

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

3

91438



914380



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

Tick this box if
there is no writing
in this booklet

Level 3 History 2020

91438 Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event

2.00 p.m. Thursday 19 November 2020
Credits: Six

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.	Analyse, in depth, the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.	Comprehensively analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

Write ONE essay in this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–12 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

Low Achievement

TOTAL

03

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

INSTRUCTIONS

Write an essay on ONE significant historical event that you have studied, using the essay task below. Your essay should be concise and well argued.

Write your chosen historical event in the box below.

Plan your essay on page 3. Begin your essay on page 4.

**ESSAY QUESTION**

Causes are always clear but consequences are not.

Analyse the important causes and consequences of a significant historical event you have studied. To what extent do you agree or disagree with the statement above that causes are clearer than consequences?

Historical event: Atomic bombing of Hiroshima.

analysing
analysing

PLANNING

Introduction:

- 8:10am, 6 August 1945 ✓
- 80,000 killed instantly ✓
- 'Little Boy' = 67 million sticks dynamite. ✓
- Enola Gay - B29 Bomber ✓

Cause 1: Rise of Imperial Japan

↳ Meiji Restoration ✓

↳ Social Economic political changes ✓

↳ Anglo-Japanese Treaty 1902 ✓

↳ Major power ✓

↳ inspiration - could modernise, industrialise & negotiate alliances. ✓

↳ WWI ✓

1) No troops to Europe ✓

2) Captured Shandong China & North Pacific Islands ✓

↳ Treaty of Versailles ✓

- Victorious nation ✓

- Wanted to retain former German territories. Island made mandates under LOR ✓

✓ - Racial Equality rejected by Britain and USA - "White alliance against a yellow people"

✓ ↳ Strong military, 3rd largest navy and strong economy

↳ 1923 Kanto Earthquake, 1927 recession, 1930 Great depression. Led to rise in anti-democracy and militarism + down path of ~~extreme~~ imperialism ✓

↳ Expansionism N/A

Cause 2: Pearl Harbour

↳ 7th December 1941

↳ 6.10am attack commenced, 8.10am 2nd wave, 10am Japanese pulled back

- 360 Japanese aircraft - 60 destroyed

- USS Oklahoma, Arizona & Utah completely destroyed. Other 5 ships repaired

- 160 US planes destroyed

- ~~Not~~ Autumn 1941 negotiations started. November 27 negotiations ceased

You should aim to write a concise essay of no more than 5–6 pages. The quality of your writing is more important than the length of your essay.

Begin your essay here:

On the 6th of August 1945, the American B-29 bomber 'Enola Gay' dropped the world's first deployed atomic bomb - 'Little Boy', on the Japanese city of Hiroshima at 8:10am. The bomb's blast killed 80,000 men, women, children and soldiers instantly. The blast was the equivalent to 67 million sticks of dynamite. The statement "Causes are always clear but consequences are not" is not true nor applicable when analysing the bombing of Hiroshima. The ~~causes~~ clear causes that will be investigated are the rise of imperial Japan and the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbour. The also clear consequences that will be investigated is the immediate nuclear fallout and the New Zealand anti-nuclear movement.

The ~~rise~~ origins of the rise in imperialism within Japan can be dated back to 1867 to the Meiji Restoration. The Meiji Restoration saw the rapid modernisation and industrialisation of Japan. This restoration occurred to prevent the loss of traditional Japanese culture due to Western influence. Consequently, Japan grew into a major power. ^{*} In 1902, Japan was officially recognised as a major power with the signing of the Anglo-Japanese Treaty. ~~Consequently~~ The signing of this treaty made Japan an inspiration to other Asian nations as ~~it~~ Japan showed that it was possible to modernise, industrialise and negotiate alliances with other major and great powers. Japan continued to grow as a major power throughout and after World War I. During World War I, Japan took over German controlled territories of Shandong China, and a handful of islands in the North Pacific. Japan

* The Meiji restoration also saw History 91438, 2020
major economic, social and political changes.

