

External Evaluation and Review Report

Skills4Work Limited

Date of report: 1 March 2023

About Skills4Work Limited

Skills4Work Limited has recently transitioned from a small to a medium-sized PTE, having taken on the functions of arranging training for retail butchery apprenticeships and securing Tertiary Education Commission funding for full-time butchery and bakery training. During this transition period, Skills4Work has continued to support Foodstuff Groups' apprentices. In conjunction with Te Pūkenga Work Based Learning - Competenz, Skills4Work offers commercial training, partners with the Auckland Māori and Pasifika Trades Training consortium, and supports Gateway programmes for local secondary schools.

Type of organisation: Private training establishment (PTE)

Location: Unit 5, 11 Ronwood Avenue, Manukau, Auckland

Code of Practice signatory: No

Number of students: Domestic: in 2022 there were 23 full-time bakery

students (six Māori and three Pasifika) and 11 full-time butchery students (seven Māori) – 29.4 equivalent full-time students; 694 butchery apprentices (27 per cent Māori and 7 per cent Pasifika); 242 bakery apprentices (under contract

to Te Pūkenga Work Based Learning -

Competenz)

In 2022, 24 butchery apprentices identified as

having a disability or learning need.

Number of staff: 18.5 full-time equivalents

TEO profile: Skills4Work provider page on the NZQA website

Last EER outcome: NZQA was Highly Confident in Skills4Work's

educational performance and self-assessment at

the last EER in 2018.

Scope of evaluation:

• New Zealand Certificate in Trade Baking

(Craft) (Level 4) (ID: 125024, Ref: 2698)

 New Zealand Certificate in Trade Butchery (Level 4) with optional strands in Carcass Breaking and Boning, Curing and Smoking, and Handcrafted Small Goods (Level 4) (ID:

126819, Ref: 2972-2)

MoE number: 9130

NZQA reference: C50772

Dates of EER virtual enquiry: 29 and 30 November 2022

Summary of results

Skills4Work has strong stakeholder relationships and comprehensive understanding of industry needs, as well as highly effective contributing process and exceptional self-assessment. These have supported the successful and seamless transition of the arranging of training functions for butchery apprenticeships and the delivery of baking training, and have offered highly valued outcomes for all stakeholders. There is very strong evidence that this level of performance will continue and there will be increases in apprentice and learner completions over time.

Taking into account the length of time programmes have been running¹, and the impacts of Covid-19 on retail industries such as bakery and butchery², achievement of qualifications is generally strong.

Highly Confident in educational performance

 Growth in butchery apprenticeships and the increase in unit standard credit registrations reflect industry's confidence in Skills4Work and the wellcommunicated and supported transition.

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

- Skills4Work's contributions and value-add to the industry extend well beyond apprentice and learner achievements. These contributions are well understood and acknowledged by stakeholders. Overall, industry skills and the body of knowledge are enhanced, skill shortages are reduced, longterm careers are established, and industry associations and competitions are well supported.
- Programmes are well designed and are being changed to reflect industry trends and challenges.
 Learning resources and assessment activities are contextualised and continually improved. Innovative approaches are being developed to cater for

¹ At the time of this EER the New Zealand Certificate in Trade Baking (Craft) (Level 4) full-time programme of study was in its second year of operation; and the New Zealand Certificate in Trade Butchery (Level 4) programme of industry training had transitioned to Skills4Work in August 2021, 14 months previously.

² Independent bakery and butchery businesses were not considered to be 'essential services' during the lockdown periods, and this interrupted some learners' and apprentices' programmes and work placements. Those working in supermarkets were deemed essential workers.

apprentices' preferred learning styles.

- Skills4Work is meeting the most important learning and well-being needs of learners. Support is tailored to the learning and work context. Staff are upskilling to meet the diversity of learner needs.
- The successful transition from a small to a mediumsized organisation, offering both industry training and study programmes, has been underpinned by strong professional leadership, extensive planning, analysis and reflection, and purposeful staff and infrastructure capability building. At the same time, the managed devolution of responsibilities has supported and ensures continuity of educational performance and service to stakeholders.
- There is strong evidence that the important and continually changing compliance accountabilities are well understood and being managed effectively.

