External Evaluation and Review Report

Bethlehem Tertiary Institute

Date of report: 27 May 2021

About Bethlehem Tertiary Institute

Bethlehem Tertiary Institute (BTI) offers programmes in counselling, education and social work which are shaped by a Christian worldview. All programmes are offered via distance learning platforms as well as on-site. Degrees include campus-based block courses and work-based practicums. Two-thirds of BTI students are distance learners.

Type of organisation:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	24 Elder Lane, Tauranga
Code of Practice signatory:	Yes
Number of students:	Domestic: In 2020, 247.5 equivalent full-time students (EFTS) (449 students), including 51 (11 per cent) Māori and 13 (3 per cent) Pasifika students.
	International: In 2020, four students
Number of staff:	42, including 24 full-time and 18 part-time
TEO profile:	[Bethlehem Tertiary Institute](#)
Last EER outcome:	In 2016, Highly Confident in educational performance and capability in self-assessment.
Scope of evaluation:	• Bachelor of Counselling
	• Bachelor of Education (Teaching) leading to Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Primary and Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Early Childhood Education[1]
MoE number:	8694
NZQA reference:	C45357
Dates of EER visit:	29 March-1 April 2021

---

[1] As BTI enrols only a very small number of international students each year, the mandatory focus on International Students: support and wellbeing is addressed through the key evaluation questions.

Summary of Results

BTI is a high-performing PTE which is meeting the most important needs of learners and stakeholders. Self-assessment practices are well embedded and effective.

Highly Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

- Most students succeed in their studies and progress into employment at consistently high rates. Highly effective, individualised guidance and support underpins strong learner achievement and fosters personal and professional growth and enhanced wellbeing.

- BTI has significant capability in blended and online delivery. The compulsory block courses provide important opportunities for degree students to establish strong social and academic support networks.

- BTI has effective academic leadership and thorough, well-documented quality assurance processes. Assessment and moderation practices have been a focus for improvement in recent years.

- Course reviews are comprehensive, drawing on information from a variety of sources to identify improvements. Extensive and thorough consultation, programme development and review processes ensure close alignment to the emerging needs of relevant professions.

- BTI is developing research capability and outputs as well as strengthening links between research and teaching.

- BTI's bicultural integration strategy is increasingly reflected in relationships, programme design and delivery, and organisational capability. It is contributing to valued outcomes for students and stakeholders.

- BTI has an effective reporting and review framework. It uses good quality information to monitor educational performance and outcomes.

Key evaluation question findings[2]

1.1 How well do students achieve?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Good**
Findings and supporting evidence:	BTI has consistently high course completion rates overall (refer Table 1, Appendix 1). These rates exceed their own targets and compare favourably with other PTEs. Māori course completion rates have improved significantly (3 per cent lower than other students in 2020). Qualification completion rates have increased steadily since the previous EER (refer Table 2, Appendix 1) and reflect strong performance. This judgement reflects BTI's flexible approach to programme pathways (i.e. students moving between part and full-time study) and low withdrawal rates. BTI supports and monitors students' acquisition of personal and professional attributes and practical skills. This ensures that students become capable and resilient practitioners. Generally robust assessment and moderation processes and oversight by BTI's academic committees provide assurance of academic integrity and valid and reliable achievement data (refer KEQ 3). Learner achievement data is reviewed regularly at programme, school and management level. Mentoring and other support structures ensure barriers to achievement are promptly identified and addressed. BTI has reliable data management systems to aggregate and analyse overall academic data, but does not routinely do so, other than review and benchmarking of published TEC educational performance indicators.
Conclusion:	BTI has very effective processes for understanding and supporting individual student achievement, including professional skills and personal growth. Further aggregation and analysis of achievement data would strengthen evidence and understanding of trends over time and across cohorts.

