

Report of External Evaluation and Review

Education and Training Consultants
New Zealand Limited trading as
English Teaching College

Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 21 November 2012

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	5
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	6
Summary of Results	7
Findings	9
Recommendations	17
Appendix	18

MoE Number: 9290
NZQA Reference: C07600
Date of EER visit: 5-7 June 2012

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	Education and Training Consultants New Zealand Limited trading as English Teaching College (ETC)
Type:	Private training establishment
Location:	Broadway Avenue, Palmerston North
Delivery sites:	Willis Street, Wellington
First registered:	30 June 1993
Courses currently delivered	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Certificate in Academic English (Level 3)• Certificate in English Language Competence (Level 3)• Certificate in English Language Skills (Level 3)• English for Living in New Zealand (Level 3)• Foundation Focused Training Opportunities – English for Migrants• Foundation Focused Training Opportunities – English for Employment• Youth – non-trade level 1• Intensive Literacy and Numeracy – 100 hours• Intensive Literacy and Numeracy – 200 hours
Code of Practice signatory?	ETC is a signatory for students aged 14-17 and for students aged 18 upwards.
Number of students:	Domestic: 152 equivalent full-time students International: 70 equivalent full-time students

Number of staff:	27 full-time equivalents
Scope of active accreditation:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment of Learning (to level 4) • Delivery of Adult Education and Training (to level 4) • English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) (to level 5) • Generic Computing (to level 5) • Mathematical Processes (to level 3) • Occupational Health and Safety Practice (to level 1) • Self-Management (to level 2) • Service Sector - Core Skills (to level 3) • Service Sector Skills (to level 3) • Work and Study Skills (to level 2)
Distinctive characteristics:	<p>ETC is a Palmerston North-based private training establishment delivering programmes in Palmerston North and Wellington.</p> <p>All delivery has an ESOL focus.</p> <p>Targeted training funding is aimed at migrants and refugees. Work experience is a component of these programmes.</p> <p>Placement tests are used upon entry.</p> <p>There are currently three dedicated IELTS (International English Language Testing System) classes and one pre-IELTS class.</p> <p>Over 20 ethnicities are currently enrolled, mainly from Asia and the Middle East.</p>
Recent significant changes:	<p>A new website was launched in 2011.</p> <p>ETC received funding for a new 200 hour-long Intensive Literacy and Numeracy programme in 2012 for the first time.</p>
Previous quality assurance history:	<p>ETC had an adverse moderation report for 2011. Of the seven unit standards submitted for moderation, three required modification, and assessor decisions could not be verified for two of</p>

these.

At the previous quality assurance visit by NZQA, an audit (2008), ETC met all but two requirements. The two requirements not met related to governance and management. The requirement not met at the previous audit had been addressed.

Other:

Many of the refugees at ETC present additional learning problems such as lack of literacy or numeracy, physical or mental trauma, difficulty of coping with a new society, and worries about family members abroad.

ETC in both Palmerston North and Wellington offers its buildings for community use, such as for the Somali Council's Homework Club.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

In accordance with NZQA policy, the mandatory focus areas of governance, management, and strategy and international student support were included in the scope of this external evaluation and review (EER). The IELTS programme was selected as a focus area as it is the main programme for international students delivered by ETC. The English for Living in New Zealand programme (level 3) was selected as it is one of the main Student Achievement Component-funded programmes delivered by ETC. The final focus area selected was the English for Migrants programme (level 2) (employment strand) because it is the main targeted training programme delivered by ETC.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eeer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

The EER was conducted over three days by two NZQA evaluators at the college premises in Palmerston North. The evaluation involved interviews with:

- The director
- The quality assurance manager
- The managers of the three programmes selected as focus areas
- All the tutors in the focus areas
- A class in each of the three programmes selected as focus areas
- Three ex-students
- A range of stakeholders via phone

The evaluation also involved a review of relevant documentation such as the investment plan, the student handbook, achievement data, student evaluation forms, meeting minutes, self-assessment reports, and associated correspondence.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Confident** in the educational performance of **Education and Training Consultants New Zealand Limited trading as English Teaching College.**

The students achieve excellent academic results. In 2010, for example, the course completion rate for the English for Living in New Zealand programme was 89 per cent compared with the median rate for the sector of 76 per cent. The Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) set a target of 64 per cent positive labour market outcomes (students moving into employment or further education) for the English for Migrants programme. The figures achieved for ETC's students were 85 per cent in 2009, 92 per cent in 2010, and 87 per cent in 2011. The national median for 2011 was 79 per cent. However, national external moderation by NZQA has identified ongoing problems with assessment materials and assessors' decisions, in some cases. While these have been rectified when found by NZQA, further issues have emerged in subsequent years.