Key evaluation question findings³

1.1 How well do students achieve?

Performance:	Good
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	Achievement of qualifications is generally strong. ⁴ In 2021, 65 of the 694 butchery apprentices completed their apprenticeship programme within the approved timeframe, compared with 16 of the 662 apprentices in 2020, and 33 of the 472 apprentices in 2019. ⁵ Twenty-two per cent of the 2021 completions were Māori apprentices, on par with the participation rate. Some of this increase in qualification completions in 2021 is attributable to Skills4Work's transition model, Pūtia. This has brought an increase in training advisors, more regular visits, comprehensive tracking of progress, goal-setting, and focusing on completing within the approved duration of the programme.
	There has also been an increase in apprentice numbers since Skills4Work took over this programme, and a corresponding increase in unit standard credit registrations. For the five months from August to December 2021, 8263 credits were registered by Skills4Work, compared with 5948 for the same period in 2020. These increases reflect the industry's confidence in Skills4Work and the well-communicated and supported transition. This will translate into increased qualification completions in the next few years.
	The full-time bakery learners' progress and completion rates ⁶ were significantly impacted by Covid-19 lockdowns, related financial and whānau pressures, and the length of the programme at 16 months. These contributing factors, coupled with learners not necessarily having the literacy and numeracy

³ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

⁴ Refer to footnotes 1 and 2 on the summary of results page for context relating to the generally strong achievement.

⁵ Completions prior to August 2021 relate to apprentices managed by Competenz.

⁶ In 2021, there were 11 enrolments in the bakery programme in Auckland, and two learners completed. At the same time, the butchery programme had 13 enrolments and three learners completed.

and academic skills to succeed – despite meeting the entry criteria – have led to high withdrawal rates from the small, mostly female cohorts. Skills4Work fully understands the reasons for withdrawal for each individual, and has taken this information into consideration in the review and redevelopment of the programme.

Gains in personal attributes, general confidence and work-readiness skills obtained through the Essential Skills⁷ programme and work placements, have been significant achievements for the full-time learners. Many of them have not had positive experiences at secondary school, or are older and seeking a career change. Skills4Work uses attendance as a measure of success of these achievements, as those learners who are most engaged in their learning are gaining these skills.

Assessment and moderation practices give overall confidence in the reliability of the achievement results. Accurate and timely monitoring and reporting mechanisms have been developed and implemented. Skills4Work has maintained a high standard of data collection and reporting over the transition period. This was confirmed by the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC). These systems, and the enhancements currently being worked on to meet new funding requirements for 2023, will provide Skills4Work with valuable data to inform improvements in the future.

Conclusion:

Taking into account the length of time the programmes have been running and the impacts of Covid-19 on retail industries such as bakery and butchery⁸, achievement of qualifications is generally strong.

Growth in butchery apprenticeships and the increases in unit standard credit registrations reflect industry's confidence in Skills4Work and the well-communicated and supported transition.

Comprehensive review and analysis has informed Skills4Work's performance and guided improvements.

⁷ Essential Skills is an externally facilitated course, run over six weeks, focusing on the development of communication skills, active listening, critical thinking, social skills and increased self-belief.

⁸ Refer to footnotes 1 and 2 on the summary of results page for context relating to the generally strong achievement.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	Skills4Work offers butchery stakeholders a range of highly valued outcomes. Apprentices value the support received to succeed in their apprenticeships, as well as the acknowledgement of learning provided from Skills4Work and their employers upon completion, including framed certificates, pay increases and promotion opportunities.
	The regional, national and international butchery competitions run by the industry association – supported by Skills4Work through sponsorship and access to their top-class butchery facility – provide motivation and aspiration to join other elite butchers in pursuit of recognition and prizes. Skills4Work supports the industry membership fees for all apprentices, providing them with access to up-to-date industry information and other benefits.
	Employers value Skills4Works' comprehensive understanding of the industry and the challenges involved in their businesses, particularly over the pandemic. The experienced and well-respected training advisers willingly share their skills and knowledge. Examples, such as providing ideas to support a business with a new product line of 'ready to heat meals' and demonstrating techniques of stringing meat rolls, were shared with the evaluators during interviews. Skills4Work has recently launched an employment listing service for employers on their website. This service will support employers seeking employees and apprentices seeking new opportunities upon completion.
	From a wider industry perspective, Skills4Work provides young people and those seeking a career change with direction and confidence, and the opportunity to earn while you learn. This helps in meeting skills shortages, improving retention, and securing the future of the retail butcher industry. The industry association and the workforce development council value the close working relationship they share with Skills4Work.
	The full-time bakery learners said they valued the safe environment created by Skills4Work, where 'you can be yourself' and 'diversity is recognised and celebrated'. They also valued

