

Report of External Evaluation and Review

C Hayes Engineering Training Division

Highly Confident in educational performance

Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 12 December 2012

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	4
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	4
Summary of Results	6
Findings	8
Recommendations	15
Appendix	16

MoE Number: 9310
NZQA Reference: C08662
Date of EER visit: 30 and 31 October 2012

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	C Hayes Engineering Training Division (Hayes)
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	Waioeka Road, Opotiki
Delivery sites:	One as above
First registered:	1 July 1993
Courses currently delivered	Youth Guarantee and Foundation Focussed Training Opportunities funded training programmes. Both programmes deliver training in mechanical engineering leading towards the achievement of the National Certificate in Manufacturing and Mechanical Engineering (Levels 1 and 2)
Code of Practice signatory?	No
Number of students:	Domestic: 23 equivalent full-time students. In recent years 50-70 per cent of trainees have been Māori, and very few Pasifika.
Number of staff:	Three full-time equivalent staff, including two owner-directors
Scope of active consent to assess:	Hayes has consent to assess assessment standards on the New Zealand Qualifications Framework (NZQF) within the manufacturing and mechanical engineering and core generic domains.
Distinctive characteristics:	Hayes operates a general engineering business alongside the training division, and the training is

focussed primarily on the engineering sector. However, Hayes also includes training in core generic workplace skills, which has enabled trainees to gain employment across a range of industry sectors.

Recent significant changes: None

Previous quality assurance history: The most recent quality assurance visit by NZQA was in 2008 when no significant issues were noted.

The Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) recently carried out an audit against contract requirements, in April 2012, and no significant issues were noted.

Competenz is the standard-setting body for the engineering sector. Its most recent national external moderation of assessment, in 2012, identified minor issues and a plan has been agreed to rectify these.

NZQA's most recent national external moderation of assessments within the core generic domain was carried out in 2012, with some issues related to one maths unit in regard to assessment material and assessors' decisions. These matters are being addressed.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

This evaluation included the two mechanical engineering programmes currently offered by Hayes, funded through Youth Guarantee, and Foundation Focused Training Opportunities, and the mandatory focus area of governance, management, and strategy. In effect, this was an evaluation of the whole organisation.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

An evaluation team of two evaluators visited the engineering workshops and training site in Opotiki for one and half-days. The evaluators interviewed students, graduates, local employers, staff from referring agencies, and other interested parties, and sighted and reviewed a range of the organisation's documents and records.

Summary of Results

Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance of **C Hayes Engineering Training Division**.

Hayes has been providing training in Opotiki since 1988, and has established a well-respected position in the community, described by one stakeholder interviewed at this evaluation as, 'lifting up the students ... building their confidence'.

Hayes has a long-established reputation, based on delivering results that enable trainees to achieve credits on the NZQF towards the completion of national certificates, and supporting trainees into employment or further training. The results achieved for the trainees, the community, the referring agencies such as Work and Income, and the funding body, the TEC, are of high value.

The evaluators found consistent and coherent evidence across all aspects of this evaluation, indicating that Hayes has quality processes and is achieving quality outcomes. Hayes has successfully maintained ongoing contracts with the TEC for many years, delivering programmes to trainees aged 16 and over, enabling them to gain core generic employment skills as well as basic engineering skills, and to move into further training or employment. Hayes has consistently met or exceeded TEC contracted targets.

While trainees have been achieving on average 20-30 NZQF credits each, an increasing number of trainees are also achieving the National Certificate in Manufacturing and Mechanical Engineering (Levels 1 or 2). A number of trainees are also gaining engineering apprenticeships in the local area. These are significant achievements for this client group, who in the main have not experienced educational or employment success previously.

The evaluators observed a high level of respect between trainees as well as between trainees and staff, and a high level of interest and engagement in the learning.

No issues or concerns were noted during this evaluation, and all matters reviewed indicated Hayes is delivering quality training and outcomes and the organisation is highly valued as an education provider within its community.

Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **C Hayes Engineering Training Division**.

