

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

3

91438



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

Tick this box if you
have NOT written
in this booklet

Level 3 History 2021

91438 Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event

Credits: Six

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.	Analyse, in depth, the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.	Comprehensively analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

Write ONE essay in this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–12 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

Do not write in any cross-hatched area (///). This area may be cut off when the booklet is marked.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

High Excellence

08

INSTRUCTIONS

Write an essay on ONE significant historical event that you have studied, using the essay question below. Your essay should be concise and well argued.

Write your chosen historical event in the box below.

Plan your essay on page 3. Begin your essay on page 4.

ESSAY QUESTION

Evaluate the most important causes of your chosen historical event.

Historical event: Pope Urban's Speech at the Council of Clermont, 1095

PLANNING

You should aim to write a concise essay of no more than 5–6 pages. The quality of your writing is more important than the length of your essay.

Begin your essay here:

The Council of Clermont, held between the 17th and 27th of November, 1095, was a gathering of a large number of church officials and laymen alike to discuss a number of matters primarily pertaining to current events within eleventh century Catholicism. However, it would also be host to a very significant historical event, namely the current Pope's- Urban II -speech there, which announced plans for the First Crusade, a so-called Holy Army that would embark upon a pilgrimage to Jerusalem and brought war along with them. However, the events that acted as the causes for Pope Urban to make his fateful speech are were of varying importance to the latter, among them being concern about the rising muslim empires that now dominated the Middle East, the pleas of the weakened Byzantine Empire to for aid in their present plight, and most especially Urban's own goals of church reform and to strengthen the Papacy. Thus, in this essay, these causes will be analyzed and evaluated in their importance to Pope Urban II's speech at the Council of Clermont.

The Council of Clermont was, as previously stated, a gathering on the 17-27th of November, 1095, of thousands of church officials and many more laymen with the primary goal of discussing the state of the Catholic Church. In spite of its often violent, feudal and effectively warmongering tendencies, western society was dominated by Christianity, which was fueled moreso by the believers' devotion therein. The religion, and thus the Church, was of great importance to the vast majority of people, with non-believers and infidels swiftly disconnected from much of society. Therefore, when time came for Pope Urban's speech to commence, it would come to no surprise that it was met with overwhelming support, given that it had tapped into the key tenets of eleventh century Europe; An army to embark on a pilgrimage to Jerusalem, promise of the atonement of sins, potential to return with riches and spurred on by an islamophobic hatred caused by propaganda. While historians debate the primary motivations for people joining the crusade, the various promises in Pope Urban's speech was able to allured more than 80,000 people to join his Crusade.

The most important cause of the fateful speech at the Council of Clermont would coincidentally be the Pope's own goals of strengthening the Papacy. This began when his predecessor, Pope Gregory VII, started to seek widespread church reform, seeking to both cut down on the number of corrupt and sinful officials within the church as well as to control the amount of wars being fought between European powers. These grew to become a great responsibility for Urban, as the so-called Investiture Contest, a war between Gregory (and the Church) and King Henry II, began to be fought in 1075 over the right to elect church officials such as bishops, as each side believed only they should be able to. This war would continue over the next almost 50 years, only ending in 1122. The latter goal, controlling European violence, also became a balancing act as Gregory had been