	the well-supported work placements and the preparation for full-time employment in the baking industry. Once the programme changes are implemented and more completions achieved, the benefits to the baking industry will be further evidenced.
Conclusion:	Skills4Work offers highly valued and genuine outcomes for all stakeholders. Learners gain confidence, find direction and career pathways, and achieve recognition through promotions and salary increases. Employers value the growth in skills and knowledge of their staff, the contribution to their businesses, and the expertise of Skills4Work training advisors. Skills4Work's ongoing commitment to the wider industry through supporting industry associations, industry competitions and sponsorship is highly valued.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	To ensure continuity over the transition period, the butchery programme of industry training was maintained in accordance with the transition agreement, with only a few minor changes to the support model and enhancements to resources made by Skills4Work. A review of the qualification is underway. Skills4Work is representing one of the grocery co-operatives on the workforce development council in this review process. This speaks highly of the respect industry has for Skills4Work and their understanding of industry's training needs. When the review is completed, the newly appointed learning and development manager will manage the redevelopment of the programme to align with the graduate profile outcomes of the new qualification, and refresh the resources. Understanding the full-time bakery learners' needs and aspirations starts in the enrolment process, collecting information in a face-to-face interview. Literacy and numeracy, and the visual, aural, reading/writing and kinesthetics assessments inform and ensure that planned content, delivery and assessment are appropriate for each learner. An essential skills programme is provided in preparation for work placements in the bakery industry. This is designed for learners to better understand themselves and their motivators, set goals, and

enhance their communication skills and coping strategies.

The full-time bakery programme is being redeveloped in response to low completions and feedback from employers and learners. Once finalised and approved, this micro-credential will provide learners with essential pre-employment skills in preparation for transitioning to a bakery apprenticeship. This change aligns with the recommendation made by the TEC in its recent audit of Skills4Work.

Bakery tutors employ a range of innovative teaching strategies to develop learners' skills, knowledge and confidence. An example is the venture where learners work in teams to develop and test their entrepreneurship skills. Evidence was provided from the Auckland and Christchurch cohorts showing how products (baked goods) were developed, produced, marketed and sold at a market with proceeds donated to the charity of the learners choosing.

Staff hold relevant industry and adult education and training qualifications, with some working towards the New Zealand Certificate in Adult Tertiary and Teaching (Level 5). Skills4Work has adopted the Ako Aotearoa professional development framework as a whole-of-organisation approach to capability building. Staff are working towards the individual awards, having completed session one of the training in 2022. This award will confirm that staff meet standards for professional values, knowledge and practices that are needed to maximise learner success.

The enhanced internal moderation process includes robust, constructive feedback supported through coaching sessions and peer moderation. Professional development of the moderation unit standards has built staff capability and provided a focus on the value of moderation activity. This ensures Skills4Work has sound bases for maintaining the quality and integrity of assessment.

An initiative to support apprentices to demonstrate their knowledge and skills verbally as an alternative to writing, which is the less preferred approach and creates barriers for some, is being investigated through the reader/recorder project. Skills4Work is approaching this work carefully, consulting with NZQA, to ensure they develop robust processes that capture the evidence to support the assessment result appropriately.

Conclusion:

Skills4Work's comprehensive understanding of its business and connections with the butchery and bakery industries ensures

programmes are well aligned to their needs, are being updated to reflect industry trends and challenges, and maintain their relevance for all stakeholders.