Hayes has long-established and effective networks within the local region, and strong evidence was sighted during this evaluation that the organisation stays in close contact with its industry base and the wider community, enabling it to assess and review how well it is meeting the needs of trainees, industry, and other interested parties.

This is a very small training establishment, and many of its self-assessment processes are informal and ongoing in nature, such as day-to-day contact with employers and Work and Income staff. Hayes is establishing the needs of its trainees and wider community effectively as well as identifying how well it is addressing those needs. This was borne out at this evaluation through the educational and employment results being gained. Hayes has consistently been delivering what the TEC requires, it is meeting Work and Income's needs in placing trainees into employment or further training, and is identifying and lifting trainees' skills and confidence.

The organisation maintains a range of formal and informal records, for example diary notes of issues arising or changes made, and wall charts tracking trainees' progress, as well as computer-based records. As with many small organisations, the level of documentation is not as complete as it could be, limiting to some extent the organisation's ability to reflect objectively on its performance. Hayes is currently in the process of purchasing a student management system that is likely to greatly improve its ability to manage and review data with greater efficiency. For example, the new system may improve Hayes' ability to analyse how well it is achieving similarity of outcomes for Māori, Pasifika, and other trainees. However, the evaluation team noted that the organisation has for some time been attracting a significantly higher percentage of Māori trainees than are represented in the local community demographics, and a high percentage are achieving positive results both educationally and in employment.

The evaluation team considers the organisation's current processes to be strong and consistently applied, providing Hayes with a good level of understanding in regard to how well it is meeting its trainees' and community needs. However, the organisation's self-assessment practices could be enhanced with stronger or more complete documentation.

Findings¹

1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

On all counts, trainees are achieving significantly. Possibly the greatest achievement is with trainees' improvement in their core generic employment skills. This was evident in the organisation's self-assessment and confirmed at this evaluation through interviews with trainees, graduates, and external stakeholders, with frequent comments such as, 'they break down the barriers and lift trainees' expectations'. Work and Income staff interviewed at this evaluation noted, 'we don't see many of our clients returning back at Work and Income' and, 'our clients move on to employment'. During the site visit, the evaluators observed a high level of respect and support among trainees, both for their fellow trainees as well as for staff. These factors have had a major impact on trainees' academic achievements and have supported them to move into employment.

In recent years, trainees have been achieving an average of between 23 and 31 credits on the NZQF, with some trainees achieving a full National Certificate in Manufacturing and Mechanical Engineering. Further to this, a significant number of trainees (six) have achieved apprenticeships in engineering and related fields, with a further nine gaining 'trade assistant' positions within engineering firms. Over the two programmes in recent years, trainees have been gaining employment or moving on to further training significantly above the contracted targets, as high as 90-100 per cent.

The organisation has effective processes to monitor and track trainees' achievements, including monitoring trainees' growth in literacy and numeracy skills through the TEC online assessment tool. A common theme across the organisation's approach to self-assessment is a mixture of formal and informal or undocumented processes. While the records for tracking and monitoring trainees' achievements were providing the organisation with a reasonable level of detail, a more formal or fully documented process may improve the organisation's ability to reflect on specific aspects of its educational performance, such as comparing achievement between Māori and non-Māori or comparing results year on year more easily.

¹ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Trainees, the local community, employers, and other stakeholders benefit significantly as a result of the training delivered by Hayes. The value added ranges from trainees lifting their aspirations, confidence, and basic skills to their gaining high-value employment as already noted, such as engineering apprenticeships. The community experiences the added value of better-skilled people in its workforce. One employer interviewed at this evaluation commented that the apprentice he had signed on, 'was the best apprentice he had ever had ... Hayes brings them out of their shells and gives them the right basic engineering skills'.

The organisation engages actively with its local community, with trainees contributing to a number of community projects, for example a recent project to build a waterslide as an asset for local children.

The training operates within a commercial general engineering business, which provides trainees with real-time work experience on client projects. This has the added benefit of trainees gaining a realistic understanding of the commercial reality of timeliness and work quality.