ETC has a systematic and holistic commitment to the students. It is clear that the students are the organisation's central focus and ETC's role is to enable them to achieve their outcomes. Some of the outcomes sought by migrants differ from the outcomes sought by fee-paying international students. Consequently, ETC recognises not only learning needs but also needs associated with employment and integration into the community. It successfully ensures that these needs are met and makes particularly effective use of work experience. Relevant unit standards, such as for cleaning and safe food handling, are brought into the programmes when ETC sees a connection to securing work experience. This has led in some cases to part-time employment. Other valuable outcomes, particularly for fee-paying international students, take the form of entry into courses at other educational institutions such as Massey University and a local polytechnic.

The feedback provided to ETC is very positive. ETC is recognised as being inclusive, respectful of diversity, and responsive to its clientele. The students appreciate the supportive environment and the way in which every effort is made to facilitate their integration into the community. The level of support for the international students is very effective.

The evaluation team met all the staff members at the Palmerston North campus and was impressed with their quality and levels of commitment to the students. The director has a central role in setting the tone. He is well known for the way in which he networks with local communities in order to arrive at the best possible outcomes for the college's students.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Education and Training Consultants New Zealand Limited trading as English Teaching College.**

ETC effectively makes use of both informal and formal methods of self-assessment. There is a clear focus on student achievement and consequently measures are taken to ensure these are carefully tracked. Internal benchmarking takes place by comparing student achievement rates with previous years and with the rates achieved on the other campus. External benchmarking is also used when appropriate data exists such as the median completion rates in comparable sectors. Similar benchmarking takes place in the area of positive labour market outcomes.

Assessment of labour market outcomes showed ETC the importance of work experience for the students who were migrants. Reflection and discussion led to a decision to introduce cleaning and safe food handling unit standards into the programmes. These have resulted in the acquisition by the students of new skills and knowledge which has secured part-time employment for some of them and provided useful material for their CVs.

ETC assesses its operation through course evaluations, student reflection diaries, checks on the progress of each individual student, and reviews of the value gained from the unit standards underpinning particular programmes. When an issue is highlighted in the feedback, ETC takes appropriate action. An example of this was the use of a representative from a local mosque to help the staff gain a better understanding of Saudi culture. This resulted in improved attendance rates by the Saudi students. Student feedback also revealed a need for a prayer room and ETC quickly made this available.

Comprehensive course evaluations by the students are undertaken annually. These are effectively used by ETC to gain a fuller picture of the value of its programmes and associated procedures than is available from the informal feedback being received during the course of the year. ETC collates course evaluations and uses them as a basis for a meeting between the director and each tutor, thereby ensuring that the main issues are highlighted so that appropriate actions can be taken.

ETC is now in a position where it could consider documenting more of its feedback so that it can check that relevant issues receive the treatment they often deserve rather than wait to be highlighted when the annual evaluations are undertaken. The college's commitment to student achievement is clearly evident. ETC might also want to explore how it can further demonstrate the value added by its work.

Findings¹

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The ETC student body is multinational and the students come from a wide variety of backgrounds including as refugees, migrants, and fee-paying international students. The programmes offered reflect this variety but they all share the common feature of excellent rates of student achievement. The course completion rates for the English for Living in New Zealand programme rose from 72 per cent in 2009 to 89 per cent in 2010 and to a provisional rate of 94 per cent in 2011. The most recent median rate for the sector was 76 per cent in 2010.

