

# Report of External Evaluation and Review

Trade and Commerce Centre Limited

Highly Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 1 October 2015

# Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction .....	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review .....	4
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	5
Summary of Results .....	6
Findings .....	8
Recommendations .....	15
Appendix .....	16

MoE Number: 9384  
NZQA Reference: C18674  
Date of EER visit: 8-11 June 2015

*Final Report*

# Purpose of this Report

*The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.*

## Introduction

### 1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	Trade and Commerce Centre Limited
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
First registered:	16 March 1992
Location:	31 Edmundson Street, Onekawa, Napier
Delivery sites:	105D and E Manukau Road Pukekohe, Auckland; 803 Caroline Road, Hastings; 7-9 Prouse Street, Levin; 91 Chapel St, Masterton; 6 Sheffield Place, Napier; 10 Devon Street East, New Plymouth; 121 Queen St, Palmerston North; 255-259 Main St, Palmerston North; 757 Cameron Road, Tauranga; 32 Wilson St, Whanganui; 180 Glasgow St, Whanganui; 11 Kodex Place, Paraparaumu; 6 Lyttelton Ave, Porirua
Courses currently delivered:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Active Careers Vocational Pathway (NCEA Level 2)</li><li>• Careers in Hospitality (Level 2)</li><li>• Youth Options (Information Technology) (Level 2)</li><li>• Careers in Automotive and Related Trades (Level 1)</li></ul>
Code of Practice signatory:	No
Number of students:	Domestic: 156 equivalent full-time students (50 per cent Māori, 47 per cent New Zealand European, 2 per cent Pasifika, 1 per cent Other)

*Final Report*

Number of staff:	58 full-time equivalents
Distinctive characteristics:	Trade and Commerce delivers foundation-level programmes funded through Youth Guarantee across 15 sites. Training for Work programmes, funded by the Ministry of Social Development are run across 10 sites. Trade and Commerce also runs an Alternative Education programme in Hastings. My Voice, a strengths-based engagement framework developed by Trade and Commerce, is embedded in all programmes.
Recent significant changes:	NA
Previous quality assurance history:	At the previous external evaluation and review (EER) in May 2011, NZQA was Highly Confident in the organisation's educational performance and Highly Confident in its capability in self-assessment. For 2014, Trade and Commerce did not meet requirements for three unit standards submitted to NZQA for external moderation. An action plan to address issues identified has been accepted by NZQA.

## 2. Scope of external evaluation and review

The scope of the EER included the mandatory focus area of governance, management and strategy. A second horizontal focus area, the learning management system, was chosen to enable the evaluation team to review how Trade and Commerce was using this system to monitor learner achievement and quality processes across a large number of campuses. Two of the Youth Guarantee programmes were also chosen as focus areas:

- Active Careers – a newly developed programme that allows learners to achieve their NCEA qualifications with a Services Industries Vocational Pathway Award. This programme is offered at Whanganui, Masterton, Tauranga, Levin and Palmerston North.
- Careers in Hospitality – this is the largest Youth Guarantee programme offered by Trade and Commerce. Learners who complete this programme achieve the National Certificate in Employment Skills and the New Zealand Certificate in Hospitality. This programme is delivered in Pukekohe, Napier, Hastings, Palmerston North, Whanganui, New Plymouth, Masterton and Porirua.

### 3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

*All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document *Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review* available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.*

Prior to the EER, Trade and Commerce submitted a self-assessment document that outlined the distinctive nature of the organisation and answered the six key evaluation questions, and highlighted the learning and teaching approach and learner management system.

The evaluation team of two visited the Pukekohe, Napier, Hastings, Palmerston North and Whanganui campuses over four days. Interviews were conducted with senior management, programme managers, stakeholders and students. A range of documentation was reviewed, including achievement data, evidence of outcomes, internal review reports and moderation records.

# Summary of Results

## Statement of confidence on educational performance

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance of **Trade and Commerce Centre Limited**.

Trade and Commerce has strong processes that inform the delivery of the programmes and drive consistency across the organisation. The programmes have been carefully designed with the foundation learner in mind and therefore the majority of students are engaged and learning. The course completion rates for 2013 and 2014 were 72 and 67 per cent respectively; in 2014, 85 per cent of those who remained engaged passed the programme.