The organisation's self-assessment in this area includes regular surveys which evaluate trainees' satisfaction with all aspects of the programme, as well as the outcomes they are gaining. Hayes' analysis of these surveys shows a high level of satisfaction.

The benefit provided to community organisations, government agencies, and employers is gauged through ongoing day-by-day contact with these organisations. This evaluation established that Hayes has a high level of contact with the local community and a high level of understanding of how well it is meeting the community's needs. The evaluators' interviews with external stakeholders also provided a very strong confirmation of Hayes' own self-assessment that it was meeting the community's needs. However, as already noted, the organisation may be leaving itself vulnerable because of the informality of these processes, and further strengthening of the documentation in this area may contribute to a more robust analysis.

1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

It was clearly evident at this evaluation that the programmes and activities provided at Hayes match learners' and other stakeholders' needs to a high degree.

Trainees' needs are assessed at the time of enrolment, and all trainees are assessed twice using the TEC online literacy assessment tool. The early results from the online testing indicate that trainees are improving their literacy and numeracy. The organisation attributes this improvement at least in part to the nature of the engineering programme, which includes embedded literacy and numeracy relating to engineering. A significant number of trainees enter this programme with barriers to learning, and the quality and number of outcomes being achieved indicates that trainees' learning needs have been well matched.

The programme is based on level 1 and 2 assessment standards, which contribute towards an entry-level National Certificate in Manufacturing and Mechanical Engineering. Hayes has chosen to deliver training towards this certificate in engineering because the qualification has been designed by Competenz, the standard-setting body for the engineering sector. This has ensured that the trainees are gaining appropriate basic engineering skills to gain employment in the local region.

The physical and training resources provided are at an appropriate level for the mechanical engineering basic skills programme, including training workbooks and supporting learning material as well as access to engineering machinery equipment and materials. Hayes is the only provider of entry-level engineering training in the region.

The organisation has systematic and purposeful processes that monitor and review how well it is matching trainees' and other stakeholders' needs. Trainees meet every Wednesday with their tutor and discuss emerging learning or employment issues and any other areas where they need support. This appears to be a particularly effective process and provides trainees, tutor, and management with good information, enabling the organisation to more completely match trainees' needs.

Management meets regularly with industry representatives, agencies, and other community groups, and this process has ensured stakeholders' needs are well matched. This was confirmed through the evaluators' interviews with stakeholders. Hayes is held in high regard by all stakeholders contacted by the evaluators, with all confirming that the organisation is providing the right level of support and the right level of training for trainees and the community.

1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The combination of trainees' academic achievements, further training and employment outcomes, evidence of trainees' gains in core generic employment skills, and the organisation's student and employer feedback indicate that learning and teaching are highly effective.

The evaluators observed trainees studying independently and revising theory, and engaging well with staff as well as working purposefully on practical projects. Trainees showed a high level of respect for each other, actively listening to each other in discussions, and were able to discuss in depth the theory and practical aspects of the training. This indicates that Hayes is providing a stimulating and engaging learning environment.

The tutor is well qualified in a related trade and has undertaken suitable professional development, including training in competency-based assessment and adult learning and teaching. The most recent external moderation of assessments by Competenz indicated minor issues with assessment material. However, this has not affected the validity of trainees' learning or their achievements. Hayes is currently in the process of purchasing Competenz assessment tools and developing its programme to meet the requirements of the revised national certificate, now known as the National Certificate in Manufacturing and Mechanical Engineering.

The organisation has well-developed and highly effective internal moderation of 100 per cent of its assessment material and decisions, ensuring the validity, consistency, and reliability of its assessment processes. Trainees undertake one or two pre-tests prior to attempting the final assessments, with trainees and the tutor commenting that this has contributed to achievement rates. Trainees interviewed at this evaluation noted that, 'the tutor is great, he uses different ways to help us understand', and the learning process is logical.

The theory is well linked to its practical application, and the tutor discussed with the evaluators a range of strategies for maintaining trainees' motivation and interest, such as varying the timing of practice and theory and working one-to-one with trainees.