Learning resources and assessment activities are contextualised and continually improved. Innovative approaches are being developed to cater for apprentices' preferred learning styles.

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	Butchery apprentices and employers reported in interviews that Skills4Work delivers learning resources in a timely fashion, provides useful progress reports for discussion during training advisors' quarterly visits, and develops a useful learning plan for the next three months. The highly respected and experienced training advisors relate well with apprentices and employers. They are readily available to provide support for or clarification of learning resources and assessment, and will refer learners to other agencies or to the employer support networks as required.
	Annual workshops for the Foodstuffs apprentices are well organised, interesting and engaging, and incorporate visits to a range of industry suppliers and businesses. The visits are summarised in a report provided to the company. Overall, there is a high level of satisfaction with the support, inspiration and encouragement provided by Skills4Work to apprentices to complete their apprenticeships within the approved timeframe.
	The full-time bakery learners reported being well supported by their tutors and navigators, and that this support helped them to stay focused on their learning, their work placement, and to complete the programme. A structured and comprehensive induction programme supports learners in the early stages of their learning programme. The learner's reflective journal forms the basis of progress discussions with the navigators during fortnightly visits to the workplace. Examples of navigators supporting learners to overcome challenges were provided, such as negotiating with an employer to change shifts to accommodate childcare, and moving to a gender-balanced

workplace. The high satisfaction levels are reflected in formal evaluations which received above 85 per cent in ratings.⁹

Skills4Work is focused on creating an inclusive and supportive organisation that supports those with disabilities and diverse learning needs. Data collection processes and a related policy are being developed. Staff are undertaking professional development, such as dyslexia support webinars, to enhance their understanding of the needs of these learners and develop teaching and support strategies.

A calendar of diversity events is in place with events celebrated, such as dyslexia awareness week. Skills4Work is working with Ako Aotearoa to prepare an application to be awarded the Dyslexia Friendly Quality Mark. Together, these initiatives meet the Tertiary Education Strategy Priority goal 3 and will contribute significantly to reducing barriers to learning and ensure all learners have the same rights and access to enrol and train at Skills4Work.

The Education (Pastoral Care of Tertiary and International Students) Code of Practice is well understood and is being implemented appropriately by Skills4Work across the varying training and learning contexts.

Conclusion:

Skills4Work is meeting the most important learning and wellbeing needs of learners and apprentices. Support is tailored to the context and staff are upskilling to meet the diversity of learner and apprentice needs.

⁹ Skills4Work self-assessment report.

¹⁰ The Dyslexia-Friendly Quality Mark (DFQM) is an initiative to help neurodiverse learners know that an organisation is a safe place for them, where they understand and meet their needs.

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	Skills4Work has undergone significant change since the last EER in 2018. This transformation has been well managed by the experienced and professional chief executive/business owner, without impacting on the learner and employer-centric focus and inclusive team culture that underpin and drive the strategy and operations of the training business.
	Skills4Work was the first PTE to receive industry training funding for the existing apprentices and the related programme as part of the reforms in tertiary education. Considered planning and reflection, in-depth knowledge of vocational education, a drive to succeed and extensive consultation paved the way for the seamless and highly successful transition. This was confirmed by the TEC, industry stakeholders, employers and apprentices.
	Building staff capacity, capability and a 'fit-for-purpose' organisational structure has also been key to this success. The chief executive has made strategic appointments to senior management, teaching and advisory, and administrative staff positions. Responsibilities are clear, appropriately devolved and shared to ensure continuity of service and reduce risk and vulnerability. The results of the recently introduced staff satisfaction survey, with a 10 per cent increase in performance in the second survey, confirmed that staff feel valued, are committed to Skills4Work's strategic direction, and are focused on supporting learners and apprentices in their learning journeys and in achieving their goals.
	Developing and implementing applicable information management and reporting systems and infrastructure has contributed to Skills4Work's success and positioned the organisation to ensure sustainability and further growth. The TEC considers Skills4Work's financial viability to be in the low risk category. This rating provides confidence that the organisation can grow while continuing to deliver quality training

