

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

2

91231



912310



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

Tick this box if
there is no writing
in this booklet

Level 2 History 2020

91231 Examine sources of an historical event that is of significance to New Zealanders

2.00 p.m. Wednesday 25 November 2020
Credits: Four

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Examine sources of an historical event that is of significance to New Zealanders.	Examine, in depth, sources of an historical event that is of significance to New Zealanders.	Comprehensively examine sources of an historical event that is of significance to New Zealanders.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

You should attempt ALL the questions in this booklet.

Pull out Resource Booklet 91231R from the centre of this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–11 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

Low Excellence

TOTAL

21

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

INSTRUCTIONS

Read the **Introduction** in the resource booklet before analysing **Sources A–G**. The introduction will provide a context for your examination of the sources.

You may wish to identify, highlight, or annotate aspects of the sources in the resource booklet. However, this will not be assessed.

In your answers, you should (where appropriate):

- go beyond the immediately obvious information in the sources, in order to draw conclusions
- note relevant question(s) that the sources might raise in a historian's mind, that may be investigated further
- consider who created the source, and for what purpose.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION ONE

With reference to **Sources A and B**, examine the reasons why men and women committed to Seacliff Asylum in the early 20th century differ.

One reason why men and women committed to Seacliff Asylum in the early 20th century differ is because the man in the relationship was more dominant than the woman. For example, Source B refers to Mary N. of Port Chalmers "condemned by her husband for her neglect of her house and her family." ~~The~~ Significantly, this shows how men were more powerful and had more authority over women; especially a husband over his wife because men are genetically stronger than women and were always the worker of the home while the wife stayed home to cook and clean. Moreover, this meant men were the 'boss' of the household and many felt they could do anything to their wives such as hit them. Furthermore, Source B goes on to state that "neither of her examiners considered the 'unhappiness of her married life' a worthy excuse for her actions." This can be related to society today in which tradition has //

continued and the majority of women in the relationship still do all the cooking and cleaning even if they have a full time job like their partners. Therefore, I think one of the reasons why men and women committed to the asylum differ is because men did whatever they wanted to their wives. Whether that was committing them to the asylum or abuse their partners either cause of alcoholism, physical or sexual abuse. This can be cross referenced because Source A states 13 men were committed to the asylum for alcoholism compared to 3 women. Furthermore, 7 women were committed to the asylum for domestic troubles and 0 men were. //

Interestingly, 18 men were committed to the asylum for heredity reasons compared to 9 women (1/2 the numbers) according to source A which indicates that men have struggles with mental health as well which is harder for men to admit because traditionally, they are tough and brave and shouldn't have problems as that would make them look weak. In today's society men's mental health is slowly starting to be talked about a lot more and becoming more normalised. In 1905 (source A), it would have been a very unspoken about topic. Furthermore, as Source B says, "the stress upon men to fulfil their economic obligations to their families was heightened, then, by ideological imperative". This, would have impacted on men's mental health

Ex

QUESTION TWO

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

With reference to **Sources C and D**, and any of the other sources, examine TWO different perspectives on the way patients were treated and/or responded to treatment at Seacliff Asylum.

According to Source (C)(iii), Janet Frame remembers the asylum as a horror house. For instance, "from my first moment there I knew that I could not turn back to my usual life or forget what I saw at Seacliff." Janet Frame obviously did not like her time at the asylum and must have come across some very interesting characters. Moreover, from reading the extract from Source (C)(iii), it is clear that Janet Frame thought the staff at Seacliff to be awful. "With certain forms of medical treatment being threatened as punishment for failure to 'co-operate'... 'not-co-operate' might mean a refusal to obey an order, say to go to the doorless lavatories with six others and urinate in public while suffering verbal abuse..." Furthermore, source (C)(iv) states that Avis Hunter was forced to take paraffin to make him go to the toilet. "That was really horrible" he said. ~~For~~ Additionally, according to source D, ~~the~~ Istina Mavet still lived in fear of his traumatic past of living in the asylum: "he apologised countless times for being a messy eater... his youth living in fear of being told off by the guards/nurses."