using the concept of "just war", devised by Saint Augustine and supported by a council of scholars led by Matilda of Tuscany after she and her army was commissioned by the Church to fight for them in the investiture contest in 1081, to manipulate the warmongering yet incredibly devout nature of the powers in his favor, blessing certain causes that worked to his advantage such as the invasion of England in 1072 because he deemed the king there to be heretical. Thus, when Pope Urban II became the head of the Catholic Church, he eagerly continued Gregory's work and sought to strengthen the papacy, realizing that the church would not be able to complete either goal if it does not have a military force of its own to enforce such rules. In the years leading up to the Council of Clermont, Urban continued to manipulate European armies; after it fell to King Henry's armies in 1084, Urban was able to rally an army of Normans to retake Rome on his behalf, commissioning a number of knights to defend and fortify a fort between Christian/Muslim territories in the Spanish region in 1092. He would also successfully attempt to improve relations with the Byzantine Empire, where there were previously great tensions following the Great Schism in 1062 as they followed the opposing Greek Church, in order to further increase the church's political presence in Europe. These endeavors would culminate in the devising of the First Crusade, a plan that was originally thought up by Pope Gregory in 1074 before being dropped due to the Investiture Contest, which would provide Pope Urban with the powerful "Holy Army" needed to enforce his will and truly strengthen the papacy's position in Europe. Therefore, in both leading up to and motivating the conception of the First Crusade, both Popes' convictions to reform the church and strengthen the papacy to be the first and foremost important causes to Pope Urban's speech at the Council of Clermont.

Another important cause of Pope Urban's speech was the current plight of the Byzantine Empire. Before its current emperor at the time of the Council of Clermont, Alexios Komnenos, had come into power, the Byzantine Empire had been on the path of a slow, but steady decline. Being an offshoot of the now-nonexistent Roman Empire, the Byzantine Empire found itself on valuable territory about the region of modern day Turkey. It was still a powerful empire, being in an excellent position as a bridge between the Middle East and the rest of Europe and facilitating much trade between the two; it was a fairly wealthy empire because of this. It also held great political influence alongside a powerful mercenary military, making it a very well-known empire about Europe. Despite this, it had been facing a steady decline as of late, seen most clearly with the loss of very large amounts of land to the Seljuk Turks in the region of Anatolia; this came to a head in the Battle of Manzikert in 1071, which historian Steve Runciman describes to be the "most decisive defeat in the Byzantine history". Upon the beginning of his reign in 1081, Emperor Komnenos inherited a now-dying empire and sought to restore the Byzantine Empire to its former glory by whatever means possible. This was seen in his cooperation in improving relations with the Catholic Church, and was further observed upon his organizing of the Council of Piacenza in 1095, which saw over

35 thousand attendees, about 4 thousand of whom were church officials, which sought to discuss the looming threat of the Seljuk Turks upon the Byzantine Empire. This drive to defend his empire would soon bring him to work together with Pope Urban upon the latter's sharing of his plan for the First Crusade, agreeing to allow the army to rally in Constantinople as well as to provide naval support and to supply the army with provisions. Komnenos' conviction to save his dying empire motivated him to cooperate with and enable Pope Urban's plans for a Crusade, thus playing a very important role in causing Urban to make his speech at the Council of Clermont.

Arguably the relatively (relative to the other causes to be discussed in this essay) least of the important causes to Pope Urban's speech was the rise of the Islam in the Middle East. Beginning with the founding of Islam in 610 by the prophet Muhammed, the religion quickly grew to dominate the Middle East and the Muslim Empire began its rise. Bolstered further in 636 with a Muslim victory in the battle of Yomusk against a Roman army, the Muslim Empire would continue to expand rapidly over the next 400 years. As it expanded and conquered more territory, it assimilated a large number of cultures and knowledge into its own, producing a society with a wide range of cultural influences that was very advanced for its time because of this. For example, in drawing from Arabic and Indian cultures, the Empire made great advancements in the fields of mathematics, literature, and technology, as well as their construction and architectural skills from Greek influence. In the decades leading up to the Council of Piacenza, the Muslim Empire, particularly the Seljuk Turks, found great success as seen in taking swathes of land in the region of Anatolia and defeating the Byzantine Empire at Mazikert in 1074. As Steve Runciman states, the technologically advanced Muslim Empire posed a grave threat to the rest of Europe following the defeat of the Byzantines, and that the danger of an invasion potentially loomed. However, at the time, the Empire was fighting against the Fatimids, an offshoot faction that was contesting lands in the southern areas of the Middle East. It can be argued that Pope Urban's devising of the First Crusade took into account their present situation and that its goal to reach Jerusalem, which was controlled by the Muslim Empire at the time, was very intentional to drive back a threat of a Muslim invasion. However, historian Thomas Asbridge believes otherwise, stating that for the last 400 years as a purely religious conflict between the two religions had yet to be seen, diminishing the sentiment that Urban chose to attack the Muslim Empire as a religious contest. Instead it can be seen as a means to an end; gathering his holy army and aiding the Byzantine Empire. Therefore, while the threat of the Muslim Empire can be seen as a motivator for devising the First Crusade and Pope Urban's speech, it is of lesser importance to the two primary causes to the speech as explained above.

