

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

# 3

91438



914380



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY  
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD  
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

## Level 3 History, 2016

### 91438 Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event

9.30 a.m. Friday 18 November 2016  
Credits: Six

| Achievement  | Achievement with Merit  | Achievement with Excellence  |
|--|---|--|
| Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. | Analyse, in depth, the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. | Comprehensively analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. |

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

**Write ONE essay in this booklet.**

If you need more room for your answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–12 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

**YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.**

**Excellence**

**TOTAL**

**7**

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

**INSTRUCTIONS**

Write an essay on ONE significant historical event that you have studied, using the essay task below.

Write your chosen historical event in the box below.

Your essay should be at least 800 words long.

Plan your essay on page 3. Begin your essay on page 4.

**ESSAY TASK**

Analyse the extent to which particular factors caused a significant historical event, and the different ways this event changed people's lives over an extended period of time.

Historical event: *The First Battle of Passchendaele 12<sup>th</sup> October 1917.*

Begin your essay here:

ASSESSOR  
USE ONLY

The First Battle of Passchendaele on 12<sup>th</sup> October 1917 was to be New Zealanders bloodiest day and biggest military defeat ~~ever~~ ever in its history. In only one ~~day~~ day, on 12<sup>th</sup> October, the New Zealand Division suffered casualties around 2725 men, with 845 dead. There ~~are~~ <sup>were</sup> several factors that caused the event, including the necessity for British to eliminate the German U-boat bases, the success of the Battle of Messines, the attentional August battles with no ~~clear~~ clear consequence, and Haig's optimism. The event also changed people's lives both short-term and long-term in different ways. It resulted in huge number of casualties, the mourning and grieving of deaths, ~~politician and historians' criticism~~ ~~criticism over Haig's role~~ and the enduring bond formed between New Zealand and Belgium.

A long-term factor for causing the First Battle of Passchendaele was the necessity for British to eliminate the German U-boat bases along Belgian coastline. In June @ Royal Navy officer Admiral Jellicoe warned the British War Cabinet of the necessity of ~~eliminating~~ eliminating the German U-boat bases along Belgian coast at Ostend and Zeebrugge, where the Germans used for operating in the North Sea and sinking British merchant vessels. Considering the rate of British merchant ships losses, ~~the~~ @ British aims of maintaining the western front line and driving Germans out of Belgium and France

faced an immediate threat. The British Commander on Western Front, Sir Douglas Haig, then proposed an offensive that would not only eliminate the German U-boat bases, but also encourage Russians to stay in war and release the pressure on France, when its armies were suffering from a severe crisis of morale. Haig said "it's something to feed on" during the waiting time for American support. Haig argued the possibility of reaching the Dutch Frontier, and might even, if all succeeded, force the Germans to make peace in 1917. Haig's plan was a series of land-based advances along Belgian coast to open Ostend and nearby Bruges to British artillery. Then an advance along the Passchendaele Ridge would bring the railway line in Roulers-~~thru~~ Thourout, ~~would bring~~ just behind the ridge, within the British artillery range and hence disrupt the German supply route between Belgian coast and Flanders. Therefore ~~Haig's~~ the necessity for British to eliminate the German U-boat bases became a factor in resulting in Haig's plan for the Passchendaele offensive.

Another factor that caused the First Battle of Passchendaele was the success of the Battle of Messines. In order to launch the Passchendaele offensive, the removal of Germans from the Messines Ridge was

required, otherwise the ~~enemies~~ enemies would have observed the Allied preparations for major offensive. With Haig's ~~to~~ bite-and-hold operation, mounted by the Second Army under the command of ~~Herb~~ Herbert Plumer, the capture of Messines was an obvious success. At 3.10. am. on 7 June, 19 ~~of~~ huge mines buried under the German lines exploded, resulting in the most powerful ~~man-made~~ man-made explosion ever at the time. By the end of the day the British had gained control over the whole ridge with <sup>lost of</sup> 17,000 men ~~lost~~, while the Germans had lost 24,000 <sup>men</sup> and 67 guns. This success, which laid the potential background for the Passchendaele offensive, directly resulted in Haig's strategic plan for Ypres. Haig's plan fell into two phases. First strike ~~to~~ would be at North-east from Ypres salient to capture a rim of high ground running from Scudler through Passchendaele and Gheluvelt. Next, in conjunction with a seaborne landing near Newport, the troops would drive north, reaching the Dutch Frontier ultimately.