On the other hand, ~~acc~~ via source (C)(ii), ~~L~~ Lionel Terry thought of the asylum completely differently. "They'll diagnose your symptoms in a most amazing way" wrote Terry in the poem. Terry obviously had major mental issues considering he murdered //

a Chinese Immigrant and supposedly, he was able to get away with it because he had 'mental problems'. Mental health is a very real and important thing and everyone should be able to be helped and listened to. However, getting away with murder or abuse and being told that's fine is not okay just because you have 'mental problems'. This can be linked to society today in which politicians in New Zealand parliament have sexually abused people and said it's because they have mental health issues which not okay. One, because that's offensive to people dealing with real mental health issues and two; there is no excuse for abusing someone. Significantly, Lionel Terry would have liked being in the asylum because no one would have judged him for murdering someone. "You prove yourself a victim of Emotional Insanity!" wrote Terry. Terry obviously liked the way he was treated at the asylum and enjoyed the result of his actions and behaviour being put down to 'emotional insanity.' Furthermore, he thought the treatment at asylum wonderful; "before these wonderful Medicos who probe our mental weakness!" The exclamation mark he adds to the end of a few of the lines on his poem almost shows his excitement and emphasis that the asylum was a wonderful place that looked after you and didn't judge you.

EX

QUESTION THREE

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

An important historical relationship considered by historians is change and continuity.

With reference to **Sources D–G**, and any of the other sources, examine the change and continuity in people's attitudes to mental health in New Zealand over time.

Over the years, it has been easier for women to normalise mental health issues compared to men in some respects because women were always traditionally weak and at home and more seceptable to being sad and lonely because women were/are not gender equal to men. Husbands during the early 1900's would committ their wives to asylums because, one reason, according to Source B: "of her neglect of her house and her family... their husbands perceptions of that inability." Consequently, females have been more 'recognised' for mental illness than men in the past. While it still wasn't normalised: source (c)(iii) "I felt as if my life were overturned by this sudden division of peoples into 'ordinary' people on the street, and these 'secret' people whom few had seen or talked to..." Today, many women speak out about their mental health issues and seek help because they know that it is okay to feel the way they feel and to be listened to. While there is still a long way to go with suicide rates in New Zealand still a big number, women with mental health issues are definetly made to still feel 'normal' in society. //

On the other hand, males in New Zealand today have & extremley high suicide rates and more so//

feel they need to keep their feelings and emotions bottled up because they are a man and should be 'tough' and 'manly'. As source B states "stress upon men ~~to~~ in the 1930's to fulfil their economic obligations to their families was heightened then, by ideological imperative... men were arrested primarily on the basis of their mental condition." The fear and stress of talking about mental illness among men in the 1930's and on was not normalised and most likely frowned upon as the man in the family was supposed to be tough, and cry, etc. Masculinity was important and being a tough man still are dominant stereotypical men. Today, men such as John Kirwan; source D: "showing us it's okay to need some help with feeling sad and empty," have paved the way for men to speak up about their mental health issues and know it's okay. You can still be masculine and have off days. Men are starting to advocate for mental illness and men's suicide rates in New Zealand a lot more today compared to men dealing with mental health issues in the past to be arrested or judged. There is still a long way to go in making mental health a subject that is normalised and okay to talk about for women and especially men. As source E states: "mental health was associated with dangerousness... and that's wrong." We've obviously come a long way from thinking that people who are depressed need to be put in an asylum when really, like we

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION
NUMBER

ONE tremendousley as they would have felt the need to bottle it up so they didn't look weak. This still happens in society today and is an issue that needs to change. //

THREE are starting to do more and more of today, people need to be listened to know that everyone has bad days and your ~~o~~ just stuck in a moment in which it shall pass. //

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

Excellence Exemplar 2020

Subject	L2 History	Standard	91231	Total score	21
Q	Grade score	Annotation			
1	E7	<p>The candidate frames their response to this question predominantly in their own words. There is a consistent use of relevant supporting evidence with clear distinctions made between the candidate's own ideas and those drawn from the source material. There is a perceptive (though inferred) identification regarding the reliability and usefulness of the source material included within the response.</p> <p>The response clearly examines both Sources A and B and addresses the question in a clear and logical manner. The response demonstrates a comprehensive understanding as to the identified reasons to why there was a gender bias regarding a patient's committal to the Seacliff Asylum.</p>			
2	E7	<p>The candidate comprehensively examines two perspectives regarding the treatment of patients while committed to Seacliff Asylum. The response is predominantly in their own words and there is consistent, appropriate use of both detailed direct references to the source material and perceptive inferred inferences from the sources.</p> <p>The candidate's response demonstrates a high level of engagement with the sources. There is clear evidence that this candidate has used their own knowledge to strengthen their analysis of the source material, raising both relevant and appropriate further questions and also concerns over identified limitations such as validity and usefulness.</p>			
3	E7	<p>The candidate provides a detailed and comprehensive answer that addresses all aspects of the question. The response is clear, logical, and structured appropriately, producing a perceptive examination of the role that change and continuity have had in shaping people's attitudes towards mental health in New Zealand since the establishment of the Seacliff Asylum.</p> <p>The candidate has made a number of judgements supported by the evidence and has clearly examined the extent of change over time. This specifically reflects the candidate's ability to make insightful conclusions.</p>			