Not only are engaged learners completing unit standards and qualifications, they are also developing important life skills. For example, the organisation has worked to embed literacy and numeracy into the programmes, and the evaluation team saw how programme managers are using the information provided by the Tertiary Education Commission's adult literacy and numeracy assessment tool to plan individual programmes of learning. In addition, My Voice, a strengths-based learning framework, is a useful underpinning for all programmes which is appreciated by both students and programme managers for the support it gives to knowing the learner and planning their journey. Learners from across the campuses told the evaluation team that they also appreciated learning life skills like budgeting, cooking and how to exercise safely.

The evaluation team saw strong value for learners, most of whom have disengaged from the compulsory education sector. Programmes are designed in consultation with communities and provide opportunities for learners to gain NCEA and other level 1 and 2 qualifications outside of the school environment. From a total of 430 learners in 2014, 455 qualifications were gained. Evidence shows that a significant number of learners move to higher education, with progression rates at 44 per cent. Learners also move to employment, with the programme designed to support the transition.

Trade and Commerce engages with stakeholder groups on an ongoing basis. Through My Voice, learners are encouraged to give feedback on the programme and their progress, and regular systematic programme reviews provide an opportunity to engage with local industry and community groups. Most campuses have strong links with local schools, youth services providers, police and Youth Justice. Feedback from stakeholders is used to develop and refine programmes.

The organisation has a strong education mission to support entry-level learners to achieve meaningful qualifications using strengths-based pedagogy. Systems and processes, including the bespoke learning management system, effectively support this mission. Processes are focused on retention and engagement and, as the

majority of those retained achieve well, NZQA is highly confident in Trade and Commerce's educational performance.

## Statement of confidence on capability in self-assessment

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of **Trade and Commerce Centre Limited**.

The purpose-built learning management system used by Trade and Commerce provides useful, real-time performance and attendance data that is regularly reviewed by staff at different levels throughout the organisation. The organisation has adopted a hub and spoke approach to delivery, and the role of the programme manager is key to providing a conduit between what happens at each site and the leadership and support team at the hub. The majority of programme managers found the real-time, interactive learning management system dashboard supportive of their work with learners. For example, the system sends programme managers prompts for the learners who may need an attendance plan, what assessments are due, and what assessments must be submitted for moderation.

There is good evidence that the organisation reviews its programmes and activities on a regular basis and that these reviews result in enhancements. For example, a review of the programmes being offered in the Horowhenua which involved significant stakeholder engagement resulted in the development of the Active Careers programme. A review of the Hospitality programmes resulted in all campuses being equipped with commercial-grade coffee machines. In 2014, an in-depth review was conducted into the reasons behind why 30 per cent of learners disengage after enrolment. A closer attention to attendance policies and monitoring and greater whānau engagement were two actions implemented in response to this review.

My Voice gives learners the opportunity to give feedback about their progress, and the operations support managers touch base with learners when they are on campus. Moving the coaching questions online, and enabling learners to give feedback independently, will provide another monitoring tool to capture the learner voice systematically.

# Findings<sup>1</sup>

## 1.1 How well do learners achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Trade and Commerce regularly monitors learner achievement, by campus, programme and ethnicity, and by each learner's progress. Data provided to the evaluation team shows that of those learners who remain engaged (69 per cent) 85 per cent successfully complete their programmes. A review of attrition has targeted strategies aimed at lifting the retention rate for 2015.

Analysis shows that 60 per cent of learners were Māori in 2014 but only 54 per cent of the qualifications awarded were for Māori. Strategies have been put in place to try to address this disparity, including work to align the learner engagement statements with the learner voice outcomes stated in Tataiako: Cultural Competencies for Teachers of Maori Learners (Ministry of Education 2011).

**Table 1. Tertiary Education Commission educational performance indicator: course completions, for Trade and Commerce, 2013-2014**

Year	Level 1	Level 2	Overall
2013	74	69	72
2014	61	70	67

The data shows (Table 1) that Trade and Commerce performed well above the sector median of 57 per cent for successful course completion for Youth Guarantee learners in 2013. In 2014, achievement dipped slightly, due in part to government policy settings with respect to entry criteria.

In addition to achieving credits and qualifications, learners are achieving gains in their literacy and numeracy skills. In 2014, 70 per cent of learners were below the NCEA level 1 numeracy requirements and 73 per cent were below the NCEA 1 reading requirements at the beginning of their programmes. A summary of results, as measured by the Tertiary Education Commission literacy and numeracy assessment tool, shows that significant gains were made by learners in their reading and numeracy, particularly for those whose initial assessment placed them at Steps 1 and 2.