High levels of student achievement are a feature of all the programmes studied at ETC. The TEC has set targets of 64 per cent positive labour market outcomes and three unit standards for the English for Migrants programme in Palmerston North. The figures achieved for ETC's students were 85 per cent in 2009, 92 per cent in 2010, and 87 per cent in 2011. The national median figure for 2011 was 79 per cent. The number of unit standards achieved also shows a level well above the target, with an average credits per learner figure of 32.32 in 2011, reflecting more than double the unit standards set as the target. However, national external moderation by NZQA has identified ongoing problems with assessment materials and assessors' decisions, in some cases. While these have been rectified when found by NZQA, further issues have emerged in subsequent years.

There is a clear focus on student achievement at ETC. The tone is set by the director who interviews most of the students and has a close connection with them. The students on the IELTS programme move through the levels and succeed in achieving the level required for their future courses or careers. A running record is kept of their achievement in the monthly 'mock' IELTS tests.

ETC benchmarks its rates of student achievement internally by comparing the most recent year with previous years. It also has the benefit of running similar courses at the campus in Wellington and uses these as another benchmark. Further external benchmarking takes the form of comparing ETC's achievement rates with the national median rates. The weekly staff meetings discuss trends in student achievement and they are further discussed in the programme meetings that follow. The results of these discussions and the subsequent actions should be documented more carefully so that ETC can benefit from the experience gained. More reflection on the value added by each course could then be undertaken.

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

ETC recognises that the nature of the outcomes is dictated by the needs of the students. The college is clear that the students are the organisation's central focus and its role is to enable them to achieve the outcome targets they set. The outcomes achieved by the migrants differ from the outcomes achieved by the fee-paying international students.

The main outcome for the former group is successful integration into New Zealand society, whether it be in the form of a job or another course leading to employment. A registered social worker from Refugee Services Aotearoa New Zealand summarised ETC's contribution well when she wrote that ETC:

'provides opportunities for social and cultural integration. The incorporation into the curriculum of life skills and tasks necessary for successful resettlement contributes to supporting students into becoming more independent in all areas of their lives'.

During the process of reflection on the value of its programmes, ETC realised that its students needed to be better prepared for the workplace. It recognised that most of its students were seeking entry-level positions so it obtained approval for the students to study some cleaning unit standards. At first, ETC brought in specialist cleaning trainers and used material from the industry training organisation, the Building Service Contractors of New Zealand. ETC now looks after all facets of delivery of these unit standards. Some of the students have gained cleaning positions and others work at the college in return for contributions to a fund set up for student trips. This initiative builds the confidence of the students and provides them with material they can include in their CVs.

Emphasis is placed on the importance of work experience to the students and ETC expends considerable energy finding it for the students. The evaluation team spoke to a number of employers who were unstinting in their appreciation of the support provided by ETC. They described the value of the work experience to both the students who learn about the workplace and the employers who want to help and can sometimes provide employment at a later stage. The local Work and Income New Zealand office regards ETC as an excellent college for migrants seeking work.

Other valuable outcomes, particularly for fee-paying international students, take the form of entry into courses at other educational institutions such as Massey University, UCOL Polytechnic, and Horizons Training. The director is well known

for the way in which he networks with different local communities in order to arrive at the best possible outcomes for the college's students.

The self-assessment that was behind the move to introduce cleaning unit standards also led to the introduction of safe food handling unit standards. ETC carefully traces the destinations of its students so it can assess the value of its outcomes. It listens to feedback from stakeholders and uses it to improve the chances of students gaining employment. ETC also carefully assesses the progress of students while they are at ETC so it can ensure that each student's goals are in the process of being achieved. The monthly mock IELTS tests are a good example of this checking.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

By placing the needs of the students at the centre of its operation, ETC ensures that its programmes and activities successfully match not only the students' needs but also the needs of other educational institutions, employers, and the wider community interested in integration of the migrants into New Zealand. All the students are tested on entry to ETC and are interviewed by a senior manager, usually the director. The enrolment form includes sections on possible learning difficulties and future pathways for the students. This information is used in the development of individual learning plans. The goals set by the students form the foundations of these plans and are continuously being reviewed. The ongoing needs analysis is thorough and effective.

ETC works with other bodies such as Refugee Services to share ideas about the needs of the students and how they can be met. The students' reflection diaries used in some classes are also a way in which needs are identified. Sources such as these provide the information used by ETC to make all the students feel welcome and safe. The evaluation team heard reports from many different people that the environment is so comfortable and supportive at ETC that the students are reluctant to leave.