The organisation has effective processes – both formal and informal – to monitor and review the effectiveness of teaching.

1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Trainees receive a high level of guidance and support from the time of enrolment through to their placement in employment or further training. The evaluators noted evidence from all sources within the organisation and in comments from interviews with stakeholders, that Hayes provides an exemplary level of support, lifting students' confidence and aspirations.

Hayes places high value on developing a caring and mutually supportive learning environment for its trainees. This was evident during interviews with trainees discussing their Wednesday meetings, acknowledging they were able to bring personal and training matters to the group and said they felt supported through this process.

During evaluator interviews with external stakeholders, many noted the level of support, for example the timeliness of transport pickups and close attention to trainee attendance as examples of setting standards and supporting trainees to achieve. The tutor noted that the time spent early in a programme socialising the group and spending time sharing kai has paid dividends in developing the mutual support network across the trainees.

Trainees have a clear pathway plan that guides them through the programme to the next steps of either further training or employment.

The organisation has strong and purposeful processes to monitor and evaluate how well trainees are guided and supported.

1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

Management has a clear focus on supporting trainees and ensuring their success in achieving the educational outcomes intended and moving on to employment.

Hayes is a small organisation with two owner-directors and one tutor, and is in the process of recruiting a second part-time tutor to replace one who recently left. Hayes also operates a commercial general engineering business with engineers operating in an adjacent workshop, who are able to be called on to supervise and support trainees with practical engineering skills development. As already noted, the combination of the training division and the general engineering business provides a commercial environment for the trainees to develop workplace

communications, work speed, and work quality. This adds considerable value to the trainees' experience and outcomes.

Hayes has been delivering training under contract to the TEC for many years, and has consistently met or exceeded contract targets and delivered on the key issues in the Tertiary Education Strategy, such as lifting participation and achievement rates of Māori.

The organisation is effective in staying up to date with current changes, such as in welfare reform and education legislation, and is meeting the needs of the standard-setting bodies for engineering and core generic skills, Competenz and NZQA.

The organisation has effective processes to ensure it maintains its focus on trainee achievement, and is in the process of strengthening its monitoring and review processes across all aspects of the business. As already noted, this is a small organisation and has operated successfully through its informal networks in the community. There are some aspects of this that could be further strengthened through more complete documentation to enable more effective reflection and analysis across all aspects of training delivery.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Governance, management, and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

The organisation has a reasonably well-structured and purposeful set of processes to monitor and review its success as an education provider.

The gap in this focus area in particular relates to developing and maintaining sufficient records to enable management to refer back, for example, to past performance issues, or to changes intended to bring about improvements and to monitor their success. The current level of documentation potentially limits management's ability to reflect on past issues objectively.

2.2 Focus area: TEC-funded programmes: Youth Guarantee and Foundation Focused Training Opportunities

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

Recommendations

In addition to the recommendations expressed or implied within the report, NZQA recommends that Hayes:

- Continue to explore and develop stronger recording and documentation processes that will enable the organisation to more effectively and objectively reflect on and analyse its performance.
- Review how the organisation monitors the effectiveness of changes made to improve processes or outcomes, to provide evidence (for review) that they are resulting in meaningful improvements.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

Self-assessment and external evaluation and review are requirements of programme approval and accreditation (under sections 249 and 250 of the Education Act 1989) for all TEOs that are entitled to apply. The requirements are set through the Criteria for Approval and Accreditation of Programmes established by NZQA under section 253(1)(d) and (e) of the Act and published in the Gazette of 28 July 2011 at page 3207. These policies and criteria are deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under the new section 253.

In addition, for registered private training establishments, the criteria and policies for their registration require self-assessment and external evaluation and review at an organisational level in addition to the individual programmes they own or provide. These criteria and policies are also deemed, by section 44 of the Education Amendment Act 2011, to be rules made under section 253. Section 233B(1) of the Act requires registered PTEs to comply with these rules.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the EER process approved by the NZQA Board.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

Information relevant to the external evaluation and review process, including the publication Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review, is available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz