust acceptance process ensures that as much as possible new students are highly motivated and clear about the programme they intend to enter and are able to succeed. All prospective students are interviewed using a structured and documented process. Acceptance can be conditional on students agreeing to access learning support and academic writing tuition. Similarly, an interview-based re-selection process occurs if students fail two or more papers. That said, BTI will and does accept motivated adult learners with poor educational history; they see this as important to their ethos. Based on information provided to the evaluators on site, this practice at times may have an impact on credit and qualification completion rates. It is evident from interview forms, testimonials and evaluator interviews with students that support to succeed is available, suitable and is enabling success. Teaching staff are closely involved with the processes summarised above, which are effective and support student learning.

The students' learning environments are planned and structured for the benefits and needs of learners, and this is a particular theme at BTI. Staff and educational documentation describe a 'relational model', which is intentional and well-expressed in programme delivery. The positive impact of this was confirmed by student survey feedback and direct testimony to the evaluators. Learning processes at BTI reflect this description given by a teacher: 'self-discovery, enhancing awareness of own knowledge and skills, adding value to practice...'. Increasing the availability of learning support resources is also noted as an improvement, and feedback from users is positive. Notably, learning support staff have direct input into course self-assessment conversations. The teachers' use of and capability in blended learning is apparent.<sup>8</sup> This is an area to continue developing due to its importance for all students.

Teaching staff have suitable qualifications and experience and are engaged in relevant research which is published and/or presented at conferences and is teaching-related (see Findings 1.6). Models of mentoring, practicum supervision and engaging teaching methods have been areas of research. A key document developed at BTI ('examples of how BTI meet the 6 KEQs') provided an accurate, shared understanding of both academic quality processes and self-assessment, and aligns well with what was seen on site. For example, the course critique model

---

<sup>8</sup> The 2014 NZQA panel report (postgraduate programme approval) provides additional evidence here.

brings insights from teachers, and student feedback. There are clear linkages between course critiques, moderation (internal and external), boards of examiners for each programme, the academic board, the senior leadership team and the BTI board. Among these processes there is nothing ambiguous: meetings and their reporting are scheduled, recorded, available and seem very accurate.

Consistent practices across programme areas were obvious in this evaluation and these add rigour to the academic quality overall. The focus area programmes shared some commonalities in terms of course design and delivery, and based on the evidence gathered on site and self-assessment material, practices are robust and subject to critique. Course content is updated on an ongoing basis. In addition to the ongoing performance appraisal and internal professional development around teaching, BTI may wish to consider a specific tertiary teaching qualification for teaching staff. Aspects of the developing bicultural practices that have an impact on teaching are detailed under Findings 1.5.

### 1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

BTI provides good quality guidance and support for the students. Programme and course-related information, library services (including online and postal services), classrooms and study areas, and a suitable student common area appear to clearly meet the needs of the students on campus and those visiting for short intensives. More generally, the facilities and environment are attractive and well maintained, and there has been recent investment in heating and information technology as a response to feedback. BTI staff say they have an open-door policy – which was confirmed by survey comments and direct comment to the evaluators by students, who feel ‘known by name’.

Broadly, samples of student feedback expressed both as ratings and comment are positive and constructive; the breadth of feedback sought and the quality of feedback given are impressive. Reception, administration, library and learning support staff rate highly. That said, there is a degree of student comment in the 2015 BTI experience evaluation report and graduate survey report 2016 which indicate that performance is generally very strong but improvements are still ongoing.<sup>9</sup> Student surveys are comprehensive and investigative in approach; student feedback is seen by academic staff and the academic board, and low scores are investigated. Where

---

<sup>9</sup> BTI records unfiltered, student responses which are shared and used internally.

feasible, changes are made as a response. Looping these BTI responses back to students in some new ways may be a helpful addition to current processes.

The development of blended learning is supported by a reliable online platform which appears to be working well, and investments have been made to improve this service. Staff capability development for using this has been ongoing. This too is an area of continued development since the previous EER. Ongoing online support and interaction with teaching staff is an important part of the programme model at BTI. Student-to-student support through online forums builds on and contributes to the on-campus intensives, where students get to know each other. Distance students also meet all support staff and are introduced to facilities at their (now scheduled earlier) first intensive. These intensive components enhance the effectiveness of the online engagement, according to the students. The programme model is subject to ongoing review and adjustment to ensure that teaching and support are aligned.

BTI's bicultural and Treaty of Waitangi-related statements in their strategic documents<sup>10</sup> were borne out by examples:

- All new students and staff are welcomed by and onto a local marae.
- Students are taught and/or encouraged to use te Reo, particularly during on-campus events. Student work has also been submitted and assessed in te Reo.
- Additional learning support staff have been recruited, including from Māori and Pasifika cultures and learning styles perspectives.
- Māori students may receive annual scholarships, and taura (students) of local iwi may also receive annual scholarships. It may be timely for BTI to collaboratively review the effectiveness and impacts of these in terms of their overall goals.

BTI's cultural advisor stated that 'Māori students who have studied at BTI have been glowing in their evaluations and reflections on their learning journey'. These comments were reflected in an interview with a BTI graduate, now a local teacher and current Master's programme student. Another external stakeholder also confirmed that responsiveness to Māori was an area of considerable growth since 1993. Māori taura can be confident that BTI will be genuine in meeting their needs, make culturally appropriate support available to them, and will provide opportunities for them to gain skills in suitable settings. This is an example of self-assessment leading to improvement. BTI will need to sustain these efforts to reach parity of learner achievement for all groups.