didn't however, send troops to fight in Europe. Following World War I, Japan attended the signing of the Treaty of Versailles as one of the victorious nations. Japan requested three things from the Treaty of Versailles. Firstly Japan wanted to ~~not~~ retain the former German concessions of Shandong China and the former German islands in the North Pacific. Japan managed to ~~not~~ retain Shandong, China, and the former German islands in the North Pacific however, the islands were made mandates under the League of Nations. Secondly, Japan wanted the ability to fully cooperate with the other nations such as France, Britain and the United States of America. Thirdly, Japan wanted to put forward a 'Racial Equality Treaty'. This treaty was ultimately rejected by both Britain and the United States of America. Britain rejected the treaty after receiving pressure from New Zealand, Australia and Canada (white dominions). America declined to sign out of fears of Japanese emmigration on California and the West Coast. A Japanese elder statesman summed the situation as "a white alliance against a yellow people." Consequently, Japan continued to grow in concern. After World War I, Japan had a formidable army, the world's third largest navy and a strong economy to accompany. All of which was equally comparable to other 'Great' powers, yet Japan would not be recognised as such. Thus, highlighting the racial prejudice of the time. Between 1923 and 1930, Japan suffered a series of economic ~~crises~~ crises. 1923 saw the Kanto Earthquake. 1927 saw an economic recession. 1930 saw a world-wide depression. Consequently, anti-democracy and militarism grew in Japan, ~~forcing~~ forcing it down a route of imperialism. ~~As no other major or great power would give Japan the recognition it deserved, it is~~ The statement "causes are always clear but

Consequences are not" is an invalid statement in regards to the rise of imperial Japan as a cause to the atomic bombing of Hiroshima. The rise of imperial Japan ~~may have made~~ arguably made Japan a valid 'Great' power. However, this is irrelevant as Japan wasn't recognised as such by other 'Great' Powers. Consequently, ~~For~~ due to this racial prejudice, Japan was forced into a situation where they had to find other methods of proving themselves.

~~Throughout the 1940s~~ A short term cause of the atomic bombing of Hiroshima was the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbour. Throughout the 1940s, the relationship between America and Japan was beyond poor. Japan wanted to keep the trading ~~between~~ in Asia for Asian countries only much to the detest of America. Consequently, America placed tariffs, embargos and an oil blockade on Japan. In the autumn of 1941, with continued mounting tensions, negotiations between Japan and America began. It was not until November where it was obvious that no agreement would be achieved. On the 27th of November 1941, Japanese ambassadors requested to meet with the U.S. Secretary of State. This was a clear indication that war was at hand. Therefore, military superiors in Washington D.C. dispatched a message to Lieut. Gen. Short and Adm. Kimmel on the 27th of November 1941. The message addressed to Adm. Kimmel read "this dispatch should be considered a war warning" and "negotiations with Japan have ceased." The message went on to instruct Adm. Kimmel to undertake reconnaissance and defensive measures. Lieut. Gen. Short received a similar message also ordering him to undertake defensive measures and reconnaissance. The pair also received warnings on the 14th and 16th of October. The defensive measures undertaken by Adm.

Kimmel and Lieut. Gen. Short would prove far from adequate. On the 7th December 1941, the first wave of Japanese aircraft launched from one of six Japanese aircraft carriers. The attack on Pearl Harbour commenced at 7:55am. At 8:10am, the second wave of Japanese fighters were deployed. The most damage was inflicted within the first 30 minutes of the attack. At 10:00am the Japanese aircraft withdrew, ~~out of~~ without the deployment of the intended third wave of Japanese aircraft. Out of the 360 Japanese aircraft deployed, only 60 were destroyed. The American losses were far more significant. Eight U.S. naval ships ~~there~~ ^{of the} Pacific fleet were crippled. Three of the ~~eight~~ ships were completely destroyed - the USS Arizona, Oklahoma and Utah. The other five were repaired and returned to service. 2404 civilians and soldiers were killed with 160 aircraft destroyed as well. The Japanese attack could be considered a marginal success as they managed to sink three naval ships, damage ~~5~~ five others, and destroy 160 U.S. aircraft. However, the Japanese failed to sink any U.S. aircraft carriers nor did they destroy vital oil ~~stg~~ storage facilities on the island. On the 8th of December, President Franklin D. Roosevelt addressed congress stating "the United States of America was suddenly and deliberately attacked by the imperial forces of the Empire of Japan." Congress voted to declare war on Japan with only one dissenting ~~2~~ vote. Oliver Lyttleton, a British politician stated "America provoked Japan to the extent to which there was no alternative." Japan was forced by America to make a move which highlight how America was only looking for justification to enter ~~the~~ World War II. The statement "causes are always clear but consequences are not" is again invalid in the case of ~~5~~ the attack on Pearl Harbour being a cause to the atomic bombing of Hiroshima. This is due to the fact that now America and Japan were at war and how

Japan presented a fierce and difficult enemy to America, then President Harry S. Truman needed a solution to end the war against Japan with little loss to America. Thus, the atomic bombing of Hiroshima was inevitable.