---

[2] The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	Graduate employment rates are strong (more than 80 per cent overall in 2020). This reflects the labour market for teachers, social workers and counsellors, as well as the quality and relevance of BTI programmes. Evidence includes graduate surveys, formal and informal feedback from placement supervisors and employers, programme monitors reports, and advisory board discussions. BTI has developed an employer survey for 2021, to augment information gathered informally.
	BTI graduates often gain employment at their practicum or placement organisation. In addition to the professional attributes for beginning roles in education, health, non-government organisations, etc, BTI is developing graduates that meet the specific needs of organisations which share BTI's Christian worldview.
	Regular engagement with professional bodies (such as New Zealand Association of Counsellors (NZAC) and the Teachers' Council), particularly in programme design and review, informs BTI's understanding of what outcomes and graduate skills are valued.
	BTI has strengthened its formal and informal relationships with Māori, including local iwi and Māori agencies and employers. Representatives interviewed during the evaluation confirmed the value of BTI's focus on supporting Māori communities (such as through scholarships) and iwi bodies of knowledge (through research). Graduates are increasingly well prepared to work effectively with Māori clients and whānau.
	BTI staff contribute on a voluntary basis to education initiatives in several Pacific Island and South East Asian communities.
Conclusion:	BTI graduates are achieving their employment goals at consistently high rates. Regular stakeholder engagement, and formal accountability to professional associations ensures graduates have the required knowledge, skills and attributes for employment. BTI has a good understanding of graduate pathways and is improving processes for gathering evidence of the value of programmes and making any improvements.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	Thorough and comprehensive consultation, information-gathering and reflective processes inform development and regular reviews of BTI programmes. Subsequent improvements ensure the currency and suitability of content, activities and resources. BTI also systematically reviews and responds to external degree monitors' reports. BTI programmes increasingly incorporate Māori kaupapa alongside the Christian worldview. All staff and students are supported to engage with Te Tiriti o Waitangi and concepts of partnership, and to improve confidence and capability in mātauranga Maori content, te reo and tikanga. BTI is highly effective in meeting the needs of students through appropriate teaching practices for mixed mode delivery, and key programme elements such as block face-to-face courses, noho marae experiences, and practicums. Teaching staff monitor student progress closely and provide timely advice and support. Internal and external moderation is used to review and improve assessment practices. NZQA monitoring has informed ongoing improvements to assessment design and moderation policy and processes, and staff professional development.[3] BTI has an effective approach to detecting and managing academic misconduct which could be further strengthened by the adoption of plagiarism detection software. Recent revisions to student surveys have increased response rates and yielded more useful feedback for improvement purposes.
Conclusion:	BTI is meeting the needs of stakeholders, including students. Review processes are regular and well documented as part of a robust academic quality framework. Improvements to programme design and delivery are monitored for effectiveness.

---

[3] In 2020, NZQA required an action plan to address assessment and moderation issues in the New Zealand Certificate in Preparation for Study and People-focussed Careers (Level 4). BTI has extended the scope of this improvement activity across the institute.

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	BTI provides an inclusive learning environment with strong evidence of Christian values and Māori concepts of manaakitanga and whaunangatanga. Faculty and central services staff share responsibilities for providing highly effective academic and pastoral support. BTI recently developed a flow chart to clarify roles, and provides teachers with information so they can support students with diverse needs. New students have opportunities to develop essential study skills and habits to enhance their chances of success.[4] Students are allocated mentors to cohort groups and benefit from close relationships with key staff throughout their programmes. BTI helps students to build strong academic and social networks with peers. Staff use reviews of the two Codes,[5] together with regular reflections on student progress and wellbeing, to identify improvements. Examples include enhanced information and advice for prospective students (particularly about learning needs and delivery mode) and revisions to online orientations and block courses (to improve the study experience and integration of distance students). In 2021, BTI is re-establishing the students' association. This will increase opportunities for student input into relevant academic and support policies and practices.
Conclusion:	BTI provides highly effective, individualised support and guidance to students to achieve their personal and study goals. Processes and feedback are regularly reviewed and there is good evidence of continuous improvement.