 $^{^{\}rm 11}$ TEC financial risk category Low (A) - Meets expectations against most financial viability indicators and does not raise any major concerns in terms of ongoing viability.

	and assessment services and outcomes. Self-assessment practices are embedded in Skills4Work's activities, with the 'plan-do-check and act' cycle of review used effectively to continually improve processes and products. An example is the full review conducted in 2020 in response to the high volume of early learner withdrawals from the bakery programme, and the changes and enhancements made to enrolment and administration processes, teaching and learning practices, and support and pastoral care services.
Conclusion:	Skills4Work has made a successful transition from a small to a medium-sized organisation, offering both industry training and study programmes. This has been underpinned by strong professional leadership, extensive planning, analysis and reflection, and purposeful capability building of staff and infrastructure. At the same time, the managed devolution of responsibilities from the chief executive/owner has supported and ensures continuity of educational performance and service to stakeholders.

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	Key compliance accountabilities are well understood, overseen and monitored by the chief executive. A schedule of compliance activities guides the systematic and timely reporting and submitting of attestations. Skills4Work's proactive approach to compliance ensures that changes in the rules and/or legislation that may impact on processes or reporting systems are identified early and solutions sought. Examples identified at the time of this EER included the unified funding system (UFS) being introduced in 2023 and changes to IT systems, the potential impact of immigration changes for bakery apprentices on work visas, and the barriers for Halal butchers in the design of the qualification, as well as seeking avenues to complete their qualification through a culturally appropriate pathway of learning.
	The TEC desk-top audit conducted in May 2022 had a positive result, with only a few minor improvements required in one focus area. Skills4Work has proactively continued discussion

with the TEC regarding qualification completions for the bakery programme. An application is in progress to change this programme to a micro-credential to provide learners with foundation skills and enhance engagement and achievement in preparation for moving into an apprenticeship.

Moderation requirements for unit standards managed by NZQA and Ringa Hora - Services Workforce Development Council have been met. Reporting of learner results to NZQA is in accordance with the rules. Results for the unit standards¹² assessed in the period 2018-22 were mostly reported within 90 days of the assessment occurring.

The quality management system is a living document providing a solid foundation for the business and training delivery. Policies are updated regularly, signed off by the policy owner, and changes communicated to staff through meetings and newsletters.

Skills4Work maintains positive relationships with NZQA and the TEC, monitoring changes to PTE rules and funding requirements, and seeking clarification as necessary.

Conclusion:

There is strong evidence that the important and continually changing compliance accountabilities are well understood and are being managed effectively.

¹² During the period 1 January 2018 to 31 October 2022, Skills4Work reported 20,759-unit standard results to NZQA, with 221 results (1.06 per cent) reported outside of the required 90 days.

Focus areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: New Zealand Certificate in Trade Baking (Craft) (Level 4) Programme of Study

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent

2.2 Focus area: New Zealand Certificate in Trade Butchery (Level 4) with optional strands in Carcass Breaking and Boning, Curing and Smoking, and Handcrafted Small Goods (Level 4) Programme of Industry Training

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

There are no recommendations arising from the external evaluation and review.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. This include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

Appendix

Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published rules. The methodology used is described in the web document https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- Identify organisational fraud¹³
- Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources
- Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.

Final report

¹³ NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted under the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2021, which are made by NZQA under section 452(1)(t) of the Education and Training Act 2020 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister of Education.

Self-assessment and participation and cooperation in external evaluation and review are requirements for:

- maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities, and
- maintaining consent to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards for all TEOs including ITOs but excluding universities, and
- maintaining training scheme approval for all TEOs other than universities.

The requirements for participation and cooperation are set through the Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2021, the Consent to Assess Against Standards Rules 2021 and the Training Scheme Rules 2021 respectively.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2021 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review as a condition of maintaining registration.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes, training schemes and consents to assess and registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2021. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). All rules cited above are available at https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/.

NZQA
Ph 0800 697 296
E <u>qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz</u>
www.nzqa.govt.nz