An immediate consequence of the atomic bombing of Hiroshima was the immediate nuclear fallout. The atomic bomb killed 80,000 people instantly. Those in the open were either vapourised or turned to carbon. Those who were not killed were exposed to infra-red radiation and Gamma-rays. Furthermore, survivors were severely burned ~~by~~ by the bomb's explosion's heat. Additionally, some survivors were left blind from the explosion's light, deaf from the shockwave following the bomb's explosion, or both.

Survivors were in desperate need of medical attention however, there was little available. Medical personnel in Hiroshima were already scarce even before the bombing. Furthermore, the bomb reduced 90,000 buildings including medical centres and hospitals to rubble. Consequently, there were only a handful of ~~the~~ make-shift treatment centres with little to no medical supplies. Gar Alperovitz, an American revisionist historian argues that the bomb had more of a political intention stating "the [atomic] bombs were used as a political and diplomatic weapon against the Soviet Union". The nuclear fallout in Hiroshima can also be considered a long-term consequence due to the long-term health implications. Survivors of Hiroshima had a 46% chance of getting leukaemia due to the radiation exposure. A rise in leukaemia was seen two years after the bombing and peaked ~~to~~ four to six years later. A rise in other cancers wasn't seen until 10 years after the bombing. Furthermore, three out of four children ~~was~~ born of mothers who survived the atomic bombing were both severely

disabled and disfigured. Children represented the most severely affected portion of the population. The statement "causes are always clear but consequences are not" is simply inaccurate in this case. The consequences of the atomic bombing of Hiroshima are clear. Survivors were left blind, deaf, burned and exposed to infra-red radiation and Gamma-rays. Furthermore, an estimated 166,000 people were killed due to the bomb. The consequences of the bomb continued years later with an increase in leukaemia and other cancers. The bomb's ~~effect~~ effects impacted an entire generation. Therefore, the consequences of the atomic bomb are more than obvious.

The NZ anti-nuclear movement is a long-term consequence of the bombing of Hiroshima. The atomic bombing of Hiroshima brought international attention to this new form of weaponry. Countries around the world chose to either stand against nuclear weapons or begin stockpiling and creating their own. New Zealand stood against the use of nuclear weapons. In 1966, France moved its nuclear testing to the South Pacific, much to the detest of New Zealand. France then began conducting atmospheric testing. Therefore, in 1972, New Zealand Prime Minister Norman Kirk took two ~~measures~~ measures. Firstly, he took France to the ~~World~~ World Court and ~~sent it~~ secondly he sent HMNZS 'Otago' to the testing zone to ~~take~~ both bear witness and bring attention to French actions. The World Court ordered France to move its testing underground and cease atmospheric testing. ~~Therefore~~ In 1974, France complied. This bold move by New Zealand earned them a marginal win. In 1976, New Zealand was presented with another problem - US nuclear warship visits.

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION
NUMBER

New Zealand could not be both nuclear free and allow US nuclear warship visits. Between 1976 - 1983, New Zealand allowed ~~8~~ eight nuclear warships into NZ waters and ports, all of which gathered protests. Therefore, Prime Minister David Lange requested that the United States send non-nuclear powered ships. The United States complied by sending the USS Buchanan in 1984. However, the United States would "neither confirm nor deny" the presence ~~is~~ of nuclear weapons. Therefore, in early 1985, David Lange refused the USS Buchanan access to NZ ports, ~~Further~~ much to the dismay of the United States. Despite negotiations the United States declared the 'ANZUS Treaty' "inoperative" even though ~~the~~ New Zealand was under no legal obligation to allow US ships access to NZ under the 'ANZUS Treaty'. Furthermore, New Zealand was downgraded from 'ally' to 'friend'. US Secretary of State George Schultz summed the situation as "we part company as friends, but we part company as far as the alliance is concerned." New Zealand's anti-nuclear was set in stone with the signing of the 'South Pacific Nuclear Free Zone' also known as the 'Treaty of Rarotonga'. The treaty stated there would be no testing, producing, use, stockpiling or dumping of nuclear material. This was signed on the 6th of August ~~1985~~ 1985, 40 years after the bombing of Hiroshima. ~~The~~ Maggie ~~Child's~~ Childs, a modern day academic scholar of Japanese language and culture ~~is~~ stated that "we should focus on eliminating such weapons from the face of the Earth." New Zealand has played a major part in achieving