Another factor that caused the First Battle of Passchendaele was the attritional battles ~~of~~ in August with no clear consequence. After the first day assault on 31<sup>st</sup> July, the incessant rain caused a delay for the battle until

①, under the command of 7  
General Sir Hubert Gough,

August, and this was when the costly and futile battles at Pilcherm Ridge and Langemarck took place. But the battles had also brought severe damage to the German side. Ludendorff had recalled of the heavy strain laid on the western troops brought by the costly August battles in Flanders and at Verdun. In spite of German ~~concrete~~ concrete protection they seemed "more or less powerless <sup>in front</sup> of the enormous weight of army's artillery" and Ludendorff felt that they no longer displayed the firmness upon which he relied. Therefore based on Ludendorff's conclusion, it is reasonable to say that the first month of the battle was attritional to both sides, and this became a factor that caused the First Battle of Passchendaele, as it offered British some inducement to continue the battle, for no one was prepared to waste the lives that had been ~~sacrificed~~ sacrificed.

The last factor that ~~was~~ directly caused the first Battle of Passchendaele was Haig's optimism. By the end of August, General Sir Hubert Gough was replaced by the Second Army commander General Sir Herbert Plumer. ~~Plumer~~ Plumer launched three outstanding attacks at Menin ~~Road~~ Road, Polygon Wood and Broodseinde, giving Haig further confidence.

at Passchendaele. However, the weather became worse later on, the autumn of 1917 ~~in Belg~~ had been the wettest in Belgium for 70 years. The rain dissolved the battlefield into a porridge. In words of ~~Pr~~ Rupprecht, Crown Prince of Bavaria, "it's our most effective ally." Several ~~Br~~ high-ranking British ~~&~~ officers wanted to halt the attack, but Haig ~~was~~ would not accept it.

The victories at Messines and Gravenstafel Spur, as well as a false impression ~~of~~ of a substantial advance at Poelcapelle on 9<sup>th</sup> October made Haig optimistic. He was quoted saying "the ~~enemies~~ <sup>enemy</sup> <sup>is</sup> now much weakened in morale and ~~that~~ ~~&~~ lacks the desire to fight." His insistence on the battle would mean that the Allies ~~&~~ troops would struggle through the mud, the rain filled shell craters, the war debris and the uncrotted barbed wire all the way through, facing problems of ~~a~~ aiming shortage. The order was still given out. The attack on Belleme Spur was scheduled at 5.25 a.m. on <sup>ever</sup> 12<sup>th</sup> October, resulting in the bloodiest day in New Zealand history. Hence Haig's optimism was the most important and direct factor that caused the First Battle of Passchendaele.

✓ A way that  
 ✓ The First Battle of Passchendaele had greatly changed New Zealanders' lives as ~~it brought huge~~ was the

② on 12<sup>th</sup> October

casualties <sup>✓ brought</sup> to this small nation. In only one day the New Zealand suffered 895 men, including 65 officers. The total number of ~~casual~~ wounded and missing is still controversial due to the incomplete casualty statistics. Based on analysis by historian Andrew Macdonald, a number of around 1900 wounded and missing is arrived at. He calculated this by subtracting the CWGC's figure of 895 dead from the total brigade level casualty of 2797, which gives a ~~total~~ number of 1952 wounded (including a few soldiers wounded before 12<sup>th</sup> October). With such a loss in a single day, the Battle of Passchendaele was ~~the~~ New Zealanders' worst day in any overseas wars. On the other hand, the German casualty on 12<sup>th</sup> October was light. The 5<sup>th</sup> Jaeger Battalion defended the forward battle zone attacked by New Zealanders, lost 21 men with 78 wounded and 55 missing. The 5<sup>th</sup> Jaeger Battalion totalled casualty of 154. This means that, every one German casualty in New Zealand commander Russell's sector, about 18 New Zealanders were either killed, wounded or missing. Therefore this huge ~~number~~ number of casualty was the most immediate consequence that greatly changed the lives of New Zealand soldiers.