---

[4] Get Set is a three-day introduction to academic study. Head Start provides a one-semester 'light load' introduction to the programme, to facilitate entry/re-entry into academic study.

[5] The Interim Domestic Code of Pastoral Care and the Education (Pastoral Care of International Students) Code of Practice 2016 (including Amendments 2019).

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	BTI's governance and management have appropriate skills and sector understanding. They are effective in strategic planning and monitoring outcomes. Communication practices are open and transparent. Staff report feeling valued and well supported. Māori perspectives are increasingly informing organisational activities and decisions, reflecting BTI's commitment to Te Tiriti o Waitangi. Examples include increased engagement with Māori stakeholders in research and programme design and delivery and appointing Māori staff.[6] Tikanga Māori is reflected in organisational practices, policies and support services. BTI is making good progress in developing research capability and outputs.[7] This reflects effective leadership and investment in supporting researchers through time allocations, mentoring and monitoring research plans. This research informs degree teaching. During the 2020 COVID-19 lockdown, BTI successfully built on existing delivery modalities and capabilities, to deliver programmes and provide additional student support. Research into staff and student experiences during that period is ongoing. BTI is using learnings from the lockdown period to better integrate distance students into programmes. BTI now has an institutional quality assurance committee and well-documented processes for regularly gathering and reviewing information. There is a high level of informal information sharing and reflection and a clear focus on improving outcomes.
Conclusion:	BTI is a high-performing organisation which is responsive to the needs of learners and other stakeholders. Organisational and academic leadership is effective, ensuring academic quality and

---

[6] Eight of 41 educators are Māori.

[7] Nearly all educators are engaged in research and/or undertaking higher degrees. In the 2018 PBRF, BTI was mid-range of the 12 PTEs who were awarded funded quality categories. BTI is currently implementing a system to better record quality assured outputs.

	ongoing review and improvement across all priority areas. BTI is well positioned to maintain its high performance as it grows.[8]

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	BTI has effective processes for managing compliance responsibilities and ensuring accountabilities are met, including: • Regular reporting through to governance, management and academic board about the requirements of key stakeholders, including the TEC, NZQA and professional associations. BTI responds appropriately to the findings of external monitoring. • Appropriate processes for undertaking reviews and developing action plans to provide required attestations and to ensure compliance with the Interim Domestic Code of Pastoral Care, and the Education (Pastoral Care of International Students) Code of Practice 2016 (including Amendments 2019). This was confirmed by a sampling of international student files. • Policies and processes to comply with relevant legislation including the Health and Safety at Work Act 2015 and the Vulnerable Children Act 2014. • An overall compliance schedule for BTI, plus school checklists, which administration staff monitor. • Regular review of policies and procedures maintain their currency. Day-to-day practices are monitored to ensure compliance with BTI policies, NZQA rules and requirements of registered providers.
Conclusion:	BTI is managing its ongoing compliance responsibilities well. There is appropriate evidence to confirm this.

---

[8] BTI has experienced significant growth recently. In 2021 there was a 27 per cent increase in EFTS.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Bachelor of Counselling

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	Student enrolments in the Bachelor of Counselling have increased by 55 per cent since 2017. This reflects government priorities (mental health and addiction services, counsellors in primary schools) and registration requirements for professional bodies (minimum of a Bachelor's degree).[9] Student achievement in the degree (2017-2020) is high: course completion rates consistently exceed 90 per cent. In 2019 and 2020, Māori student course completion rates were lower than other students, although they still compare well to TEC sector medians. Achieving parity remains a priority for BTI. Graduates can now get full membership in NZAC. Most are gaining employment: 82 per cent of 2020 graduates were employed. Key stakeholders confirm the suitability and value of the programme for graduates early in their career. Graduates have enhanced cultural capability, which reflects, in part, BTI's implementation of NZAC's Pouwananga Kaitiakitanga framework in the degree programme. The programme is currently undergoing its five-yearly review. There is evidence of a very comprehensive consultation and reflective process. BTI is developing a proposal for programme changes and will send it to the academic board for approval. The School of Social Practice has implemented a team-based approach to providing academic and pastoral care to students called Nga Maunga Āwhina. This new initiative seems to be meeting student needs well.