In conclusion, Pope Urban's speech at the Council of Clermont found itself to be motivated by a number of causes, some of which were more important than others. Pope Urban II's goals of church reformation and strengthening the papacy saw years of effort across two generations of popes, with the gathering of a holy army being the ultimate form of this, fulfilling his desire for a military force to impose his will and to finally complete the goals he had been working to accomplish, making this by far the most important cause for his speech at Clermont. The plight of the Byzantine Empire falls short of this in terms of importance but is nevertheless high in that regard. The decline the empire faced and the threat the Seljuk Turks now posed motivated Komnenos to cooperate with the plan and to facilitate the holy army's conquest into Muslim territories, which enabled the plan in the first place. This places the plight high in its importance to the speech. The implications of a rising Muslim Empire were dangerous however was simply not nearly as important as the primary causes for the Crusade. However, because it did push Komnenos to cooperate as he did, it is still clear that it was a significant cause to planning the Crusade and therefore Pope Urban's speech. And thus, with these causes, Pope Urban's speech at Clermont would occur nevertheless, and inevitably allured more than 80,000 people to its cause. Whether it be the rise of the Muslim Empire, the dangerous position the Byzantine Empire found itself in, or the wishes of Urban himself to strengthen the church and its papacy, every one of these events had its role, significant to not-so-much, in motivating and thereby causing that fateful speech. Therefore, on the 17th of November, 1095, Europe and the Middle East would begin to fundamentally change over the next two centuries as a result of Pope Urban's speech, whether that be in the First Crusade itself or the many, far-reaching consequences therein, with thousands fighting and dying in the name of the holy army and Christianity.

Extra space if required.
Write the question number(s) if applicable.

QUESTION
NUMBER

91438

Excellence Exemplar 2021

Subject	L3 History		Standard	91438	Total score	08
Q	Grade score	Annotation				
1	E8	<p>Pope Urban II's speech at the Council of Clermont (1095)</p> <p>The candidate provides a well-structured response that directly answers the question. A clear position is taken at the beginning of the essay, which is sustained and built upon throughout the response.</p> <p>A suitable event has been chosen that allows for the discussion of the complexity of causation required for Excellence. Three important causes are chosen for Pope Urban's speech at the Council of Clermont: the Pope's goal of strengthening the Papacy; the plight of the Byzantine Empire; and the rise of Islam in the Middle East. The choices of causation by the candidate demonstrate understanding of causal complexity and in particular how the aims and motivations of humans, shape the course of events. The choice of three causes rather than two is appropriate for this event, as it allows the candidate to present a well-considered argument around the causes.</p> <p>The candidate sets out the relevant details of the event and enough context surrounding the event to develop a comprehensive argument.</p> <p>Overall, the candidate shows comprehensive understanding in their selection of well-chosen evidence and the judicious inclusion of historiography. The inclusion of historiography is not required by the standard. However here, the inclusion supports and enhances the candidate's response and helps to demonstrate comprehensive understanding of causation as required by the High Excellence criteria.</p> <p>The candidate clearly weighs the importance of each cause relative to each other. This is woven through the response. A good portion of the response is spent evaluating the importance and significance of each cause, thereby directly answering the question.</p>				