---

<sup>10</sup> Vision, Mission and Values statements.

## 1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Overall, the governance, management and operational aspects of BTI perform effectively. The governance model of an expert board reporting to the owner, Christian Education Trust, and overseeing the performance of the college dean continues to work effectively. The board has appropriate skills and sector understanding which guides strategy and leads to changes and improvements. Performance appraisal processes and clear delegation of responsibility, academic and financial, maintains the clear line of sight between strategy and operational matters. As indicated under Findings 1.3, compliance is well understood and is well managed. The voice of staff is responded to constructively, as evidenced by changes to teaching workloads and research. A collegial and supportive work culture is actively encouraged. Stewardship of resources is sound, and the PTE maintains a sound financial status within its mandate as a not-for-profit entity.

Relevant examples of changes and improvements include:

- The increase in permanent as opposed to casual staff since the previous EER, reflecting consolidation of roles and the transition of contractors into permanent positions.
- Management was successful in renegotiating components of course funding with the TEC, resulting in more funding overall, with a slight decrease in total student numbers. Efficiencies were achieved.
- The BTI annual report indicates a '27 per cent increase in staff time allocated to research' in 2015. This shows responsiveness to feedback from both staff and degree monitors and the postgraduate approval panel. BTI needs to continue with this, and the findings of the next Performance Based Research Fund round should prove a useful indicator of progress.
- Successful new programme development since 2012 indicates strong self-assessment, staff expertise and concerted effort in adding programmes that fit well with BTI vision and values. These developments are relevant to and build on existing expertise. These developments also align with the 'all of New Zealand catchment' philosophy and the 'bringing learning to the student' strategy at BTI.
- Investment in a local internet server and network has brought improvements in the service to staff and students.

Staff at BTI enjoy their work, and students/graduates comment favourably on this. The value placed on them is reflected in the facilities they enjoy, the opportunities for ongoing professional development which attracts financial support from BTI, and

mentoring by experienced colleagues. Some academic staff have completed postgraduate qualifications since the previous EER, including doctorates. New staff have been recruited and the staffing profile is gradually diversifying. Staff undergo a structured induction process. The purpose and direction of BTI is clear, and the organisational culture reflects this.

BTI is involved with supporting two off-shore teacher education programmes, including teaching them. One is a longstanding partnership in Tonga, and a more recent one is on the Thai-Burma border, working with refugees. Publications like BTI's Forward magazine, the Ako Aotearoa workshops, and resources and other research outputs add value beyond BTI's core community of interest. The PTE makes an important educational contribution beyond the programme offerings, and these provide growth and development for staff and students.

BTI functions well as an academic institution capable of offering pre-degree to postgraduate programmes in a sustainable and credible way. Numerous aspects of the effective academic quality and programme monitoring and review cycles are referenced in this report. All of these require upkeep and management oversight and involvement, which occurs. Under this key evaluation question, the Christian Education Trust audit, BTI annual report, committee minutes and papers (board, senior leadership team, and academic board) and five-year reviews provide solid evidence of ongoing and documented reflection and review leading to strong educational performance from a leadership perspective.

# Focus Areas

*This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.*

## 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

## 2.2 Focus area: Bachelor of Counselling (Level 7)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

After 15 years delivery, this is in many ways a strong programme, and external monitoring of the degree clearly supports this view. Graduate surveys reported in the 2016 programme evaluation report show close correlation between employment (or voluntary work for a smaller proportion) and the skills and knowledge gained through the programme.<sup>11</sup> As indicated under Findings 1.1, the course completion rate is very positive; qualification completion rates vary from year to year due to students varying their mode of study, including taking breaks.

BTI is candid with prospective students regarding modest earnings in this sector, and fewer full-time jobs, but applicants are most often driven by a sense of social concern. A recent graduate with business skills who gained a position leading an established social service agency is just one example showing the varied qualification outcomes. Self-assessment shows ongoing responsiveness to findings and feedback, with changes and improvements made. For example, the very important practicum component of the programme – which has been problematic for some students – is working better, as confirmed by the recent monitor's report.

As with other programmes considered during this evaluation, strong themes of 'self-discovery, being on a learning journey and being personally challenged and changed' were reflected in student and graduate survey feedback and in direct comments to the evaluators.

---

<sup>11</sup> Of the 19 graduates surveyed in 2016, 15 were employed either full or part-time. In addition, most graduates are involved in some form of voluntary community or church work, in a role related to their BTI qualification.

### 2.3 Focus area: Graduate Diploma of Teaching (Secondary) (Level 7)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

### 2.4 Focus area: Postgraduate programmes

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

This is a new programme area and hence has yet to produce graduates. There has been some transfer of students from the postgraduate diploma to the Masterate track, and some attrition. Most students are making good progress in passing courses and proceeding to the thesis stage of the Master's programme, which has proven to be the preferred qualification for most who enrol. After an on-site visit in late November 2015, the NZQA-appointed monitor wrote that the programme was providing for students' development in a holistic way 'through [BTI's] relational approach to teaching and learning'. Furthermore, 'the reflective approach to...course design and development [is] evidenced through their innovative and varied assessment and the robust and thorough moderation practices as well as through the establishment of the Postgraduate Programme Committee'. These findings were confirmed in this evaluation.

# Recommendations

Apart from those discussed in the body of this report, there are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review.

# Appendix

## Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

*External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.*

*This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.*

*The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.*

*External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.*

*External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website ([www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)).*

*The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.*

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E [qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz](mailto:qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz)

[www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)

*Final Report*