---

[9] In 2019, BTI was accredited by New Zealand Quality College as a registered counselling education provider.

	School management is based on a distributed leadership model. Senior educators assume specific responsibilities for the programme, such as quality assurance or student support.
Conclusion:	Performance in this focus area programme is excellent. There is comprehensive evidence that student and stakeholder needs are well understood and met, and are contributing to strong learner outcomes. BTI is managing the impact of growth on programme delivery and support services well. BTI uses effective processes to share information, monitor student progress, and respond to feedback.

2.2 Focus area: Bachelor of Education (Teaching) leading to Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Primary and Bachelor of Education (Teaching) Early Childhood Education

Performance:	**Excellent**
Self-assessment:	**Excellent**
Findings and supporting evidence:	These programmes are small, and numbers continue to decline (23 students in total in 2021) reflecting national trends, and the funding context for ECE (early childhood education) centres. BTI remains committed to developing capable teachers for schools and centres which share their Christian worldview. BTI is currently redeveloping these programmes for 2022 delivery, to meet Teachers' Council requirements. Ngati Kahu has been invited to contribute to the programmes which will provide a scaffolding of Māori content and knowledge through the three years. BTI is also developing a centre-based ECE programme for distance students. Student achievement has improved steadily since 2017. It is very strong in 2020: 93 per cent course completion in both strands, with comparable achievement by Māori students. Graduate employment rates are also creditable (75 per cent for ECE and 99 per cent for Primary), with graduates often gaining jobs at the placement schools. Students are allocated mentors for their three-year programme, and they meet regularly to discuss learning goals, monitor progress, answer questions, etc. This individualised approach reflects the wider BTI context, where students feel known and build key relationships which support their academic, professional and personal growth.

Conclusion:	Performance in this focus programme is very strong overall. There is a high level of flexibility for individual pathways and students are well supported to meet their objectives through study at BTI.

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

There are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. This include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

Appendix 1

Table 1. BTI overall course completion rates 2017–2020, by ethnicity (TEC data)

Year	Māori	Pasifika**	Others
2017	78.8%	78.9%	90.5%
2018	89.2%	90.0%	90.4%
2019	83.8%	83.3%	89.9%
*2020	87.2%	71.4%	91.0%

Table 2. BTI overall qualification completion rates 2017–2020, by ethnicity (TEC data)

Year	Māori	Pasifika**	Others
2017	22.6%	66.7%	46.9%
2018	43.5%	-	53.8%
2019	36.4%	-	53.1%
2020*	80.0%	-	67.0%

*2020 completion rates were derived from the BTI student management system as TEC rates for 2020 were not released at time of printing.

**The numbers of Pasifika students are low, reducing the statistical reliability of the data.

Appendix 2

Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published rules. The methodology used is described in the web document https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- *Identify organisational fraud[10]*

- *Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources*

- *Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.*

---

[10] NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Final

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted under the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016, which are made by NZQA under section 253(1)(pa) of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister authorised as responsible for Part 20 of the Education Act.

Self-assessment and participation and cooperation in external evaluation and review are requirements for:

- *maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities, and*

- *maintaining consent to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards for all TEOs including ITOs but excluding universities, and*

- *maintaining training scheme approval for all TEOs other than universities.*

The requirements for participation and cooperation are set through the Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2018, the Consent to Assess Against Standards Rules 2011 and the Training Scheme Rules 2012 respectively. These rules were also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Rules 2018 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2018 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes, training schemes and consents to assess and registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). All rules cited above are available at https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz

Final