The learning management system enables the senior leadership team to monitor and track the achievement of every learner and cohort from the head office in

---

<sup>1</sup> The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

Napier. A Learner Achievement Plan identifies units and achievement standards already gained and plans completion dates for unit standards needed to gain the qualifications (including NCEA). These plans are used by the learners and programme managers and are aggregated at head office to track progress against goals. Regular leadership meetings review achievement targets and support is put in place if a particular programme or campus appears to be at risk of lower than expected achievement.

## 1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Good**.

The organisation's mission is focused on learners gaining useful training to enable them to engage effectively in further education or to find useful employment. A range of evidence was viewed, including industry reviews, learner profiles and withdrawal notes made by programme managers which demonstrate that this goal is being largely met, with a significant number moving to either further education or employment. Tertiary Education Commission data shows that 44 per cent of learners progress to higher study.

While destination data was collected and reported systematically in previous years, a shift in policy settings, from Youth Training to Youth Guarantee, meant the Tertiary Education Commission no longer required Trade and Commerce to report on labour market outcomes. Therefore, the organisation turned its focus to ensuring that the shift from credits to qualifications is successful and labour market outcomes are no longer reported systematically. However, most programme managers have a good understanding of the destinations of their graduates, and the learning management system has the capacity to collect and analyse this data at some point in the future.

The programmes in place support learners gaining valued outcomes. For example, the programmes are linked to Vocational Pathways, which supports the transition of learners to study at higher levels. In addition, the My Voice framework supports learners to engage with planning and preparing for their next steps. Work experience is encouraged and supported at some campuses, and learners were confident that this gave them confidence to transition to employment.

There is value in gaining level 1 or 2 qualifications. In 2014, 455 qualifications were awarded, 110 at NCEA level 2. Some learners achieved more than one qualification. Learners spoken to by the evaluation team valued the opportunity to study in an environment that enabled them to gain these foundation-level qualifications and the opportunities that this opened up for them.

### 1.3 How well do programmes and activities match the needs of learners and other stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

As noted above, Trade and Commerce has designed its programmes with its learners and community in mind. For example, the Active Careers programme was designed in consultation with the local community in the Horowhenua to provide young people with an alternative programme for disengaged youth that enabled them to gain their NCEA qualifications. In 2014, Trade and Commerce was offered more Youth Guarantee places for 2015, and knew through Youth Guarantee networks that Wairarapa was needing more provision. The organisation consulted with youth services providers and local iwi, and as a result an Active Careers programme began there for 2015.

The My Voice framework, learner interviews and literacy and numeracy assessments ensure that learner needs are well understood. All learners arrive with different needs, and learner achievement plans are designed accordingly. Literacy and numeracy needs are identified early and engagement with the skills building tool, Pathways Awarua, is timetabled to support this learning. A recent initiative in response to analysis of achievement data has been to map the My Voice framework against the Ministry of Education resource Tataiako, to try to better match the needs of Māori learners.

A key component of the programmes offered at Trade and Commerce is a mix of theory and practice. As well as in class work, the Active Careers programme structures time in the gym, with learners setting fitness and health goals and learning about nutrition and exercise. Hospitality students are given the opportunity to practise their skills in the kitchen and café settings, and automotive students are based primarily in the automotive workshop. All learners gain experience planning weekly breakfast and lunch menus, budgeting, shopping, cooking and cleaning as part of their programmes.

There are regular formal reviews of programmes and activities that inform developments and enhancements. For these reviews, a number of stakeholder perspectives are assessed, including learners, industry, youth services providers, iwi, the Tertiary Education Commission, NZQA and the Ministry of Social Development. Learners have opportunities to give feedback, and the operations support managers touch base with learners when they are on campus. Moving the coaching questions online, and enabling learners to give feedback independently, will provide another monitoring tool to capture the learner voice systematically.

#### 1.4 How effective is the teaching?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Programme managers, who work directly with the learners, are supported to develop their skills as teachers. All have either completed or are enrolled in adult teaching qualifications. Internal professional development is ongoing and effective. For example, programme managers are brought together regularly for training on the learning management system, literacy and numeracy and improving moderation practices. Ongoing supervision from operations support managers and annual internal reviews of each campus and programme highlights issues that need addressing and require support.

The EER determined that the moderation action plan submitted to NZQA is well on track and has been a focus for improvement for the organisation. Actions implemented include revising assessment materials, increased frequency and scope of internal moderation, the use of an experienced external moderator to support internal moderation and training, and support for staff to understand evidence requirements for certain unit standards.

Learners are positive about the teaching, noting that 'learning was fun' and that their tutors gave them the support they needed to ensure understanding. They appreciated the small classes and the variety of activities spread across the day. Learners were clear about how well they were achieving and all centres had goal charts on the wall which tracked learners' progress through the different unit standards. Regular celebrations of unit standards gained supported learner motivation and engagement.