Another way that changed ~~the~~ the <sup>✓ First</sup> Battle of Passchendaele changed New Zealanders' lives in



short-term was the mourning and grieving ~~grieving~~<sup>grieving</sup> of deaths. After the battle many <sup>dead</sup> New Zealanders were buried in Belgium due to scale of death and the distance ~~separating~~ separating New Zealanders from their homes and communities. When a soldier was killed, the ~~resp~~ responsibility of mourning and carrying out a ritual, if possible, fell on his comrades. This could be extremely difficult for the soldiers, for themselves were struggling to ~~to~~ control their feelings and phrases such as "he had it", "he's taken to the count" or "he's gone west" were commonly used. Soldiers would also write to families of fallen comrades. For example, in ~~one~~ a letter of one soldier writing to a mourning mother noted "his boys said he met death with a smile and I believe that his noble and ~~his~~ heroic death would bring to you some consolations." Back in home many families held funerals in absence of the bodies as the battle of Passchendaele was a ~~complete~~ complete turmoil where many dead and wounded soldiers were left ~~undiscovered~~ uncovered. Even now some bodies are still un-identified. This further added the difficulties of grieving at home. In many cases families of missing soldiers desperately waited for news and information about their loved ones' fate. Even for those who died, their families exhaustively sought details about their

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR  
USE ONLYQUESTION  
NUMBER

dear deaths, just to understand what really had happened in their last minute of lives. The death notices ~~were~~ were published on local newspaper with heavy black lines around the entry and a banner read "For the Empire's Cause", <sup>national's</sup> ~~underlining the mourning of the nations~~ for the dead soldiers.

Another ~~way~~ <sup>also</sup> ~~that~~ <sup>the</sup> First Battle of Passchendaele ~~was~~ <sup>as</sup> ~~the~~ friendship <sup>was</sup> built between New Zealand and Belgium. The Battle of Passchendaele had left deep scar on this nation with a population of just a million, but this ~~is~~ scar also formed an enduring bond between New Zealand and Belgium. ~~It is~~ In Belgium there are war memorials, cemeteries, monuments, along with bunkers and trenches where people still pay ~~reference~~ reverence to the contributions New Zealanders made for the freedom of Belgium. At Passchendaele there are New Zealand flags hanging and ~~over~~ ~~architecture~~ ~~and~~ architecture built in memory of New Zealanders' sacrifice. Belgium also held official meetings with New Zealand to build friendship and peace ~~to~~ in honouring 'our ancestors' sacrifice at Passchendaele. On 4<sup>th</sup> October 2007, the 90<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the

Extra space if required.  
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION  
NUMBER

Battle of Broodseinde, ~~was held in Belgium~~ the Rt. Hon Helen Clark ONZ representing the New Zealand government was in Ypres and signed the Ypres agreement with the Flemish government. The agreement committed to cooperate in increasing recognition in ~~our~~ society, especially for younger generations, memorializing the dead and encouraging tourism to commemorative and historical places in ~~the~~ New Zealand and Flanders. This promoted the forming of Passchendaele Society <sup>in</sup> March 2004 to ensure the tragedy of Passchendaele would never be forgotten. The Passchendaele Society was also involved in a project to build a New Zealand Memorial Garden, which ~~was~~ <sup>is</sup> begun ~~in~~ in January 2014 and is still ongoing. Therefore the First Battle of Passchendaele had <sup>significantly</sup> ~~greatly~~ changed the lives of New Zealanders and Belgians in a way of memorializing the dead.

The First Battle of Passchendaele on 12<sup>th</sup> October 1917 was a significant historical event that resulted in the most tragic day ever in New Zealand history. There are several factors that caused the event, including the necessity for British to ~~an~~ eliminate the German U-boat bases, the success of the Battle of Messines, the attritional August battles with no clear consequence, \*

91438

\* | ~~It~~ and King's optimism. The ~~the~~ First Battle of Passchendaele also changed people's lives both in short and long term in different ways, ~~such as~~ as it resulted in huge number of casualties, the mourning and grieving of deaths, and the friendship built between New Zealand and Belgium.

## **91438 Annotated Exemplar 2016**

### **Excellence - 07**

This response is typical of a lower level Excellence level scripts. The candidate effectively responds to the question set for this examination this year throughout their response. In particular, coverage of all the question component “the different ways this event changed people’s lives over an extended period of time” is developed with a comprehensive range of evidence presented, with the essay addressing impacts of this early 20<sup>th</sup> Century event through to the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.

Solid evidence is presented to support the first part of the question, as a range of causal factors are considered, and a strong argument is developed throughout the response. The impression this essay gives the marker is that the writer is in control of their material and able to construct a lucid and convincing response to the question posed.

A wider range of evidence would be needed to gain an E8 grade, as would perhaps a more sustained and detailed coverage of the relative importance of Passchendaele as compared to say Gallipoli, in terms of impact on New Zealander’s lives [or perhaps other relevant military conflicts]. All in all, a clearly comprehensive response, hence 07 is the most appropriate grade.