Emphasis is also placed on ensuring the IELTS programmes and activities match the students' needs. The enrolment form captures the necessary information about each student's proficiency in English. Monthly mock IELTS tests are used to check each student's progress and for progression to a higher class when appropriate. Further effective ongoing needs analysis takes place in the one-to-one interviews between the tutor and the student which focus on each student's writing, reading, listening, and speaking skills.

ETC is also careful to ensure that its programmes match the needs of its stakeholders. It has a formalised partnership with UCOL Polytechnic and has

developed good relationships with other educational institutions. The awareness of different stakeholder needs extends to the work experience providers who endorsed the value of the work experience to all parties. The needs of both the wider community and the students are met by the emphasis on speaking English at ETC and the way in which speakers such as police personnel are used to inform the students about community issues.

ETC assesses its operation through course evaluations, student reflection diaries, checks on the progress of each individual student, and reviews of the value gained from the unit standards underpinning particular programmes. When an issue, such as the attendance of Saudi students, is highlighted, ETC takes appropriate action. An example of this was the use of a representative from a local mosque to help the staff gain a better understanding of Saudi culture so that actions could be taken which have since resulted in improved attendance rates. ETC now needs to consider whether its systems are identifying issues as early as they should.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

ETC uses classroom-based learning, off-site visits, and work experience for students undertaking the English for Migrants and the English for Living in New Zealand programmes. The tutors are well qualified, experienced, and show high levels of commitment to their students. This combination of staff and teaching approaches works very well and is particularly appropriate for the clientele of ETC. The teaching is highly effective and this was endorsed by the positive feedback from the students.

Similarly effective teaching was evident in the IELTS programme where the tutors maintain a focus on the IELTS tests and successfully cater for the different levels of English proficiency. The current students spoke glowingly about their positive relationships with the tutors, and one ex-student described how he was continuously amazed that there was 'something new each day'. Students from the other programmes reinforced this when they described the activities in class as always engaging and 'never boring'.

All the students are aware of their progress, either through the records of unit standard achievement, the progress in literacy and numeracy shown by the Literacy and Numeracy for Adults Assessment Tool, and the results of the mock IELTS tests. The assessment of learning is continuous and students receive written feedback on their tests and assignments. The students undertaking work experience also receive a written report. Although most of the unit standards submitted for external moderation in 2011 reached the required standard, three required minor modifications and six of the submitted scripts were not assessed at the national standard. A similar pattern was apparent in the two previous years, indicating that more strengthening of internal moderation procedures is required.

The tutors are very supportive of one another and work well in teams. They frequently share ideas and everyone gains from the collegial atmosphere. The director plays his part in this by informally visiting the classrooms and making suggestions for improvement. An inclusive approach is used and this was particularly well demonstrated in one classroom where the evaluation team saw something written on the board about each student in the class. The students are frequently placed in small groups so they can help one another, and games are often used to reinforce teaching points.

The informal visits by the director to the classrooms are part of an effective self-assessment system which results in a more effective teaching approach. An example of this was the advice the director gave to a tutor to talk less, which resulted in that tutor using a more episodic teaching approach based on smaller chunks of instruction. The informal visits are supplemented by formal classroom observations undertaken by the director, comprehensive course evaluation forms, peer observations, weekly staff meetings, and programme meetings. The course evaluation forms completed by the students are collated and used by the director as a basis for a meeting with each tutor to assess the effectiveness of the teaching. Some of the tutors receive additional feedback about their effectiveness from the students' reflection journals. More widespread use of these journals would allow ETC to receive more comprehensive feedback about the effectiveness of the teaching, as the course evaluations are only completed annually.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The supportive environment at ETC has already been mentioned as a factor explaining why students are reluctant to leave. ETC recognises the important role played by this environment in successfully integrating the migrants into New Zealand society and providing excellent support in many different ways. The tutors are an effective source of advice and help the students to clarify their social as well as educational goals in individual learning plans. They organise visits to other educational institutions and local libraries and help the students to find work experience. The students also receive good support from a manager who will access specialist support when it is required.