#### 1.5 How well are learners guided and supported?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Processes for guiding and supporting learners are strong. Learners come to Trade and Commerce via a range of referrals, including from friends and whānau, schools, Youth Justice and youth services. All arrive with a range of learning needs. All are interviewed to determine, first, whether they meet the criteria for the programme, and secondly, whether the learner thinks the programme will suit their goals. The evaluation team heard examples of young people being supported to find alternative training that better met their needs. A trial period allows learners to settle in and better understand how the programme works.

All cohorts establish clear guidelines and rules and these are negotiated and determined by the learners in conjunction with the programme managers. The *Final Report*

guidelines and rules are displayed in the classroom and enforced when necessary. The evaluation team heard about some serious behavioural issues being dealt with by the programme managers and noted that, while the responses were appropriate, Trade and Commerce procedures were not always clearly understood or articulated. Attendance is closely monitored and plans are put in place for those who fall below an agreed threshold. For those who stop attending, programme managers work hard to re-engage them, at times needing to find community support to address health, housing or family issues that may be getting in the way of attendance. In some regions, Trade and Commerce has strong mutually supporting relationships with youth services providers that enhance their ability to guide and support the young person.

The My Voice programme supports and guides the learners' journey through their programmes. It begins with learners working with their coach to understand their strengths and goals. Towards the end of the programme, planning for their careers includes researching study and employment options and seeking career guidance and practising interview skills.

The organisation has useful systems to track how well learners are being guided and supported. For example, the learner management system supports the monitoring of attendance and attendance plans. There is also the ability to enter in pastoral care notes for students so that at-risk learners can be monitored by the wider management team. In addition, a 2014 review of attrition looked at the reasons why students left the programme early, and the existing strategies and policies to deal with attrition. As a result, Trade and Commerce has initiated a trial period and enhanced early engagement to try to lift retention. A review period is scheduled.

## 1.6 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The senior management team, including the managing director, are clearly focused on the organisation's mission. The learning management system enables the leadership team to track real-time achievement, engagement and quality processes across the many campuses and programmes where training is delivered. These key performance indicators are considered at regular meetings, and any issues are identified and responded to. The operations support managers fill an important role as a quality assurance link between the different delivery sites and head office.

Staff feel valued and are supported to achieve in their roles. There is a clear orientation process that supports new programme managers to adjust to their roles. For example, new programme managers are required to submit all marked

*Final Report*

assessments for moderation until the organisation has developed confidence in their judgements. Supervision and support from operations support managers and internal quality reviews are other processes that ensure performance is monitored and necessary support provided. It is clear that Trade and Commerce is committed to supporting people to develop in their roles and has invested in targeted training and development.

Programme managers noted that head office was responsive to feedback and requests for resources. Sites are encouraged to have their own flavour and distinctive approach to delivery, but key components and assessment policy and processes are aligned and consistency is well managed. There is a good backbone of support provided in terms of programme workbooks and guides and supplementary teaching resources. Issues with respect to information technology and connection speeds were noted across a number of sites, but the management team is aware of this and has a plan in place to address it.

There is good evidence that Trade and Commerce is responsive to the changing policy environment. For example, the organisation has successfully managed the change from Training Opportunities and Youth Training funding to the new requirements of Youth Guarantee and Training for Work. This required a significant shift in monitoring and reporting requirements. The bespoke learning management system enables performance to be closely monitored and has the capacity to expand its requirements as policy settings shift. Systematically collecting graduate destination and outcomes data would strengthen the organisation's understanding of how well it is achieving its goals.

## Focus Areas

*This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.*

### 2.1 Focus area: Governance, management and strategy

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

### 2.2 Focus area: Careers in Hospitality (Level 2)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

### 2.3 Focus area: Active Careers programme (Level 2)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

This first cycle of this programme was completed in Palmerston North in 2014, with strong achievement for those who stayed engaged. A significant number of staff are developing their skills to fully support learners. However, the processes for monitoring and supporting programme development are strong, issues are identified and appropriate support is in place.

### 2.4 Focus area: Learning Management System

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

# Recommendations

NZQA recommends that Trade and Commerce reintroduce the collection and analysis of graduate destination and outcomes data.

# Appendix

## Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

*External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.*

*NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.*

*This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.*

*The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.*

*External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.*

*External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website ([www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)).*

*The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.*

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E [qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz](mailto:qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz)

[www.nzqa.govt.nz](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz)

Final Report