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

This. The statement "causes are always clear but consequences are not" is completely untrue in this case. Because of the bombing of Hiroshima, it spurred movements (that needn't have been necessary if there was no atomic bomb/weaponry) that ~~is~~ worked to prevent the use of atomic bombing in the future. //

To conclude, the atomic bombing of Hiroshima was caused by numerous factors and had even more consequences, both of which can clearly be identified. The most important cause identified and investigated was the rise of imperial Japan. This cause was the root of everything. Moreover, the way Japan was treated by the racist Western nations altered how Japan developed and how they were forced to go down an imperialistic route and prove their ability through other outlets. The most important consequence of the bombing of Hiroshima was the anti-nuclear movement in New Zealand. New Zealand set the standard for standing up for their beliefs. New Zealand was not going to be deterred ~~is~~ nor bullied by 'great' powers or the superpower of the 20th century ~~is~~ — ~~is~~ United States of America, of which New Zealand relied on for its economy and security. New Zealand would rather lose its ~~alliance~~ allies than drop their beliefs. The people of New Zealand ~~objected to the~~ wanted to make their country nuclear free and achieved that mission. Whilst the statement "causes

Extra space if required.

Write the question number(s) if applicable.

ASSESSOR'S
USE ONLY

QUESTION
NUMBER

are clear but consequences are not" may be true in other things, it can not be applied to any significant historical event as there is always a cause and a consequence. //

Achievement Exemplar 2020

Subject	L3 History		Standard	91438	Total score	03
Q	Grade score	Annotation				
1	A3	<p>Atomic bombing of Hiroshima</p> <p>The candidate has chosen a well-defined event with two causes and consequences.</p> <p>The candidate acknowledges the statement “causes are always clear but consequences are not” in the introduction and determines that the statement is not true in relation to their chosen event.</p> <p>The candidate uses the term “clear” to categorise the first cause but does not acknowledge that the causes and consequences to be analysed are required by the question to be important ones.</p> <p>There is even treatment of causes and consequences and candidate has identified short- and long-term causes and consequences, indicating some analysis. Each cause / consequence is supported by a lot of factual detail, but it lacks the depth of analysis required for a Merit grade because there is little evaluation.</p> <p>The statement is consistently acknowledged but an argument is not developed; rather the candidate continues to assert that the statement is not valid for causes or for consequences.</p> <p>The conclusion identifies which cause and consequence are most important, but both of these choices are still not clearly linked to the event.</p> <p>The candidate does not achieve a higher grade because they describe unnecessary facts rather than providing an argument and no clear explanation of how each causal factor led to the event. The first cause does not establish how the rise of Imperial Japan led to the bombing of Hiroshima, and the second causal factor (the bombing of Pearl Harbour) does not develop enough of an explanation of why the USA would need to resort to the bombing of civilians to bring an end to the war.</p> <p>Another reason the candidate does not achieve a higher grade is because of their choice of the second consequence, namely the New Zealand anti-nuclear movement. The link between this consequence and the event is very vague and requires a big leap to be made with a broad generalisation that lacks accuracy, i.e. that the bombing caused countries to choose one of two options: to stand against nuclear weapons or to stockpile and create their own.</p> <p>Overall, there is enough evidence within the response and engagement with the quote. However, a higher grade may have been achieved by focusing on the most important causes rather than the long-term and short-term causes; drawing clearer links as to how each causal factor led to the event; focusing on analysis including prioritisation rather than a detailed description of facts; and choosing a more direct second consequence.</p>				