ETC makes effective use of any opportunities for integration into the community and has many links with migrant community organisations. It recognises the importance of establishing a good rapport with different cultural groups in the college and celebrates many of the festivals associated with those groups. When it lacks expertise, it accesses outside assistance such as the speaker from the local mosque who explained to the staff how they could provide better support to the Saudi students. ETC takes a proactive approach in guiding the students, such as

the sessions it organises for the police to talk to the students about issues of crime prevention and family violence.

The support provided to international students is also extensive. ETC takes the appropriate steps set out in the Code of Practice for the Pastoral Care of International Students and offers particularly comprehensive support for those students living with New Zealand homestay families. This comprehensive system includes the clearing of police vetting forms before the homestay is visited, a careful matching of the homestays with the students, and regular phone communication with the homestays. The students spoken to by the evaluation team also mentioned the help they had received with renewing visas, opening bank accounts, and making health insurance claims. The extent of the educational support stretches to one-to-one interviews with each student after the monthly mock IELTS tests and running additional listening tests after the end of the school day.

ETC makes effective use of the procedures involved with the annual review of its implementation of the Code of Practice to assess its pastoral support for international students. This is supplemented by the verbal feedback received from homestay families. The annual course evaluation forms include open-ended questions covering general issues and more specific comments on the ways the students could have been helped more by the tutors. These forms have a separate section at the end for the tutors to comment on any aspects of the feedback to the director. This ensures that issues raised in the feedback are discussed and appropriate action is taken. An example of one such action was the decision in 2010 to introduce prayer spaces for the students. Informal feedback from the students alleviates some of the problems associated with such a large gap of time between the evaluations, and ETC could consider using exit interviews as a further tool for assessing the effectiveness of the support for students.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The director of ETC is heavily involved in both governance and management. His considered and proactive approach to his role effectively supports the educational achievements of the students. He and his colleagues have developed a culture of sharing which pervades many of the interactions with the students. The staff members are very supportive of one another and willingly share resources and ideas about teaching. This occurs both informally in the group meetings that follow the weekly staff meetings and more formally in the staff professional development days. The evaluation team saw evidence of this in the reports from the professional development days. At the same time, the evaluation team noticed how much the staff members talked about the students rather than themselves.

Staff professional development records are kept and there is generous support for staff to attend courses and conferences. The staff professional development days consider examples of good professional practice and measures are taken to ensure they result in changes, through the development of action plans at the end of each day. The use of student reflection diaries has spread since a tutor explained how she used them during one of these development days. More sharing of approaches between the Palmerston North and Wellington sites also resulted from these days.

At this stage in its development, ETC would benefit from additional documentation in the form of a business plan to capture the many ideas circulating in the organisation. There is widespread support in the community and ETC could utilise this by forming an advisory group which could assist the director in his governance role.

The director continuously considers the future of the college. In doing so he examines the performance of the management and explores possible future directions. This process was formalised in the case of the review of the English for Living in New Zealand programme at the beginning of 2010 which resulted in the conclusion that it should be a three-year course rather than two years. The development of a business plan would provide further opportunities for assessment of the effectiveness of management, for example through the use of key performance indicators.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management, and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.2 Focus area: International student support

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.3 Focus area: IELTS programme

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.4 Focus area: English for Migrants programme (level 2) (employment strand)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

2.5 Focus area: English for Living in New Zealand programme (level 3)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Recommendations

There are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review, other than those expressed or implied within the report.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

Self-assessment and external evaluation and review are requirements of programme approval and accreditation (under sections 249 and 250 of the Education Act 1989) for all TEOs that are entitled to apply. The requirements are set through the Criteria for Approval and Accreditation of Programmes established by NZQA under section 253(1)(d) and (e) of the Act and published in the Gazette of 28 July 2011 at page 3207. These policies and criteria are deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under the new section 253.

In addition, for registered private training establishments, the criteria and policies for their registration require self-assessment and external evaluation and review at an organisational level in addition to the individual programmes they own or provide. These criteria and policies are also deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under section 253. Section 233B(1) of the Act requires registered PTEs to comply with these rules.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the EER process approved by the NZQA Board.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process, including the publication Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review, is available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz